

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday February 20, 2018
4:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Shannon Fergus, Rex Hagerling.

Commissioners Absent: Kiley Christian, Ben Goodman, Jason Sudy.

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:04pm.
- II. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, March 13, 2018 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- IV. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Tuesday, March 20, 2018.
- V. SWEAR IN STAFF
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, January 16, 2018. MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (2-0-2) APPROVED.
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. STAFF APPROVALS
- IX. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- X. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 18-2-6
1110-1112 Summit St.
Brian Knoppe (Applicant)
Supra Investments, LLC & Tommie L., Jason M., and Cynthia L. Dowell (Owners)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
2. 18-2-7
930-940 N. High St.
Schooley Caldwell (Applicant) Brunner Building, LLC (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

3. 18-1-4
991 N. Fourth Ave.
Nayked Brands (Applicant) Capital Equities (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
4. 17-12-6
188 E. Third Ave.
Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant) Urban Restorations (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

NEW APPLICATIONS

5. 18-2-8
249 E. Fifth Ave.
Joe Valenti (Applicant) FK IV, LLC (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL



6. **18-2-9**

248 E. Fourth Ave. (“House A”)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Myers Property Solutions/New Victorians (Owner)

Approve application #18-2-9, 248 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new single-family home per submitted drawings.
- Variances were approved in March 2017 and revised in December 2017.
- The front porch railing is to be changed to metal or wood, and to have vertical balusters.
- The siding material on the dormers is to be horizontal fiber cement clapboard with a 4” exposure and traditional trim/casings.
- Final light fixtures to be submitted to HPO for review.
- Revised drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-0-0) APPROVED.

7. **18-2-10**

250 E. Fourth Ave. (“House B”)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Ashley Lester (Owner)

Approve application #18-2-10, 250 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new single-family home per submitted drawings.
- Variances were approved in March 2017 and revised in December 2017.
- The sidewalk and curb are to be continued and match the existing materials of the street.
- The front door is to be changed into a full-lite door without grilles.
- Final light fixtures to be submitted to HPO for review.
- Revised drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-0-0) APPROVED.

8. **18-2-11**

972-974 N. Fourth St.

Jarrold Share (Applicant)

Allison Adams (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 2-bedroom, 2.5 bath apartment above three (3) garages.
- Building has been designed to defer to the historic two-family home on the site.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Fergus – The flat roof design for the carriage house makes sense. The color of the building should stay within those of the main house.
- Commissioner Cooke – Not supportive of the flat roof. The current design seems too big. Encouraged the applicant to consider a pitched roof to help bring the scale down. The buildings across the street have a different vocabulary; there is a difference between row houses and carriage houses. The man doors should be pulled away from the end wall (at least 1-ft if not more). Is concerned with the scale of the patio.
- Commissioner Hagerling – Agrees with Commissioner Cooke. The third floor should be pulled in/away from the end walls to help the massing. The windows sizes taken from the main house are good. More windows are needed on the side elevations. The mass does need to be broken down more.
- Commissioner Boyer – Agrees with the other comments. The footprint size is fine for the site; there is plenty of room. The overall mass need to be broken down further.

9. 18-2-12

283 Auden Ave.

Ecohouse Solar, LLC (Applicant) Bruce Nation (Owner)

Continue application #18-2-12, 283 Auden Ave., to allow the applicant time to submit additional information:

- Installation of solar panels on new build within Jeffrey Park.
- Panels to be located on the roof of the townhouse and the garage.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Fergus – Is okay with both sets of solar panels (both main and garage roof). Any approval would need to be contingent on the proposal receiving approval from the Home Owners Association (HOA).
- Commissioner Hagerling – Asked in the panels are stationary (yes). Recognizes that some people may have concerns with views from other units, but mitigating any views from the public right-of-way (ROW) is most important.
- Commissioner Cooke – Is against the lower set of panels located on the garage due to visibility from other units. Is okay with the use of the main roof. Any approval needs to be contingent on the proposal receiving approval from the HOA.
- Commissioner Boyer – Asked is there are any other parts located outside of the buildings (no). The placement of the arrays on either or both roofs is appropriate due to their location in the rear and that they cannot be seen from the ROW.

