

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION AGENDA

Tuesday, July 17, 2018
6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-7206, or email raisbell@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, August 14, 2018 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, August 21, 2018.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, June 19, 2018.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

NEW APPLICATIONS

1. 18-7-10

248 E. Fourth Ave.

Josh Myers (Owner)

An application, drawings, site plan, and specs have been submitted.

- Revision to Previously Approved Plans.
- Revise window configurations to a combination of Casement, Awning, and Fixed.
- Add a garage door on the South side of the garage.
- Modify railing detail.
- Change window specifications to Marvin Integrity.

2. 18-7-11

772 N. High Street

Kevin Crowley (Applicant) Wood Companies (Owner)

An application, drawings, site plan, and specs have been submitted.

- Exterior sign located above the existing steel beams.
- Sign would be 24" High by 18' 9.5" Wide.
- Sign to be aluminum and illuminated with channel set flex-neon LEDs.

3. 18-7-12

51 E. Lincoln St.

Susan Sommerfeld (Owner)

An application, drawings, site plan, and photos have been submitted.

- Construct Family Room addition to connect residence with the 2nd floor of the existing garage.
- Window and door replacement on existing garage.
- Replace an existing wood fence with a wrought iron fence.
- New addition to be clad in Board & Batten siding to match the existing garage.
- 3-tab shingles to be chosen from the approved list.

The following is taken from the June 2018 Italian Village Commission meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Hagerling – The proposed removals are good. The roofline of the addition needs some work; the off-center roofline needs to be adjusted. The pitch should match either the pitch of the addition to the main house or the pitch of the roof of the garage. Maybe the addition should be made parallel to the house, not both.
- Commissioner Boyer – Agrees with Commissioner Hagerling. A roof pitch change would help “settle in” the addition.
- Commissioner Cooke – Okay with the addition because of the location, and that it isn’t visible from the street. The windows shown at the ends of the east wall should be reconfigured, not at the ends of the wall. Horizontal siding should be considered for the addition and garage.
- Commissioner Fergus – Agrees with other Commissioners. The addition to the house is appropriate. A more symmetrical roofline is needed.

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.

4. 18-7-13

608 N. High Street

3D/Group – Antonio Colosimo (Applicant) Battersea Development Sub, LLC. (Owner)

An application, drawings, site plan, and specs have been submitted.

- Revision to Previously Approved Plans.
- North High Street elevation revised to retain existing original angles, recessed entry, replacing existing inward swinging doors with a single egress door. Code required closer and egress hardware, and matching sidelites.
- Entry to the apartments will remain on Poplar. Patio will Not be constructed.
- Previously approved Nana-wall systems will Not be constructed. The existing storefronts will be rebuilt with new tempered or safety glazing, clear transoms, and new painted wood trim.
- Existing High Street canopy will be removed. New awnings will be only at the apartment entries on Poplar.
- Existing exterior lights will be cleaned, re-lamped, and repainted.

5. 18-7-14

197-201 E. Fifth Ave./aka 1453 N. 4th St.

DEV (Applicant) 4x5 Investment Holdings, LLC (Owner)

An application, drawings, site plan, and specs have been submitted.

- Revision to Previously Approved Plans (COA#17-6-20).
- Third floor deck depth revisions and change in roof slope.
- Proposed additions and revisions to windows.
- Proposed 24” overhang.
- Color scheme revision.

The following is taken from the June 2017 Italian Village Commission meeting minutes:

- *Construct new 3-story residential building containing 11 new townhomes and 3 new flat-style units. Exterior 3rd floor terraces and attached garages are provided for the 8 townhouse units.*
- *Construct new 6-unit private garage structure, with 2 additional off-street parking spots.*
- *The divider is to be removed from the Fifth Ave. balcony.*
- *The corner canopy design, all signage, lighting, and landscaping are to return for review at a future IVC hearing.*

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (4-0-0) APPROVED.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:00 P.M.

6. 18-7-15

796 N. High St. (Parkside On Pearl)

JBAD (Applicant)/ Short North Partners, LLC (Owner)

An application, drawings, site plan, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Approval was granted at the June 2018 meeting.

