

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION AGENDA

August 16, 2018

6:00 p.m.

111 North Front Street, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. If you have any questions, please call Connie Torbeck (614-645-0664) in the City's Historic Preservation Office. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-7206, or email raisbell@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, September 13, 2018 – 111 North Front Street, 3rd Floor, Room 312
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 p.m., Thursday, September 20, 2018 – 111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Thursday, July 19, 2018.
- VII. APPROVAL OF STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **18-8-7** (*not required to attend*)
170 W. Jeffrey Place Old Beechwold Historic District
Anna Hoffman (Applicant/Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
2. **18-8-8** (*not required to attend*)
177 Rustic Place Old Beechwold Historic District
Patricia R. Donnally (Applicant/Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
3. **18-8-9** (*not required to attend*)
1216 Bryden Road Bryden Road Historic District
Jeffrey Steele/The Cleary Co. (Applicant) Michael & Anne Ponzani (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:05 P.M.

4. 18-5-4a

774 Bedford Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Mitchell Levine & Ashley Buckmaster (Applicant/Owner)

This application was reviewed at and continued from the May 17, 2018 HRC hearing and continued from the July 19 hearing at the request of the Applicant. Applicant requests to be continued to the August 16, 2018 HRC hearing to allow for time to prepare drawings.

Build Garage Addition

- Build new, 21' L x 10' W x 15' H, concrete block addition on south side of the existing, one-car garage, per the submitted photos, site plan, and elevation drawings.
- Foundation to be poured concrete.
- Apron to be concrete, per the submitted site plan.

5. 18-5-7a (not attending)

674 Bedford Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Home Source Ohio (Applicant)

Phoenix Financial, LLC. (Owner)

This application was reviewed at and continued from the May 17, 2018 HRC hearing and was continued from the June 21, 2018 HRC hearing in the absence of the Applicant. No new information has been submitted.

Cover Rear Door and Window

- Install new vinyl siding, to match existing, over the rear, enclosed porch entry door and window, per the submitted photographs.

New Deck

- Build a new, wood deck in rear yard, per the submitted drawings.

6. 18-7-18 (not attending)

1734 Bryden Road

Andrew H. Stevens (Applicant/Owner)

A new, terraced retaining wall and landscaping were installed, prior to review and approval. A code order has been issued. Applicant requests to be continued to the September 20, 2018 HRC hearing.

Install New Retaining Wall

- Retain the existing tiered retaining wall and plantings, as installed prior to review and approval, per the submitted application and photographs.

7. 18-7-19 (not attending)

987 Bryden Road

Right Property Group, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

An application for a new six unit building was conceptually reviewed June 21, 2018. A two-story frame dwelling previously stood on the lot and was demolished ca. 1970. Applicant expects to submit a revised design for the September 20, 2018 HRC hearing.

New Construction

- Build a new five-unit condo building on the existing vacant lot, per the submitted drawings.
- Each unit to include a private entranced and two-car garage.
- Exterior cladding to be James Hardie siding. Colors to be: Soffit/fascia - "Arctic White;" Siding - "Monterey Taupe" and "Iron Gray."
- Front doors to be Fiber Classic Oak Collection, wooden, half-lite/two-panel doors.
- Roofing material to be GAF Timberline "Charcoal."
- Garage doors to be Wayne Dalton, Model 9100/9605, "Sonoma." Color to be "Brown."

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:15 P.M.

NEW APPLICATIONS

8. 18-8-10

682 Linwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Jessica Jones (Applicant/Owner)

An application and photos have been submitted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all deteriorated windows. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Install new appropriate style windows from the Approved Windows Lists.
- All glass is to be clear, with no decorative patterns or texture, unless otherwise approved by the Commissions.
- All composite, fiberglass, or aluminum surfaces are to be smooth, without faux-wood texture.
- Any sashes with muntins are to be simulated divided lite sash, with muntins permanently applied to the interior/exterior of the glass and with a spacer bar between the two layers of glass.
- Style of exterior brickmould, casings, and subsills to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval.

Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all slate down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

- CertainTeed
- GAF

Style:

- Carriage House (dimensional)
- Slateline (dimensional)

- (standard 3-tab)
- Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)

Color:

- Stonegate Gray
- English Gray Slate
- Weathered Slate
- Nickel Gray
- Nickel Gray
- Estate Gray
- Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- **Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.**

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:25 P.M.

9. 18-8-11

666 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Cassie Wilhelm & Greg Myers (Applicant/Owner)

An application, site plan, and photos have been submitted.

Chimney Removal & Roof Repair

- Remove the chimney on the east side of the house.
- Patch the roof with matching shingles (GAF Royal Sovereign, Nickle Gray).
- Tuckpoint and stabilize the chimney on the North side of the house.

