

## HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION AGENDA

March 15, 2018

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. If you have any questions, please call Randy Black (645-6821) in the City's Historic Preservation Office. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-7206, or email raisbell@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Thursday, April 12, 2018 – 50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room 'A'
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 pm, Thursday, April 19, 2018 – 50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room 'B'
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Thursday, February 15, 2018.
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### HOLDOVERS

*Holdover Items #1 and #2 and Staff Recommendation Item #3 were converted to Staff Approval following the Business Meeting review. (See below)*

1. **18-2-11—*Converted to Staff Approval***  
457-59 N. High Street  
William M. Sorboro III (Applicant)  
**North Market Historic District**  
459 High St. Development LLC. (Owner)
2. **18-2-6b—*Converted to Staff Approval***  
730 S. Champion Avenue  
Andy Wright (Applicant)  
**Old Oaks Historic District**  
Upward Home Solutions (Owner)

### STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

3. **18-3-6—*Converted to Staff Approval***  
444 E. Broad Street  
G. Thomas Worley (Applicant)  
**Individual Historic Listing**  
First Congressional Church (Owner)



**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:00 P.M.**

**4. 18-3-11**

**343 N. Front Street**

**David Tyler/Columbus Architectural Studio (Applicant)**

**Individual Historic Listing**

**Nationwide Realty Investors (Owner)**

*An Application has been submitted with detailed work description, current photos, metal samples, and drawings.*

Re-Roofing—Main Roof & Elevator Penthouse Roof

- Complete tear-off of existing EPDM roofing.
- Install new black EPDM per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Metal Coping

- Install painted metal coping to minimally cover the main stone coping due to ongoing source of water intrusion.
- New metal to be selected from one of the two samples provided: 1) Kalkreuth DMI Slate Grey; or 2) Duranar Slate Gray.

Repair Gutters & Downspouts—(visible from W. Naughten Street Alley)

- Repair existing copper gutters and downspout seams and splices as necessary per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

•

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:15 P.M.**

**5. 18-3-5b**

**1110 Bryden Road**

**Joseph Huber (Applicant)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Mary Meredith (Owner)**

*An Application has been submitted with detailed work description and drawings. The Application has been separated into Item 'a' for Staff Approval (see below) and Item 'b' for commission review.*

Remove Rear Porch

- Tear down to grade and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Install new, twenty-five foot by fourteen foot (25' x 14') paver patio at grade.
- Install large monolithic service stone steps to grade per submitted plan.
- Re-sod rear yard per industry standards.

Garage

- Construct a new, twenty foot by twenty foot (20' x 20') frame garage with block foundation per submitted drawings and site plan.
- New garage to have smooth vinyl siding with cement block foundation.
- New garage to have a five foot (5') setback at the north and west property lines and concrete apron per submitted plans.

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.**

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**6. 18-3-7**

**459 N. High Street**

**The Escape Room USA/Jennifer Harbron (Applicant)**

**North Market Historic District**

**High Street Development LLC/Zach Price (Owner)**

*An Application has been submitted with detailed work description, current photos, and drawings. Sign company representative has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer.*

Signage

- Install double-faced, internally illuminated, 42.4 square foot, blade sign on southeast corner elevation per submitted plans.
- New sign to protrude from the building at a 45 degree angle as indicated on color rendering submitted.
- Structural support brackets to be anchored in the existing building mortar joints per industry and City Building Code standards.



**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:45P.M.**

**7. 18-3-8**

**1797 Bryden Road**

**Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Lisa Sullivan & Colin Vent (Owner)**

*An Application has been submitted with detailed work description, current photos, and drawings.*

Rehabilitate Existing Single-Family Residence

- Install new window in previously enclosed south elevation porch location.
- Install new French doors in south elevation bay window location.
- Remove third floor deck and railing and install new rubber membrane roof per industry standards.
- Remove third floor doorway and install new window and casing.
- Rebuild second floor porch and install new windows

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:00 P.M.**

**VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION(S)**

**8. 18-3-9**

**973 E. Broad Street**

**Midnight Blue, LLC/Dave Perry (Applicant)**

**18<sup>th</sup> & E. Broad Historic District**

**Dixie L. Foley, AFTD (Owner)**

*An Application has been submitted with copy of Council Variance Application, detailed work description, current photos, and drawings. The Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer.*

Renovate Existing Residential Building

- Renovate the existing building to convert to a six (6) room Bed and Breakfast (B. & B.) and four hundred fifty feet (450') of commercial office space.

Construct New Apartment Buildings

- Construct one (1) eight (8) dwelling unit apartment building per submitted plans.
- Construct one (1) three (3) dwelling unit carriage house per submitted plans.

Variances Requested

- 3333.04—Permitted Uses in AR-O Apartment Office District
- 3333.18(D)—Building Lines
- 3333.24—Rear Yard
- 33312.25—Maneuvering
- 3312.27(3)—Parking Setback Line
- 3312.49—Minimum Number of Parking Spaces Required—Reduce from 22 spaces required to 11 spaces.

