

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION AGENDA

April 19, 2018

6:00 p.m.

111 North Front Street, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. If you have any questions, please call Connie Torbeck (614-645-0664) in the City's Historic Preservation Office. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-7206, or email raisbell@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, May 10, 2018 – 111 North Front Street, 3rd Floor, Room 312
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 p.m., Thursday, May 17, 2018 – 111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Thursday, March 15, 2018.
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **18-4-6**

**755 Boone Street
Ace Fence & Deck, LLC.**

**Hamilton Park Historic District
Joel Simmons**

An application, photographs, site plan, and product cut sheet have been submitted.

Install New Fence

- Install approximately 64' of 6' high, satin black, Courtyard aluminum fence, per the submitted site plan.
- Fence style to be #1230, per the submitted product cut sheet and sample photo.

HOLDOVERS

2. **18-3-11b**

**1150 Bryden Road
GC Town Properties II, LLC/Dave Perry Company (A)**

**Bryden Road Historic District
GC Town Properties II, LLC (owner)**

This application was reviewed at and continued from the March 15, 2018 HRC hearing. Installation of new front entry columns and landscaping was approved. A modified landscape plan has been submitted.

Landscaping

- Install new plantings, per the submitted site plan and rendering.

New Fence

- Install a new, 6' High, horizontal board fence, per the submitted site plan and rendering.

3. 18-4-7 (Variance Recommendation)

1150 Bryden Road

GC Town Properties II, LLC/Dave Perry Company (A)

An application, site plan, and statement of hardship have been submitted.

Request for Variance Recommendation

Bryden Road Historic District

GC Town Properties II, LLC (owner)

- 1) Section 3332.035, R-3 Residential District, to permit a 17 dwelling unit apartment building.
- 2) Section 3312.25, Maneuvering, to reduce maneuvering from 20 feet to 16 feet for the north row of nine (9) parking spaces, to reflect the existing approved parking.
- 3) Section 3312.27(3), Parking Setback Line, to reduce the parking setback along S. Champion Avenue from ten (10) feet to 4.5 feet to 6 feet, as depicted on the site plan.
- 4) Section 3312.49, Minimum Numbers of Parking Spaces Required, to reduce parking from 1.5 spaces/dwelling unit (26 spaces total) to 1.05 spaces/dwelling unit (18 spaces total) for 17 one (1) bedroom apartments.
- 5) Section 3321.05(A)(1)(B)(1), Vision Clearance, to reduce the vision clearance triangle at the driveway to S. Champion Avenue from 10'x10' to 5'x5' and to reduce the vision clearance triangle at the intersection of E Chapel Street (alley) and S. Champion Avenue from 10'x10' to 6'x6'.

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. 18-4-8

973 East Broad Street

Midnight Blue LLC. c/o Laurie Gunzelman (Applicant)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the March 15, 2018 HRC hearing. The variance package was recommended for approval at that hearing. Current zoning is AR-0(Apartment/Office). The house was converted to office space in the 1950s.

Renovate Existing Residential Building

- Renovate the existing building to convert to a six (6) room Bed and Breakfast and four hundred fifty feet (450') of commercial office space.

Construct New Apartment Buildings

- Construct one (1) eight (8) dwelling unit apartment building, per submitted plans.
- Construct one (1) three (3) dwelling unit carriage house, per submitted plans.

The following is from the March 15, 2018 HRC hearing:

Commissioner McCabe

- *The removal of the rear addition needs further information regarding its significance.*
- *The style and materials of the new replacement structure is an important consideration.*

Commissioner Morgan

- *The rear addition architecture is important. Its approval is dependent on the project design team. The proposal is “a bit faux historic”.*

Commissioner Prosser

- *A “simple, elegant” new building is important to successful infill in this district.*

Commissioner Rowan

- *Not in favor of the board and batten siding proposal for the new construction. Brick or stone is a more appropriate finish material. Clearance between the existing and new residences is very important.*

Commissioner Gibboney

- *“On the right path.” More detail is now needed for further review.*

5. **18-4-9 (Variance Recommendation)**

973 East Broad Street

Midnight Blue LLC. c/o Laurie Gunzelman (Applicant)

18th & East Broad Street Historic District

Dixie L. Foley AFDT (Owner)

An application and site plan have been submitted. The variance package was recommended for approval on March 15, 2018, but the dumpster was not shown on the site plan. The zoning code requires dumpsters to function independently meaning, and it can't be blocked by parking spaces.

