

STAFF REPORT

DATE June 21, 2016 PLACE 50 W Gay St TIME 3:00 pm

A CALL TO ORDER

~3:06

B APPROVAL OF MINUTES

~3:05 Meeting Summary – May 17, 2016

C OLD BUSINESS – Applications for CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

15-11-003	Address:	250, 254, and 258 S Gru	bb	
	Property Owner:	Dr. Robert Falcone		
	Applicant:	Scott Watson		
	To be reviewed:	Application revisions		
Sub-Dis	tricts:	West Broad St	Arts and Innovation	Dodge Park
Code Re	eference:	3323.21 Developme	ent Standards	

Staff Observations:

In December 2015, the Board approved the renovation of 250 S Grubb into a private residence, including a private art gallery space. The applicant is requesting to apply exterior insulation over the existing masonry on the existing commercial garage in response to requirements for insulation by the building department. The modifications apply to the west and south elevations and include a stucco (textured) finish that matches the original paint color approved.

Staff recommends approval.

Recommendations:

Conceptual Approval

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Disapproval

D Applications for CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

~3:10

16-06-001	Address:	250 W Rich Street		
Property Owner:		Columbus Metropolitan	Housing Authority	
	Applicant:	CASTO		
	To be reviewed:	Development Plan, Exterior Construction		
Sub-District	s:	West Broad St	Arts and Innovation	Dodge Park
Code Reference:		3323.19 Uses 3323.21 Developme	ent Standards	

Staff Observations:

250 W Rich is a mixed use development on approximately 7 acres. The site will contain eight buildings with a mix of residential, retail, office, restaurant and live/work space. The site will also include a southern extension of Lucas Street and an eastern extension of Cherry Street. As stated in the application, "The objective of the design... is to preserve the industrial heritage of East Franklinton while introducing contemporary architectural elements into the building. Using industrial elements such as corrugated steel siding from storage containers, iron balconies and overhangs, as well as exposed beams in the interior, will integrate the site's past and future and create a pedestrian scale to this large development."

The development includes 230 residential units, including 164 apartment flats and 66 townhome units. The site also includes a pool and community area and a two-story parking deck. In total, the site will have 389 parking spaces.

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Retail (< 10,000 SF)	Permitted Use	Consistent
Live/Work	Permitted Use	Consistent
Office	Permitted Use	Consistent
Restaurant	Permitted Use	Consistent
Residential (4+ du)	Permitted Use	Consistent

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	To be determined
Maximum Front Yard	10' (Except public/private zone)	
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	To be determined
Minimum Side Yard	0'	To be determined
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	To be determined
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	To be determined
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Building 1: 67'-4" (t.o. wall) Building 2: 67'-4" (t.o. wall) Townhomes: 39'-4" (t.o. metal roof) Townhome/Garden: 36'-7"
Building Frontage	Buildings shall front on Public street	A3 and A4 front on a private street
Lighting	3323.21	To be reviewed at future date
Graphics	3323.21	To be reviewed at future date
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	450 spaces required 20 bicycle spaces required	 389 total spaces provided (61 space reduction) Townhome garages - 1 space ea. 292 spaces in parking deck

Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Neighborhood Mixed Use	16-45 du/acre	Consistent
		230 du/6.3 Acres = 35.5 du/ac

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

	Recommendation and Standard Standard Staff Comments				
	d Use Compatibility				
	When a proposed use is compatible with adjacent uses, it should be supported.	Consistent			
Der	nsity				
•	Density of infill development should be consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton plan.	Consistent			
•	Building heights should be consistent with the urban design standards recommended in the plan and height map on page 4.18. Buildings between three and five stories should provide an additional building setback above the third floor. Buildings that exceed five stories should provide at least one additional setback above the fifth floor and employ design solutions that protect views.	Setbacks are not provided above the third floor. Design is appropriate based on adjacent uses and urban design recommendations of EFCCD Plan.			
	hitecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and itutional buildings				
•	Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.	Additional details on building materials and design is required for review. Staff requests material change or architectural relief to be integrated into 8 and 10 unit townhome elevations.			
•	New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods.	Parking platform design and screening should be more integrated into the fabric and scale of the overall development. Staff has concerns with lack of pedestrian connections and integration of parking platform with rear of Building B			
•	A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials.	Additional details on building materials and design is required for review. Staff requests material change or architectural relief to be integrated into 8 and 10 unit townhome elevations.			
•	All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture).	Consistent			
•	Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation.	Consistent			
•	New buildings should be consistent in mass and scale to recommendations in the East Franklinton plan. Larger buildings should be divided into smaller modules or bays. Floor-to-floor heights should appear to be similar to those in nearby traditional buildings, especially first floor windows.	Consistent			

