

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday January 16, 2018

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke (excused 9:15pm), Shannon Fergus, Ben Goodman, Jason Sudy.

Commissioners Absent: Kiley Christian, Rex Hagerling.

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:11pm.
- II. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, February 13, 2018 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- IV. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Tuesday, February 20, 2018.
- V. SWEAR IN STAFF
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, December 19, 2017. MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-1) APPROVED. [Cooke]
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM – Mindy Justis - High Street Streetscape Improvement project update.
- VIII. STAFF APPROVALS
- IX. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- X. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 18-1-2

86 Warren St.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Mike Holsinger (Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

2. 17-12-9

38 E. Lincoln St. (Corner of Lincoln and Pearl streets)

Schooley Caldwell & Associates (Applicant)

The Wood Company (Owner)

Approve application #17-12-9a, 38 E. Lincoln St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Fill in all the openings on the east elevation.
- The brick within the infilled openings is to be recessed approximately 2-inches from the plain of the wall.
- Final infill brick color to be submitted to architectural sub-committee for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve application #17-12-9b, 38 E. Lincoln St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Add half level of parking for 18-20 additional spaces.
- The addition steps back approximately 24-ft from the east side and is approximately 4-ft taller than the property fronting Lincoln St.
- An art location is to be added to the design.
- Final materials/screening of upper level not approved at this time.

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (3-2-0) APPROVED. [Cooke, Boyer]



3. **17-12-6**

188 E. Third Ave.

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Urban Restorations (Owner)

Continue application #17-12-6, 188 E. Third Ave., to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

- Construct new two-story single-family home per submitted drawings.

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners complemented the move of the garage to the rear of the lot.
- The windows on the west elevation of the house need to be enlarged, and it is recommended that the windows on the west elevation of the garage be changed to a ribbon/transom along the top of the wall.
- The large amount of hardiplank was discussed and metal was suggested as an alternative material.
- Commissioners also discussed changing the windows to remove the lintels and using a contrasting material for the chimney.

4. **17-12-8**

286 E. Fourth Ave. (Rear)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Esteban Salarriaga (Owner)

Approve application #17-12-8, 286 E. Fourth Ave. (Rear), as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new two-story single-family home per submitted drawings.
- Siteplan and variances have previously received approval.
- The parapet walls of the garage/roof terrace are to be flattened.
- Revised drawings including the widow specifications to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Boyer/ Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

5. **18-1-3**

249 E. Greenwood Ave., "House F"

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Hallmark Campus Property (Owner)

Approve application #18-1-3, 249 E. Greenwood Ave., "House F", as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Design for previously conceptually reviewed new build.
- Variances were approved in March 2017 and revised in December 2017.
- The current design moves the garage opening to Greenwood Ave. and incorporates an all brick design.
- A water-table of different material is to be added to the design.
- The glass panels are to be removed from the garage door, and the solid panel/industrial door is to be painted to match the brick.
- The sidewalk transition at the driveway is to be field verified by HPO Staff.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-1-0) APPROVED. [Goodman]

6. **18-1-4**

991 N. Fourth Ave.

Nayked Brands (Applicant)

Capital Equities (Owner)

Continue application #18-1-4, 991 N. Fourth Ave., to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

- Install new 23.52-sqft non-illuminated sign.
- Install new 9-inch letters on existing awning.
- Install new white vinyl graphics on door.

MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners indicated concerns with the die-cut vinyl letters, and the acrylic faced aluminum housing signage as being too suburban in design. It was also recommended to review the signage on the neighboring units.
- Asked how the “& Juice Co.” signage would be mounted to the building.
- Commissioners also indicated that the building wall next to the entry could be a location for signage.
- The slogan, “Norish. Heal. Cleanse.” will need to be removed from the signage installation. The Short North Design Guidelines state that signage message be limited to “business name, logo, function, and/or street number” (3.38). The slogan language could be applied on the glass storefront as interior window graphic, but would need to be resized.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

7. 18-1-5

839 Summit St.

Ben Goodman & Chris Zuelke (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 2-car concrete block stepped parapet roof garage.
- Variances will be required due to the “pie-shaped” lot.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners indicated that a double garage door could be utilized in the design due to the narrowness of the alley ROW.
- A concrete apron was recommended for durability; however, Commissioners were supportive of the other hardscape elements shown.
- A list of required variances for construction should be developed and submitted for recommendation.

8. 18-1-6

1100 Summit St.

MM Developing, LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 2-story two-unit multi-family home.
- Construct new 2-car garage.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- A drawing should be developed that shows the height datum of the new building with existing neighboring properties.
- The additional stacked parking spaces should be removed from the design. The driveway will need to utilize a brick paver system due to the amount of hardscaped area.
- Commissioners also discussed the possibility of turning the building on the site.

