

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

Tuesday, May 15, 2018

6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke (Excused 8:15), Ben Goodman (7:01/8:00), Jason Sudy.

Commissioners Absent: Shannon Fergus, Rex Hagerling.

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 7:01pm.**
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, June 12, 2018 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 312.**
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Tuesday, June 19, 2018.**
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF**
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, April 17, 2018. MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED.**
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM**
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS**
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS**
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS**

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. 18-5-8
762 Waldron St.
Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey New Day (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**
- 2. 18-5-9
303, 305, 307, 309, 281, 283, 285 Neruda Ave.
Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey New Day (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**
- 3. 18-5-10
974 Mt. Pleasant Ave.
Adam Yates & Tyler Cummins (Owners)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**
- 4. 18-5-11
1120 N. High St.
Adrienne Consales (Applicant)/ Kyle Katz (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**
- 5. 18-5-12
109 E. Warren St.
MM Developing, LLC (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

6. 18-4-10a

972-974 N. Fourth St.

Jarrold Share (Applicant)/ Allison Adams (Owner)

Approve application #18-4-10a, 972-974 N. Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

New Construction

- Construct new 2-bedroom, 2.5 bath apartment above three (3) garages.
- Building has been designed to defer to the historic two-family home on the site.
- The awnings are to be removed from the 3rd floor.
- Project is approved with "Option B", the lowered parapet wall and railing design.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Boyer/Cooke (3-1-0) APPROVED. [Goodman]

Recommend approval of application #18-4-10b, 972-974 N. Fourth St., as submitted:

Variance Recommendation

- 3332.039 - R-4 Allowable uses: to allow a 2-family and a carriage house to be on the same parcel.
- 3332.15 - R-4 area district requirements: Requires that a 2-family be on a lot that's 6,000sq' and a 1-family be on a lot that is 5,000sq' whereas the applicant is proposing to place both a 1-family and a 2-family on a lot that is 6,375 sq'.
- 3332.19 - Fronting, Dwelling fronting an alley
- 3332.25 Max Side Yards: The 2 required side yards must add up to at least 20% of the lot width or 8.5', whereas the applicant is proposing 6'.
- 3332.26 - Minimum side yard permitted: minimum side yard is 5', whereas the applicant is proposing 3' for both the north and south side yards.
- 3332.27 - Rear yard, 25% of lot for each dwelling: Whereas the applicant is proposing 35% for the 2-family and 0% for the carriage house.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (4-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

7. 18-5-13

792-796 Summit St.

Cathleen & Zachary Graves (Owners)

Approve application #18-5-13, 792-796 Summit St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Replace deteriorated wood siding on rear addition with LP Smartside Lap Siding.
- Replace wood sills with new oak sills.
- Install new concrete walk from rear parking pad to back of house.
- Siding to be installed (reinstalled) with a 4" exposure.
- Smartside siding approved in this location due to history of termite infestation.

MOTION: Boyer/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED.

8. 18-5-14

800 N. High St.

Gary Fischer (Applicant)/ Hubbard High Acquisition, LLC. (Owner)

Approve application #18-5-14, 800 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Proposed patio finishes and landscaping for sidewalk dining at Townhall.
- The fence is to be changed to the metal design revision per submitted drawings.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED.

9. 18-5-15

1100 Summit St.

MM Developing, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #18-5-15, 1100 Summit St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new two-story two-family residence and two-car garage per submitted drawings.
- Required variances have been previously approved by IVC and BZA.
- The gable-end windows (on east & west elevations) are to be narrowed.
- Revised drawings including ½” to 1’ porch drawing, with comparative height from grade, are to be submitted to HPO for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED.

10. 18-5-16

247 E. Greenwood Ave. (Building E)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Urban Restorations (Owner)

Approve application #18-5-16, 247 E. Greenwood Ave. (Building E), as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new two-story single-family residence per submitted drawings.
- Variances for the project have been previously approved.
- Brick corbelling is to be added to the design.
- Revised drawings including ½” to 1’ porch drawing, with comparative height from grade, are to be submitted to HPO for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED.

11. 18-5-17

249 E. Greenwood Ave. (Building D)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Urban Restorations (Owner)

Approve application #18-5-16, 247 E. Greenwood Ave. (Building E), as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new two-story single-family residence per submitted drawings.
- Variances for the project have been previously approved, and the project received a conceptual review while under different ownership.
- The block is to be smooth, through-body concrete block.
- Revised drawings including ½” to 1’ porch drawing, with comparative height from grade, are to be submitted to HPO for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED.

12. 18-5-18

288 E. Fourth Ave. (Front & Rear)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Jeff Jablonka (Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

13. 18-4-16b

796 N. High St. (Parkside On Pearl)

JBAD (Applicant)/ Short North Partners, LLC (Owner)

Variance Recommendation Request

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

14. 18-5-19

853 Summit

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)/ David Armeni (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new two-family structure at rear of property of existing single-family house with access off common alley to the north of the property.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Sudy – Is much more comfortable with the current design direction. The pulled-back element is on a good track. The siteplan is better, and the materials seem to be appropriate.
- Commissioner Cooke – Appreciates the changes that have been made to the design. Remains concerned with the addition of two or more units on the lot. Is also concerned with the deck element of the design and that it could turn into a party deck. Asked the location of the AC condensers.
- Commissioner Boyer – The scale of the proposed building seems to be okay because of the larger buildings in the surrounding area. The landscaping and siteplan will need more development to help mitigate the additional building.

15. 18-5-20

782 N. High St.

Architectural Alliance (Applicant)/ Rajesh Lahoti (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Demolish the freestanding façade and building façade.
- Retain existing patio and flip the main entrance.
- Partial rear addition for egress and elevator.
- Retain first floor patio/bar use.
- Add second floor patio/bar expansion, kitchen, and third floor office.
- Add second floor recessed balcony on front of building.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Cooke – Appreciates the design direction and the responses to previous comments. The massing is better, but it should be grounded in a manner more like neighboring historic contexts. The banner element should be removed from the design.
- Commissioner Sudy – The hallmark of the site has been the sidewalk seating, so keeping the program out front is good. The current massing is good. Likes the shape, voids, upper deck that doesn't extend all the way out, but perhaps has a concern with materials. The metal corner should be detailed.
- Commissioner Boyer – Conceptually headed in the right direction. Appreciates that the parapet of the existing building is pretty clear, but any artwork on that north wall should probably be framed to ensure that you can "read" the parapet. The large voids are nice. It's a very contemporary building, so it's harder to pull direct contextual relationships from the other surrounding buildings. Development of the interior wall is needed (green-wall, mural location).

16. 18-5-21

245 E. Fourth Ave. (Bethany Flats)

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct 35-unit wood frame apartment building with parking at grade on the first floor.
- Discussion of massing, density, site access, and general building metrics.

NO ACTION TAKEN

17. 18-5-22

1050 N. Fourth St.

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing concrete block building (former location of Durable Slate).
- Construct 70-unit wood frame apartment building with parking at grade on the first floor.
- Discussion of massing, density, site access, and general building metrics.

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

• **18-5-1**

51 E. Lincoln St.

Susan Sommerfeld (Owner)

Approve Application #18-5-1, 51 E. Lincoln St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace deteriorated porch floor to match existing.
- Repair/replace soffit as needed to match existing.

Replace Porch Flooring

- Remove and dispose of all existing flooring; pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing joists to insure structural integrity.
- Install 1" x 3" tongue and groove, yellow pine, porch decking.
- Blind nail with galvanized finish nails only.
- Allow a 1 1/2" minimum to 2 1/2" maximum flooring overhang on all outside edges.
- Install exterior grade, quarter-round moulding to band board fascia, tight against all flooring overhang.
- Prime on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with appropriate material prior to installation. After installation, topcoat with same porch floor enamel according to manufacturer's specifications for finish coat.
- Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

• **18-5-2**

808 Kerr St.

Able Roof (Applicant)/ Stanley Huck (Owner)

Approve Application #18-5-2, 808 Kerr St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing deteriorated asphalt shingle roof.
- Install new CertainTeed standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be "Nickel Gray".
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; color to be "Tinner's Red".

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingle to be CertainTeed standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be "Nickel Gray".

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **18-5-3**

829 Hamlet St.

Ace Fence & Deck, LLC (Applicant)/ Dwaine Young (Owner)

Approve Application #18-5-3, 829 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing deteriorated wood fence.
- Install new 6’ wood fence per submitted siteplan and specifications.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6’ wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **18-5-4**

1056 Summit St.

Shauna R. Patterson (Owner)

Approve Application #18-5-4, 1056 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair and paint wood components of front porch and windows as needed to match existing.
- Repair gutters and downspouts as needed to match existing.
- Repair chimney as needed to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.

- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repainting Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings").

- **18-5-5**

870 H. High St.

Lesley Thomas (Applicant)/ Igor Bogin (Owner)

Approve Application #18-5-5, 870 H. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint storefront per submitted specifications.
- Colors to be Sherwin Williams "Tricorn Black" (SW6528) and "Show Stopper" (SW7588).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **18-5-6**

681 Kerr St.

Zach Crusse (Owner)

Approve Application #18-5-6, 681 Kerr St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace deteriorated porch floor to match existing and per submitted specifications.
- New floor to be sealed and stained (not painted).
- Repair/replace porch ceiling to match existing.

