

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION MINUTES

Thursday, September 20, 2018

6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front Street, Room 205

Commissioners Present: Jackie Barton, Steward Gibboney, Clyde Henry Joseph McCabe, Dan Morgan

Commissioners Absent: Erin Prosser, Abbie Stiers

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:02 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, October 11, 2018 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Third Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, October 18, 2018 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Room 204 (Hearing Room)
- IV. SWEAR IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Thursday, August 16, 2018.
MOTION: Barton/McCabe (3-0-2 [Henry & Gibboney-abstain]) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Henry/Morgan (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **18-9-8** (*not required to attend*)
851 Bryden Road
Gunzelman Architecture & Interiors (Applicant)
 - **MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**
2. **18-9-9** (*not required to attend*)
1053 Bryden Road
Travis More (Owner)
 - **MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**

Bryden Road Historic District
David Fischer & Lisa Imondi (Owners)

Bryden Road Historic District



CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

3. 18-7-18

1734 Bryden Road

Andrew H. Stevens (Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application #18-7-18, 1734 Bryden Road, and direct HPO staff to place on the October 18, 2018 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

NOTE: This application was reviewed and continued at the July 19, 2018 HRC hearing, and continued at the request of and in the absence of the Applicant at the August 16, 2018 HRC hearing. Based on the Historic Resources Commission policy to remove an application from the agenda following three (3) consecutive absences by the Applicant, Application # 18-7-18 will be removed from the agenda if the Applicant is not available to attend the October 18, 2018 HRC hearing, and will revert to Code Enforcement. Submittal of a new application would then be required to be placed on a future agenda.

MOTION: Morgan/McCabe (5-0-0) CONTINUED

4. 18-8-11a

666 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Cassie Wilhelm & Greg Myers (Owners)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-8-11a, 666 Oakwood Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Build New Addition

- Demolish the existing rear porch.
- Construct a new addition in the same footprint of the existing rear porch.
- New addition to have shed roof with roofing shingles from the approved list. Final choice of shingle to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Foundation to be concrete block.
- Exterior cladding to be smooth, horizontal Hardiplank.
- Corner boards and window/door trim to match trim on main house.
- Revised drawings and cut sheets for windows, door, railings, and exterior light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: McCabe/Henry (5-0-0) APPROVED.

5. 18-8-14b (not required to attend)

71 West Jeffrey Place

Old Beechwold Historic District

Dominic Boyden/Boyden Renovations, LLC. (Applicant)

Rhonda Comer & Vincent Day (Owners)

- **MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**

NEW APPLICATIONS

6. 18-9-10

1494 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Adrian Calloway (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant's representative, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Continue Application #18-9-10, 1494 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the October 18, 2018 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- The current porch railings, as built, are not appropriate for the style and era of the house.
- Please look at other similar houses in the area with original porches and submit drawings at the October 18th HRC hearing for review.

MOTION: Henry/Morgan (5-0-0) CONTINUED

7. 18-9-11

1110 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Joe Huber (Applicant)

Valor Investments (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #18-9-11 was divided into Items 'a', 'b', and 'c', for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

18-9-11a

Approve Application 18-9-11a, 1110 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

- Retain the existing concrete block retaining wall modifications, with the addition of stone veneer and cap, as installed prior to review and approval.

MOTION: McCabe/Henry (2-2[Gibboney & Morgan-against]-1-[Barton-abstain]) DENIED

Reasons for Denial:

3116.13 - Standards for site improvements.

(A) Landscaping, parking, utility or service areas, walkways and similar improvements should be compatible to each other and to the subject building or structure as well as to adjacent contributing properties, open spaces and the overall environment.

