

Regular Meeting

January 30, 2017
12:30 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission convened on Monday, January 30, 2017, at 1:02 p.m. with Grady Pettigrew, Jr. and Delena Edwards in attendance.

PLEASE NOTE: These Minutes are summarized and are not actual statements made by each presenter in the meeting.

* * *

RE: Review and approval of the Minutes from the December 12, 2016 Regular Meeting.

A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded, and approved unanimously.

* * *

RE: Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews.

a. T J Stewart vs. Columbus City Schools; Custodian; Discharge. Trial Board Hearing scheduled for March 1, 2017; Appeal Number 16-BA-0003.

PRESENT: Brenda Sobieck, Personnel Administrative Officer

Brenda Sobieck presented the pre-hearing conference review of T J Stewart, a Custodian, who was discharged from Columbus City Schools. Columbus City Schools will have four witnesses and the Appellant will have three witnesses. Both Columbus City Schools' counsel and the Appellant's counsel believe the hearing can be heard in an afternoon.

* * *

RE: Rule Revisions.

No Rule Revisions were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the Background Standards for Police Officers, 911 Emergency Communications Employees, and Firefighters.

PRESENT: Brenda Sobieck, Personnel Administrative Manager

Brenda Sobieck presented the request to revise the Background Removal Standards for Police Officer, 911 Emergency Communications Employees, and Firefighters at the request of the Division of Police and the Division of Fire.

Standard A.3 was revised to include language regarding providing false information to background personnel. The Division of Police and the Division of Fire requested this change because they noted that other cities within the state and outside of Ohio have removal standards for providing false information. The Division of Fire requested an addition to the language to the employment section regarding termination from the Columbus Fire Academy or Police Academy. The Fire Chief feels that termination from the Academy for cause should be cause for removal if the individual applies again in the future.

The Division of Fire also requested changes to the theft standards. They felt that the wording of Standard G.1 was unclear. They suggested that the standard for Police was clearer; therefore, they requested that Standards G.1, G.2, and G.9 be reworded to match the Police Standards.

The last revision was to add a standard to the criminal activity section regarding Medicare/Medicaid fraud. Because the Division of Fire participates in these federally funded health care programs through its EMS transport reimbursement program, the City Attorney's Office advised that the Division cannot hire anyone who appears on exclusion lists for these funds. This change only affects the Division of Fire Standards.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Trial Board Recommendations.

No Trial Board Recommendations were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Personnel Action for Columbus City Schools:

Request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to reallocate a specified position, currently classified as Supervisor, Warehouse (Job Code 5710), to Warehouse Services Supervisor (Job Code 5715), and to allow the affected employee to retain his current classification seniority and status. It is proposed that the reallocation be effective within thirty (30) days of the Columbus City School Board's adoption of the reallocation recommendation.

PRESENT: Barb Crawford, Personnel Analyst II

Barb Crawford presented this request, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to reallocate a specified position, currently classified as Supervisor, Warehouse (Job Code 5710), to Warehouse Services Supervisor (Job Code 5715) and to allow the affected employee to retain his current classification seniority and status. It was proposed that the reallocation be effective within thirty (30) days of the Columbus City School Board's adoption of the reallocation recommendation. Civil Service Commission staff was asked to review the Warehouse Services Supervisor and Supervisor, Warehouse classifications. The Warehouse Services Supervisor classification was last revised in 1976, and has been vacant for a number of years. The Supervisor, Warehouse, was last substantially revised in 2007, and there is currently one incumbent in the class.

During the classification review discussions with the Director of Purchasing, he indicated that both classifications would not be necessary for the current operations. It was decided that the Warehouse Services Supervisor specification would be revised to update the inventory management and control portions and include supervisory responsibilities currently covered in the other class.

When the current incumbent in the Supervisor, Warehouse classification, was hired nine years ago, he was given full responsibility for all warehouse operations and supervision. He has been responsible for implementing the computerized tracking and reporting systems, supervising and training employees, coordination of the auctions of surplus materials, and assisting in budget review and preparation. It was agreed that the Supervisor does and continues to perform the duties and responsibilities assigned to the Warehouse Services Supervisor classification. Therefore, it was recommended that a personnel action to reallocate the Supervisor, Warehouse position to the Warehouse Services Supervisor classification would be the most appropriate action.

It was further requested that the employee occupying this position retain his classification seniority and status upon reallocation. It would be redundant to require the employee to serve a new probationary period, as it has already been served. The work assigned and performed by the employee will remain the same. It was requested that the designated position be reallocated to the classification Warehouse Services Supervisor, and that the affected employee retain his classification seniority and status.

