

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION REVISED AGENDA

Tuesday, April 17, 2018

6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-7206, or email raisbell@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, May 8, 2018 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 312.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, May 15, 2018.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, March 20, 2018.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

1. **18-4-7**
1160 N. High St.
Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)/ Stonewall Columbus (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

NEW APPLICATIONS

- ~~2. 18-4-8~~
~~288 E. Fourth Ave. (Front & Rear)~~
~~Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Jeff Jablonka (Owner)~~ —
WITHDRAWN
3. **18-4-9**
834 Hamlet St.
Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Kristin Boggs & Adam Ward (Owners)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
4. **18-4-10**
972-974 N. Fourth St.
Jarrod Share (Applicant)/ Allison Adams (Owner)
An application, siteplan, drawings, photos, and variance information has been submitted.
New Construction
 - Construct new 2-bedroom, 2.5 bath apartment above three (3) garages.
 - Building has been designed to defer to the historic two-family home on the site.Variance Recommendation Request
 - 3332.039 - R-4 Allowable uses: to allow a 2-family and a carriage house to be on the same parcel.



- 3332.15 - R-4 area district requirements: Requires that a 2-family be on a lot that's 6,000sq' and a 1-family be on a lot that is 5,000sq' whereas the applicant is proposing to place both a 1-family and a 2-family on a lot that is 6,375 sq'.
- 3332.19 - Fronting, Dwelling fronting an alley
- 3332.25 Max Side Yards: The 2 required side yards must add up to at least 20% of the lot width or 8.5', whereas the applicant is proposing 6'.
- 3332.26 - Minimum side yard permitted: minimum side yard is 5', whereas the applicant is proposing 3' for both the north and south side yards.
- 3332.27 - Rear yard, 25% of lot for each dwelling: Whereas the applicant is proposing 35% for the 2-family and 0% for the carriage house.

The following is taken from the February 2018 Italian Village Commission meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Fergus – *The flat roof design for the carriage house makes sense. The color of the building should stay within those of the main house.*
- Commissioner Cooke – *Not supportive of the flat roof. The current design seems too big. Encouraged the applicant to consider a pitched roof to help bring the scale down. The buildings across the street have a different vocabulary; there is a difference between row houses and carriage houses. The man doors should be pulled away from the end wall (at least 1-ft if not more). Is concerned with the scale of the patio.*
- Commissioner Hagerling – *Agrees with Commissioner Cooke. The third floor should be pulled in/away from the end walls to help the massing. The windows sizes taken from the main house are good. More windows are needed on the side elevations. The mass does need to be broken down more.*
- Commissioner Boyer – *Agrees with the other comments. The footprint size is fine for the site; there is plenty of room. The overall mass need to be broken down further.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

5. 18-4-11

1100 Summit St.

MM Developing, LLC (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, photos have been submitted.

- Construct new 2-story two-unit multi-family home.
- Construct new 2-car garage.

The following is taken from the January 2018 Italian Village Commission meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- *A drawing should be developed that shows the height datum of the new building with existing neighboring properties.*
- *The additional stacked parking spaces should be removed from the design. The driveway will need to utilize a brick paver system due to the amount of hardscaped area.*
- *Commissioners also discussed the possibility of turning the building on the site.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.

7. 18-4-13

853 Summit St.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)/ David Armeni (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Construct new cross-gable addition and new dormers on existing single-family residence.

- Construct new two-story structure at rear of property; first floor includes parking for up to 8 cars and the second floor contains two (2) residential units.

8. 18-4-14

848 Pearl St.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)/ Borrer Properties (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Installation of new windows in previously blocked-in openings.
- Construct new recessed entrance vestibules.
- Paint block and brick.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:00 P.M.

6. 18-4-12

251 Greenwood Ave. (Reviewed as 249 E. Greenwood Ave., “House F”)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Hallmark Campus Property (Owner)

An application, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

- Revision of previously approved new single-family home (COA#18-1-3) to painted brick.
- Revise headers over windows and doors to brick.