(B) Fences of wrought iron, stone or wood are encouraged. Chain link fence, although not favored, may be used in the rear of a property if not facing on another street. Chain link fence shall not be erected in a location that is visible from the street or is in front of the setback line. Chain link or privacy fence shall not exceed six (6) feet in height and shall generally be restricted to side and rear yards. Front yard fence shall be permitted only where allowed by guidelines. A parking lot, automobile dealer, junkyard, yard storage facility, or any similar use shall have solid fencing to prevent headlight and unsightly scene interference with the enjoyment of the neighborhood in general. Alternatively, properly landscaped mounds may be approved for installation around a parking area. Box wire, chicken wire and wire fences in general shall be discouraged.

18-9-11b

Approve Application 18-9-11b, 1110 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

- Remove the 6-ft high, wood privacy fence in the front yard, along the south property line, as installed prior to review and approval. Any privacy fence must be at least six feet back from the main façade of the house (not including the front porch), or behind the first side elevation window.
- Retain the existing paint trim and fascia color, as installed: Sherwin Williams “Natural Linen” (SW9109).
- Retain the existing paint color for railings, trim, windows, and previously painted masonry, as installed: Sherwin Williams “Iron Ore” (SW7069).

MOTION: McCabe/Henry (5-0-0-) APPROVED

18-9-11c

Continue Application #18-9-11c, 1110 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, to retain the existing, Owens Corning, “Estate Gray” color, “Oakridge” dimensional asphalt shingles, as installed contrary to specifications of COA#18-5-8 (5-17-2018).

Commissioner Comments:

- The Oakridge dimensional shingles are not on the “Approved Roofing Shingles” list, which was approved in COA#18-5-8, and are not an appropriate replacement shingle for a slate roof.
- Please return with a plan to replace the existing shingles with a shingle from the approve list.

MOTION: McCabe/Morgan (5-0-0) CONTINUED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

8. 18-9-12 (attending)

4771 N. High Street

Old Beechwold Historic District

Albert & Paige Chapman-Layland (Applicants/Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new addition to side of existing residence.
- The same materials will be used when available; all trim, windows, doors, etc. will match existing.
- The purpose of the extension is to provide adjoined but independent living space for the aging mother of one of the applicants.

Following presentation by the Applicant,, Chairperson Gibboney opened the discussion and Commission members offered comments to the applicants:

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Henry:

- The design of the addition does not need to be symmetrical.
- Will need to be careful about details on the addition in regard to the contemporary design of the original house.
- Pay attention to the location and height of the windows on the original house – close to the fascia.
- The use of three roof step backs on the south elevation is too busy and does not reflect the clean lines of the existing roof.
- Clues for details on the addition should come from the existing house. The design needs to fit into the neighborhood a bit better.

Commissioner Morgan:

- In agreement with comments of Commissioner Henry.
- The addition should be in keeping with the language of the existing, mid-century modern house – not an exact replica, but using some of the same language.
- Sees an addition on this lot as completely possible with some modification.

Commissioner McCabe:

- Consider bringing the existing frieze board beneath the soffit around to the new addition. This detail enforces the horizontality of the house design.

NO ACTION TAKEN

9. 18-9-13

602 E. Town Street

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

East Town Street Historic District

Joe Collins property, LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Redevelopment discussion and carriage house findings.

Following presentation by the Applicant,, Chairperson Gibboney opened the discussion and Commission members offered comments to the applicants:

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners Henry and McCabe discussed their findings regarding the condition of the carriage house, based on an August 30th site visit with the HPO staff, project architect, Karrick Sherrill, et.al.
- The building is highly deteriorated from rot and termite damage.
- Continuous movement of the building is apparent.
- Even if the carriage house could be safely disassembled, there would likely be less than 20% salvageable historic fabric.
- Historic sistering of joists is apparent.
- Demolition of the building will likely be required, but the Commission will need to see some sort of plan for the site before demolition takes place.
- A Historic American Buildings Survey (HABS) report will be required prior to demolition.
- New design will need to strongly consider the importance of the building.
- Need to be aware of the volume and massing of a new building on the alley.
- A HABS report will be good to have, but also need to consider some on site methods of conveying the history of the carriage house.