•	Street-level facades are recommended to be as	Consistent
	transparent as possible to create an attractive	
pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces		
on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60		
	percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet	
	and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass,	
	which permits a view of the building's interior to a	
	minimum depth of four feet. At least 25 percent of	
	upper-floor wall areas should be clear/non-tinted	
	window glass.	
•	Buildings with ground-floor residential spaces should	Consistent
	have direct access to the public sidewalk and	
	incorporate front stoops or small plazas to contribute	
	to street activity. Multi-story buildings with residential	
	units should incorporate balconies for the same	
	reason.	
Ret	ail	
•	Retail uses are appropriate throughout the	Consistent
	neighborhood, consistent with the East Franklinton	
	plan, provided applicable code requirements are met.	
Mix	red Uses	
•	Mixed uses can occur vertically in a building (i.e., first	Consistent
	floor retail, second-floor office, third and higher floors	
	residential) or horizontally in a development among	
	various buildings (in these cases, the uses should be	
	integrated and not segregated).	
•	Ground-floor uses in mixed-use buildings should	Consistent
	include retail, restaurants, services, cultural facilities	Consistent
	and amenities, personal services and offices.	
•	A variety of housing unit types and sizes should be	Consistent
-	provided in the residential portions of mixed-use	
	developments.	
Acc	essibility	
		Consistant
•	Promote accessibility and "visitability" in all new	Consistent
	construction and in rehabilitation and redevelopment	
_	of existing buildings.	
	king	
•	Surface parking should be located to the rear or side of	Consistent
	street-oriented buildings, with preference for the rear	
1	of buildings and screened per code. The use of	
1	pervious surfaces for surface parking is encouraged to	
L	minimize storm water runoff and increase infiltration.	
•	The minimum setback for parking lots is five feet;	To be determined
1	parking located adjacent to a public sidewalk, however,	
1	can be located closer than five feet, provided that it	
	fully meets all screening requirements. Parking lots and	
1	accessory buildings should be located at the rear of the	
1	principal building. Where access to the rear of the	
1	property is not possible from a public alley or street, up	
1	to 50 percent of the parking may be located at the side	
	of the principal building.	
•	Structured parking should be considered for higher	Additional screening of parking should be
1	density projects, as appropriate, and designed to	provided through the use of landscaping or
	minimize visual impacts. Building materials, detailing	design.
	and landscape should be used that complement the	

surrounding area. Primary elevations should include	
ground floor uses (e.g., commercial space) or be	
screened with residential uses. Parking structures should be set back no more than 10 feet.	
 Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher 	The requested parking reduction of 61 spaces
density, mixed use projects. Shared parking	The requested parking reduction of 61 spaces (389 total spaces) is consistent with plan
arrangements may be appropriate.	recommendations.
	recommendations.
Building Orientation and Setbacks	Consistent
Buildings should be located parallel to the street on	Consistent
which they front. The primary façade should be located	
on the major street abutting the building and the	
secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings	
on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to	
the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the	
building lines of each street.	
The minimum setback for a principal building is zero	TBD
feet and the maximum setback for a principal building	
is ten feet, except where a Public-Private Setback Zone	
is provided. Where a Public-Private Setback Zone is	
provided, a maximum setback of 15 feet is permitted	
for up to 50 percent of the building frontage.	
• Buildings, parking structures and other structures taller	TBD
than four stories should provide additional space for	
pedestrians adjacent to the public sidewalk if the	
existing sidewalk is five feet or less in width.	
• The minimum setback for fences and masonry or stone	TBD
walls is three feet. Fences or walls along a Public-	
Private Setback Zone may be located zero feet from	
the sidewalk.	
Primary entrances to buildings should be oriented to	Consistent
the primary public street with at least one operable	
door on the primary public street. Buildings located at	
a corner should orient the main entrance to the corner	
instead of to one of the two abutting streets (only one operable door is necessary).	
 Secondary entrances can be located on side and rear 	Consistent
elevations to meet fire code and to service adjacent	Consistent
parking.	
Buffering and Screening	To be reviewed with landscape plan
Public Spaces	
• Developments over 1.5 acres in size in urban settings	The development is linked to city trails south of
should include public spaces, such as plazas and	the site. The site does not incorporate public
courtyards.	spaces such as plazas and courtyards. Staff
	recommends incorporation of public space in
	future phase of development.
Landscaping	To be reviewed with landscape plan
Street Trees and Streetscape	To be reviewed with landscape plan
Landscape Material	To be reviewed with landscape plan
Security	
• Development should be designed to encourage visible	Site plan and landscaping should be designed to
space that will serve as a means to discourage and to	deter crime through activity and maximizing
deter crime through the location of physical features,	visibility