10. 18-2-13

698 N. High St.

Bean Architects (Applicant) The Wood Company (Owner)

Approve application #18-2-13, 698 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Paint existing storefronts.
- Replace one (1) existing entrance door on the west elevation, and two (2) existing entrance doors on the east elevation. (All doors to be custom made to match the existing design).
- Replace existing awning on west elevation, and installation of two (2) new awnings on west elevation.
- Install new blade sign on west elevation and new wall sign on east elevation.
- Install new gooseneck light fixtures on west and east elevations.
- Replace center window on west elevation with custom openable unit to allow for mechanical access, to allow for art display.
- Install movable planters near entrance on High St.
- The rear awning is to be changed to a solid “dark olive” color as represented in the submitted awning details.
- The panel at the rear door is to have the same profile.
- Revised drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Hagerling (4-0-0) APPROVED.

11. 18-2-14

38 E. Lincoln St. (Corner of Lincoln and Pearl streets)

Schooley Caldwell & Associates (Applicant)

The Wood Company (Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

12. 18-2-15

324 E. Second Ave.

Avenue Partners/Snyder Barker & Elford Development (Applicant) Jana Holdings, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #18-2-15, 324 E. Second Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Demolish existing buildings located on the parcel.
- Renovate and reconstruct the two (2) smaller east buildings.
- Extend north/south boulevard the full depth of the site.
- Construct two (2) new 3-story, garden buildings.

- Construct one (1) new 3-story, garden building.
 - Construct a new 4-story, apartment building.
 - Construct a new 4-story, apartment building.
 - The total number of units is now 196-units.
 - The top band of the roof of the covered terrace on Building 4 is to be changed to a dark color.
 - Revised drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.
- MOTION: Cooke/Hagerling (4-0-0) APPROVED.

13. 18-2-16a

750 N. Fourth St.

Wagenbrenner Development (Applicant)

Jeffrey Park New Day (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 42-unit apartment building on N. Fourth St. that will be raised up from the street and sidewalk.
- Structure to be surrounded on all four sides with brick and will have concrete trim and panels.
- A lot split is required because the two buildings on this block will have different owners.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Fergus – Likes the new direction that is shown on the revised drawings, but the changes could be even more dramatic. Recommended removing the panels and having all brick for a more traditional and less suburban design.
- Commissioner Cooke – Had hoped that the building would be split into two or four separate buildings. The panels should be removed from the design and perhaps a different window should be used. The roof is much better than a flat roof design and concealing the mechanical is good. The window treatment on the ends could mirror the historic building.
- Commissioner Boyer – Agrees with the previous comments. The overhang does doesn't work and should be remove form the design.
- Commissioner Hagerling – The thickness of the parapet need to be the same. The vertical bays breaking the eave should be consistent. Encouraged the applicant to continue to try more things.

Recommend approval of application #18-2-16b, 750 N. Fourth St., as submitted:

- Lot split per submitted siteplan due to mixed ownership of the current parcel.

MOTION: Fergus/Hagerling (4-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL.

14. 18-2-17

750 N. High St.

Meyers Architecture (Applicant)

SNH Columbus Owner, LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Renovation of existing Bollinger Tower building for use as a boutique Graduate Hotel with 171 guestrooms.
- Approximately 35 existing parking spaces on site will be parked and stacked by valet and the balance of required spaces will be leased off-site and valet parked.
- Existing windows will be removed and replaced with units integrating the necessary mechanicals grills.
- Existing EIFS will be painted and the sunscreens removed.
- The High Street portion of the site will be built out to continue the Short North streetscape, housing a 1,500sqft retail space to the north and an expansion of lobby spaces and a restaurant to the south with occupiable roof terraces.
- A rooftop bar and terrace will be added atop the existing 11-story tower.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Fergus – The rooftop use is fine. The design of the front façade is good. The open space of the vestibule space was important to the neighborhood, and some space needs to be returned to the design. The character of the High Street commercial spaces should more reflect the existing buildings, and the design should be less symmetrical.
- Commissioner Cooke – Has concerns with the current design. Factory-like windows have no precedence within the High Street corridor. Removal of the glass canopy is not an issue, but the loss of the open space is. Has issue with the proposed addition of a rooftop use and is not in favor.
- Commissioner Hagerling – Streetscape improvements are already underway, and are not a consideration to “hurry” with the redesign of the building. The original design of the building was big and ugly, and the last round of changes was an improvement. Has concerns with the current storefront designs, there are no precedents for many of the elements shown, and the designs need to reflect the existing fabric of the neighborhood.
- Commissioner Boyer – The cleaned up design of the tower is better. The street front design needs work, less choppy and more like existing buildings such as the Hubbard Grill. The design should be less symmetrical. Is okay with the proposed rooftop use.

15. 18-2-18

800 N. High St.

Allison Srail (Applicant)

High Hubbard Acquisition, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #18-2-18, 800 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Alterations to previously approved ten-story, mixed-use building with 116 room Moxy Hotel, 42,865 sq. ft. of office space, a 144 space parking garage, and 11,125 sq. ft. restaurant space (including a rooftop bar and outdoor terraces), and 1,500 sq. ft. of retail, per the submitted drawings.
- Signage review and approval.
- A cutsheet for the louvers is to be provided.
- Signage for “Moxy” is to be the LED neon option per the Short North Design Guidelines; no internally illuminated signage is approved.
- The words “Café” and “Bar” are to be removed from the signage band, and revised “Townhall” signage details are to be provided.
- The spandrel glass on the north elevation is to be replaced with the “red” brick, and each space is to be recessed to align with the recess of the window units.
- Revised drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (3-1-0) APPROVED. [Boyer]

16. 18-2-19

889 N. Fourth St.

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

Lykens Companies (Owner)

Approve application #18-2-19, 889 N. Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Demolish existing rear one-story addition on existing single-family home.
- Construct a new one-story rear addition.
- The proposed use of the building is a common room for the 875 N. Fourth apartment building on the first floor, and a new apartment on the second floor.
- The new hardiplank siding is to have a 4” exposure with traditional trim and casing details.
- The brick wall is to be changed to a wrought-iron fence design.
- The existing front porch is to be rehabilitated to its historic design in consultation with HPO staff.
- Revised drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Fergus/Hagerling (3-0-0) APPROVED. [Cook Abstained]

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

17. 18-2-20

1068 N. Sixth St. (Bethany Terrace)

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- The proposal is for redevelopment of the currently vacant property at the corner of N 6th and Detroit.
- The applicant is proposing a four story building with parking on the first floor and three stories of apartments above.
- The applicant would like to discuss and get recommendations from the commission on massing, density, site access and building setbacks.

NO ACTION TAKEN

18. 18-2-21

245 E. Fourth Ave. (Bethany Flats)

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- The proposal is for redevelopment of the currently vacant property at the very east end of 4th Ave where 4th Ave dead ends into the Clark Grave Vault site.
- The applicant is proposing a three story building with parking on the first floor and three stories of apartments above.
- The applicant would like to discuss and get recommendations from the commission on massing, density, and site access.

NO ACTION TAKEN

NOTE: The Commission discussed both #18-2-20 & #18-2-21 at the same time.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Hagerling – Indicated that despite apartments being previously approved on the site next to the church, the larger parcel to the south should be more influenced by single-family house design.
- Commissioner Cooke – Development of the parcels should follow the single-family and two-family dwellings that surround the properties.
- Commissioner Boyer – Is okay with an apartment building next to the church, but the southern lot should be developed as single-family homes.
- Commissioner Fergus – The church needs to be the dominant part of the northern portion of the development. That area could maybe be more dense in development on the far eastern part of the site due to its proximity to the Clark Grave Vault property. Generally, the project should be built with larger floorplans, and townhomes.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

• 18-2-1

1113-1115 Mt. Pleasant Ave.

C. John Smith (Applicant)

Chution Ruanphae (Owner)

Approve Application 18-2-1, 1113-1115 Mt. Pleasant Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing deteriorated asphalt shingle roof.
- Install new Owens Corning “Supreme” 3-Tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Estate Gray”.
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; color to be “Tinner’s Red”.
- Install new gutters and downspouts.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.

- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingle to be GAF "Slateline" dimensional asphalt shingle roof; color to be "Weathered Slate".
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• 18-2-2

163-177 Punta Alley

Michelle Mixer (Applicant)

(Multiple Owners)

Approve Application #18-2-2, 163-177 Punta Alley, for renewal of expired COA #15-9-3 (Expired: August 25, 2016), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Approve Application 15-9-3, 163-177 Punta Alley, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- *Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public and service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.*
- *Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as needed.*
- *All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.*
- *Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.*

• 18-2-3

673 Kerr St.

Able Roof (Applicant)

Andrew Lehman (Owner)

Approve Application 18-2-3, 673 Kerr St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing deteriorated asphalt shingle roof.
- Install new GAF "Slateline" dimensional asphalt shingle roof; color to be "English Gray Slate".
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; color to be "Tinner's Red".
- Install new gutters and downspouts.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.

- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingle to be GAF “Slateline” dimensional asphalt shingle roof; color to be “English Gray Slate”.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **18-2-4**

39-55 Hull Alley

Jason Rowland (Applicant) Casa Di Litta, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 18-2-4, 39-55 Hull Alley, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair/replace any/all damaged material on porches as needed to match existing.

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers’ specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers’ specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Restore the front porch banisters/hand rails/columns as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails/columns; like-for-like.

- **18-2-5**

38-56 Warren St.

Jason Rowland (Applicant) Casa Di Litta, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 18-2-5, 38-56 Warren St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair/replace any/all damaged material on porches as needed to match existing.

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers’ specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers’ specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Restore the front porch banisters/hand rails/columns as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails/columns; like-for-like.

- **18-2-6**

1110-1112 Summit St.

Brian Knoppe (Applicant)

Supra Investments, LLC & Tommie L., Jason M., and Cynthia L. Dowell (Owners)

Approve Application 18-2-6, 1110-1112 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Construct two (2) single-car garages per submitted drawings.

- No variances are required.
- Garages are to have metal ridge roll installed over ridge vent; color to be either “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray”.

- **18-2-7**
930-940 N. High St.
Schooley Caldwell (Applicant) Brunner Building, LLC (Owner)
Approve Application 18-2-7, 930-940 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Revise entrance canopy design per submitted drawings.
 - The “Brunner Building” letter are to be backlit (halo) per the supplied detailed section-through drawing.

- **18-1-4**
991 N. Fourth Ave.
Nayked Brands (Applicant) Capital Equities (Owner)
Approve Application 18-1-4, 991 N. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Install new 24.99-sqft non-illuminated sign per submitted drawings.

- **17-12-6**
188 E. Third Ave.
Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant) Urban Restorations (Owner)
Approve Application 17-12-6, 188 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Construct new two-story single-family home per submitted drawings.

- **18-2-8**
249 E. Fifth Ave.
Joe Valenti (Applicant) FK IV, LLC (Owner)
Approve Application 18-2-8, 249 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Modification of front entrance with new handicap accessible ramp as required by Building department and per submitted revised drawings.
 - Install new sign; sign to be “Option B” non-illuminated sign per submitted drawing.
 - Applicant has the option to alter the design into a backlit/halo style letter, with revised drawings to be submitted to HPO for review and approval.

- **18-2-14**
38 E. Lincoln St. (Corner of Lincoln and Pearl streets)
Schooley Caldwell & Associates (Applicant) The Wood Company (Owner)
Approve Application 18-2-14, 38 E. Lincoln St. (Corner of Lincoln and Pearl streets), as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Final brick color discussion for the approved infill of openings on the east elevation.
 - Final materials/screening of approved upper level discussion.
 - Identified art location for future installation.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/ Fergus (4-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

VIII. ADJOURNMENT– Cooke/Boyer (4-0-0) ADJOURNED. 7:35 pm.