Porch/New Addition

- Demolish the existing rear porch.
- Construct a new addition in the same footprint of the existing rear porch. Refer to submitted materials for details.

Front Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the (insert name of) Commission.
- Restore the front porch banisters/hand rails/columns as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails/columns; like-for-like.

Garage Rehabilitation

- Replace any rotted framing and bring the structure back to plumb.
- Repair/replace the existing siding as needed.
- Replace the window panes as needed.
- Replace the entry door with square panel steel door, refer to submitted materials.
- Replace garage doors, refer to submitted materials.

House Rehabilitation

- Replace the bent gutters on the south side of the house to match the existing and painted to match the trim.
- Replace the existing vinyl kitchen windows with appropriate windows from the Approved Window List, refer to submitted materials.
- Install new Bilco door over the cellar entrance, refer to submitted materials.

10. 18-8-12 (VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION) (not required to attend)

633 Linwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Michael P. Herman (Applicant/Owner)

New windows and doors were staff approved in 2017. An application, site plan and statement of hardship have been submitted.

- Section 3332.035, R-3 residential district, does not permit two dwelling units on one lot, while I propose to develop a dwelling unit above a garage (carriage house) on a single parcel comprised of two lots developed with a single unit dwelling; and
- Section 3332.13, R-3 area district requirements, requires that a single-unit dwelling or other principal building shall be situated on a lot not less than 5,000 square feet in area, while I propose two single unit dwellings on an existing parcel that contains two lots that comprise 9,300+ feet (approximately 4,650 square feet per dwelling unit); and
- Section 3332.27, Rear yard, requires that each dwelling, apartment house, or other principal building shall be erected so as to provide a rear yard totaling not less than 25 percent of the total lot area, while I propose a 25% rear yard for the existing dwelling and no rear yard for the rear carriage house. However, since my parcel contains two lots, with one being situated on a street corner, by adding the additional side yard on the south lot (Lot #312; additional 1,334 sq.ft.) and the additional side yard on the north lot due to it being on a street corner (Lot #311; additional 673 sq.ft.), the total rear yard and side yards make up 44% of the total parcel area. If you also include the open terrace attached to the front of the house, (342 sq.ft.) and the front yard (1,916 sq.ft.), the total open yard space for the entire parcel (front, two side yards and rear yard) is 68% of the total area (34% per dwelling unit).

CONCEPTUAL REIVEW

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.

11. 18-8-13

602 E. Town Street

East Town Street Historic District

Karrick Sherrill (Applicant)

Joe Collins Property LLC (Owner)

An application, site plan, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review of Addition

- Addition to the existing 2 story brick masonry apartment building, including the expansion of levels 1 and 2 and the addition of levels 3 and 4 on the north half of the building. The south elevation will not be altered.
- Demolish the existing carriage house at the rear of the property.

12. 18-8-14

71 West Jeffrey Place

Old Beechwold Historic District

Dominic Boyden/Boyden Renovations, LLC. (Applicant)

Rhond Comer & Vincent Day (Owners)

An application, window specifications, and photos have been submitted.

Install New Windows

- Remove five (5) existing casement style windows, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new Marvin Clad Ultimate, out-swinging Casement window replacements (3) and Marvin Clad Ulimatte Casement fixed windows (2), per the submitted specifications.
- New windows to fit the historic openings, not to be down-sized.
- All existing, existing, exterior wood window trim to remain, as is.

STAFF APPROVALS

- **18-8-1**

196 East Frambes Avenue

Jonathan Cope (Applicant)

Approve Application 18-8-1, 196 East Frambes Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Seal Existing Asphalt Driveway

- Make any required repairs to the existing asphalt driveway and apron, as needed.
- Apply seal coat to existing driveway and apron, retaining the same dimensions as the existing, in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Building Codes and industry standards; like-for-like.
- Reinstall or replace any wood edging, to match existing, as needed.

**Indianola Forest Historic District
Jonathan & Stephanie Cope (Owner)**

- **18-8-2**

734 South Champion

APCO (Applicant)

Approve Application 18-8-2, 734 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Storm Windows

- Install twenty-two new, low profile, metal ProVia Storm Windows.
- 14 windows will be triple track, and 8 windows will be picture storm.
- New storm windows to be installed inside the existing window frame.
- Storm window to be white to match existing white wood windows.
- Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.
- Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows.
- Storm windows to operate smoothly.
- All work to be in accordance with the performance manual.