9. 18-4-15

750 N. High St.

Meyers Architecture (Applicant) SNH Columbus Owner, LLC (Owner)

An application, siteplan, and revised drawings have been submitted.

- Renovation of existing Bollinger Tower building for use as a boutique Graduate Hotel with 171 guestrooms.
- Approximately 35 existing parking spaces on site will be parked and stacked by valet and the balance of required spaces will be leased off-site and valet parked.
- Existing windows will be removed and replaced with units integrating the necessary mechanicals grills.
- Existing EIFS will be painted and the sunscreens removed.
- The High Street portion of the site will be built out to continue the Short North streetscape, housing a 1,500sqft retail space to the north and an expansion of lobby spaces and a restaurant to the south with occupiable roof terraces.
- A rooftop bar and terrace will be added atop the existing 11-story tower.

The following is taken from the March 2018 Italian Village Commission meeting minutes:

Continue application #18-3-10, 750 N. High St., to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Goodman – *The metal used in the storefront systems and throughout the project should be heavy gauge to avoid any possible oil-canning of light gauge material. Is against the southern-most small building.*
- Commissioner Hagerling – *The new streetscape is good. The kneewall needs to be updated, and no break metal should be used in the design. The edge details will be important. The enlarged windows are an improvement.*
- Commissioner Boyer – *Agrees that the current design is a big improvement. The entry piece needs to have more details and the lighting needs to be figured out. The back canopy needs to have more detail. The storefront window designs are good.*
- Commissioner Cooke – *Is against the rooftop use. All the changes are really good. The use of a block kneewall is not typical and should be redesigned. Signage, lighting, and landscaping will need to be thought out and return for review.*

- Commissioner Fergus – Agrees with other Commissioners. Is in support of the rooftop use. The smaller building on the end and its use are good. Supports the project.
- Commissioner Sudy – Needs to see details on how the rear canopy will work. The new entry plaza needs to be taken to the next level, details need to be developed. Supports the rooftop use because its height will make minimize its effect on the neighboring properties. The landscaping of the new High Street approach needs to pull down to the side streets.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:30 P.M.

10. 18-4-16

796 N. High St. (Parkside On Pearl)

JBAD (Applicant)/ Short North Partners, LLC (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

New Construction

- Construction of a 7-story approximately 81,000sf apartment development.
- The proposed development will consist of: 65 apartment units on floors 3-7, a fitness area and lobby and/or residential at level 1, common areas, lounge and decks at level 7, and two parking decks (above and below grade).
- Proposed exterior materials include brick, aluminum and glass storefront windows, and an aluminum panel cladding. The seventh story being recessed from the Italian Village Park property line.

Variance Recommendation Request

- The project was previously approved for variances per Council Variance #CVS14-005. Below please find updates to the variance request based on the current design.
- Use: Previously approved in CVS14-005 variance for 47 units. Proposed current design revised use request includes 65 apartment units.
- Mixed-Use Requirement: Proposed current project shows single use with apartment units, parking amenities and lobby. Previously approved for 47 units over townhomes at level 01. Per documentation, C-4 only permits dwelling units over specific, non-residential uses.
- Height Limit: Proposed current design height is 79'-6". Previously approved for 72'-0".
- Setback: Approved for zero lot line setback - no change.
- Parking: Proposed current design includes 46 parking spaces. Previously approved in CVS14-005 variance for deficit of 10 parking spaces. Owner shall comply with Short North Parking Guidelines.
- Vision Triangle: Vision triangle required at Hubbard and Pearl entrance. Project is on lot line, variance was approved to omit vision triangle requirement. No change in updated design to this condition.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

