

Commissioner's Present:

Janet Jackson, Chair, Brooke Burns, Emily Buster, Tammy Fournier-Alsaada, Ellen Moore Griffin, Dr. Chenelle Jones, Dr. Vlad Kogan, Matt McCrystal, Andrea Morbitzer, Traci Shaw, Oleatha Waugh

Commissioner's Absent:

LaShaun Carter, Pastor Jason Ridley, Erin Synk, Tiffany White, Mary Wehrle, Dr. Reginald Wilkinson

Staff Present:

Denise Bauer, Bryan Clark, Jeff Furbee, Lt. Dennis Jeffrey, Lt. David Justice, Commander Bob Meader, Kate Pishotti, Elon Simms, Lt. Tim Sansbury

WELCOME

Chair Janet Jackson welcomed the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission ("Safety Commission") to the meeting.

SAFETY COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Chair Jackson asked for a motion to approve the meeting minutes of the September 12, 2018 Safety Commission Meeting. After a concern was raised by Commission Fournier-Alsaada about the completeness of the meeting minutes overall and the omission of transcriptions of in-depth conversations, Chair Jackson asked for a volunteer from the Commission to serve as recording secretary for the group. Commissioner Griffin agreed to serve in this capacity.

Committee Chairs – Commissioner Fournier-Alsaada commented that the discussion had at the September 12 meeting was omitted from the meeting minutes; specifically, she asked how were chairs and co-chairs chosen for the committees. Chair Jackson responded that the question was asked and answered at the September 12 meeting and no further discussion was needed. Commissioner Fournier-Alsaada requested that a discussion about the topic be scheduled for a future meeting.

TRAINING BUREAU OVERVIEW

Commander Bob Meader provided a briefing of the makeup of the Training Bureau's 44 member staff noting that the Training Bureau is responsible for training every new hire all the way through to the end of their career.

OHIO PEACE OFFICERS TRAINING

Presentation by Mary Davis, Executive Director of the Ohio Peace Officers Training Commission on the structure, certification and training of Ohio Peace Officers. The Training Commission is established by the Ohio Revised Code and its 10 members are appointed by the Governor of the State of Ohio and confirmed by the Senate. The Commission appoints the Executive Director and that office operates under the authority of the Ohio Attorney General. Ms. Davis noted that there is only one type of office in Ohio and that is a Peace Officer, sharing that all Certified Peace Officers are certified by the Peace Officer Training Commission. To become certified, you must complete basic training, pass the state certification exam and hold an appointment

with an agency. The Peace Officer Training Commission can also decertify an officer for certain offenses as laid out in the statute.

The Peace Officer Training Commission sets the minimum standards for basic training, the number of training hours and the instructor qualifications for the basic training program. After a recruit passes basic training, they sit for the state certification examination. Once a recruit becomes a certified officer, legislative mandates have been made requiring all peace officers to get training in a certain topic. There is also Continuing Professional Training (CPT). The commission sets the number of CPT hours annually, based on funding.

Ms. Davis shared an overview of the advisory group recommendations that were provided to the peace officer training commission in 2015. There were 29 recommendations made to the training commission and Ms. Davis provided the Safety Commission a list of those recommendations and the completions and in-progress status (attached). Ms. Davis shared details on the Pre-Certification Recommendations and Certification Recommendations. She noted the most notable changes was that prior to these recommendations, there was an administrative code that put a cap on the amount of training hours that the commission could establish. Prior they could not mandate training over 650 hours, and that as of July 2018, the hours have been increased to 728 hours.

James Burke, Director of Advanced Training at the Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy, provided details on basic training and the continuing professional training requirements. He covered the Ohio Peace Officer Training Commission Peace Officer Basic Training Audit Sheet (attached). The audit sheet shows the topics and number of hours of training for each topic.

Discussion points:

- Will we have the ability to see the trauma-informed training offered to Columbus Police Officers? All training sessions are public record, so anyone can see the course materials.
- Correlation between new training sessions and the impact they have on statistics? This has not been tracked.
- How are new continuing education sessions chosen? Funding source dictates the subject matter covered. In 2007-2010, training topics were largely funded by the Attorney General's office through the crime victim's assistance monies. The large pot of money existed due to the impediments imposed on those seeking restitution. In 2014-2017, continuing education training funded by Attorney General's office general fund – topics covered subject matter raised in the Police-Community Relations report.
- What portion of trauma-informed training focused on officers responding to situations where victims and perpetrators may have been exposed to trauma in their past as opposed to training focused on officer self-reflection? 75% of the training focused on response; 25% on self-reflection.
- Is cultural competency training provided? Yes, it is covered under community diversity and procedural justice training module and must be covered by a certified instructor. It is not taught by a community member.

