

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION REVISED AGENDA

Tuesday, November 21, 2017

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-7206, or email raisbell@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, December 12, 2017 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, December 19, 2017.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, October 10, 2017.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

1. **17-11-8**
1023 N. Sixth St.
Jennifer McGann (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
2. **17-11-9**
936 N. Fourth St.
Nick Gore – Goremade Pizza (Applicant) **Kevin Noesner (Owner)**
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

NEW APPLICATIONS

3. **17-11-10**
66 E. Fourth Ave.
Joe Huber (Applicant) **Carson Thrush (Owner)**
An application, siteplan, and drawings have been submitted.
 - Construct 1-story rear addition in location of former porch per submitted drawings.
 - Addition to have Hardie siding and Jeldwen wood windows.
4. **17-11-11**
751 N. Sixth St.
Robert S. Harris, II (Applicant) **Jeffrey New Day, LLC (Owner)**
An application, siteplan, and drawings have been submitted.
 - Material alteration to previously approved condominium building.
 - Brick has been changed from terra-cotta to “Gray” brick with white highlights.
 - Windows have been changed to “White”.



- Garage grills have been changed to gray garage doors.
- Top panels have been changed from Hardi-board to through-body color Nichiha fiber cement panels.

5. 17-11-12

51 E. Fourth Ave.

MM Developing, LLC (Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

6. 17-11-13

109 E. Warren St.

MM Developing, LLC (Owner)

An application, siteplan, and drawings have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Change previously approved rear elevation of new construction house to allow for single-story bump-out and covered rear porch per submitted drawings.

7. 17-11-14

1030-1032 N. Sixth St.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

169 Brandywine, LLC (Owner)

An application, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing single-story concrete block rear addition and related decks.
- Construct new two-story rear addition.
- Replace all existing replacement windows with new aluminum-clad windows.
- Replace existing front and side doors with new fiberglass doors.
- Replace existing front porch posts and railings.

8. 17-11-15

324 E. Second Ave.

Avenue Partners/Snyder Barker & Elford Development (Applicant)

Jana Holdings, LLC (Owner)

An application, siteplan, and drawings have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing buildings located on the parcel.
- Renovate and reconstruct the two (2) smaller east buildings.
- Extend north/south boulevard the full depth of the site.
- Construct two (2) new 3-story, garden buildings.
- Construct one (1) new 3-story, garden building.
- Construct a new 4-story, apartment building.
- Construct a new 4-story, apartment building.
- The total number of units is now 197-units.

The following is taken from the August 2017 Italian Village Commissioner meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Hagerling – *Is against the variance request at this point in the process. Following the project discussion, is encouraged by the architectural examples. The street grid is an important part of making the project work within the district.*

- Commissioner Sudy – *The siteplan is much improved and is a very good response to previous discussions. The reintroduced street grid is good. Grade changes on the site will need to be figured out as part of the design. The landscape architectural side will be important to the development. Pervious paving should be added as part of the design to address storm water.*
- Commissioner Mass – *Great improvements have been made with the design. The reuse of the two historic buildings and integrating salvaged industrial elements of the site will be important. Different pavement types should be considered. The caliper of trees may affect the setback.*
- Commissioner Boyers – *The 4-5 story benchmark is pretty typical within the city currently, advices that the team “look hard at different heights” to provide a more interesting mix of buildings on the site. The outdoor spaces make sense. With the multiple entrances for the various buildings, there are opportunities for some to have “significant entrances”.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

- **17-11-1**

1070 -1084 Mt. Pleasant Ave.

Lifetime Quality Roofing (Applicant)

B+A Realty, LTD, RLLP (Owner)

Approve Application 17-11-1, 1070 -1084 Mt. Pleasant Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated rubber roofing and existing tile parapet cap.
- Install new EPDM rubber membrane roofing per submitted specifications.
- Reinstall tile parapet cap to match existing.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the rear addition down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

- **17-11-2**

93 E. Lincoln St.

Sherrill & Charles Massey (Owners)

Approve Application 17-11-2, 93 E. Lincoln St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated overhead single-car garage door.
- Install new single-car overhead garage door per submitted cutsheet; door to be Haas Overhead model #2500 series, color to match exiting “Purdy House Grey”.

- **17-11-3**

68 E. Lincoln St.

Andrew Christensen (Applicant)

Julie Schultz (Owner)

Approve Application 17-11-3, 68 E. Lincoln St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace eleven (11) deteriorated windows on residence.

- Install new Marvin all-wood, interior/exterior, one-over-one double-hung windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings.

Replace Deteriorated Windows

- Replace eleven (11) deteriorated/non-original windows on house per City Staff determination.
- Install new, 1-OVER-1, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

Repair / Replace Exterior Casings & Sills

- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile as needed to match existing.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

- **17-11-4**

1077-1079 Mt. Pleasant Ave.