Request for Variance Recommendation

- 1) Section 3321.01 - Dumpster area, to permit a dumpster located behind a parking space without independent access and maneuvering area.

6. **18-4-10**

620 East Town Street

Jason Dorsey/Windsor Homes, LLC. (Applicant)

East Town Street Historic District

Windsor Homes, LLC. (Owner)

The ca. 1956 brick building was painted prior to review and approval. A code order has been submitted. An application and photographs have been submitted.

Paint Apartment Building

- Retain the existing, white paint, as applied prior to review and approval.

7. **18-4-11**

730 South Champion Avenue

Andy Wright/Upward Home Solutions (Applicant/Owner)

Old Oaks Historic District

An application and site plan have been submitted.

Build New Porch

- Construct a new, full-width, front porch, similar in footprint to the original porch, per the submitted drawings.
- Porch columns, railings, and steps to be wood.
- Railings and columns to be per the Columbus Register of Historic Properties Guidelines, page 15.

8. **18-4-12**

1110 Bryden Road

Joseph Huber (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Mary Ellen Meredith (Owner)

An application, site plan, elevation drawings, and photos have been submitted.

New Garage

- Build a new, 400 sf, two-car garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be board-and-batten.
- Roofing to be from approved roofing shingles list.
- Pedestrian door on west elevation to be two-panel, half-light door.
- Foundation to be concrete block.

Demolish and Rebuild Rear Enclosed Porch

- Demolish the existing, deteriorated, enclosed rear porch, per the submitted photos and drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be horizontal wood siding.
- Handrail at steps to be wood.
- Rooftop balustrade to be wood.

9. **18-4-13a**

288 Miller Avenue

Parallel Homes, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

Bryden Road Historic District

An application, site plan, elevation drawings, and photos have been submitted. The property is a vacant building with vinyl siding and no existing windows.

Install Vinyl Siding

- Remove the existing aluminum siding and Permastone siding.
- Install new, vinyl siding, per the submitted product cut sheets.

Build New Front Porch

- Retain the existing, concrete porch deck and steps.
- Build a new front porch where a porch once existed, per the submitted drawings.

- Roof to be standing-seam-metal, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- New columns and railings to be wood, per the submitted drawings.

Install Vinyl Windows

- Remove all plywood coverings from all windows.
- Install new vinyl windows in existing openings, per the submitted product cut sheets.
- Existing stained glass window to remain.

10. 18-4-14

1221 Bryden Road

Scott Baker (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Gary Ross (Owner)

An application, site plan, drawings, and photos have been submitted. The property recently experienced significant fire damage.

Install New Roof System

- Remove the fire damaged third floor roof, slate, and roof structure, including the dormers.
- Rebuild roof, roof structure, and dormers to match existing.
- Install new asphalt shingles from the approved roofing shingles list.

Install New Windows

- Remove the existing second-story windows on the rear elevation.
- Remove the one (1) on the second-story east elevation.
- Remove all fire damaged windows on the third-story
- Install new, wood windows to match existing, per the submitted product cut sheets.

Rear Sleeping Porch

- Replace rubber roof, fascia, and gutters, as needed.
- All work to match existing.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the rear, one-story section, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

11. 18-4-15

1297-1299 Bryden Road / Vacant Lot

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Chad Seiber (Owner)

An application, site plan, and photos have been submitted.

New Construction

- First conceptual review for construction of a new, brick, two-family residence on previous double site.

Request for Variance Recommendation

1) 3332.035 - R-3 Residential District – to allow for a two-family home.

2) 3332.26 - Minimum side yard permitted (A) (B) to allow for side yard less than 5' and to be 3' on the East property line.

3) 3312.49 (A) - To reduce the required parking spaces from 4 to 2.

12. 18-4-16

1297-1299 Bryden Road / Vacant Lot

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

An application, site plan, and photos have been submitted.

Installation of Fence

- Potential purchaser requests feedback from the Commission regarding the appropriateness for installation of fencing in the rear yard, per the submitted photos and site plan.

Old Beechwood Historic District

Cheryl Meade & Matthew Gilmore (Owner)

STAFF APPROVALS

• 18-4-1

640-42 Linwood Avenue

Taisean Glover (Applicant/Owner)

Old Oaks Historic District

Approve Application #18-4-1, 640-42 Linwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications as noted and for the renewal of expired C. of A. #17-1-2 for the exact same work as indicated.