**9. 18-3-10**

**1150 Bryden Road**

**GC Town Properties II, LLC/Dave Perry Company (A)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**GC Town Properties II, LLC (owner)**

*An Application has been submitted with detailed work description, current photos, paint color renderings, and drawings. Photos of other painted brick buildings in the Bryden Road Historic District have been submitted. The Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer. The apartment building was constructed in 1967 (i.e. 51years old).*

Painting

- Paint exterior brick and trim per submitted rendering 1A or rendering 1B.

Rehabilitate Front Entry

- Install new front entry columns per photo rendering.

Landscaping

- Landscape and parking to be performed on all elevations as indicated on the Wilson Landscape Associates plan submitted.



**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:30 P.M.**

**10. 18-3-11**

**511-555 Park Street/70-100 Spruce Street** **North Market Historic District**  
**Meyers & Associates Architects/Nicholas Munoz (Applicant)**  
**David Kass/Continental Real Estate Companies (Owner)**

*An Application has been submitted with detailed work description, current photos, and drawings has been submitted. The Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer.*

*[Note: Phase I: Construction of the new, 8-story AC Marriott Hotel with surface parking lot on the west parcel received approval in December, 2016 and was renewed in October, 2017.]*

Selective Demolition

- Requesting final construction document approval for the selective demolition package.

Phase I Final Design Approval

- Construct new, 8-story AC Marriott Hotel.
- Construct new surface parking lot with landscaped screening.

*The following is taken from the Approved Minutes of the October 19, 2017 regular meeting.*

**Approve Application 17-10-10, 511-555 Park Street, 70-100 Spruce Street, North Market Historic District, for the renewal of the previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness (#16-12-13—approved December 15, 2016) for a period of one year from today’s date with all clarifications, as previously noted:**

Development Schedule—Phase I—Hotel & Phase II Parking Plan

- *Request approval of the construction of the eight (8)-story, AC Hotel with surface parking to the west per submitted plans.*
- **New foot print of the hotel to include the partial demolition and incorporation of the existing, contributing buildings as indicated.**
- *Applicant to return to the Historic Resources Commission within twelve (12) months with an update on the Phase II garage/office building status.*

**STAFF APPROVALS**

• **18-3-1**

**720 Oakwood Avenue** **Old Oaks Historic District**  
**Kyle Higgins (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #18-3-1, 720 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove the deteriorated, asphalt shingle roof on entire building, complete, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing shingles. Manufacturer and color to be from the Approved Roofing Shingles List:

Manufacturer:  
Owens Corning

Style:  
(standard 3-tab)

Color:  
Estate Gray



- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs. Metal ridge roll to run the complete length of all roof ridges (i.e. flush with the eave/soffit fascia) and painted “Tinner's Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.

• **18-3-2**

**721 Wilson Avenue**

**Able Roof (Applicant)**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Marian Craig & Rose Handon (Owners)**

Approve Application #18-3-2, 721 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications noted.

Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

*[NOTE: The existing ribbon slate roof is beyond its useful service life and replacement has been determined to be necessary to ensure the continued viability of this contributing residential property in the Old Oaks Historic District.]*

- Remove all slate on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

Nickel Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
- The original slate currently on the side cheeks of any/all dormers is to remain in place. Should cheek slate repair be deemed necessary, it is to be done in accordance with standard slate roofing industry standards. Any/all Cheek slate replacement is to be with slate of same color, style, and dimension; like-for-like.

• **18-3-3**

**4949 Olentangy Boulevard**

**Gilberto Rodriguez/Rodriguez Roofing (Applicant)**

**Old Beechwood Historic District**

**Jeanne Grothaus/Sarah Curtin (Owner)**

Approve Application #18-3-3, 4949 Olentangy Boulevard, Old Beechwood Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications noted.

New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on all roofs on the residence, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:



<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	Stonegate Gray
GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	English Gray Slate Weathered Slate
Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	Antique Slate

- Ridges are to be capped with cut shingle tabs which are appropriate for the style and age of this residence and the ridge capping is to begin and end flush with the ends of each ridge (i.e. capping not to be set back from the complete run of the ridges).
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner as indicated. [**Note: The shingle is appropriate for the age and style of the 4949 Olentangy Boulevard property.**]

Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Replace all existing gutters on the house on all elevations with new metal ogee/k-style gutters of appropriate dimensions per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts of appropriate dimension and in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **18-3-4**

**212 East Broad Street**

**Luke Lyren (Applicant)**

**Individual Historic Listing**

**Catholic Diocese (Owner)**

Approve Application #18-3-4, 212 East Broad Street, Columbus Register Listing, as submitted, and with all clarifications noted.

Replace Existing Limestone Steps

- Remove twenty-nine (29), existing, deteriorated, weather and time damaged Ohio Limestone stair treads at the southeast corner of 212 E. Broad Street, St. Joseph Cathedral.
- Install new Ohio Limestone treads of the same color and dimensions as the existing treads ranging in matching lengths from twenty-two inches long to one hundred twelve inches long (22”L –112” L); like-for-like.

• **18-3-5a**

**1110 Bryden Road**

**Joseph Huber (Applicant)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Mary Meredith (Owner)**

Approve Application #18-3-5a, 212 East Broad Street, Columbus Register Listing, as submitted, and with all clarifications noted.