Seth Clarke (Owner)

Approve Application 17-11-4, 1077-1079 Mt. Pleasant Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace front porch wood tongue & groove porch floor on 1077 side as needed to match existing.
- Replace deteriorated windows on rear elevation to match existing. New units to be Lincoln all-wood, interior/exterior, one-over-one double-hung windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings.

Replace Deteriorated Windows

- Replace deteriorated/non-original windows on rear elevation per City Staff determination.
- Install new, 1-OVER-1, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

Repair / Replace Exterior Casings & Sills

- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile as needed to match existing.

Repair Porch Flooring

- Remove all damaged and deteriorated flooring; pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing joists to insure structural integrity.
- Replace with new, tongue and groove, yellow pine, porch flooring of same dimensions as existing.
- Match existing flooring overhang. If applicable, match all damaged and deteriorated barge molding with new material of same dimension and profile.
- Blind nail with galvanized finish nails only.
- Prime new flooring on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with appropriate material prior to installation. After installation, topcoat entire porch floor with same porch floor enamel according to manufacturer's specifications for finish coat.

- **17-11-5**

1057 Summit St.

Hakeem Shittu (Owner)

Approve Application 17-11-5, 1057 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair/replace wood siding on house and garage as needed to match existing.

- All new work to be painted Olympic Paints “Grey” with “White” trim.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer’s specifications.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **17-11-6**

285 E. Fourth Ave.

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

Approve Application #17-11-6, 285 E. Fourth Ave., for renewal of expired COA #16-4-27 (Expired: April 19, 2017), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Approve Application # 16-4-27, 285 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Convert Church to Residential Units

- *Convert the abandoned and fire damaged church into six (6) residential units, per the submitted drawings.*
- *Make exterior repairs to existing brick walls and stone foundation, as needed. Any new brick, stone, and mortar to match existing, like-for-like.*
- *Repair roof and install new asphalt shingles. Shingle from approved roofing shingle list to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.*
- *Repair or install new windows, following damage of original stained glass windows by fire. Detail for new, custom windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with Commissioner Hagerling.*
- *Install new exterior doors on front and rear elevations. Door cut sheets to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.*
- *Install new wood steps and railing on rear elevation, per the submitted drawing.*
- *Install new, metal fencing on east and west elevations. Cut sheet for fencing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.*

Carriage House

- *Construct new, frame, 7-car garage with second floor living space, per the submitted drawings.*
- *Exterior cladding to be HardiPlank siding with 5” exposure, with 1 x 4 trim.*
- *Roof shingles to be from the approved roofing shingles list.*
- *Cut sheets for windows and pedestrian an garage doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.*

- Revised drawings, including a canopy or awning above the west elevation door of the carriage house and the south elevation door of the church building, to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Hagerling (4-0-1[Sudy]) APPROVED.

- **17-11-7**

1069 N. Fourth St.

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Slimbuilds, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application #17-11-7, 1069 N. Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Porch railing installation per submitted drawings and following the expired approval (*COA#11-11-8, Expired: November 15, 2012*).
- Repaint all wood elements of house as needed to match existing.
- Replace existing concrete steps and sidewalks per submitted drawings.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

Remove Existing Concrete Steps and Install Concrete Steps

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete service steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimensions, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public and service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

- **17-11-8**

1023 N. Sixth St.

Jennifer McGann (Owner)

Recommend approval of application 17-11-18, 1023 N. Sixth St., as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- Rezone property from M-2, Manufacturing to R-4 Residential.
- 3332.25 - Maximum side yards required - The existing structures are located on the lot line. It would not be possible to meet this requirement without demolishing significant portions of the existing structures.

- 3332.26 - Minimum side yard permitted - The existing structures are located on the lot line. It would not be possible to meet this requirement without demolishing significant portions of the existing structures.
- 3332.27 - Rear yard - The existing structures are located on the lot line. It would not be possible to meet this requirement without demolishing significant portions of the existing structures.
- 3332.21- Building lines - The existing structures are located on the lot line and within 15' of the front line. It would not be possible to meet this requirement without demolishing significant portions of the existing structures.
- 3332.18 - Basis of computing area - (D) The existing structures comprise approximately 52% of the lot.
- 3321.05 - Vision Clearance - (B) (1) The applicant seeks a hardship variance from the required vision clearance triangle of 10ft. since the existing building encroaches into the vision clearance triangle on both corners. The building has been in place for over 50 years without issue.

- **17-11-9**

936 N. Fourth St.

Nick Gore – Goremade Pizza (Applicant) Kevin Noesner (Owner)

Approve Application 17-11-9, 936 N. Fourth St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new 6.5-ft diameter cast vinyl logo on south elevation wall per submitted drawings.

- **17-11-12**

51 E. Fourth Ave.

MM Developing, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 17-11-12, 51 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new paver patio in rear yard per submitted siteplan and specifications.
- Install new concrete walkway from rear entrance to garage.
- Change front entry door to solid 4-panel door.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS – Discussion: development of requirements for new construction (height from grade datum, survey, and alignment with adjacent structures).

XII. ADJOURNMENT