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVALS

• **18-9-1**

1445 Summit Street/Orton Labs

New Avenue Architects & Engineers (Applicant)

Columbus Register Property

ACIHO-1 Management, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-1, 1445 Summit Street/Orton Labs, a Columbus Register Property, for renewal of expired COA # 17-1-5b (Expired: January 19, 2018), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Extend Existing Asphalt Parking Lot

- Extend asphalt parking lot south approximately seventeen feet (17') to include ten (10) new, 90-degree parking spaces.
- Install new linear storm water drain located at the parking lot apron at Peters Alley via trench in existing concrete sidewalk with steel plate cover per submitted site plan.
- Modify existing raised planter beds (adjacent to Peters Alley) to accommodate one (1) new parking space.
- Remove new-growth/volunteer trees along East Eighth Avenue (total of four [4]).
- Decrease width of existing sidewalk (adjacent to the building) from five feet (5') to four feet (4').
- Remove existing, deteriorated, modular block retaining wall along East Eighth Avenue.
- Install new, cast-in-place, buttressed concrete retaining wall in the same East Eighth Avenue location. Height to be six feet (6' H) above grade. Wall to be capped with decorative, forty-two inch (42"), wrought iron screening.

- Any/all additional screening identified by the City Building and Zoning staff to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Officer for final review and approval in consultation with the commission subcommittee of Commissioners Wolf and Henry.

Install New Primary Entrance Steps

- Relocate and reconstruct existing concrete steps closer to the primary entrance per submitted site plan.

Install New Bicycle Storage Rack

- On east elevation near old growth tree per submitted site plan.

Plant New Trees—Summit Street/East Elevation

- Plant five (5), new-growth trees of same species on preserved grass area per submitted site plan.

Exterior Lighting Fixtures

- **Applicant to submit final exterior lighting details to the Historic Preservation Officer for final review and approval in consultation with the commission subcommittee of Commissioners Wolf and Henry prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.**

MOTION: Clark/Henry (5-0-0) APPROVED

- **18-9-2**

1330 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Gerhard G. Gnosa (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-2, 1330 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, for renewal of expired COA # 17-7-3 (Expired: June 13, 2018), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Exterior Painting—Windows

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows.
- Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Replace any/all sash which are deteriorated beyond reasonable repair with new wooden sash of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.
- Prepare all exterior wooden trim surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. **Any/all replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.**
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Finish paint color to match existing; like-for-like.

Repair Stone Parapet

- Remove any/all damaged material on the parapet wall on left/west elevation and replace with like-for-like materials. Any/all replacement stone necessary is required to match the existing original stone type, size, color, and shape exactly (i. e. like-for-like).
- Mortar to match existing mortar in color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings".)
- The height, thickness, and length of the parapet wall is to remain the same as the original following the completion of all repairs.

- **18-9-3**

1822 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Justin Hayes (Applicant)/ Kevin Sarich (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-3, 1822 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated asphalt roof.

- Install new Owens Corning standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Estate Gray”.
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; to be painted either “Tinner’s red” or “Gray”.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **18-9-4**

742 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Michael Williams (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-4, 742 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated front concrete steps, from front porch to sidewalk.
- Install new concrete steps to match existing and per City of Columbus Building Codes and industry standards; like-for-like.

Remove Existing Concrete Steps and Install Concrete Steps

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete service steps, and disposes of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimensions, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

• **18-9-5**

73 W. Royal Forest Blvd.

Old Beechwold Historic District

Lindalee W. Brownstein (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-5, 73 West Royal Forest Blvd., Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new whole-house generator in rear yard.
- Generator to be positioned next to exiting AC condenser unit.