• **18-4-1**

60 E. Third Ave.

JF Bakers Sons, Inc. (Applicant)/ Phil Armbruster (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-1, 60 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing deteriorated asphalt shingle roof on east side.
- Install new CertainTeed standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Nickel Gray”.
- Reinstall metal ridge roll and install new valleys and flashing; color to be “Tinner’s Red”.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingle to be CertainTeed standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Nickel Gray”.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **18-4-2**

59-61 Hull Alley

Diane Keener (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-2, 59-61 Hull Alley, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair box gutters as needed to match existing.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **18-4-3**

Multiple Addresses (Fifth to Goodale avenues)

Short North Alliance (Applicant)

Approve Application 18-4-3, Multiple Addresses (Fifth to Goodale avenues), as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Installation of temporary murals on multiple locations for the ‘Short North Arts District Mini Mural’ program for 2018.

- The submission includes every possible mini mural location as identified by the Mini Mural Committee, which upon approval of locations will identify which site will be used for the 2018 program.

- **18-4-4**

251 Detroit Ave.

Jason Roland (Applicant)/ Ryan Osborn (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-4, 251 Detroit Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint exterior as needed to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **18-4-5**

688 Kerr St.

Christy Thorp (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-5, 688 Kerr St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new storm windows per submitted specifications; new units to be by ProVia, color to be "Chateau".
- Repair attic window and trim as needed to match existing; new work to be painted to match existing trim.

Install New Storm Windows

- Install new, low profile, metal storm windows.
- New storm windows to be installed inside the existing window frame.
- Storm window color to match the primary trim color as closely as possible.
- Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.
- Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows.
- Storm windows to operate smoothly.
- All work to be in accordance with the performance manual.

- **18-4-6**

1110-1112 Summit St.

Brian Knoppe (Applicant)/ Supra Investments, LLC & Tommie L., Jason M., and Cynthia L. Dowell (Owners)

Approve Application 18-4-6, 1110-1112 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing asphalt shingle roof; install new GAF "Slateline" dimensional asphalt shingle roof, color to be "English Gray Slate".
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; color to be either "Tinner's Red" or "Gray".
- Repair/replace existing wood siding and trim as needed to match existing and per submitted specifications.
- Repair/replace existing soffit, casings, and trim as needed to match existing and per submitted specifications.
- Paint residence: body to be Sherwin Williams "Raycroft Pewter" (SW2848), trim to be Sherwin Williams "Passive" (SW7064) or Sherwin Williams "Snowbound" (SW7004).

- Install new gutters and downspouts per submitted specifications.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Window Casings Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood window casings/trim on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
 - Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.
- **18-4-7**
1160 N. High St.
Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)/ Stonewall Columbus (Owner)
Approve Application 18-4-7, 1160 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Complete final landscaping and plant selections.
 - Signage package to be submitted for review and a future hearing.

- **18-4-9a&b**

834 Hamlet St.

Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Kristin Boggs & Adam Ward (Owners)

Approve Application 18-4-9a, 834 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

New Construction

- Demolish existing concrete block single-car garage.
- Construct new 2-car carriage house with second floor living unit.

Recommend Approval of Application 18-4-9b, 834 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 3332.039 – to allow a second residential structure on the parcel.
- 3332.15 – to reduce the minimum lot area from 6,000 square feet to 4,791 square feet (a reduction of 1,209 square feet) for two (2) dwelling units.
- 3332.38 (F)(1) – to increase the size of a garage from 720 square feet to 735 square feet (an increase of 15 square feet).
- 3332.38 (G) – to increase the height of the garage from 15' to 29' (an increase of 14').
- 3332.27- to reduce the required rear yard area for the new building from 25% to 0% (a reduction of 25%).
- 3332.26 (C)(1) – to reduce the sideyard setback on the existing house from 3' to 0' (a reduction of 3' to 0').
- 3332.21 (F) – to reduce the required building setback from 12' to 10' (a reduction 2') for the existing house.

- X. OLD BUSINESS**
- XI. NEW BUSINESS**
- XII. ADJOURNMENT**