Renewal of expired C. of A. #17-1-2 for the exact same work as previously issued:

Exterior Painting—House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish paint color scheme to match the existing exterior color(s),
or
Applicant/Owner to submit new color(s) chips to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to applying the finish coat(s).
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete, foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Remove all hung gutters and downspouts and replace with new gutters and downspouts of appropriate size to ensure proper drainage.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on porch roofs and make any repairs and/or replace existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile. Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal down spouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Repair Soffits & Fascia

- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wooden eave soffit and fascia with new wood of same dimension and profile: like-for-like.

Repair Porch Flooring

- Prime and finish coat all new and/or bare wood surfaces with exterior primer and top coat according to manufacturer's specifications. All exterior paint colors to match existing; like-for-like.

Approve the additional work as indicated.

Install New Asphalt Shingle Roofs—House & Garage

- Remove the deteriorated, slate shingle roof complete down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing shingles. Manufacturer and color to be a ‘test case’ for consideration for inclusion on the Approved Shingles List:

| <u>Manufacturer:</u> | <u>Style:</u> | <u>Color:</u> |
|-----------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| CertainTeed | Carriage House (dimensional) | Stonegate Gray |
| GAF | Slateline (dimensional) | English Gray Slate Weathered Slate |
| Certain Teed | (standard 3-tab) | Nickel Gray |
| GAF | Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab) | Nickel Gray |
| Celotex Slate Gray | (standard 3-tab) | Heritage Gray |
| Owens Corning | (standard 3-tab) | Estate Gray |
| Tamko | (standard 3-tab) | Antique Slate |

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs. Metal ridge roll to run the complete length of all roof ridges (i.e. flush with the eave/soffit fascia) and painted “Tinner's Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.

• **18-4-2**

639 Wilson Avenue

Andy Gastineau/Bone Dry Roofing (Applicant)

Old Oaks Historic District

Richard Vickers (Owner)

Approve Application #18-4-2, 639 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / Garage

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the detached garage, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

| <u>Manufacturer:</u> | <u>Style:</u> | <u>Color:</u> |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| [] Owens Corning | (standard 3-tab) | [] Estate Gray |

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **18-4-3**

912 Bryden Road

Christine Donaldson (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Christine Donaldson & Charles Moore (Owner)

Approve Application #18-4-3, 912 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications as noted:

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new six-foot high (6' H), wood privacy fence along the east side of the existing parking pad, in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to match the existing fence along E. Chapel Street, per the submitted photographs and site plan, i.e., board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), dog-eared wood fence, with finished side out, facing the existing parking pad (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside).
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **18-4-4**

174 East Oakland Avenue

Sure Home Improvements (Applicant)

Northwood Park Historic District

Ronald House (Owner)

Approve Application #18-4-4, 174 East Oakland Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / House

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the two-story, frame house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

[] Owens Corning

Style:

(standard 3-tab)

Color:

[] Estate Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Retain the existing, hat vents, as previously installed. No additional hat vents to be installed.

• **18-4-5**

125 E. Broad Street (Trinity Episcopal Church)

Bello Giardino Landscaping (Applicant)

Individual Historic Listing

Trinity Episcopal Church (Owner)

Approve Application #18-4-5, 125 E. Broad Street (Trinity Episcopal Church), Individual Historic Listing, as submitted, and with all clarifications as noted:

Landscaping

- Remove all weeds and excess plants
- Remove existing stump
- Plant 10 Taxus Everlow plants
- Plant 100 Pachysandra plants (2 flats – 50 per flat)
- Prepare proper plant bedding before installation
- Finish with 5 yards of mulch

• **18-4-13b**

288 Miller Avenue

Bryden Road Historic District

Parallel Homes, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

This application has been divided into item ‘a’, for review by the Commission (above), and item ‘b’, under staff approvals.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the frame house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

[] GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

[] English Gray Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffits and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Install New Doors

- Remove existing plywood on all exterior door openings.
- Install new, wood doors in all exterior openings, per the submitted drawings.
- Cut sheet for new doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Landscaping

- Regrade yard on all elevations, as needed.
- Install sod, or plant grass, as needed.

IX. OLD BUSINESS

X. NEW BUSINESS

XI. ADJOURN