

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

Thursday, January 18, 2018

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room ‘B’

Commissioners Present: Charles Rowan, Erin Prosser, Joe McCabe, Clyde Henry Dan Morgan (arrived 6:22).

Commissioners Absent: Steward Gibboney, Abbie Stiers.

City Staff Present: Randy Black.

- I.** CALL TO ORDER—6:18 p. m.
- I.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Thursday, February 8, 2018 – 50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room ‘A’
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 pm, Thursday, February 15, 2018 – 50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room ‘B’
- II.** APPROVAL OF Thursday, December 21, 2017 MEETING MINUTES
 - Commissioner attendees correction to include Commissioner Rowan noted and revised.MOTION: Henry/Prosser (5-0-0) APPROVED
- III.** STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Henry/Prosser (5-0-0) ACCEPTED INTO THE PERMANENT RECORD
- IV.** PUBLIC FORUM

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff Recommendation Items #1 was converted to Staff Approval following the Business Meeting review and subsequent discussion with the Applicant. (See below)

- 1. 18-1-3— *Converted to Staff Approval***
904 E. Broad Street
Paul Unger (Applicant/Owner)

Bryden Road Historic District

NEW APPLICATION

2. 18-1-4

**684 Oakwood Avenue/aka Ethiopian Tewahedo Church
T-Mobile USA, Inc./Attn. Nate Meyer (Applicant)**

**Old Oaks Historic District
Bradford Lyman, Trustee (Owner)**

Following the discussion at the January 11th Business Meeting, a revised site plan and letter of support by the property owner were submitted for review at the Regular Meeting. Subsequent to the staff report by the Historic Preservation Officer and the presentation by the applicant, Nate Meyer, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Commissioner Morgan thanked the Applicant for implementing the requested revisions to the plan and for providing the written approval by the property owner prior to final review.

Approve Application #18-1-4, 684 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Install Mobile Communications Unit—North Elevation

- Remove all non-contributing, inappropriate chain link fence and dispose of any/all debris per City Code.
- Install six foot high (6' H), opaque stained, wooden, board-on-board, gated fence surrounding the new T-Mobile communications platform per submitted plans.
- Install six foot by four foot (6' x 4') T-Mobile communications platform per within the new wooden fenced area per submitted plans.
- Install T-Mobile antennas to the existing brick chimney per submitted plans.
- Install cable inside four inch (4") diameter conduit attached to the existing brick wall on the north elevation per submitted plans.
- Conduit to be attached in mortar joints only per industry standards so that the existing brick is not drilled into or damaged in any way. Should mortar repair be necessary in conjunction with the strap attachment, any/all necessary mortar repair to be of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings")
- Conduit to be painted to match the brick as closely as possible so as to 'disappear'.

MOTION: McCabe/Morgan (5-0-0) APPROVED

HOLDOVER

3. 17-10-8b1

761 Bedford Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Seven Hills Ventures/Attn.: Dominic Bianconi (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report and presentation by the Historic Preservation Officer, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

At the request of the Applicant/Owner, remove Application #17-10-8b, 761 Bedford Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, from further consideration at this time. Applicant/Owner is directed to submit a new application to the Historic Preservation Office staff for future review and approval of any/all rear yard parking pad or garage construction prior to beginning any work.

MOTION: Morgan/McCabe (5-0-0) APPLICATION REMOVED

STAFF APPROVALS

• 18-1-1

965 E. Broad Street

18th & East Broad Street Historic District

300 Plus, Inc./Attn.: Charles R. Sims (Applicant)

Bradford Lyman, Trustee (Owner)

Approve Application #18-1-1, 965 E. Broad Street, 18th & East Broad Street Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Spot Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4", moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.

- New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings”)

Stabilize Front Porch

- Install necessary support jacks/beams as necessary to stabilize the front porch structural integrity according to industry standards and any/all applicable City Building Codes in preparation for planned future, Phase II front porch restoration in accordance with the Historic Resources Commission Architectural Guidelines for Maintenance, Design, and New Construction.
- **Applicant to submit complete front porch restoration plans to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to beginning the Phase II front porch repairs.**

Repair Window

- Make any/all necessary repairs to the deteriorated wood window on the second floor, as necessary. Any/all replacement wood to match the historic wood dimensions, profiles, and finish color(s); like-for-like.

Replace Canvas Awning—Rear

- Remove and dispose of the deteriorated canvas awning on the rear, second floor stair landing and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the metal awning frame per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Install new canvas awning of same color and style as the original awning; like-for-like.

Repair Main Roof—East & South Elevations

- **Consult with a licensed slate roofing contractor to determine the condition of the existing, deteriorated slate on the south and east sections of the main roof and select the appropriate option indicated :**

Option (1) Repair the slate roof if repair is determined to be a viable option by the slate roofing contractor.

Or

Option (2) Replace the slate on the east and south elevations only if the slate is determined to be beyond its useful life by the slate roofing contractor and that determination has been submitted to the Historic Preservation Officer for final review and approval.

Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove the deteriorated, slate shingle roof complete down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing shingles. Manufacturer and color to be a ‘test case’ for consideration for inclusion on the Approved Shingles List:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	Stonegate Gray
GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	English Gray Slate Weathered Slate
Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	Nickel Gray
GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	Nickel Gray

Celotex (standard 3-tab) Heritage Gray
 Slate Gray

Owens Corning (standard 3-tab) Estate Gray

Tamko (standard 3-tab) Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs. Metal ridge roll to run the complete length of all roof ridges (i.e. flush with the eave/soffit fascia) and painted “Tinner's Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.

• **18-1-2**

716 Bedford Avenue

Cody Jokela (Applicant)

Old Oaks Historic District

Steven Mattson (Owner)

Approve Application #18-1-2, 716 Bedford Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove the deteriorated, asphalt shingle roof complete down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing shingles. Manufacturer and color to be a ‘test case’ for consideration for inclusion on the Approved Shingles List:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	Stonegate Gray
GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	English Gray Slate Weathered Slate
Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	Nickel Gray
GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	Nickel Gray
Celotex	(standard 3-tab)	Heritage Gray Slate Gray
Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	Estate Gray
Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs. Metal ridge roll to run the complete length of all roof ridges (i.e. flush with the eave/soffit fascia) and painted “Tinner's Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.

Repair Eaves, Soffits, and Gutters

- Remove all non-original, non-contributing aluminum wrap from all soffits, eaves, and fascia on all elevations and dispose of any/all debris per City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wooden soffits, fascia, and trim with new wood of appropriate dimensions and style per the Columbus Register of Historic Properties Architectural Guidelines and historic preservation rehabilitation standards.
- All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood eaves and soffits complete for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications. All finish colors to remain the same as currently existing.

Install New Gutters & Downspouts

- Install new, metal, ogee/k-style gutters of appropriate dimensions to assure proper run-off per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Install new, metal, corrugated downspouts of appropriate dimensions to assure proper run-off per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- New gutters and downspouts to match the existing trim color; like-for-like.

Staff Recommendation Item #1 was converted to Staff Approval following the Business Meeting presentation by the Historic Preservation officer. (See above)

• **18-1-3**

904 E. Broad Street

Bryden Road Historic District

Paul Unger (Applicant/Owner)

An Application with current photos and detailed site plan and new fence specifications has been submitted.

Install New Steel Fence—Front Yard

- Install new, steel fence in front yard per submitted rendering and site plan.
- New fence to be 'Crescent' style, 'black' steel; height of 3', 3 ½', or 4' as determined by the commission recommendation.

V. OLD BUSINESS

VI. NEW BUSINESS

- Adoption of Window Replacement Standards & Procedures & Window Staff Approval List

H. P. O. Staff Report

In an effort to determine possible alternatives to all-wood window units beginning in 2009, window test cases have been approved by the local commissions on a case-by-case basis as a method to assess the appropriateness of both the design and performance of other window materials.

The Historic Preservation Office staff, in conjunction with the five (5) City of Columbus architectural review commissions, began working on the analysis of window review procedures and standards in historic districts locally and in cities nationwide in 2015. To date each commission has approved test cases in their respective districts and the installations have been completed and reviewed.

Approved Window Lists have been prepared for All-Wood Windows and for Composite, Fiberglass, and Aluminum-Clad Wood Windows. Samples have been provided in the Historic Preservation Office and reviewed by the commissioners at their respective Business Meetings, Regular Meetings, and Chairs Meetings.

**Historic Preservation Office
 Approved Composite, Fiberglass and Aluminum-Clad Wood Window List**

MANUFACTURER	SERIES	Material
Fiber Frame	2100 Series (Awning)	Fiberglass Exterior & Interior
Pella	Impervia	Fiberglass Composite Exterior & Interior
Marvin	Integrity Wood Ultrex	Fiberglass Exterior/Wood Interior
Marvin	Infinity	Fiberglass Exterior & Interior
Andersen	400 Series	Vinyl-Clad Exterior/Wood Interior
Universal	700 Series	Aluminum Exterior & Interior
JeldWen	Siteline EX	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Marvin	Ultimate-Next Generation 2.0	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Kolbe	Ultra Series "Sterling"	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Trimline	Legends	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Kolbe	Ultra Series "Sterling"	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
*Weathershield	Premium Series	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
*Pella	Architect Series Reserve	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
*Quaker	Brighton LS Series	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior

***RECOMMENDED FOR INCLUSION**

1/16/18

*Upon final review, the Historic Preservation Office staff recommends the formal adoption of the **All-Wood Windows List** and the **Approved Composite, Fiberglass, and Aluminum-Clad Wood Windows List** (dated 1/16/18).*

Evaluation of existing window conditions will be conducted by the Historic Preservation Office staff in conjunction with the appropriate architectural review commission. The H. P. O. staff will issue the Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement as a Staff Approval upon receipt and review of the application and assessment of the window condition(s).

All staff approved window repair and/or replacement will appear on the regular commission meeting agenda as Staff Approved items for acceptance into the permanent record in accordance with established procedures and per City Code.

Following the staff report and presentation by the Historic Preservation Officer, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve and adopt the Window Replacement Standards & Procedures & Window Staff Approval List as presented:

MOTION: Henry/Morgan (5-0-0) APPROVED

VII. ADJOURN

MOTION: Henry/Morgan (6-0-0) ADJOURNED (6:58 P.M.)

