

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday August 15, 2017
6:05 p.m.

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke (excused 7:44pm), Shannon Fergus, Kiley Maas (6:10pm), Jason Sudy.

Commissioners Absent: Ben Goodman, Rex Hagerling.

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:03pm.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, September 12, 2017 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, September 19, 2017.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, July 18, 2017. MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

5. 17-8-13

279 E. Fifth Ave.

Bogden Architects, Inc. (Applicant)

FK IV, LP, (Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

2. 17-7-15

900 N. High St.

Design & Engineering, Inc. (Applicant)

Elford Development (Owner)

Approve application #17-7-15, 900 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Relocate entry from High St. elevation to corner of High St. and First Ave.
- Install new 145-sqft patio on First Ave. sidewalk.
- Add metal channel details along top edge of storefront; to be painted “Babalu Orange”.
- Metal channel details over entry and patio to include accent lighting.
- Installation of new sign over entry depicting “Babalu Tacos & Tapas”.
- Installation of planters and benches along High St. façade.
- The number of dividers on the benches is to be reduced.
- The canopy over the High St. operable windows (*former entrance location*) is to be removed.
- The planters are to be changed to a square design.
- Revised designs to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of a certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED.



NEW APPLICATIONS

1. 17-8-10

38 E. Lincoln St.

Crabbe, Brown & James, LLP (Applicant)

Wood G P, Ltd. (Owner)

Recommend approval of application # 17-8-10, 38 E Lincoln St., as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 3356.11(A): C-4 district setback lines - which section states that the district setback line shall be no less than 25 feet. Applicant requests a variance to reduce the required district setback line from 25 feet to 1 foot along North Pearl Street, Bollinger Place, and East Lincoln Street.
- 3309.14: Height - The Site is currently designated with a 35-foot height district. Applicant requests a variance to increase the building height to a maximum of 54 feet, excluding mechanicals, elevator shafts, and parapets.
- 3321.05(A): Vision Clearance - which section requires two ten-foot, right-angle triangles formed by the intersection of a driveway pavement edge and street right-of-way line. Applicant requests a variance to reduce the clear vision triangles to zero feet.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL.

3. 17-8-11

1083 Say Ave.

Michael Heston (Owner)

Approve application #17-8-11, 1083 Say Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove existing silver maple located in rear yard, and plant new tree.
- Construct new 20' x 20' 2-car garage per submitted plans and specifications.
- Garage to have: hardiplank siding with a 4" exposure, 1x4 cornerboards, 1x4 casings with 1x6 headers, two (2) gooseneck fixtures over the garage door, carriage lamp at man-door, 4 panel man-door, and double-door garage designed to look like 2 separate doors.
- The width of a double-garage door is approved in this location due to the width of the alley.
- Revised designs to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of a certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

4. 17-8-12

999 N. Fourth St.

Myers & Associates Architecture (Applicant)

Capitol Equities (Owner)

Approve application #17-8-12, 999 N. Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install new halo-lit signage per submitted rendering.
- Install two (2) new linear sconce light fixtures at entry.
- Install new vinyl window graphic on door.
- Install two new metal panels at each side of door and paint entry "Gray" with "White" text.

MOTION: Cooke/Maas (5-0-0) APPROVED.

6. 17-8-14

49 E. Third Ave.

Archall (Applicant)

49 E. Third, LLC. (Owner)

Approve application #17-8-14, 49 E. Third Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications

- Revise previously approved canopy design.
- Installation of exterior lighting.
- Remove existing landscaping and sidewalks.
- Create new patio space.
- Create new landscape buffer on west property line.
- The wall pack lights on the north wall are to be removed from the design.
- The evergreens are to be removed from the front.