**Old Oaks Historic District
Randy Youmans (Owner)**

- **18-8-3**

202 East Frambes Avenue

Fred Roempler (Applicant)

Approve Application 18-8-3, 202 East Frambes Avenue, Indianola Forest, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Paint colors must be Sherwin Williams; Colonial Revival Stone SW2827, Classic White SW2829, Kaffe SW6104 (for porch deck only)
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

**Indianola Forest Historic District
Nicastro Properties LLC (Owner)**

• **18-8-4**

184 East Frambes Avenue
Fred Roempler (Applicant)

Indianola Forest Historic District
Nicastro Properties LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 18-8-4, 184 East Frambes Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Paint colors must be Sherwin Williams; Colonial Revival Stone SW2827, Classic White SW2829, Kaffe SW6104 (for porch deck only)
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **18-8-5**

2064 Indianola Avenue
Fred Roempler (Applicant)

Indianola Forest Historic District
Nicastro Properties LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 18-8-5, 2064 Indianola Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Paint shall be Sherwin Williams Colonial Revival Stone SW2827 for the sills, Classic White SW2829 for the windows and trim, and Kaffe SW6104 front the front porch decking.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.

• **18-8-6**

2045 North Fourth Street
Don L. Frederick (Applicant/Owner)

Iuka Ravine Historic District

Approve Application 18-8-6, 2045 North Fourth Street, Iuka Ravine Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Paint wooden basement window cover white to match current white trim. Exterior Valspar Paint White.

New Railing

- Build handrail and balusters for stairs on the rear of the house. Handrail will be constructed out of weather treated wood to match handrails (existing) in front of house. Handrail must be painted Valspar Pain White to match trim

of house.

• **18-8-9**

1216 Bryden Road

Jeffrey Steele/The Cleary Co. (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Michael & Anne Ponzani (Owner)

Approve Application 18-8-9, 1216 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Revision to Previously Approved Application

Build New Enclosed Screen Porch

- Build a new Screened Porch beneath the non-historic second-story rear addition. Existing support columns to remain.
- New Screened Porch to equal the footprint of the second floor structure.
- Panels to be LP Smart Vertical paneling, or similar, per the submitted drawings. Paint to match trim color.
- Screen Porch floor to include 1 x 12 trim board.
- Install new, AZEK Morado composite deck, per the submitted drawings. Color to be “Brownstone.”
- Install new, Preferred aluminum railing, “Georgian Series,” at steps, per the submitted product sample. Color to be “Black.”
- Install new ProVia aluminum storm/screen door, per the submitted product cut sheet.

Note: Composite deck material is being approved as a test case only. HPO staff is to conduct a site visit upon completion of the project and provide photographs to the Commission.

Convert Window to Door Opening/Rear Elevation

- Remove the existing window on the rear/north elevation of the brick house, per the submitted photos and renderings.
- Create new door opening in same location to provide access to a new rear porch.
- Install new, Masonite, 36”, three-quarter-lite door, per the submitted product cut sheet.

Window/East Elevation

- Existing window opening and window in location of existing range/hood is to remain in place. Paint interior of existing window glass or exterior-facing wall board black.

Window/North (rear) Elevation

- Remove the existing, westernmost window on the first floor of the north/rear elevation.
- Remove and retain existing concrete sill.
- Increase window opening at bottom to interior counter height.
- Reinstall concrete sill.
- Install new, one-over-one, double-hung sash in new opening. Window to be from the approved window list. Final window choice to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval, prior to installation.
- New brick mold to match existing.

Window/West Elevation

- Remove existing northernmost window on the first floor of the west elevation.
- Install new, one-over-one, double-hung sash in same rough opening. Window to be from the approved window list. Final window choice to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval, prior to installation.
- New brick mold to match existing.

Enclose Porch

- Enclose the existing, inset porch at the northwest corner of the house.
- Remove existing concrete steps from rear yard. Patch and paint existing block foundation, as needed.
- Remove existing porch posts. Existing roof framing to remain.
- Exterior cladding to be LP Smart Board siding and trim, or similar. Paint color to match existing colors.
- Install one (1), one-over-one, double-hung sash on north/rear elevation of new enclosure.

Cellar Steps

- Retain the existing cellar steps on rear/north elevation.

- Fix cellar door shut and/or cover door opening with plywood. Paint to match existing colors.
Note: COA# 18-8-9 modifies COA# 18-7-14 (July 19, 2018).

- **18-8-7**

170 West Jeffrey Place

Old Beechwold Historic District

Anna Hoffman (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-8-7, 170 West Jeffrey Place, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

New Garage Doors

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, flat, inset panel, wood and glass overhead garage doors.
- Install new, Clopay Model 4050, steel, short panel, overhead garage doors, with plain short panel glass inserts, per the submitted photos and product cut sheet.
- Color to be “Almond.”

- **18-8-8**

177 Rustic Place

Old Beechwold Historic District

Patricia R. Donnally (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-8-8, 177 Rustic Place, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Garage Door

- Remove the existing, flat, inset panel wood garage door, per the submitted photo.
- Install new, C.H.I., Long panel, stamped, steel garage door, Model 5916.
- New door to be white with plain glass “Stockton” window inserts, and spade hardware, per the submitted product cut sheet.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURN