

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, April 17, 2018

6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Shannon Fergus, Ben Goodman, Rex Hagerling (6:31), Jason Sudy.

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:06pm.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, May 8, 2018 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 312.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, May 15, 2018.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, March 20, 2018. MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **18-4-7**
1160 N. High St.
Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)/ Stonewall Columbus (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. **18-4-8**
~~**288 E. Fourth Ave. (Front & Rear)**~~
~~**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Jeff Jablonka (Owner)**~~ —
WITHDRAWN
3. **18-4-9**
834 Hamlet St.
Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Kristin Boggs & Adam Ward (Owners)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
4. **18-4-10**
972-974 N. Fourth St.
Jarrold Share (Applicant)/ Allison Adams (Owner)
Continue Application #18-4-10, 972-974 N. Fourth St., to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:
New Construction
 - Construct new 2-bedroom, 2.5 bath apartment above three (3) garages.
 - Building has been designed to defer to the historic two-family home on the site.Variance Recommendation Request
 - 3332.039 - R-4 Allowable uses: to allow a 2-family and a carriage house to be on the same parcel.
 - 3332.15 - R-4 area district requirements: Requires that a 2-family be on a lot that's 6,000sq' and a 1-family be on a lot that is 5,000sq' whereas the applicant is proposing to place both a 1-family and a 2-family on a lot that is 6,375 sq'.



- 3332.19 - Fronting, Dwelling fronting an alley
- 3332.25 Max Side Yards: The 2 required side yards must add up to at least 20% of the lot width or 8.5', whereas the applicant is proposing 6'.
- 3332.26 - Minimum side yard permitted: minimum side yard is 5', whereas the applicant is proposing 3' for both the north and south side yards.
- 3332.27 - Rear yard, 25% of lot for each dwelling: Whereas the applicant is proposing 35% for the 2-family and 0% for the carriage house.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Goodman – The angled wall should be reconsidered. Taller windows could be considered and/or added detail to the top. A more traditional waning with brackets should be used. The lot coverage is okay. True elevations are needed for Commission review.
- Commissioner Boyer – Agrees with Commissioner Goodman. A flat parapet top should be returned to the design. The front wall should be brought down lower, perhaps adding a small railing on top to cover code requirements. Details need to be added to the canopy. The footprint is okay.
- Commissioner Cooke – Requested floor plans and measured/scaled elevations of the carriage house. The moved position of the doors is good. The angled parapet wall should be changed back. The large panels of material on the top/penthouse should be altered to a more traditional material/design. Agrees with Commissioner Boyer, the front wall should be lowered and have a simple railing to meet code.
- Commissioner Fergus – Agrees with other Commissioner comments. The large panels of material should be removed from the design. The previous design for the carriage house was better in a number of ways. The Sketchup have been helpful, but architectural drawings are needed.

5. 18-4-11

1100 Summit St.

MM Developing, LLC (Owner)

WITHDRAWN

7. 18-4-13

853 Summit St.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)/ David Armeni (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new cross-gable addition and new dormers on existing single-family residence.
- Construct new two-story structure at rear of property; first floor includes parking for up to 8 cars and the second floor contains two (2) residential units.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners indicated support for the proposed rehabilitation and addition to the historic residence, but were not supportive of the new two-unit proposal.
- Commissioner Cooke – Is against the proposed height of the new structure, is against two (2) additional units on the site, and a design that is bigger than the original house. Could support a single carriage house.
- Commissioner Fergus – Agrees with the issues of lot coverage and size of the building; couldn't support a building that is bigger than the original (including the proposed addition).S
- Commissioner Boyer – Agrees with other Commissioners, the height and scale are too much. Asked about the proposed access from an existing easement. The extra garage doors and “drive-through” going either east or west would be too much for the site.
- Commissioner Hagerling – Is opposed to any structure that is larger than the original house. A carriage house could be okay at the site, but the proposed building is too much for the site.

8. 18-4-14

848 Pearl St.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)/ Borrer Properties (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Installation of new windows in previously blocked-in openings.
- Construct new recessed entrance vestibules.
- Paint block and brick.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission indicated support for the proposed alterations, with the majority of Commissioners in favor of either traditional storefronts or roll-up garage doors.
- Green space or art should be added to the corner (similar to the previous approval for the site).

6. 18-4-12

251 Greenwood Ave. (Reviewed as 249 E. Greenwood Ave., "House F")

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Hallmark Campus Property (Owner)

Approve application #18-4-12, 251 Greenwood Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Revision of previously approved new single-family home (COA#18-1-3) to painted brick.
- Revise headers over windows and doors to brick.
- The stoop is to be either unpainted brick or unpainted concrete.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (6-0-0) APPROVED.

9. 18-4-15

750 N. High St.

Meyers Architecture (Applicant)/ SNH Columbus Owner, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #18-4-15, 750 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Renovation of existing Bollinger Tower building for use as a boutique Graduate Hotel with 171 guestrooms.
- Approximately 35 existing parking spaces on site will be parked and stacked by valet and the balance of required spaces will be leased off-site and valet parked.
- Existing windows will be removed and replaced with units integrating the necessary mechanicals grills.
- Existing EIFS will be painted and the sunscreens removed.
- The High Street portion of the site will be built out to continue the Short North streetscape, housing a 1,500sqft retail space to the north and an expansion of lobby spaces and a restaurant to the south with occupiable roof terraces.
- A rooftop bar and terrace will be added atop the existing 11-story tower.
- The high wall associated with the ADA ramp is to be studied, perhaps modified with metal work to lower the wall visually.
- A detail design drawing of the rooftop glass railing is to be submitted.
- A new ACM panel detail is to be developed to create a more authentic appearance for the material. The use of light and edge detailing was discussed; however the applicant may take design steps as necessary.
- Revised drawings and details are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval in coordination with the Architectural Sub Committee prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Fergus/Boyer (5-1-0) APPROVED. [Goodman]

10. 18-4-16

796 N. High St. (Parkside On Pearl)

JBAD (Applicant)/ Short North Partners, LLC (Owner)

Continue Application #18-4-16, 796 N. High St., to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

New Construction

- Construction of a 7-story approximately 81,000sf apartment development.

- The proposed development will consist of: 65 apartment units on floors 3-7, a fitness area and lobby and/or residential at level 1, common areas, lounge and decks at level 7, and two parking decks (above and below grade).
- Proposed exterior materials include brick, aluminum and glass storefront windows, and an aluminum panel cladding. The seventh story being recessed from the Italian Village Park property line.

Variance Recommendation Request

- The project was previously approved for variances per Council Variance #CVS14-005. Below please find updates to the variance request based on the current design.
- Use: Previously approved in CVS14-005 variance for 47 units. Proposed current design revised use request includes 65 apartment units.
- Mixed-Use Requirement: Proposed current project shows single use with apartment units, parking amenities and lobby. Previously approved for 47 units over townhomes at level 01. Per documentation, C-4 only permits dwelling units over specific, non-residential uses.
- Height Limit: Proposed current design height is 79'-6". Previously approved for 72'-0".
- Setback: Approved for zero lot line setback - no change.
- Parking: Proposed current design includes 46 parking spaces. Previously approved in CVS14-005 variance for deficit of 10 parking spaces. Owner shall comply with Short North Parking Guidelines.
- Vision Triangle: Vision triangle required at Hubbard and Pearl entrance. Project is on lot line, variance was approved to omit vision triangle requirement. No change in updated design to this condition.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Fergus – Materials of the design will be very important. Asked the applicant to consider a retail use as part of the ground floor. The new design seems more bulky than the previous design.
- Commissioner Cooke – The new design has gotten taller than the previous approval. The materials should be lightened, and be more in harmony with the brickwork surrounding the park. Asked that the locations for the mechanicals on the roof be shown. Any signage will need to be of a more pedestrian scale. Some of the openings at the fitness center could be infilled.
- Commissioner Boyer – Appreciates the nods to traditional building designs. Has concerns with the proposed corrugated metal. The flex brick is a great design solution, but light will be key. The light should not be a bright institutional LED, rather there is an opportunity for washes of light that make the area more inviting to pedestrians.
- Commissioner Hagerling – Was previously against the development, but the context of the site has changed since the project's approval. The current design is better than the original. Echoes the concerns of other Commissioners on how the project embraces the park.
- Commissioner Goodman – More green elements should be incorporated into the roof. Has concerns with the project that are a legacy of the previous approval; particularly, the relationship of the building to the park and how its scale works with the environment. Some symbiosis with the park needs to be created. A more human scale at the park edge would be appreciated.
- Commissioner Sudy – The design of buildings with sloped ramps for parking that can't easily be converted to other uses needs to stop. The future of the neighbor will not involve automobiles and their parking spaces. Agrees with other Commissioner comments.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

- **18-4-1**

60 E. Third Ave.

JF Bakers Sons, Inc. (Applicant)/ Phil Armbruster (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-1, 60 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing deteriorated asphalt shingle roof on east side.
- Install new CertainTeed standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Nickel Gray”.
- Reinstall metal ridge roll and install new valleys and flashing; color to be “Tinner’s Red”.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingle to be CertainTeed standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Nickel Gray”.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **18-4-2**

59-61 Hull Alley

Diane Keener (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-2, 59-61 Hull Alley, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair box gutters as needed to match existing.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **18-4-3**

Multiple Addresses (Fifth to Goodale avenues)

Short North Alliance (Applicant)

Approve Application 18-4-3, Multiple Addresses (Fifth to Goodale avenues), as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Installation of temporary murals on multiple locations for the ‘Short North Arts District Mini Mural’ program for 2018.
- The submission includes every possible mini mural location as identified by the Mini Mural Committee, which upon approval of locations will identify which site will be used for the 2018 program.

- **18-4-4**

251 Detroit Ave.

Jason Roland (Applicant)/ Ryan Osborn (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-4, 251 Detroit Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint exterior as needed to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **18-4-5**

688 Kerr St.

Christy Thorp (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-5, 688 Kerr St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new storm windows per submitted specifications; new units to be by ProVia, color to be "Chateau".
- Repair attic window and trim as needed to match existing; new work to be painted to match existing trim.

Install New Storm Windows

- Install new, low profile, metal storm windows.
- New storm windows to be installed inside the existing window frame.
- Storm window color to match the primary trim color as closely as possible.
- Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.
- Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows.
- Storm windows to operate smoothly.
- All work to be in accordance with the performance manual.

- **18-4-6 [Fergus]**

1110-1112 Summit St.

Brian Knoppe (Applicant)/ Supra Investments, LLC & Tommie L., Jason M., and Cynthia L. Dowell (Owners)

Approve Application 18-4-6, 1110-1112 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing asphalt shingle roof; install new GAF "Slateline" dimensional asphalt shingle roof, color to be "English Gray Slate".
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; color to be either "Tinner's Red" or "Gray".
- Repair/replace existing wood siding and trim as needed to match existing and per submitted specifications.
- Repair/replace existing soffit, casings, and trim as needed to match existing and per submitted specifications.
- Paint residence: body to be Sherwin Williams "Raycroft Pewter" (SW2848), trim to be Sherwin Williams "Passive" (SW7064) or Sherwin Williams "Snowbound" (SW7004).
- Install new gutters and downspouts per submitted specifications.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Window Casings Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood window casings/trim on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
 - Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.
- **18-4-7**
1160 N. High St.
Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)/ Stonewall Columbus (Owner)
Approve Application 18-4-7, 1160 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Complete final landscaping and plant selections.
 - Signage package to be submitted for review and a future hearing.

- **18-4-9a&b**
834 Hamlet St.
Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Kristin Boggs & Adam Ward (Owners)

Approve Application 18-4-9a, 834 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

New Construction

- Demolish existing concrete block single-car garage.
- Construct new 2-car carriage house with second floor living unit.

Recommend Approval of Application 18-4-9b, 834 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 3332.039 – to allow a second residential structure on the parcel.
- 3332.15 – to reduce the minimum lot area from 6,000 square feet to 4,791 square feet (a reduction of 1,209 square feet) for two (2) dwelling units.
- 3332.19 (F)(1) - to permit a residential structure that does not front on a public street.
- 3332.27- to reduce the required rear yard area for the new building from 25% to 0% (a reduction of 25%).
- 3332.26 (C)(1) – to reduce the sideyard setback on the existing house from 3’ to 0’ (a reduction of 3’ to 0’).
- 3332.21 (F) – to reduce the required building setback from 12’ to 10’ (a reduction 2’) for the existing house.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Boyer /Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

VIII. ADJOURNMENT– Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) ADJOURNED. 8:53 pm.