New Construction

- Construction of a 7-story approximately 81,000sf apartment development.
- The proposed development will consist of: 65 apartment units on floors 3-7, a fitness area and lobby and/or residential at level 1, common areas, lounge and decks at level 7, and two parking decks (above and below grade).
- Proposed exterior materials include brick, aluminum and glass storefront windows, and an aluminum panel cladding. The seventh story being recessed from the Italian Village Park property line.
- Seeking approval for building design.

7. 18-7-16

Neruda Ave. (Jeffrey Park)

Michael Maistros (Applicant)

Windsor Lofts II, LLC (Owner)

An application, drawings, and site plan have been submitted.

- Construct a new 3-story condominium as per submitted plans.

The following is taken from the June 2018 Italian Village Commission meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- *Commissioner Fergus – Discussed materials, too much concrete in the design at this point.*
- *Commissioner Hagerling – The surrounding buildings should be shown to better understand the existing neighborhood context.*
- *Commissioner Boyer – Agrees with the concerns over the Hardi-plank made to look like wood. The rooftop railing should be pulled back from the edge to keep a cleaner line. The applicant should play more with the vertical element of the towers.*
- *Commissioner Cooke – Recommended that the applicant build off the strengths of the neighboring “red building”.*
- *Commissioner Sudy – The use of the alley for all parking ingress/egress is good.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:30 P.M.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

8. 18-7-17

174 E. Fourth Ave.

Philip Herren (Applicant)

David Betz (Owner)

An application, drawings, and site plan have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing concrete block residence and garage constructed in 1957.
- Construct two 2-Family buildings per submitted drawings and site plans.

Variance Recommendation

- Proposed development would require a Council Variance.
- 3332.039: R-4 residential district - Will allow the construction of two, 2-family unit buildings on one lot rather than other allowed residential buildings, on property zoned within the R-4 District.

- 3332.19: Fronting - Will allow the property to continue to have access off of Greenwood Avenue to the 4 units via a common driveway, which will be established within the condominium association documents for common use, parking restrictions, and maintenance.

The following is taken from the June 2018 Italian Village Commission meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Cooke – Thanked the applicant for the streetscape. The French door/full length doors on the first floor should be changed to windows. The awning canopies design is not from the vocabulary of the neighborhood and should be removed from the design.
- Commissioner Fergus – Appreciates the balconies, but is concerned about how they will perform with people on them. The window canopies on the first floor aren't needed and should be removed from the design. The wall dormers on the current design are a bit strange.
- Commissioner Boyer – The board and batten siding should be pulled all the way to the ground. The awnings over the windows are kind of a farmhouse look and don't fit the design. Additional columns are needed across the porches. The eaves seem really high and should be adjusted.
- Commissioner Hagerling – The mix of horizontal siding with board and batten siding is not typical. Overall the designs are good, but some adjustments are needed. The third floor needs to be shrunk down/pulled down some. More porch columns are needed.
- Commissioner Sudy – The site design is good. Fencing and plantings should be drawn from examples in the neighborhood. Encouraged maintaining existing trees were possible and the use of trees indicated in the current plan.

NO ACTION TAKEN

9. 18-7-18

1050 N. Fourth St.

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)

An application, revised drawings, and site plan have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing concrete block building (former location of Durable Slate).
- Construct 68-unit wood frame apartment building with parking at grade on the first floor.
- Discussion of massing, density, site access, and general building metrics.

The following is taken from the May 2018 Italian Village Commission Special Meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- *Commissioner Goodman – Is not opposed to the height/mass if it fits within the context of the neighborhood. How does the project contribute to the streetscape? Setback, height, and residential density will be key factors. In the next round of designs, the streetscape should be considered...contribute to the corridor and architectural narrative. Demo: It's a shame to see all of the building go. Partial reuse of the existing building would be good, but at least a motif should be saved from the building and reincorporated.*
- *Commissioner Cooke – In favor of demolition with reincorporation of elements of the building into the new design. The current design looks like Easton. Character needs to be pulled from the neighborhood and used in the design. Consider asymmetrical design. Originality is needed at this site.*
- *Commissioner Boyer – An asymmetrical approach would be helpful to the design. There is currently too much mass; parts of the building should be narrowed. It should not be a large block that takes up the entire site. Maybe three (3) buildings could be composed on the site.*
- *Commissioner Hagerling – Agrees with the comments from other Commissioners. There are differing setback conditions on the street. The current proposed is a very large building; too large. Asymmetry could help with the design. Consider following the angle of the block like the current building. Perhaps the site would work with three (3) buildings and incorporation of the stone lintels of the historic building.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