Employee	Position Number	Current Classification	Proposed Classification
Donald Jackson	571095501	Supervisor, Warehouse	Warehouse Services Supervisor

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Commission President Grady Pettigrew speaks.

On behalf of the Commission, Commission President Pettigrew wished Don White, Personnel Administrative Manager, and Barb Crawford, Personnel Analyst II, congratulations on their retirement.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create the specification for the classification Equal Employment Resources Manager, assign the probationary period to be 365 days, designate the examination type to be noncompetitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly.

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Manager

Tammy Rollins presented this request to create the specification for the classification Equal Employment Resources Manager, assign the probationary period to be 365 days, and designate the examination type to be noncompetitive based upon a request from the Department of Human Resources. This specification is modeled closely after a previous classification titled Equal Employment Manager that was coded 0347. However, in October 2016, this classification was revised and retitled to read Employment Compliance Manager. As part of those revisions at that time, the classification was broadened to incorporate a responsibility for ensuring compliance to all employment related laws. It was only later learned after Commission approval that the City Attorney's Office had great objections to those revisions. Therefore, based on this fact, the Department of Human Resources requested the creation of a new classification to be titled Equal Employment Resources Manager. This classification will keep its primary focus and scope of responsibility to that of managing equal employment laws. However, it will assist in the compliance of all State and Federal laws governing human resources practices. It is staff's understanding that the City Attorney's Office is in agreement with this specification. It is also staff's intention to propose that Job Code 0347 be abolished at the next public meeting.

The definition section reads, "Under direction, is responsible for managing, coordinating, and administering the City's equal employment policies and programs to assist with compliance to Federal, State, and local laws governing human resources related activities for the City of Columbus; performs related duties as required."

Some examples in the examples of work section include, "Implements policies and procedures as they relate to the prohibition of all forms of discrimination, harassment, and retaliation; Assists departments with discrimination, harassment, and retaliation complaint investigations; reviews and tracks the investigative findings; investigates highly complex or sensitive cases; Reviews current human resources policies, procedures, and practices from a Citywide and departmental perspective to assist with compliance to all State and Federal laws and regulations;" and "Keeps abreast of changes in laws, regulations, and guidelines governing human resources; tracks new laws/regulatory changes, assesses impact to the City, communicates changes with all relevant parties, and ensures adherence to new/updated laws and regulations."

The minimum qualifications section allows for two paths to be deemed qualified. The first path requires the more typical bachelor's degree and five (5) years of professional human resources experience. There are substitutions that would allow a master's degree to substitute for one (1) year and a law degree to substitute for two (2) years. The

second path allows for a licensed attorney who has specifically practiced employment law for two (2) years to also qualify.

The knowledge, skills, and abilities section reads, "Thorough knowledge of current Federal and State anti-discrimination laws (e.g. Title VII, Americans With Disabilities Act, Age Discrimination in Employment Act, ORC Chapter 4112 and other anti-discrimination related laws); thorough knowledge of Federal and State laws governing human resources activities (e.g. Fair Labor Standards Act, Family and Medical Leave Act, Workers Compensation and other employment related laws); considerable knowledge of procedural requirements for filing charges and complaints with the Ohio Civil Rights Commission; ability to write and speak effectively; ability to interpret statistical data; ability to communicate effectively with persons of diverse backgrounds; ability to establish and maintain effective working relationships; ability to conduct fact-finding investigations; ability to prepare and interpret data and reports; ability to analyze data, define problems, establish facts, draw valid conclusions, and resolve problems; ability to prepare technical, statistical, narrative, and comprehensive reports."

The probationary period was set to 365 days, and the examination type was designated as noncompetitive.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the Job Code for the Data Reporting Specialist classification from Job Code 5810 to Job Code 5811.

PRESENT: Mike Eccard, Deputy Executive Director of Civil Service

Mike Eccard presented this request, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the Job Code for the Data Reporting Specialist classification from Job Code 5810 to Job Code 5811. As a result of Class Plan maintenance activities undertaken by Columbus City School's human resources staff, it was discovered that recently assigned Job Code 5810, per Commission action on June 27, 2016 for the Data Reporting Specialist classification, was already used in the District's MUNIS human resources system for an abolished job classification. As such, staff requested that the Job Code for this class be revised to Job Code 5811 and records be updated as deemed necessary.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

Re: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the Job Code for the Data Communications Technician I classification from Job Code 6752 to Job Code 6756.