BASIC TRAINING

Presentation by Tim Sansbury, Lieutenant for the CPD training academy and in charge of basic training and field training. Basic Training includes 29 weeks (1160 hours) of Police Academy training, 16 weeks of Field Training and 7 weeks of probation, this is in addition to the required training required by the Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy. Lt. Sansbury provided statistics on the population of Columbus, OH, noting that Columbus is the 14th most populated city in the nation. The Columbus Police Department, with 1,948 (authorized) sworn personnel, is the largest police agency in Ohio and 17th largest metropolitan police agency in the United States. He shared statistics on other agencies in the United States.

In training new recruits, they are developing skills, knowledge and attitude. Lt. Sansbury shared that when he was a recruit, there was more of the warrior mind set than a guardian mind set. A big talking point right now is whether police officers are guardians or are they warriors. He shared a quote by Plato that is shown to every recruit class “Thousands of years before the policing profession was established, Plato envisioned the perfect society-a republic that honors the core of democracy-the greatest amount of power is given to those he called the guardians. Only those with the most impeccable character would be chosen to bear the responsibility of protecting the democracy. These guardians would love the community more than anything else, and never act in any way to harm it. They would be entrusted to preserve its ideals, the sanctity of human dignity and life itself.” Recruits are responsible for knowing, living up to and being able to recite the academies core values: Professionalism, Respect, Integrity, Discipline and Enthusiasm. All training revolves around 4 core principles: Ethics, Constitutional Policing, Community Policing and Policy. Lt. Stansbury shared that the academy does have a paramilitary structure and although that does not mean they are doing military formations using military style equipment, it is a high stress academy utilizing stress inoculation. They put a lot of stress on recruits during training so they are prepared when they are on the streets. All sworn Columbus Police Officers attend the Columbus Police Academy – they do not accept lateral transfers from other agencies. He noted the academies attrition rate is about 15% which matches up with national averages

He shared an analysis of the most recent recruiting class and the attrition rate w/reason:

Reason for Departure	Number	Total Appointed (Class 121-127)	Percentage
Medical	7	335	2.1%
Failed State Standard	4	335	1.2%
Failed Division Standard	3	335	0.9%
Personal Reasons	20	335	6.0%
Terminated (Discipline)	1	335	0.3%
Physically Unprepared	12	335	3.6%
Refused/Unknown	2	335	0.6%
Total	49	335	14.6%

He provided a typical recruit class demographic:

- Average age: 26
- College Graduates: 50% have a Bachelor's Degree
- Combat Veterans: 25%
- Second Career: 25%
- Prior Experience: 30%
- Family Member in Law Enforcement: 25%
- Millennials: 95%

Lt. Stansbury noted the required training hours mandated is 728 hours and that the police academy provides 1160 hours of training, an addition of 432 hours. He showed the areas where the additional hours are spent:

Academics
Physical Fitness
Defensive Tactics
Driving
Firearms
Scenario based training
Character

After that training, the recruits are ready to graduate and move to field training. Recruits go to four different phases of field training for a total of 15 weeks in the field and then the 16th week is spent at the police academy for classroom training and legal updates.

Discussion points:

- Where is CPD's version of the academy training agenda? Could we be provided with the full outline of the 1100+ hours of training provided to recruits by CPD?
- Do the additional 432 hours of training correlate with current crime trends and topics? Yes – we will be provided an outline of the change in training over the last several years.
- Stress inoculation – is it the sole method of conditioning for cadets? Are there other coping mechanisms or resiliency-building training offered during training? Yes – 32 hours of training with the CPD psychiatrist offers additional tools for officers to deal with stress. Cadets are required to read the book, Emotional Survival for Law Enforcement by Kevin Gilmartin, which covers topics related to dealing with short-term and long-term stress, both acute and chronic, over the course of an officer's career. Critical incident stress awareness training is also offered.
- Handout outlining significant dates in police-involved shootings and police officer deaths – what is the significance? National incidents have resulted in the increase in training hours.
- Plato referenced in terms of the “guardians vs warriors”? Shift from warrior to guardian mentality in the culture of CPD - when did it happen? Several opinions were offered: when CALEA standards came in to play; when Chief Jacobs took over; changing climate of police/community relations.

- History of law enforcement in America and its roots in racism – is it taught during basic training? Briefly, in the administrative portion of the training.
- Could we get more detail around the reasons cadets/officers did not make it through basic training and/or field training?
- Suburban departments – how are their officers chosen to be trained by CPD? Each agency determines how it trains its officers. Sharing officers between departments does not happen, except in terms of concurrent jurisdiction agreements. CPD will help other departments with training, providing support in terms of personnel (SWAT, critical incident response, etc.). Mutual aid agreements and MOUs exist between departments to facilitate cross-jurisdictional partnerships.
- State-mandated training – as it increases, how does it impact CPD’s training schedule? With the limited number of academy weeks, adjustments must be made to accommodate to the state-mandated training. Some topics get moved into the 16th week of field training. Timing of training schedule is mandated by many factors, including probationary periods under civil service rules.
- How does the officer on the street feel about their training? Will we have the opportunity to hear from officers? Yes, community meetings will include a meeting with patrol officers in South Linden, Hilltop/Franklinton, and Southside.

ADVANCE TRAINING

Presentation from David Justice, Lieutenant for the CPD training academy and in charge of advanced training. The Advanced Training Unit (ATU) builds upon the mission of the bureau by preparing and establishing professional development and educational opportunities for Division personnel through in-service training, electronic roll-call training, specialized job-specific training, rank training through the Basic Supervisory Development Course for sergeants and Management and Leadership Training for Lieutenants, regional training program courses, training supplements, and various other programs. Lt. Justice highlighted specific examples of the ATU playing an instrumental role in assisting to move the division forward in fostering more transparent operation through the implementation of technology:

- The division equipped frontline cruisers with VisionHawk Cruiser Video. Training was conducted for the Patrol Subdivision and Traffic Bureau to ensure compliance with the newly created cruiser video directive and to create proficiency in the operation of the system.
- In 2009 the division began to upgrade the cruiser video system with the purchase of the Panasonic Arbitrator. The training process was repeated for the Patrol Subdivision and Traffic Bureau.
- In 2016, two members of the ATU began training the Patrol Subdivision and Traffic Bureau for the impending rollout of body worn cameras. Over 1000 officers received the same training covering device operation and division policy.

- Adobe Connect
 - Allows for verification of all roll call training
 - Can determine length of time student spent on each slide
 - How many slides were viewed (in progress status)
 - Easy retrieval of all training records stored in LMS
 - Creation of interactive training

From 2015 to 2018, the division has averaged 37.5 hours/year of actual training hours for all sworn personnel. The per hour cost of training is \$76,960.44 with a yearly cost of \$2,886,016.50. Training. Topics and hours of training:

- 54 Hours of ATU in-service classroom instruction
- 28 Hours of Defensive Tactics Training
- 14 Hours of Joint Lifesaving Tactics
- 40 Hours of Firearms instruction and skills development
- 165 Electronic Roll Call Trainings*≈ 14 hours

ATU In-Service Topics

- 2015 (7 Hours): Implicit Bias, Verbal De-escalation, Officer Wellness, Legal Updates, Lethality Assessment Plan, Ethics
- 2016 (12 Hours): Blue Courage, Ethics, Companion Animals, De-escalation of Mentally Ill and Combat Veterans, Human Trafficking, Legal Updates
- 2017 (21 Hours): BWC, EEO, Legal Updates, Trauma Informed Policing, Procedural Justice and Police Legitimacy, Ethics, Practical Application of Force
- 2018 (14 Hours): When Crime and Mental Illness Collide, Ethics: Peer Intervention, Bias and Inclusion, Legal Updates, BWC/CVS, Patrol Narcotics, OVI/DICE/Quick Clear

Lt. Justice provided details on several of the training topics:

- Lethality assessment is a division program used to assess the danger faced by victims of domestic violence to determine if immediate action is required to safeguard their life.
- Practical application of force – the first 7 hour training of the Joint Lifesaving Tactics which combined CFD medics and CPD patrol in the techniques to quickly and safely triage a mass casualty event and evacuate the victims for immediate medical aid.
- Procedural Justice: Students gain an understanding that citizens’ perceptions of the fairness of process and treatment are key components of procedurally just policing. Positive perceptions of procedural justice add to the view of police as a legitimate authority.
- Police Legitimacy: Students are taught that police legitimacy is the perception of the public that the police are a legitimate authority and directly impacts the public’s willingness to cooperate with and obey the police.

