

## ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday July 18, 2017  
6:05 p.m.

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

**Commissioners Present:** David Cooke, Shannon Fergus, Ben Goodman, Rex Hagerling, Kiley Maas, Jason Sudy.

**Commissioners Absent:** Todd Boyer.

**HPO Staff Present:** James Goodman.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:11pm.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, August 8, 2017 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Tuesday, August 15, 2017.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, June 20, 2017. MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 17-7-11

**864 N. High St.**

**Danite Sign Co. (Applicant)**

**LPJM Family, LLP. (Owner)**

Approve application #17-7-11, 864 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

Staff Recommended Application

- Install new 9' x 2<sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub>' (24.75sqft) wall sign per submitted drawing.
- All connections to be installed into mortar joints only.
- No illumination is approved for the sign.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (6-0-0) APPROVED.

2. 17-7-12

**75 E. Russell St.**

**GRAD Architects (Applicant)**

**Connie Klema (Owner)**

Approve application #17-7-12, 75 E. Russell St., as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Construction of the final townhome on Lot 1 (75 E. Russell St.) of three townhomes of previously reviewed infill project. Lot 2 (77 E. Russell St.) and Lot 3 (79 E. Russell St.) have been constructed.
- The original design has been modified by an approximately 4-ft (+/-) expansion to the south (*on the upper floors only*) to accommodate an elevator. No other changes have been made.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) APPROVED.



**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**3. 17-7-13**

**295-301 E. Fifth Ave.**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)      301 Fifth, LLC. (Owner)**

Recommend approval of variance application #17-7-13, 295-301 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 3332.05(4): Area district lot width requirements: For lots A, B, C, D to reduce the required lot width from 50' to 32'.
- 3332.15 R-4: Area district requirements: To reduce the minimum lot area from 5000 sf to 2408.6 sf for Lot A AND C 3134.7 sf for Lot C, D
- 3332.19: Fronting Lots A and C to allow a single family home to not front a public street
- 3312.13 - This driveway variance is required for Lots A, B, C, and D because there is no driveway on this property or the drive way is on the adjacent lots and an easement will be required to allow this property to utilize the drive.
- 3312.25: Maneuvering: For lots A, B,C, and D because maneuvering is required on the adjacent parcel.
- 3332.28: Building line: To allow for a 8'-0 7/8" building setback which is existing for Lot D and 5'-4 7/8" building setback for Lot B and 5'-11" setback for lots A and C in lieu of setback of 10'.

MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (6-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL.

**4. 17-7-14**

**1146 N. Fourth St.**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)      Andrew Loinske (Owner)**

Continue application #17-7-14, 1146 N. Fourth St., to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

- Rehabilitation of existing C4 building into new Lebanese restaurant.
- Repair all gutters and eaves as needed to match existing.
- Install new handicap ramp.
- Install new handrails and railings.
- Install new patio and parking lot (*no variances are required*).
- All landscaping, signage, and light to return for review at a future IVC meeting.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners asked if the applicant could rework the parking lot and include an island.
- A site solution could involve a terrace concept with retaining walls.
- Metal railings could be okay, but the challenge is the overall amount of railings associated with the ramping and stairs. Railing design details should be developed for review and discussion.
- Horizontal railings could be used on the porch to break up the scale.
- The patio could be walled-in and utilize a seat wall to help separate the patio from the nearby traffic.

**5. 17-7-15**

**900 N. High St.**

**Design & Engineering, Inc. (Applicant)      Elford Development (Owner)**

Continue application #17-7-15, 900 N. High St., to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

- Relocate entry from High St. elevation to corner of High St. and First Ave.
- Install new 145-sqft patio on First Ave. sidewalk.
- Add metal channel details along top edge of storefront; to be painted "Babalú Orange".
- Metal channel details over entry and patio to include accent lighting.
- Installation of new blade sign over entry depicting "Babalú Tacos & Tapas".
- Installation of planters and along High St. façade.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Cooke – Is against the planters on High Street, but maybe they would work on First Ave. The blade sign is not appropriate.
- Commissioner Fergus – Supports the planters and benches, but the benches will need dividers to prevent sleeping. The archway should have a graphic or art, not a list of services.
- Commissioner Goodman – The building design is beginning to become over-branded. There are too many “bands” in the current design. The signage would be better included on the awnings. Elevations should be submitted for review at a ½” to 1-ft scale.
- Commissioner Hagerling – The planters/benches seem to be okay. The “tapas & tacos” would be better placed below the blade sign than moved to the wall.
- Commissioner Maas – The blade sign seems too small now, perhaps a “v” design or integration with the awnings would be better. The “tapas & tacos” text should be integrated with the main sign. The faux entrance breaks up the High St. façade. The design now features perhaps too much “orange” detailing.