Replace Porch Flooring

- Remove and dispose of all existing flooring; pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing joists to insure structural integrity.
- Install 1" x 3", yellow pine, porch decking.
- Blind nail with galvanized finish nails only.
- Allow a 1 1/2" minimum to 2 1/2" maximum flooring overhang on all outside edges.
- Install exterior grade, quarter-round moulding to band board fascia, tight against all flooring overhang.
- Prime on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with appropriate material prior to installation. After installation, topcoat with same porch floor enamel according to manufacturer's specifications for finish coat.
- Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Replace Porch Ceiling

- Remove and dispose of existing porch ceiling, pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing rafters to insure structural integrity.
- Install a new porch ceiling nailed with galvanized finish nails.

- **18-5-7**

- **170 Punta Al.**

- **Jeff Zelli & Joe Martin (Owners)**

- Approve Application #18-5-7, 170 Punta Al., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence: siding to be Sherwin Williams “Uncertain Gray” (SW6234); trim, casings, porch elements, soffits, and gutters & downspouts to be Sherwin Williams “Extra White” (SW7006); window frames, front & rear doors, and garage doors to be Sherwin Williams “Tricorn Black” (SW6258); porch floors and steps to be Sherwin Williams “Gibraltar” (SW6257).

- Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **18-5-8**

- **762 Waldron St.**

- **Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey New Day (Owner)**

- Approve Application #18-5-8, 762 Waldron St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Staff Recommended Application

- Install freestanding monument sign per submitted drawings and specifications.
- “Jeffrey Park” branding to be removed from the monument sign, and the overall height from grade to be lowered by approximately 14”.

- **18-5-9**

- **303, 305, 307, 309, 281, 283, 285 Neruda Ave.**

- **Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey New Day (Owner)**

- Recommend approval of application #18-5-9, 303, 305, 307, 309, 281, 283, 285 Neruda Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Jeffrey Park Townhomes required lot split.
- Revised lot split is based on a new interpretation of the code opposite of previous approval.
- No physical change will occur; all homes remain the same distance apart as approved.

- **18-5-10**

- **974 Mt. Pleasant Ave.**

- **Adam Yates & Tyler Cummins (Owners)**

- Approve Application #18-5-10, 974 Mt. Pleasant Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install a “no dig” fence in front yard per submitted siteplan.
- Fence to be Empire powder-coated steel fence and gate.
- The “circles” are to be eliminated from the gate design.

- **18-5-11**
1120 N. High St.
Adrienne Consales (Applicant)/ Kyle Katz (Owner)
Approve Application #18-5-11, 1120 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Installation of two (2) awnings; one over each window on the front elevation.
 - Any/all framing is to be black.
 - No additional graphics are approved.

- **18-5-12**
109 E. Warren St.
MM Developing, LLC (Owner)
Approve Application #18-5-12, 109 E. Warren St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Revise previously approved siteplan due to a zoning code violation of the 30' vision clearance triangle.
 - The house setback to move from 18' to 24' setback.
 - The City of Columbus Traffic is unlikely to support a variance due to the possibility of future development changes to the public Right-of-Way along Summit St. and the subject property.

- **18-5-18**
288 E. Fourth Ave. (Front & Rear)
Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Jeff Jablonka (Owner)
Recommend approval of application #18-5-18, 288 E. Fourth Ave. (Front & Rear), as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
Variance Recommendation
 - 3332.05(4) - Area district lot width requirements: For lots A,B reduce the required lot width from 50' to 32'.
 - 3332.15 R-4 - area district requirements: To reduce the minimum lot area from 5000 sf to 2859 sf for Lot A, 2873 sf for Lot B.
 - 3332.19 - Fronting Lots B allow a single family home to not front a public street.
 - 3312.49 - For Lot A to reduce the required parking spaces from 2 to 0.

- **18-4-16b**
796 N. High St. (Parkside On Pearl)
JBAD (Applicant)/ Short North Partners, LLC (Owner)
Recommend approval of application #18-4-16b, 796 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
Variance Recommendation Request
 - 3356.03, C-4, Permitted Uses, which Section does not permit multi-family residential-use; - Applicant requests a variance to allow AR-1 uses permitted in 3333.02, Apartment Residential District Use.
 - 3309.12, Height District, which Section limits the height of buildings in the H-35 District to 35 feet. Applicant requests a variance to allow a maximum building height of 81 feet.
 - 3321.05(B)(1), Vision Clearance, which Section requires a 10-foot clear vision triangle at the intersection of Pearl Alley and Hubbard Avenue and the intersection of Pearly Alley and Hull Alley. Applicant requests a variance to reduce the clear vision triangle at the intersection Pearl Alley and Hubbard Avenue and the intersection of Pearly Alley and Hull Alley to a minimum of zero feet.
 - 3356.11(3), C-4, District Setback Lines, which Section requires a building setback of no less than 25 feet. Applicant requests a variance to reduce the minimum building setback on Hubbard Avenue, Pearl Alley, and Hull Alley to zero feet.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Boyer /Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

VIII. ADJOURNMENT– ADJOURNED. 8:50 pm.