- LE Wellness: Officers are trained to recognize the negative health threats of chronic stress on the human body. Strategies are discussed to counter chronic-stress-related systemic inflammation and negative health effects.
- LE Ethics and Implicit Bias: Students gain an understanding of the need for and importance of continuing LE ethics training through videos and thought provoking exercises. Implicit bias is defined as the attitudes or stereo-types that affect understanding, actions, and decisions in an unconscious manner. Training stresses the importance of understanding the existence of implicit bias to enable self-control over our behavior
- Blue Courage: Students are introduced to the philosophy of personal and organizational transformation through the engagement of heart, mind, body and spirit. The training demonstrates how to effectively combat challenges faced by LE through the development of a culture of learning, critical thinking, open mindedness, respect, and intellectual curiosity. Blue Courage is taught in four modules: Foundations, Respect, Practical Wisdom, and Positive Psychology. These modules highlight the importance of officer wellness, ethics, and leadership and their roles in providing better service to the community.
- De-Escalation Training: Students gain an understanding that methods of normal police operation may not be effective with a person experiencing a psychological/emotional crisis and may in fact be counterproductive. Officers receive training in recognizing the signs of a person experiencing a crisis and are taught the skills of active listening, emotional labeling, paraphrasing, mirroring and reflecting, asking open ended questions, and minimal encouragers.

Officers are also offered the opportunity to receive additional training at no cost. From 2015 – 2017, 1,333 sworn employees have attended hosted elective courses.

The division also conducts leadership training covering topics:

- Basic Supervisory Development Course is a two week course of instruction designed to give newly promoted sergeants and officers approaching promotion leadership and practical skills training.
- Management and Leadership Training (MALT)
- Outside Leadership training: FBI National Academy, Police Executive Leadership College, Certified Law Enforcement Executive, Northwestern School of Police Staff and Command

Lt. Justice shared the mission of the Defensive Tactics Unit: The mission of the Defensive Tactics Unit (DTU) is to provide sworn personnel with the skills necessary to effectively serve the public in a manner consistent with the tenets of Constitutional policing. These skills include de-escalation techniques, subject control techniques, life-saving tactics, critical incident survival, stopping tactics and use of force continuum/policy. All trained techniques and tactics are developed and instructed in a manner that ensures sworn personnel's decisions to be ethically, legally, and medically sound. Sworn personnel receive a minimum of 7 hours of defensive tactics training every year. Some of the topics that are covered:

- Use of Force Policy Review and Test
- TASER Proficiency
- De-Escalation
- Handcuffing Techniques
- Prisoner Control Techniques
- Police Tactical Boxing
- Baton Techniques
- Controlled Strikes
- MILO Training
- Scenario Training
- Transition Drills
- Joint Lifesaving Tactics

Lt. Justice shared the primary mission of the Ordnance Units (1st Watch Unit and Evening Midwatch Unit, collectively referred to as Ordnance Unit) is to provide firearms instruction and training to sworn members of the Division of Police. The Ordnance Unit is responsible for training recruits, in-service officers, and reserve officers. The Division of Police Ordnance Unit conducts five phases of firearms training throughout the year. Each phase focuses on basic skills for the various weapon platforms used by the division. The phases:

- The first phase of training includes testing students' knowledge of the division's policy on firearms and mace as well as shooting the State mandated scored course of fire for the primary duty weapon
- The second phase of firearms training covers mace re-certification and patrol shotgun familiarization. Students also shoot a scored shotgun course required to carry the division issued patrol shotgun
- Phase III: The third phase of firearms training covers other division authorized firearms. This includes off-duty and in-lieu of firearms which are scored on the State course of fire.
- Phase IV: This phase of training is a decision course which requires the student to identify threats and respond according to the threat level posed. The appropriate response ranges from de-escalation tactics to the use of deadly force. Target and student movement are incorporated into this course of fire.
- Phase V: The final phase of training is a scored course of fire of the primary duty weapon on the NRA course.

Discussion points:

- What are considered "winnable" scenarios? Everyone goes home safely.
- De-escalation scenarios – when does the shift happen to go from de-escalating the situation to extreme use of force, especially in mental health situations. Each situation presents itself differently and officers must determine their reaction based on input they are presented with.
- What is the use of force continuum? Threat perceived determines the level of force used and is designed to bring the situation under control. The 6th District Court has set

guidelines for dealing with the mentally ill. When no weapon is present, the response is different.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 4:15 pm.

DRAFT