New Concrete Service Walks

- Remove existing concrete service walks and install new concrete sidewalks of same dimension in the same locations per City Building Code standards, and H. R. C. guidelines; like-for-like.

Repair Existing Concrete Pillars

- Repair all existing concrete porch pillars per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes and H. R. C. guidelines. Style, finish, and dimensions to match the original; like-for-like.

Remove Non-original, Non-contributing Steel Service Steps Handrail

- Dispose of all debris per City Code.

Repair & Finish Coat Wrought Iron Fence Finials to Match Existing



- All metal fence repairs to be with like materials and finishes in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes and H. R. C. guidelines.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on main roof and make any repairs and/or replace existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile. Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal down spouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Repair Soffits & Eaves

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood soffit, eave, and trim elements as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wooden eave and soffit surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications. All finish colors to remain the same as currently existing.

- **18-3-12**

**155 E. Frambes Avenue**

**North Steppe Realty/Attn.: Bill Irwin (Applicant)**

**Indianola Forest Historic District**

**Westwood Properties Rental (Owner)**

Approve Application #18-3-12 155 E. Frambes Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim and siding elements as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood windows and exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications. All finish colors to per submitted Pittsburg Paint schedule: Main Body='Victoria Blue'; Trim='White'.

- **18-3-13**

**1334 E. Livingston Avenue**

**Rickenbacker/Woods Foundation (Applicant)**

**Columbus Register Individual Listing**

**City of Columbus/Attn.: Land Redevelopment (Owner)**

Approve Application #18-3-13, 1334 E. Livingston Avenue/Eddie Rickenbacker Boyhood Home, Columbus Register Listing, as submitted, and with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Repairs

- Remove all porch decking, lattice, and steps and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Install new wooden porch flooring, lattice, and steps of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.

Prepare & Paint House Exterior—Complete

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim and siding elements as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood windows and exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prepare the existing metal Bilco basement access door surfaces using the appropriate hand tools. Prime and finish



coat the metal Bilco basement access door with exterior metal paint of same color and per manufacturer's specifications; like-for-like.

- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications. All finish colors to remain the same as currently existing; like-for-like. Finish Paint color chips to be in accordance with the Welsh Color and Conservation color analysis and to be submitted for inclusion in the historic property file.
- It is recommended that all exterior paint have conditioner added:
  - 1) Any/all alkyd or oil base primer and finish paint to have Flood Products 'Penetrol' or similar conditioner product;  
*and*
  - 2) Any/all latex or water base primer and finish paint to have Flood Products 'Emusibond' or 'Flotrol' or similar conditioner product added per manufacturer's specifications.

Prepare & Paint Wooden Porch Floor—Complete

- Prepare all wood porch flooring for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime any/all bare wood flooring with porch floor enamel thinned with appropriate material prior to installation.
- Topcoat entire porch floor with same porch floor enamel according to manufacturer's specifications for finish coat. Paint color chip to be for final review and approval

*Holdover Items #1 and #2 and Staff Recommendation Items #3 were converted to Staff Approval following the Business Meeting presentation by the Historic Preservation officer. (See above)*

• **18-2-11—Converted to Staff Approval**

**457-59 N. High Street**

**William M. Sorboro III (Applicant)**

Approve Application #18-2-11, 457-59 N. High Street, North Market Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Signage

- Install a new, sign in the sign band on the south (side) and east (front) elevations of the brick commercial building located at 457 N. High Street per submitted PhotoShop rendering and measured drawing.
- New sign to be as per submitted PhotoShop rendering and measured drawing.

**North Market Historic District**

**459 High St. Development LLC. (Owner)**

• **18-2-6b—Converted to Staff Approval**

**730 S. Champion Avenue**

**Andy Wright (Applicant)**

Approve Application #18-2-6b, 730 S. Champion Avenue, Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Build New Garage

- Construct new garage per submitted measured plans and detailed drawings.

Landscaping

- Upon completion of the new garage construction with new drive apron and three foot by three foot (3' x 3') front concrete pad as indicated on site plan, reseed rear yard per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Additional approval is required prior to planting any new trees and/or shrubbery.

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Upward Home Solutions (Owner)**

• **18-3-6—Converted to Staff Approval**

**444 E. Broad Street**

**G. Thomas Worley (Applicant)**

Approve Application #18-3-6, 444 E. Broad Street, Individual Historic Listing, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Landscaping/Social Justice Park Development

**Individual Historic Listing**

**First Congressional Church (Owner)**





[Note: The park development is part of the ‘Creative Campus’ concept of the 2010 Downtown Strategic Plan.]

- Develop a one thousand square foot (1000 sq. ft.) portion of the proposed eighteen thousand square foot (18,000 sq. ft.) Social Justice Park.
- New landscaping plan to include bluestone pathways and replacement of two (2) declining Linden trees in kind and in close proximity to the existing locations.

**IX. OLD BUSINESS**

**X. NEW BUSINESS**

**XI. ADJOURN**