- Stone sills and foundation to be painted a “stone” color.
 - Revised designs to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of a certificate.
- MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

7. 17-8-15

324 E. Second Ave.

Snyder Barker/Elford Development (Applicant)

Jana Holdings, LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing buildings located on the parcel.
- Construct two (2) new 6-unit townhome buildings.
- Construct a new 4-story, 178-unit apartment building with surface parking.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Fergus – The reuse of the two small historic buildings is very important. Indicated that reuse of the front of the larger building should also be considered.
- Commissioner Cooke – The current design is very far off. The shape and massing need work, and more character is needed in the design. The industrial elements of building and location need to be reflected in the designs. More character is needed with a connection to the industrial history of the area. A “green band” should be considered along Second Ave. A more north/south orientation should be utilized, and the two small historic buildings should be reused.
- Commissioner Maas – Agrees with the Commissioner Cooke’s comments. The site should be organized in a more north/south orientation following the pattern of the area. Perhaps the small historic buildings could serve another purpose on the site, such as pool houses.
- Commissioner Boyer – It is critical that the project reuse as much of the existing buildings as possible in the redevelopment of the site. The way that the boulevard follows the pattern of the neighborhood is good, but it should become a real boulevard that resolves itself and doesn’t just end. A north/south orientation to the site will be important.
- Commissioner Sudy – Agrees with Commissioner Boyer. Based on the conditions note during the site visit, is most concerned with the preservation and integration of the two smaller historic buildings. The historic block pattern of the neighborhood is important. The design of the single building is too massive; it may need to be broken down into smaller buildings. The internal grid should be more like actual streets. The Second Ave. corridor is important.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

• 17-8-1

870 N. High St.

Lesley Thomas (Applicant)

Craig Miller (Owner)

Approve Application 17-8-1, 870 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new 18”x 30” hanging sign on new bracket per submitted drawings and specifications.
- All connections to be in the mortar joints only, not in any face brick.

• 17-8-2

847 Hamlet St.

Gunzelman Architecture & Interiors (Applicant)

Mulberry Design Build (Owner)

Approve Application 17-8-2, 847 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing wood shingles and sheathing due to extensive water damage and mold.

- Install new sheathing and new wood shake to match existing to match in kind, like-for-like.
- All trim and window casings to be replaced to match existing.
- Paint color to remain "Iron Ore" (SW7069).

Replace Wood Siding

- Replace all wood shake siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood shake siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.

- **17-8-3**

146-148 E. Fourth Ave.

Robert Dorans (Owner)

Approve Application 17-8-3, 146-148 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **17-8-4**

1076 Mt. Pleasant Ave.

Luke Rakowsky, Luke Fleeman, & Grant Geiger (Owners)

Approve Application 17-8-4, 1076 Mt. Pleasant Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing mineral fiber siding and restore historic wood siding.
- Repair window casings as needed to match existing, and install new cornerboards.
- Paint siding; color to be Sherwin Williams "Storm Cloud" (SW6249), all trim and windows to be painted "White".
- Repair/replace porch as needed to match existing.
- Remove existing Evergreen, and plant new Red Oak.
- Remove chain-link fence from around property, and install new 6' wood privacy fence around rear yard per submitted siteplan.

Remove Non-Contributing Mineral Fiber Siding

- Remove the existing, non-original, non-contributing mineral fiber siding from house to expose the original wood siding.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Repair/replace any/all original, existing wood siding with any/all new wood siding to match the original wood siding profile and dimension exactly; like-for-like.
- Any/all repaired/replaced exterior trim elements (i. e. window & door trim, corner boards, eave soffit & fascia, crown moldings, etc.) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing,

original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the mineral fiber siding and any/all non-original trim repair patches.

