

## ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, August 21, 2018

6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

**Commissioners Present:** Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Lauren Crosby, Ben Goodman

**Commissioners Late:** Jason Sudy

**HPO Staff Present:** D.W. Route.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:10pm.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, September 11, 2018 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Tuesday, September 18, 2018.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, July 17, 2018. MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### NEW APPLICATIONS

1. **18-8-9**

**310 Neruda Avenue**

**Nick Ciminillo (Owner)**

Approve application as modified with the following clarifications:

- Install wall mounted canopy on 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor patio per submitted drawings.
- Canopy to be 18' wide by 10'9" deep.
- Mounts on 11' high posts (Only 2 posts approved).
- Frame to be painted to match the canopy color (Chocolate or Black).
- **Note: Retractable side curtains are NOT approved.**

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-1-0) APPROVED. [Goodman]

2. **18-8-12**

**324 E. Second Avenue**

**Avenue Partners, Snyder Barker, Elford Development (Applicant)**

**Station 324 Holdings, LLC (Owner)**

Approve application as modified with the following clarifications:

- Revision to previously approved application (COA #18-6-23).
- Replacement with 8" CMU with salvaged and matching new brick on the South wall (brick veneer is NOT approved).
- Note: the replacement of the South wall is to be rebuilt Exactly as the original façade. Stone caps, lintels, coping, size, dimension, etc.
- Replacement with 8" CMU on East wall. **Applicant agrees to reface the East wall with a matching brick or brick veneer if the adjacent property were to be taken down.** Future details for East wall to be submitted as part of final drawings.
- Revision to West elevation door. Sidelights to be eliminated or revised without Mullions.
- Additional window to be reopened on the West bay.

- Final Drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff and reviewed by Commission subcommittee prior to approval.  
MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (4-0-1) APPROVED. [Goodman]

### 3. 18-7-16

#### **Neruda Ave. (Jeffrey Park) – The Mason**

**Michael Maistros (Applicant)**

**Windsor Lofts II, LLC (Owner)**

Continue Application to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

- Construct a new 3-story condominium as per submitted plans.

*The following is taken from the August 2018 Italian Village Commission meeting minutes:*

*Continue Application to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:*

*MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED.*

#### Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Boyer – No issues with the casement windows. Would like to see final details with the railings, how the proposed Stucco (EIFS) will interact with the ground. Does not want a large section of CMU showing. Needs further detail on the proposed black trim.
- Commissioner Cooke – Would like applicant to provide further detail on the large section of proposed Stucco (EIFS) as illustrated on page 15 of 18. Concern over the color choice and how the red/burgundy will fade with different levels of sun exposure. Needs to see more Corner detail and how materials come together, as illustrated on page 9 of 18. Would like to see more interest and design elements in the West Elevation. Opposed to the new brick soldier course.
- Commissioner Sudy– Concern with the entirety of the proposed materials. Wants to see an overall better quality of materials chosen. Concern over the longevity of the current proposed materials. As submitted, is currently opposed to the development.
- Commissioner Goodman – Is good with the architectural rhythm. Thinks that the proposed brick soldier course interrupts the horizontal elements of the development. Wants the applicant to consider more of a rise to the base of the building and think about how the first floor interacts with the ground. Does not like the proposed Stucco (EIFS). Needs to see a 1/2”=1’ scale cross section through the canopy.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

*The following is taken from the July 2018 Italian Village Commission meeting minutes:*

*Continue Application to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:*

*MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) CONTINUED.*

#### Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Boyer – Likes the new earth tone of the wood samples. Concern over the new proposed railing. Wants a less heavy railing with less heavy verticals. Would like the applicant to submit more details for the railings.
- Commissioner Cooke – No on any black brick mixed into the sample. Likes the horizontal railings. Wants to make sure the applicant knows not to include any brake metal. Would like the applicant to submit new renderings with the new materials and a lighting and landscaping plan.
- Commissioner Fergus – Concern over the height of the rooftop railings for safety reasons. Applicant said that the heights of the railings meet safety standards.
- Commissioner Goodman – Concern over the design and it having no relationship to the historic character of the area. Concern over the rhythm of the architecture and the band around the building. Reminded the applicant that no swingout style casements would be appropriate, but could use hopper or awning style. Wants the applicant to provide street context.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

**4. 18-7-17**

**174 E. Fourth Ave.**

**Philip Herren (Applicant) David Betz (Owner)**

Approve application as modified with the following clarifications:

- Demolish existing concrete block residence and garage constructed in 1957.
- Construct two 2-Family buildings per submitted drawings and site plans.
- Remove the mullions on the third floor windows located in the gables (on both the north and south sides of the gables) from Building ‘A’ (4<sup>th</sup> Avenue House) to make them one-over-one.
- All storm doors to be ¾ lite without mullions on Building ‘A’ (4<sup>th</sup> Avenue House).
- Exposed concrete between the porch decks and the ground is to be a smooth finish and Not a textured finished.

MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

**STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS**

*(The following applicants do not need to attend.)*

• **18-8-1**

**1065 Say Avenue**

**Ed Schiebel (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 18-8-1, 1065 Say Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

| <u>Manufacturer:</u>                   | <u>Style:</u>                    | <u>Color:</u>   |
|--|----------------------------------|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed   | Carriage House (dimensional)     | <input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> GAF           | Slateline (dimensional)          | <input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate<br><input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed  | (standard 3-tab)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> GAF           | Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab) | <input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning | (standard 3-tab)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Tamko         | (standard 3-tab)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate  |

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **18-8-2**

**102 Warren St.**

**Ashley Manella (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-8-2, 102 Warren St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Tuckpoint all mortar joints due to deterioration of the original mortar and substandard prior restoration work.
- Replace two (2) cracked sandstone lintels to match existing, in-kind like-for-like.

Solid Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints for soundness on all elevations.
- Use hand tools to remove all mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings", available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

- **18-8-3**

**199 E. Second Ave.**

**Dianna E. Zweig (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-8-3, 199 E. Second Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove nine (9) deteriorated wood windows per submitted specifications.
- New windows to be Marvin Integrity Wood Ultrex, sized exactly to fit the existing openings.

Replace Deteriorated Windows

- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows per City Staff site visit determination.
- Install new, 1-OVER-1, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Per submitted window brochure or cutsheets.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

- **18-8-4**

**729 Hamlet St.**

**Campbell Builders (Applicant)**

**Ultican Holdings, LLC (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-8-4, 729 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated asphalt shingle roof.
- Install new CertainTeed standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be "Nickel Gray".
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; to be painted "Gray".

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **18-8-5**

**783 Summit Street**

**Ingrid Navarro (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-8-5, 783 Summit Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install 4’ wood fence from the existing 6’ wood fence on the north side of the property to the sidewalk.
- New fence to match style of existing wood fence.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 4’ wood privacy fence per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **18-8-6**

**821 Summit Street**

**John Chmielewski (Applicant)**

**Pat McCormack (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-8-6, 821 Summit Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install 6’ wood privacy fence in the rear of the property per submitted siteplan.
- New fence to be “dog ear” style fence.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6’ wood privacy fence per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **18-8-7**

**826 Kerr Street**

**Arrow Roofing, Inc. (Applicant)**

**Gursen Sidhu (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-8-7, 826 Kerr Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

| <u>Manufacturer:</u>                   | <u>Style:</u>                    | <u>Color:</u>   |
|--|----------------------------------|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed   | Carriage House (dimensional)     | <input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> GAF           | Slateline (dimensional)          | <input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate<br><input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed  | (standard 3-tab)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> GAF           | Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab) | <input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning | (standard 3-tab)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Tamko         | (standard 3-tab)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate  |

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red.”

- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **18-8-8**

**1171 Say Avenue**

**Woodrow Amos (Applicant)**

**Heels Homes LTD (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-8-8, 1171 Say Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

| <u>Manufacturer:</u>         | <u>Style:</u>                    | <u>Color:</u>                        |
|------------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> GAF | Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab) | <input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray |

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **18-8-10**

**86 Warren Street**

**John Holsinger (Owner)**

Recommend approval of application 18-8-10, 86 Warren Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Variance Recommendation

- Previously approved garage requires a side yard variance.
- 3332.26: Minimum side yard permitted- The minimum side yard shall be the least dimension between any part of the building or structure and the side lot line, which least dimension shall be as follows:
  - (C)In R-2F and R-4 districts:
    - (1)For a single-family dwelling on a lot 40 feet wide or less, no less than - three feet;

Italian Village Commission  
Tuesday, July 17, 2018 – Agenda  
7

- (2) For a single-family dwelling on a lot more than 40 feet wide, no less than - five feet;
- (3) For a two-, three-, or four-family dwelling on a lot 50 feet wide or more, no less than - five feet.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED.

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

**XII. ADJOURNMENT**– Goodman/Sudy (5-0-0) ADJOURNED. 7:50 pm.