To be reviewed with landscape plan To be reviewed with landscape plan
To be reviewed with lighting plan
To be reviewed with lighting plan
Bicycle parking should be provided per code.
Consistent
Additional space for pedestrians should be provided along Rich Street.
Consistent

Overall, the proposed development is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff recommends the parking deck be screened or designed to be more visually integrated into the fabric of the overall development. Screening could include additional landscaping to minimize the view of parking from McDowell Street and the rear of Building B. The Board should note that while the illustrative site plan depicts a pedestrian walkway south of Building B, the preliminary site plan indicates this will be an access road. The access road should be designed to be an active space and easily maneuvered by pedestrians and vehicles. Staff also recommends the 8 and 10 unit townhome elevations include material changes or architectural relief to add visual interest to the façade.

Staff recommends Board consideration to approve the proposed use, site plan, building height and parking. The approval will include the following modifications to the East Franklinton District development standards:

- 1. To reduce the number of required parking spaces to 389 spaces for the mixed use development as indicated on the site plan. Any change of use from the stated site plan will require Board review for use and parking requirements. Bicycle parking to be provided per code.
- 2. To allow Building A and B to have a maximum height of 67'-4"
- 3. To allow Buildings A3 and A4 to front on a private street
- 4. Setback modifications to be determined

Recommendations:

Approval

Table

Disapproval

1. EFRB review and approval of the following: elevations, materials, landscape plan, bicycle parking location, lighting plan, graphics plan

Approval with

Conditions

~3:40	16-06-002	Address:	566 W Rich		
		Property Owner:	G. Scott Guiler		
		Applicant:	Red Herring Productions		
		To be reviewed:	Council Variance for Use		
	Sub-Distr	icts:	West Broad St	Arts and Innovation	Dodge Park
	Code Refe	erence:	3323.19 Uses 3323.21 Developme	ent Standards	

Staff Observations:

566 W Rich is located at the corner of Rich and Gift streets within the Dodge Park sub-district. The existing building is occupied by a range of art based businesses, and Red Herring Productions recently used a portion of the building for a temporary theater production.

In 2015, a Council Variance was approved to permit Art Gallery, Artist Manufacturing, and Warehousing on the site. The applicant is now requesting a Council Variance to permit Theater, Dance Studio, Art Gallery, Artist Manufacturing, and Warehousing on the site.

Red Herring Productions has a lease agreement with Steel Erectors to park in the parking lot directly south of 566 W Rich from 6:00 pm to midnight on weekdays and all day on weekends. The shared parking arrangement will provide 30 parking spaces.

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Theater (performance)	Not Permitted	Staff recommends approval
Dance Studio/Fitness Club (All other athletic facilities)	Permitted Use	Consistent
Art Gallery	Not Permitted	Previously approved CV
Warehousing (<10,000 SF)	Not Permitted	Previously approved CV
Artist Manufacturing	Accessory Use	Consistent

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard (All other uses)	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of- way	Consistent
Parking	Use of Record: Warehouse (4647 SF): 5 Manufacturing (1394 SF): 2 Artist work/office (980 SF): 3 25% reduction= 8 spaces 4 spaces required (from previous use) New Use: Theater (1620 SF): 54 Warehouse (649 SF): 1 Fitness Club (1394 SF): 6 Manufacturing (409): 3 Office (1047 SF): 3 25% reduction = 50 spaces 50 – 4 = 46 spaces required 4 bicycle parking spaces	Code requires 46 parking spaces and 4 bicycle parking spaces. Red Herring Productions has a lease agreement with Steel Erectors to park in the parking lot from 6:00 pm to midnight on weekdays and all day on weekends. Shared parking lot of 30 spaces. 0 bicycle parking spaces.