**6. 17-7-16**

**875 N. Fourth St.**

**Shremshock Architects (Applicant)**

**Lykens Companies (Owner)**

Approve application #17-7-16a, 875 N. Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Demolish existing Spring Cleaners building.
- The building is to be photo documented prior to any demolition; photos to be supplied to HPO for property file.
- The demolition of the building is approved due to the building being non-contributing, non-historic building.

MOTION: Goodman/Maas (3-0-3) APPROVED. [Sudy, Fergus, Cooke]

Approve application #17-7-16b, 875 N. Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new 3-story mixed-use building with ground floor commercial space, structured parking, and 27 living-units.
- Elevations are to be submitted for review at a ½” to 1-ft scale.
- The applicant is encouraged to work with the neighboring property owners and the City of Columbus Refuse on the existing trash & recycling collection point and future collection location.
- All signage, lighting, and landscaping are to return for review at a future IVC hearing.

MOTION: Goodman/Maas (3-0-3) APPROVED. [Sudy, Fergus, Cooke]

**7. 17-7-17**

**295 E. Fourth Ave.**

**Gunzelman Architecture & Interiors (Applicant)**

**New Victorians (Owner)**

Continue application #17-7-17, 295 E. Fourth Ave., to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

- Construct fourteen (14) townhomes.
- Townhomes to be between 3-4 stories with attached garages and rooftop patios per submitted drawings.
- Final landscaping and lighting to be submitted for review and approval at a future IVC meeting.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Cooke – The previously reviewed design should be included for comparison. The black brick doesn’t agree with the neighboring church. Has some issues with the height. The awnings should be differentiated from each other in some way. The porches/stoops should provide some personal space, maybe by having railings.
- Commissioner Fergus – The design should reflect the church in some way. The proposed height is fine. Appreciates the mix of color; color would help with the expanse of metal siding. A porch area creating personal space for the residents will be important.

- Commissioner Maas – The concept of added railings and creating “personal” space for residents will be important. Perhaps gates should be considered to enclose the porches/stoops. The corrugated metal should probably be a darker color.
- Commissioner Hagerling – The previously reviewed design are needed for comparison. Agrees with other commissioners.
- Commissioner Goodman – Is supportive of the design, the windows ratio to mass is very good. Canopy details will be important. The stoop concrete should be something more than “brushed”, perhaps stained, but something different. A streetscape should be included showing the new development within the existing context. The current materials and colors are good.
- Commissioner Sudy – Has concerns with the private drive design; the throats needs to be narrowed to their minimum width. No garage door should be visible. Trash collection details need to be worked out and shown. Permeable pavement materials will be needed.

**8. 17-7-18**

**1112 N. High St.**

**John Ingwersen (Applicant)**

**Giannopoulos Properties (Owner)**

Continue application #17-7-18a, 1112 N. High St., to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

Exterior Alterations

- Convert current vacant retail use to assembly/bar/food hall with four (4) individual kitchens serving a common dining/bar area.
- Refurbish existing façade: remove awnings and inappropriate storefront system. Reopen transom windows, install new canopy, install new storefront system including operable nan-walls.
- Install new signage.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Recommend approval of application #17-7-18b, 1112 N. High St., as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 3312.49: Minimum Numbers of Parking Spaces Required - This Section requires a total of 56 additional parking spaces for the change of use of 6,035 +/- SF of existing building area from retail to restaurant use. Applicant proposes 0 on-site parking spaces and a variance to reduce the remainder of required parking from 56 to 0 spaces.
- 3312.49: Minimum Numbers of Parking Spaces Required - This Section requires a total of 4 bicycle parking spaces. Applicant proposes 0 on-site bicycle parking spaces and a variance to reduce the required number of bicycle parking spaces from 4 to 0 spaces.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (4-2-0) RECOMMENDED. [Hagerling, Goodman]

Conceptual Review

- Discussion of Phase II development of rooftop deck/enclosure.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners indicated serious concerns with the proposed size, scale, and concept of a second floor dining area/patio; no commissioners stated support for the concept.
- The patio as shown would not be appropriate, would be an issue for the adjoining residential units, and based on the supplied floorplans would bring the total of occupant to approximately 329 people in a very small space.

**CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

**9. 17-7-19**

**1100 N. High St.**

**John Ingwersen (Applicant)**

**Giannopoulos Properties (Owner)**

Conceptual Review

- Review of further detail regarding the proposed plaza/beer garden design, including: paving and paving patterns, site configuration, tree well and drainage and pergola design.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners indicated support for the revised beer garden designs, and stated that it had made great strides in its design development.
- Controlling the stone on site will be important.
- A fence matching the gate design should be added behind/on the inside of the shrub area.
- The up-lighting and the pergola design are good.

**STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS**

• **17-7-1**

**79 E. First Ave.**

**Michael Zoller (Owner)**

Approve Application 17-7-1, 79 E. First Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence to match existing and per submitted paint chips. Note: pink color to be replaced with Valspar “Evening Eclipse” (4007-3C).
- Remove existing concrete pavers and railroad tie path to front door; install new Indiana Limestone steps and flagstone stepper per submitted specifications.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **17-7-2**

**1070 Mt. Pleasant Ave.**

**Andrew & Janise Turso (Owners)**

Approve Application 17-7-2, 1070 Mt. Pleasant Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair stucco as needed to match existing.
- Paint residence: Body to be Behr “Silver Bullet” (N520-2), trim and siding to be Behr “Cool Ashes” (N520-4), front door to be Behr “Carbon” (N520-7), and accent to be Behr “Ultra Pure White” (PPU18-06).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **17-7-3**

**673 Kerr St.**

**Andrew Lehman & Daniel Mercer (Owners)**

Approve Application 17-7-3, 673 Kerr St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repaint rear of house as needed to match existing color scheme.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **17-7-4**

**162 E. Second Ave.**

**K.D. Yoder & Associates (Applicant)**

**Christine Brown (Owner)**

Approve Application 17-7-4, 162 E. Second Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated wood windows on the side and front elevation; six (6) total per submitted specifications.
- New units to be Marvin all-wood, interior/exterior double-hung windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings.
- Repair/replace any/all deteriorated trim to as needed to match existing.
- All finished work to be painted to match existing.

Replace Deteriorated Windows

- Replace six (6) deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows per City Staff determination.
- Install new, 1-OVER-1, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

- **17-7-5**

**988 N. High St.**

**Maren Roth (Applicant)**

**Wood Companies (Owner)**

Approve Application 17-7-5, 988 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new 32"x 32" hanging sign on existing bracket per submitted drawings and specifications.

- **17-7-6**

**150 Punta Aly.**

**Richard Lincoln (Owner)**

Approve Application 17-7-6, 150 Punta Aly., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence: Body to be Sherwin Williams “Rococco Violet” (HGSW2402), trim to be Sherwin Williams “Fundamental White” (HGSW4001), and fishscale and doors to be Sherwin Williams “Emminent Purple” (HGSW2421).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **17-7-7**

**280 E. Fourth Ave.**

**Blue Chip Homes, LLC (Owner)**

Approve Application 17-7-7, 280 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated wood siding.
- Install new wood siding in the same size and profile (#116) to match existing.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

- **17-7-8**

**1094 Say Ave.**

**Nelson Novak (Owner)**

Approve Application 17-7-8, 1094 Say Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence: Body to be Sherwin Williams “Chelsea Gray” (SW2850), trim to be Sherwin Williams “Westchester Gray” (SW2849), and doors to be Sherwin Williams “Decorous Amber” (SW0007 ).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.

- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **17-7-9**

**162 E. Fourth Ave.**

**Lindsay Barrie (Owner)**

Approve Application 17-7-8, 1094 Say Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair/replace any all deteriorated wood siding as needed to match existing.
- Paint residence: Body to be Sherwin Williams “Slate Tile” (SW7624), and trim to be Sherwin Williams “Favorite Tan” (SW2849).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **17-7-10 [Sudy Abstained]**

**933 Hamlet St.**

**Jason Kentner (Applicant)                      St. Joseph Montessori School (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-7-10, 933 Hamlet St., for renewal of expired COA #15-6-11 (Expired: June 16, 2016), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

*Approve Application #15-6-22, 933 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.*

Install Playground Equipment

- *Install new zip lines, monkey bars, balance beams, climbing walls, and slides, per the submitted site plan and photo renderings.*
- *Install three swing sets I pea-gravel area.*

Install New Running Track

- *Install a new running track, per the submitted site plan.*

Install Multi-Sport Field and Multi-Game Court

- *Install new sport field and game court within the perimeter running track.*

*MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-2) APPROVED. [Sudy, Sutton]*

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) APPROVED.

**VIII. OLD BUSINESS**

**IX. NEW BUSINESS**

**X. ADJOURNMENT**– Goodman/Maas (6-0-0) ADJOURNED. 9:00 pm.