• **18-9-6**

672 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Charles Lusco (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-6, 672 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Clean and paint exterior wood trim and shutters. Trim to be painted Sherwin Williams “Lilting Lily” (HGSW1186), and shutters to be painted Sherwin Williams “Bayside Blue” (HGSW2313).
- Repair front porch ceiling as needed to match existing.

- Replace broken gutter supports and install 1 new downspout.
- Repair front porch roof as needed; any/all new slate is to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **18-9-7**

262 E. Lane Avenue

Iuka Ravine Historic District

Jason Bally (Applicant)/ Olde Alexandria Acquisitions, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-7, 262 E. Lane Avenue Iuka Ravine Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repaint existing windows and siding; color to be Sherwin Williams "Neutral Ground" (SW7568).
- Repaint soffit and fascia; color to be Sherwin Williams "Rookwood Red" (SW2802).
- Repaint existing egress stairs; color to be Sherwin Williams "Tricorn Black" (SW6258).
- Previously painted stone lintels, sills, and water table to be painted a STONE color; new paint chip to be provided to HPO Staff prior to painting for final review.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **18-9-8**

851 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Gunzelman Architecture & Interiors (Applicant)/ David Fischer & Lisa Imondi (Owners)

Approve Application 18-9-8, 851 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Build New Garage

- Construct new 2-car garage at rear of lot, per the submitted drawings.

- Garage to use existing curb cut along 17th Avenue.
- Exterior cladding to be 4” horizontal Hardie Siding with Hardi Shake in gables.
- Trim to be 1 x, per the Columbus Register Guidelines, page 85.
- Two (2) overhead garage doors on west elevation to be flush metal.
- One (1) pedestrian door on north elevation to be flush metal.
- One (1) 2/2 Double-hung sash on north elevation to be from approved windows lists. Final window choice to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles from approved roofing list. Final shingle choice to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Exterior colors to match existing.
- Exterior lighting to be per the submitted drawings.

• **18-9-9**

1053 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Travis More (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-8, 851 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Modify Previous Approval/Porch Columns

- Modify previous porch rehabilitation from wood columns to fiberglass columns.
- New columns to be 10” by 9’ non-tapered columns.
- Final design for base and capital to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- New fiberglass to be painted. Paint color to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Note: COA # 18-9-9 modifies COA # 18-6-13 (June 14, 2018). Fiberglass columns are being approved as a “Test Case” only. Final installation is to be inspected by Historic Preservation Office staff and reported to the Commission.

• **18-8-14b**

71 West Jeffrey Place

Old Beechwold Historic District

Dominic Boyden/Boyden Renovations, LLC. (Applicant)

Rhonda Comer & Vincent Day (Owners)

Approve Application 18-8-14b, 71 West Jeffrey Place, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Windows

- Replace the three (3) sets of casement windows on the second floor of the façade, and the one (1) casement window on the second floor of the rear elevation of the same room.
- Install new Marvin Clad Ultimate, out-swinging Casement window replacements, per the submitted specifications.
- New windows to fit the historic openings, not to be down-sized with any additional trim.
- All existing, exterior wood window trim to remain, as is.

Note: The Marvin Ultimate Next Generation (aluminum-clad wood) window is on the Approved Windows List for double-hung sash replacement. Installation of the Ultimate Next Generation is being approved at this particular site as a “Test Case” for replacement of casement windows. Final installation is to be inspected by Historic Preservation Office staff and reported to the Commission.

X. OLD BUSINESS

18-9-14 (*Not required to attend*)

1445 Summit Street

Orton Memorial Lab / Individually Listed Property

Steven Schwope/New Avenue Architects (Applicant)

ACIHO-1 Management, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-14, 71 1445 Summit Street, Orton Memorial Lab / Individually Listed Property, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Modify Guard Rail

- Add rosette design feature to new railings on the south elevation, along Eighth Avenue, per the submitted drawings and product cut sheet.
- Note: COA # 18-9-14 modifies COA # 18-9-1 (August 20, 2018).

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURN

DRAFT