Standard	Dodge Park	Staff Comments
Medium-density mixed residential	 Includes single-family, duplexes, and townhouses Existing commercial, light-industrial, and institutional uses are recognized and supported but are limited to existing footprints and must comply with zoning and other regulations. 	While the plan recommends strategic infill of single-family homes within the Dodge Park neighborhood, it also recognizes that each district within East Franklinton should incorporate a diverse mix of land uses. The plan recommends that existing commercial, light-industrial and institutional uses to be recognized and supported but limited to existing footprints. The plan also recommends the maintenance of existing quality commercial and industrial structures on W Rich Street, in the Dodge Park area and conversion of the buildings into mixed use as opportunities arise.
Community Based Principles – Vision	Throughout the district, mix new and historic buildings, respect existing, appropriate businesses, emphasize a strong, visible presence for arts, and other creative activities along public streets. (P. 3.3)	See notes above
Overview	The Dodge Park Neighborhood calls for strategic infill of single-family affordable and market-rate houses to reinforce the character of this neighborhood and ensure ongoing affordable housing options. (P. 4.3)	See notes above
	While each area possesses unique characteristics that will shape its future development, many of these strategies will apply equally across the entire neighborhood. Above all, each area should incorporate a diverse mix of land uses. (P. 4.3)	See notes above
Urban Design and Character Dodge Park W. Rich Street	Maintenance of existing quality commercial/industrial structures; conversion to mixed use as opportunities arise. (P. 4.16)	See notes above

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

•	Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher	The requested parking modification to 0 spaces
•		
	density, mixed use projects. Shared parking	is consistent with the plan due to a shared
	arrangements may be appropriate.	parking arrangement with Steel Erectors to use
		the lot directly south of 566 W Rich during
		evening and weekend hours.

The East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan recommends medium-density mixed residential for the Dodge Park sub-district through strategic infill of single-family homes and support for existing commercial, lightindustrial and institutional uses on existing footprints. The plan recognizes that each district within East Franklinton should incorporate a diverse mix of land uses and recommends the maintenance of existing quality commercial and industrial structures on W Rich Street, in the Dodge Park area, and the conversion of such structures into mixed use buildings as opportunities arise. The proposed mixed use of theater, a multi-purpose studio, warehousing, and art gallery within an existing industrial building is consistent with the recommendations of the EFCCD Plan. Staff supports Board recommendation of approval to City Council for the Variance request.

Staff supports the requested parking modification to 0 parking spaces and 0 bicycle parking spaces with the condition a lease agreement allows for a shared parking arrangement of 30 spaces on evenings and weekends.

Recommendations:	Approval	Approval with Conditions	Table	Disapproval
Recommendations.	Арргочаг	Conditions	Table	Disappioval

1. Occupant maintains shared parking arrangement to use parcel ID 010-023972 during evening and weekend hours.

E Applications for Conceptual Review

~3:50	16-06-003	Address: Property Owner:	231 S. Grubb Columbus Karma Thegsum Choling Inc (CKTC)		
		Applicant:	Columbus Karma Thegsu	m Choling Inc (CKTC)	
		To be reviewed:	New Construction (Conce	eptual)	
	Sub-Dist	ricts:	West Broad St	Arts and Innovation	Dodge Park
	Code Ref	ference:	3323.19 Uses 3323.21 Developme	ent Standards	

Staff Observations:

Columbus Karma Thegsum Choling Tibetan Buddhist Meditation Center (CKTC) purchased the former Rich Street Church of Christ on the southwest corner of Rich and Grubb streets in July 1990. The church building was recently destroyed by an arson fire in January 2016. CKTC had already been considering expansion of the existing building prior to the fire and would like to rebuild in Franklinton on the existing site. The proposed new building will include a sanctuary (Shrine room) to seat up to 120 people, several classrooms, administrative offices, and a community room.

The building is oriented toward Rich street and provides an accessible pedestrian route and an accessible vehicle drop-off space on Sandusky street (alley). The lower level is partially below grade and the total height of the building at the top of the pitched roof is approximately 35'7" on the east elevation. The proposed new use will provide one accessible parking space on-site. CKTC is working to secure shared parking arrangements with area businesses.

As presented, the proposal includes a request for several modifications to the East Franklinton District development standards including: 1. To allow an increased maximum front yard setback on Rich street, 2. To reduce the parking setback to 0 feet, 3. To reduce the side yard setback to 6 inches (east elevation), and 4. To modify the required number of on-site parking spaces and to allow for a shared parking arrangement.

The proposed ornamental banners will require a variance to the Graphics code (CC. 3375.22). Staff will work with the applicant to determine the extent of the variance(s) required.