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools.
- Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Repair Porch Flooring

- Remove all damaged and deteriorated flooring; pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing joists to insure structural integrity.
- Replace with new, tongue and groove, yellow pine, porch flooring of same dimensions as existing.
- Match existing flooring overhang. If applicable, match all damaged and deteriorated barge molding with new material of same dimension and profile.
- Blind nail with galvanized finish nails only.
- Prime new flooring on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with appropriate material prior to installation. After installation, topcoat entire porch floor with same porch floor enamel according to manufacturer's specifications for finish coat.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **17-8-5**

1156 Summit St.

John Chimielewski (Applicant)

Michael Essman (Owner)

Approve Application 17-8-5, 1156 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove two (2) deteriorated wood windows located on the second floor of the front elevation.
- Install two (2) new all-wood interior/exterior Pella window sized exactly to fit the existing opening per submitted specifications.
- Finished work to be painted to match existing color scheme.

Replace Deteriorated Window

- Replace two (2) deteriorated/non-original windows as per City Staff determination.
- Install new, 1-OVER-1, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

- **17-8-6**

780 N. High St.

Jeffery Parenteau (Applicant)

Silver Century Holdings

Approve Application 17-8-6, 780 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted

- Install new EPDM rubber membrane roof per submitted specifications.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.

- **17-8-7**

1088 North High St.

John Ingwersen (Applicant)

Giannopoulos Properties, Ltd. (Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-7, 1088 North High St., for renewal of expired COA #16-4-12 (Expired: April 19, 2017), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Approve Application 16-4-12, 1088 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Rebuild Brick Wall

- *Rebuild the existing, deteriorated and damaged brick wall along the north and south sides of the parking area.*
- *Design of existing wall to be modified, as follows: 1) Increase the height of the wall by 2-3 courses; 2) Remove all piers, including on High Street; 3) Include a consistent stone cap on the wall.*
- *New wall to be Belden Sandcast solid brick matching the color of the existing building and wall.*
- *Mortar to match existing mortar of building.*
- *Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.*

Note: Commissioner Cooke noted the following from the Short North Guidelines: Commercial Patios and Outdoor Dining – "Masonry walls or other permanent structures proposed to delineate outdoor spaces in public rights-of-way are not appropriate" (p.3.14).

Note: A wall at this location was approved in 1999. Rebuilding of the wall is being approved for the following reasons: 1) The parking lot and wall are existing conditions; 2) The building is set back from the street; 3) Removal of the wall would leave the base in place.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-1-0) APPROVED. [Cooke]

- **17-8-8**

40 E. Second Ave.

Lifetime Quality Roofing & Storm Restoration, LLC (Applicant)

Andre N. Thompson (Owner)

Approve Application 17-8-8, 40 E. Second Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted

- Remove existing asphalt shingle roof.
- Install new Owens Corning Supreme AR standard 3-tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be "Estate Gray".
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; to be painted either "Tinner's Red" or "Gray".

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.

- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **17-8-9**

680 Kerr St.

Connor Gregg (Owner)

Approve Application 17-8-9, 680 Kerr St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted

- Remove canvas awning.
- Paint porch, front door, and window flower boxes, color to be “Black”.
- Plant new shrubs along retaining wall.
- Paint existing wood privacy fence; color to be “Carbonized” (HGSW1481).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **17-8-13**

279 E. Fifth Ave.

Bogden Architects, Inc. (Applicant)

FK IV, LP, (Owner)

Approve Application 17-8-13a, 279 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted

Staff Recommended Application

- Replace existing ramp at rear entrance with new ADA compliant handicap ramp per submitted drawings.
- Improve existing stairway and landing on the north elevation of building per submitted drawings.

Recommend approval of application 17-8-13b, 279 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 3312.49: Parking – To reduce the number of parking spaces from 45 spaces to 24 Spaces.
- 3370.05: Permitted uses – to allow fitness center use within an L-M district, limited overlay permitted use district.
- 3363.01: M-manufacturing districts – to allow office use within M district.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS – Commissioners discussed changing the date of the October 2017 IVC meeting due to a conflict with the 2017 Heritage Ohio conference. The October hearing will now be held on October 10, 2017 beginning at 4pm in Conference Rm A of 50 W. Gay St.

X. ADJOURNMENT– Boyer/Fergus (4-0-0) ADJOURNED. 8:00 pm.