• **18-7-1**

144-146 Warren Street

Joe Galati (Applicant)

Sam Gorant & Joe Galati (Owners)

Approve Application 18-7-1, 144-146 Warren Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Body, Trim, Molding, Windows to be Benjamin Moore Graphite (1603)
- Shake, Wood Siding, Doors to be Benjamin Moore Temptation (1607)
- Porch Floors & Ceiling to be Benjamin Moore Rock Gray(1615)
- Repair front and rear porch as needed to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new 1" x 3" tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Restore the front porch banisters/hand rails/columns as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails/columns; like-for-like.

• **18-7-2**

53 E. First Avenue

Greg Anglin (Applicant)

Mike Blue & Greg Anglin (Owners)

Approve Application 18-7-2, 53 E. First Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair and paint porch columns as needed to match existing.
- Repair porch banisters as needed to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.

- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new 1" x 3" tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Restore the front porch banisters/hand rails/columns as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails/columns; like-for-like.

- **18-7-3**

45-47 E. First Avenue

Greg Anglin (Applicant)

Mike Blue & Greg Anglin (Owners)

Approve Application 18-7-3, 45-47 E. First Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint rear porches as needed to match existing.
- Repair chimney as needed to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing (brick/stone/block) to match the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-

4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings”).

- **18-7-4**

- **674 Kerr Street**

- **Andrew Lehman (Owner)**

- Approve Application 18-7-4, 674 Kerr Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove and replace the existing fence as per submitted drawing and materials.

- Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6’ wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **18-7-5**

- **942 Mt. Pleasant Avenue**

- **Able Roof (Applicant)**

- **Ben Ogg (Owners)**

- Approve Application 18-7-5, 942 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove and replace the existing rubber (EPDM) roof on the garage.

- Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- **All existing historic tile parapet coping to be reinstalled. Any/all replacement tile to match existing.**

- **18-7-6**

- **1122-1124 N. High Street**

- **John Smith/J&J Roofing (Applicant)**

- **Sandra Ruanphae (Owners)**

- Approve Application 18-7-6, 1122-1124 N. High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove and replace the existing rubber (EPDM) roof on the garage.
- Remove the existing rubber roof (EDPM) and the existing shingles underneath on the 5/12 pitched roof on the rear of the building and replace with new Owens Corning standard 3-tab Estate Gray

- Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.

- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

- **All existing historic tile parapet coping to be reinstalled. Any/all replacement tile to match existing.**

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the 5/12 pitched roof on the rear of the building, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **18-7-7**

1065 Say Avenue

Ed Schiebel Owners)

Approve Application 18-7-7, 1065 Say Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Restore the middle window on the North side of the house that was previously removed and boarded.
- To be replaced with a wood one-over-one double hung window from the approved window list.

Replace Window

- Install new, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window to be selected from Approved Window List and brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

- **18-7-8**

250 E. Fourth Ave.

KM Development Group, LLC (Applicant)

Josh Myers (Owner)

Approve Application 18-7-8, 250 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Revision to Previously Approved Plans
- Change window specifications to Marvin Integrity.
- Revise window grids per submitted drawings.

- **18-7-9**

31-39 E. Hubbard Ave.

Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve Application #18-7-9, 31-39 E. Hubbard Ave., for renewal of expired COA #17-6-13 (Expired: June 20, 2018), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Approve application #17-6-13, 31-39 E. Hubbard Ave., as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- *Demolition of non-contributing non-historic garage in preparation for previously approved Parkside On Pearl project.*

MOTION: Boyer/Maas (4-0-0) APPROVED.

- X. OLD BUSINESS**
- XI. NEW BUSINESS**
- XII. ADJOURNMENT**