PRESENT: Mike Eccard, Deputy Executive Director of Civil Service

Mike Eccard presented this request, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the Job Code for the Data Communications Technician I classification from Job Code 6752 to Job Code 6756. As a result of Class Plan maintenance activities undertaken by Columbus City School's human resources staff, it was discovered that recently assigned Job Code 6752, per Commission action on June 27, 2016 for the Data Communications Technician I classification, was already used in the District's MUNIS human resources

system for an abolished job classification. As such, staff requested that the Job Code for this class be revised to Job Code 6756 and records be updated as deemed necessary.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

Re: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification EMS Instructor I (Job Code 1626).

PRESENT: Suzy Ulry, Personnel Analyst II

Suzy Ulry presented this request to revise the specification for the classification EMS Instructor I as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in February 2012. There are currently two full-time employees and five part-time employees serving in this classification located in the Department of Public Safety, within the Fire Division. Based upon questionnaire responses from incumbents, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representatives, some revisions were proposed.

There were no revisions to the definition section. The examples of work section was revised by adding one statement which reads, "Provides one-on-one tutoring, mentoring, and coaching for students." The minimum qualifications section now reads, "Possession of a valid State of Ohio EMS Instructor Certificate. (Substitution: Possession of a valid Continuing Education Instructor certificate issued by the State of Ohio Emergency Medical Services.) Possession of a valid State of Ohio certification/licensure as a Paramedic, Registered Nurse, or Physician Assistant. (Substitution: Possession of a National Registry of Emergency Medical Technicians - Paramedic Certification may be substituted for the State of Ohio Paramedic Certificate.)

Upon completion of the probationary period, appointees must possess the following: Valid State of Ohio EMS Instructor Certificate AND valid State of Ohio certification/licensure as a Paramedic, Registered Nurse, or Physician Assistant; valid American Heart Association (or nationally accredited equivalent) Instructor Certificate in Basic Cardiac Life Support (BCLS), Advanced Cardiac Life Support (ACLS), and Pediatric Advanced Life Support (PALS)."

Revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section includes the rewording on one statement to read, "ability to operate a computer and utilize related software;" and two added statements which read, "ability to conduct varied learning environments including classroom lectures, demonstrations, and hands-on practices;" and "ability to conduct self-reflective activities to facilitate improved student practice." There were no revisions to the examination type or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification EMS Instructor II (Job Code 1627).

PRESENT: Suzy Ulry, Personnel Analyst II

Suzy Ulry presented this request to revise the specification for the classification EMS Instructor II as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in February 2012. There are currently two full-time employees serving in this classification located in the Department of Public Safety, within the Fire Division. Based upon questionnaire responses from incumbents, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representatives, some revisions were proposed.

There were no revisions to the definition section. The examples of work section was revised by adding one statement which reads, "Provides one-on-one tutoring, mentoring, and coaching for students." The minimum qualifications section was revised to read, "Two (2) years of experience as an EMS Instructor I with the City of Columbus or comparable experience. Possession of a valid State of Ohio EMS Instructor Certificate. Possession of a valid State of Ohio certification/licensure as a Paramedic, Registered Nurse, or Physician Assistant. Upon completion of the probationary period, appointees must possess the following: valid American Heart Association (or nationally accredited equivalent) Instructor Certificate in Basic Cardiac Life Support (BCLS), Advanced Cardiac Life Support (ACLS), and Pediatric Advanced Life Support (PALS)."

Revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section includes the rewording on one statement to read, "ability to operate a personal computer and utilize related software;" and two added statements which read, "ability to develop and conduct varied learning environments including classroom lectures, demonstrations, and hands-on practices;" and "ability to develop and conduct self-reflective activities to facilitate improved student practice." There were no revisions to the examination type or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification EMS Education Manager (Job Code 1629).

PRESENT: Suzy Ulry, Personnel Analyst II

Suzy Ulry presented this request to revise the specification for the classification EMS Education Manager as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was created in September 2012. There is currently one employee serving in this classification located in the Department of Public Safety, within the Fire Division. EMS Education Manager was reviewed concurrently with the EMS Instructor I and EMS Instructor II classifications. Based upon a response from the incumbent questionnaire, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representative, some minor revisions were proposed.

There were no revisions to the definition section. The minimum qualifications section was revised to read, "Possession of a bachelor's degree AND four (4) years of experience teaching emergency medical services curriculum at the paramedic level in an accredited training facility AND one (1) year of field experience in the delivery of out-of hospital emergency care at the paramedic level. Possession of a valid State of Ohio certification/licensure as a Paramedic or Registered Nurse. Possession of a valid State of Ohio EMS Instructor Certificate. Possession of valid American Heart Association (or nationally accredited equivalent) Instructor Certificate in Basic Cardiac Life Support (BCLS), Advanced Cardiac Life Support (ACLS), and Pediatric Advanced Life Support (PALS)."

Revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section includes the rewording on one statement to read, "ability to operate a personal computer and utilize related software;" and one added statement which reads, "ability to evaluate the development and delivery of educational programming." There were no revisions to the examples of work section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Office Manager to designate the examination type as noncompetitive (with qualifying examination), and to re-establish any active competitive eligible list as a qualifying noncompetitive list for the class (Job Code 1240).

PRESENT: Suzy Ulry, Personnel Analyst II

Suzy Ulry presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Office Manager to designate the examination type as noncompetitive (with qualifying examination) and to re-establish any active competitive eligible list as a qualifying noncompetitive list for the class. Designating this classification's examination type as noncompetitive (with qualifying examination) still utilizes the current examination; however, it will be administered on a pass/fail basis. All candidates who pass the examination will be included on the eligible list. This results in a larger pool of eligible candidates, and affords the departments greater flexibility to select a qualified candidate with the necessary knowledge base. Individuals that are included on the eligible list will in turn afford greater opportunities for appointment, as they will be eligible for consideration for any Office Manager position to be filled.

There were no revisions to the definition section, the examples of work section, the minimum qualifications section, the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Personnel Actions for the Civil Service Commission.

No Personnel Actions for the Civil Service Commission were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Residency Hearing Reviews.

No Residency Hearing Reviews were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Background Removals - Post-Exam.

	Name of Applicant	Position Applied For	BAR #
1.	Brianna Stevenson	Police Officer	16-BR-046
2.	John Faherty	Police Officer	16-BR-047
3.	Brandon Woodford	Police Officer	17-BR-001
4.	Katherine Van Order	Police Officer	17-BR-003

After reviewing the files of Brianna Stevenson, John Faherty, and Brandon Woodford, the Commissioners decided their names would be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

After reviewing the file of Katherine Van Order, the Commissioners decided her name would not be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

* * *

RE: Other Administrative/Jurisdictional Reviews:

Review of the appeal of Tiffany Fields-Williams, regarding her denied Request for Review for the position of Management Analyst II.

This appeal was deferred to February 2017's agenda pending the submission of further information.

* * *

Review of the appeal of Alvin Butler, regarding his concerns about the performance test for Refuse Collection Vehicle Operator (RCVO) and his denied Request for Review with the City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0015.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Alvin Butler on December 15, 2016 regarding his concerns about the performance test he took for Refuse Collection Vehicle Operator (RCVO) and his denied Request for Review with the City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Butler stated that he did not have enough time to review the map and did not know he could ask for more time. Mr. Butler stated that he felt like he wasn't given enough information during the test. He also asked that the Commission review his Request for Review and the Director's response.

Mr. Butler was informed that he is always allowed to ask questions during an exam and that he would need to speak up if he didn't have time to read the instructions by the time his name is called. However, Mr. Butler was one of the first test candidates to arrive; therefore the check-in monitor verified that he had at least 15 minutes to review the page of instructions and the map. With regards to the information given to candidates, the monitors were instructed during their training on what they were allowed to say. Their instructions included not giving more details about the pre-trip inspection or instructions for each event. Riding monitors are only allowed to direct candidates to the next event. Mr. Butler's Request for Review was reviewed by Commission staff and his score sheets and test scores for each component were reviewed as well. There was also a discussion with the employees who worked as monitors at the test with regards to Mr. Butler's Request for Review.

In addition, all of the information listed above was reviewed again with respect to Mr. Butler's appeal. The Commission determined that Mr. Butler's exam was properly administered. Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to dismiss Mr. Butler's appeal without a hearing pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1).

* * *

Review of the appeal of Charles Ervin, regarding the Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II exam and his denied Request for Review with the City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0016.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Charles Ervin on December 29, 2017 regarding the Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II exam and his denied Request for Review with the City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Ervin stated that he was unable to read the map and expressed concerns with the software portion of the exam. Mr. Ervin was informed that he was permitted to ask for a different map if it was not legible, and a staff member would have provided a different map. Mr. Ervin was also informed that the software program for the computer exams on Microsoft Word and Microsoft Excel allows a candidate five attempts to respond correctly to the questions. In addition, the program allows a candidate to skip questions and gives the opportunity for the candidate to go back and answer those questions as long as there is time remaining for that particular exam.

Mr. Ervin was informed that a Commission staff member reviewed all of his test scores, including the computerized portion of the exam with respect to his Request for

Review, and it was determined that he left a number of questions unanswered on the Microsoft Word and Microsoft Excel tests. After a review of Mr. Ervin's appeal, it was determined that his final score on this exam stands.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to dismiss Mr. Ervin's appeal without a hearing pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1).

* * *

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 1:19 p.m.

* * *

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

Date