Recommend approval of variance application #18-1-6, 1100 Summit St., as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 3332.21(B) Front Setback: 25’ required, neighboring properties have average approximately 17’: reduce to 13’-6”.

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

9. 18-1-7

782 N. High St.

Architectural Alliance (Applicant) RGB, LLC. (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 1st floor rear addition.
- Construct new dedicated High Street entrance.
- Construct new 2nd floor for kitchen/restaurant/bar; including, a roof terrace with operable glass enclosure.
- Construct new 3rd floor for office use.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Expansions need to be secondary to the historic building and its design.
- The covered deck is a non-starter, and the current proposal is too big, and has too much program.
- The character of the building needs to be maintained per the Short North Design Guidelines and City Code 3116: 11 Standards for Alteration.

10. 18-1-8

324 E. Second Ave.

Avenue Partners/Snyder Barker & Elford Development (Applicant) Jana Holdings, LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing buildings located on the parcel.
- Renovate and reconstruct the two (2) smaller east buildings.
- Extend north/south boulevard the full depth of the site.
- Construct two (2) new 3-story, garden buildings.
- Construct one (1) new 3-story, garden building.
- Construct a new 4-story, apartment building.
- Construct a new 4-story, apartment building.
- The total number of units is now 197-units.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioners Comments

- Commissioner Fergus – The materials on building 4 would be better not painted the dark gray, its starting to look like one large mass, and some color somewhere on the building would help. Questions the position of the trash and the requirement for residents to roll their trash to the single location.
- Commissioner Sudy – The siteplan is very good and is a success. It is unfortunate that the width of the boulevard had to grow to 44-ft wide, but a being able to reconnect the historic street grid will be an asset in the future. Concern that these large building don't come off as "fake industrial". The project is on the right track. Art, mural(s), and "pops" of color would be welcome.
- Commissioner Boyer – No additional comments for buildings 1, 2, or 3. Some concern with buildings 4 & 5 and sameness. Is there something that changes the scale? There currently is a lot of metal siding, vertical and horizontal. The needs to be more elements to differentiate the buildings. Maybe leave building 4 the way that it is and do more with building 5, more connection to the neighboring buildings to the east. Go further with the cladding, perhaps exposed fasteners.

Recommend approval of variance application #18-1-8b, 324 E. Second Ave., as submitted:

- 3363.01 M- Manufacturing districts to permit 197 dwelling units.
- 3363.24 Building lines in an M-Manufacturing district to reduce the building setback from 25 to 2 feet 9 inches along Second Avenue.
- 3321.27 Parking setback line to reduce the parking setback from 25 to 10 feet along Second Avenue.

MOTION: Fergus/Boyers (4-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

- **18-1-1**

940-942 Hamlet St.

Greg Anglin & Mike Blue (Owners)

Approve Application 18-1-1, 940-942 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair /replace wood siding to match existing and per submitted specifications.
- Replace front doors with new wood half-light doors.
- Repair transoms as needed.
- Repair soffit as needed to match existing.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.

Install New Door

- Install new, solid core door in existing door jamb. New door to be either a four-panel or half-lite wood door.
- Set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides.
- Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

Repair Transom

- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing, contributing, transom per industry standards.
- Any/all necessary new wood to be of exact same profile and dimension as the existing transom casing, stiles, and rails; like-for-like.
- Remove any plywood transom inserts. If glass is broken or missing, clean any/all remaining debris from sash, install new glass, and finish of proper dimension. Topcoat paint color to be the same color as the door.
- Traditional transom address numerals are permitted upon receipt of details/specifications.
- Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

- **18-1-2**

86 Warren St.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Mike Holsinger (Owner)

Approve Application 18-1-1, 940-942 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Construct new 12'-6" x 24' single car garage per submitted drawings.
- A gooseneck light is to be added above the garage door, and a coach light is to be added to the entry door.
- Gutters and downspouts are to be added to the design.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/ Fergus (4-1-0) APPROVED. [Goodman]

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

- A) Short North Alliance - Streetscape Improvement Project: artwork installation on construction barriers within the public ROW. The proposal has been approved by the Columbus Art Commission.
- B) Adoption of Window Replacement Standards & Procedures & Window Staff Approval List

Motion to approve and adopt the Window Replacement Standards & Procedures & Window Staff Approval List:
MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT– Fergus/Boyer (4-0-0) ADJOURNED. 10:00 pm.