Standard	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Religious assembly (Primary Use)	Permitted Use	Consistent
Religious non-assembly	Accessory Use	Consistent

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard (All other uses)	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Requesting additional setback for a
Maximum Front Yard	10' (except w public-private zone)	portion of the front yard
Minimum Parking Setback	5′	Requesting O' setback
Minimum Side Yard	3'	Requesting 6" setback (east)
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	To be determined
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg Height	3 stories or 35'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent
Lighting	Per C.C. 3323.21	To be determined
Graphics	Per C.C. 3323.21	Ornamental Banners (C.C 3375.22)
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of- way	Consistent
Parking		To be determined

Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

Standard	Dodge Park	Staff Comments
Medium-density mixed residential	Existing commercial, light-	Consistent
	industrial, and institutional uses	
	are recognized and supported	

Overall, the proposed development is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff recommends the applicant provide additional information on the proposed shared parking arrangements, proposed iron fence, building materials, and buffering of the site from the adjacent singlefamily home. These items are not required for a conceptual review, but will allow the Board to respond better to the proposal. Staff also recommends consideration of additional windows on the north and east elevations and incorporating vertical elements on the north elevation.

16-06-004	Address:	500 W Broad	
	Property Owner:	West Broad Street Partners, LLC Manus Holdings, LLC	
	Applicant:	Brian Suiter (Kaufman Development)	
	To be reviewed:	New Construction (Conceptual)	
Sub-Distri	icts:	West Broad St Arts and Innovation Dodge Park	
Code Reference:		3323.19 Uses 3323.21 Development Standards	

Staff Observations:

~4:20

500 W Broad is a 4.42 acre site located on three parcels including portions of Gay Street and Anson Street. The site is currently occupied by Phillip's Coney Island, Wasserstrom and National Office Warehouse. The applicant is seeking conceptual review of a new, six-story, mixed used development with approximately 40,000 sq. ft. of office space, 250 residential units and varied retail and site amenities. The existing structures will be demolished and the applicant plans to apply for right-of-way vacation of a portion of Gay and Anson streets. The development will also include a four-story parking structure accessible from May Avenue.

As stated in the application, "The project seeks to capitalize on site visibility and accessibility, as well as proximity to downtown, to create a primary gateway into Franklinton." The primary façade is parallel to Broad street and includes distinct plaza and courtyard spaces that are internally connected. The ground floor includes office, retail, restaurant, gallery, and recreation space. Residential units are the primary use of the upper five stories, and an office tower is planned for the southwest corner of the site.

As presented, the proposal includes a request for several modifications to the East Franklinton District development standards including: 1. Allowing a maximum building setback of 86 feet to allow for courtyards on Broad Street, 2. Allowing a 0' setback for parking on May Avenue, 3. Reducing the minimum building frontage to 36%, and 4. To allow a six-story building with a maximum building height of 90 feet.

The parking garage will provide approximately 564 spaces as presented for conceptual review.

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Office (>5,000 SF)	Permitted Use	Consistent
Retail (< 10,000 SF)	Permitted Use	Consistent
Fitness Club	Permitted Use	Consistent
Eating/Drinking Establishment	Permitted Use	Consistent
Residential (4+ du)	Permitted Use	Consistent

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Request to permit courtyard/plaza
Maximum Front Yard	10' (Except public/private zone)	space on Broad Street with portions
		of the building setback to a
		maximum of 86'
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Parking structure has two points at 0'
		setback
Minimum Side Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	36% Building Frontage
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	6 stories and 90' at top of office
		building bulkhead. (77'-6" t.o.
		residential)
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public	Consistent
	street	
Lighting	3323.21	
Graphics	3323.21	
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the	Consistent
	principle building and right-of-	
	way	
Parking	Required parking = 609	564 parking spaces provided
	Residential = 362	(45 space reduction)
	Retail = 30	
	Office = 90	
	Restaurant = 127	

Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Urban Mixed Use	45 or greater	Consistent (~54 du/acre)

Overall, the proposed mixed use development is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff requests the applicant describes proposed building materials, and discuss landscaping and daylighting in the courtyard spaces with the Board.

F STAFF ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

G BOARD APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

496 W Rich | Application #16-04-002

- 1. Demolition | Reviewed 05/17/2016 | Issued 05/18/2016 435 W Town | Application #16-05-001 5
- 2. Demolition | Reviewed 05/17/2016 | Issued 05/18/2016

H OTHER BUSINESS

NEXT MEETING

Tuesday – July 19, 2016 at 50 W Gay St at 3:00 pm