

**BREWERY DISTRICT COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
Thursday, March 1, 2018  
Conference Room B, 50 W. Gay Street – Ground Floor**

**Commissioners Present:** Cynthia Hunt, William Schottenstein, Gerald Simmons, Bill Hugus, Jeff Pongonis, Dina Lopez, Rob Moore

**Historic Preservation Office Staff Present:** Cristin Moody

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:00 pm
- II. NEXT MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – Thursday, March 29, 2018
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Thursday, April 5, 2018
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES – February 1, 2018 MOTION: Pongonis/Hugus (7-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION**

**1. 18-3-1**

**755 South High Street**

**Maxwell Adam McGarity (Applicant)**

**McGarity Holdings, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #18-3-2, 755 South High Street, as submitted:

Variance Request

- C.C. 3312.49 – to allow zero additional parking spaces for expansion of restaurant/event space use on second floor (10 spaces required for additional square footage).
- Business owner has agreement with Grange Insurance to allow unlimited use of their parking garage.

MOTION: Pongonis/Hugus (6-0-1) RECOMMENDED [Schottenstein abstained].

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**2. 18-3-2**

**966 South High Street**

**966 South High Development, LLC (Applicant)**

**Columbus City Schools (Owner)**

*Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant, Commissioners present offered comments and suggestions, as summarized here:*

Commissioner Comments

- *Hugus:* Attended the site visit, and it changed his perspective; he saw that the building is in structurally excellent shape, even on the third story. The only thing missing is the rear wall, due to previous removal of a rear addition. Feels the building does deserve to be saved. The front addition, built after 1921, could go, if necessary.



- *Simmons*: One of the Commission’s duties is to guard historic buildings. But just because a building is old, doesn’t mean it is a bad idea to replace it with something better, particularly if it’s constructed in such a way that it lends itself to the neighborhood. In favor of the proposal.
- *Lopez*: Following the site visit and seeing that the building looked structurally sound, she is undecided on the proposal. There is still concern about the cost of renovation. She noted that it would be helpful to see more of the applicant’s due diligence process for determining that reuse of the building, and incorporating it into the project, would not work.
- *Pongonis*: It is disappointing that Columbus City Schools did not agree to add to the parcel and that they are not here to participate in this process. The Commission has not been presented with enough information to give a positive vote. Will need to see a master plan, the proposed architecture, and more on the new Maennerchor expansion. Even a recommendation for the lot split will need more information.
- *Hunt*: She would also like to see a reasonable effort by the applicant to show any concepts that have been considered for reusing the building, and how the conclusion was reached that it is not possible. Noted that she is not prepared to make any decision on the lot split until we know the whole picture because that will have material impact on the ability to do a development here.

*Following the Commissioner comments, the Chair called all members of the public wishing to comment:*

<b><u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u></b>	<b><u>Issues/Comments:</u></b>
Cathy Hunsinger 228 Lear St.	Written comments submitted opposing the demolition of the existing Maennerchor building.
Sarah Marsom Young Ohio Preservationists	Opposed to the demolition. Questioned the consideration of demolition for a private developer when it was denied previously for the school. Noted that the developer could pursue tax credits for rehabilitation. She believes that the building is contributing and should be retained.
Mike Knilans Columbus Maennerchor	Supports the demolition proposal. Shared the history of the Columbus Maennerchor group and noted that they were planning to demolish the existing building to build a new structure before they sold it. The proposed project would help the organization survive. Stated that he does not believe the existing structure is historic.
Nancy Kotting German Village Society	Opposed to the demolition. Asked that the Commission abide by its duties and deny the proposal. Noted that in her experience, authenticity in a new development is a “hot ticket” right now. She has seen many projects where structures in worse condition than this were successfully redeveloped and were economically viable.
Beck West Columbus Landmarks Foundation	Opposed to the proposal for demolition and concerned that it would set a dangerous precedent. The property is significant and contributes to the architectural character of the neighborhood as well as the area’s cultural history. Sacrificing this building risks eroding more of the neighborhood identity and becoming a generic anyplace. Urged the Commission to wait for a redevelopment proposal that reuses this building.

At the request of the Applicant, continue Application #18-3-2, 966 South High Street, and place on the April 5, 2018 meeting agenda as a holdover.

**Lot Split Recommendation**

- Subdivide existing school property to create new 0.317 acre parcel with frontage along High Street, per submitted site plan.

Conceptual Review

- Construct new building with 1’ setback from High Street for landscaping, per submitted site plan.

MOTION: Hugus/Hunt (7-0-0) CONTINUED.

**3. 18-3-3**

**715 South Pearl Street**

**Joan C. Janning, Flat Black Commercial Visuals (Applicant) Luteg High, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #18-3-3, 715 South Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Paint previously painted masonry walls dark gray.

Signage

- Install one 23.75 sq. ft. wall sign over the door on the east elevation (facing South Pearl Street) with external light fixture and one 15.32 sq. ft. oval wall sign on the south elevation with external light fixture, per submitted plans and specifications.

New Door

- Create new doorway opening in the concrete block wall for a single service door on the east elevation, per submitted, revised plans. A cut sheet for the door is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final approval, prior to installation.

MOTION: Hunt/Pongonis (7-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners were supportive of the idea for the mural and look forward to seeing the artwork.

Conceptual Review

- Install hand-paint mural on north elevation, to cover the full two-story wall. Artwork to be submitted for Brewery District Commission review.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

**4. 18-3-4**

**455 South Ludlow Street**

**David Rectenwald (Applicant)**

**Icehouse Ventures, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #18-3-4, 455 South Ludlow Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Parking Deck

- Amend previously approved parking deck to remove one bay at the northwest corner of the building, per submitted, revised plan.
- Install new dumpster enclosure east of the existing smokestack; enclosure to be black metal framing with vertical wood boards.

MOTION: Hugus/Pongonis (5-0-2) APPROVED [Schottenstein recused, Lopez abstained].

**IX. OLD BUSINESS**

**X. NEW BUSINESS**

**VI. ADJOURNMENT – 7:31pm - MOTION: Hugus/Hunt (7-0-0) ADJOURNED.**