

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

**Tuesday, September 18, 2018
6:00 p.m.**

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, Jason Sudy, Shannon Fergus, Lauren Crosby, Ben Goodman.

HPO Staff Present: D.W. Route.

- I.** CALL TO ORDER – 6:13pm.
- I.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, October 9, 2018 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Tuesday, October 16, 2018.
- III.** SWEAR IN STAFF
- IV.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, August 21, 2018. MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- V.** PUBLIC FORUM
- VI.** STAFF APPROVALS
- VII.** STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- VIII.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

NEW APPLICATIONS

1. 18-9-10

45-47 E. First Ave.

Michael Blue Kirk (Owner)

Continue application #18-9-10, 45-47 E. First Ave., at the applicant's request:

- Install an approximately 38' x 75' asphalt parking lot at rear of property.

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

2. 18-9-11

324 E. Second Ave.

Ben Goodman, Designpath LLC (Applicant)/ Station 324, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #18-9-11, 324 E. Second Ave., as submitted:

- Install 5.08' x 14.17' internally illuminated sign as per submitted drawing and elevation.

MOTION: Boyer/Fergus (4-0-1) APPROVED. [Goodman]

3. 18-9-12

201 E. Fourth St.

Julie Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Andrew Loinske (Owner)

Continue application #18-9-12, 201 E. Fourth St., due to the absence of the applicant:

- Revisions to previously approved drawings to match as-built conditions
- Approve existing exterior ductwork to remain.
- Replacement of rear door with ¾ lite steel door with double panels at the bottom.
- Revise front door to be ¾ lite steel door with double panels at the bottom.
- Revise previously approved fence.

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

4. 18-9-14

843 Hamlet St.

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Dan & Christie Crane (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new addition to the south side of the existing house.
- Addition is a side addition to the property.
- Siding, Windows, trim, and all other exterior to match the existing house.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Goodman – Supports the concept and feels the addition is appropriate. Before approval, need to submit ¾" to 1' section drawings.
- Commissioner Boyer – Ok with the roofline due to the new construction of the original house.
- Commissioner Sudy – Initial concern over the doors facing the street on the addition, but given the context of the site and the property fence obscuring the proposed addition, has no issues with the proposal. Told the applicant to submit more detailed drawings for Staff Approval next month.
- Commissioner Fergus – Had concerns over the addition creating a double front porch on the front elevation of the house, but given the setback distance, fence, and with the house being a new construction, supports the proposal.

5. 18-9-15

1160 N. High St.

Stonewall Columbus, Inc. (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Install three brand logo vinyl applications on the glass per submitted drawing. Logos to be 48"x14.4"
- Install painted aluminum "Stonewall" sign per submitted drawing. Sign to be 96"x10.25"
- Install painted aluminum "1160" address per submitted drawing. Sign to be 18"x6"
- Install Cornerstone Mark. Zinc channel mounted, back-lit with RGB-LED Tape Lighting.
- Install Clock Sign with Brand Logo as per submitted drawing. Sign to be 96"x39.5" and Clock to be 30"x42".
- Install Mission Letter Forms as per submitted drawing. Signs to be painted aluminum of "CONNECT" (72"x10.25"), "UPLIFT" (52"x10.25"), and "THRIVE" (60"x10.25").

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Goodman – Agrees with Commissioner Fergus regarding the Cornerstone Mark. Make it more expressive. Does not support the current "Stonewall" signage over the original entrance, but highly recommends sandblasting "Stonewall" into the limestone above the original entrance. With that, the new entrances should be reinforced. The mission words would be better suited as vinyl graphics on the glass. Need more detailed site plans and colored renderings with the next submission.
- Commissioner Boyer – Also feels that the mission words should be put down on the glass, as they are secondary signage. Questions having the "Stonewall" and address located above the old entrance, and not a current entrance.
- Commissioner Sudy – Needs to have a more representative drawing of the Cornerstone Mark. Agrees with the other commissioner's comments regarding the mission words needing to be put on the glass, and also have a more artistic and calculated and less confusing signage package. Currently the mission words are also too large, as they are secondary signage.
- Commissioner Crosby – Put the mission words "Connect, Uplift, and Thrive" as vinyl window graphics.
- Commissioner Fergus – Make the Cornerstone Mark more artistic and larger. Currently there is too much signage and logos, without a clear layout and direction. Doesn't feel that the brand logos and the mission words are even needed. Need to articulate a clear entrance to the building.

6. 18-9-16

1050 N. Fourth St.

Karrick Sherrill (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing concrete block building (former location of Durable Slate).
- Construct 68-unit wood frame apartment building with parking at grade on the first floor.
- Discussion of massing, density, site access, and general building metrics.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Goodman – Mixed feelings regarding the garage access off of Detroit Avenue. Enjoyed the steps from the previous design. Would like the building to fill the unique angle of the property line and not have a boring corner. The massing style is much improved. Concern with how the brick and metal will interact. If metal is used, it would need to be the thicker plate metal for quality purposes. Concern over multiple business signs on 4th Street. Would like the applicant to research and provide precedent for the proposed brick detailing.
- Commissioner Boyer – Really likes the direction of the new design and the massing on Detroit Avenue. Fine with the new entrance off of Detroit Avenue. Good building transition on Detroit Avenue. Would like to explore a non-brick traditional retail storefront entrance. Would also propose making the 2nd floor courtyard a public space and provide stadium style stairs leading up to it from 4th Street.
- Commissioner Fergus – Massing and the courtyard are good. The project is heading in the right direction. The new access point off of Detroit Avenue is fine. Suggests that the red brick be a lighter shade.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

- **18-9-1**

821 Summit St.

Able Roof (Applicant)/Sarah Vosler (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-1, 821 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated rubber roof on rear addition.
- Install new EPDM rubber membrane roof per submitted specifications.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the rear addition down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

- **18-9-2**

839 Summit Street

Ben Goodman & Chris Zuelke (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-2, 839 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Revision to previously approved porch design.
- Install Horizontal baluster dividers as per submitted drawing.
- Remove the previously approved right hand planter box and install a wood panel design as per submitted drawing.
- Rebuild existing porch deck and steps and integrate into existing deck.
- Add new porch roof and related posts, beams, and handrails.
- Features include standing seam roofing, exposed rafter tails, and half-round gutter.

- **18-9-3**

86 Warren Street

John Michael Holsinger (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-3, 86 Warren Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repaint house with the same color scheme.
- Main house color to be Behr Anchor Gray
- Trim color to be Behr Secret Violet
- Accent color to be Sherwin Williams Green Danube

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
 - Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.
- **18-9-4**
41 E. Prescott Street
Michele & Kenneth Gagen (Owner)
Approve Application 18-9-4, 41 E. Prescott Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Replace plywood shingle/trim as needed with wood shingle/trim and paint to match.
 - Repaint house with the same color scheme.
 - Main house color to be Valspar Reserve (Brown)
 - Trim/Porch color to be Valspar Reserve (Yellow)
 - Accent color to be Valspar Reserve (Red)Exterior Painting
 - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
 - Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.
 - **18-9-5**
17 E. Brickel Street
Jennifer Bender (Applicant) CKE Management/C. Kruegers (Owner)
Approve Application 18-9-5, 17 E. Brickel Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Install externally illuminated 2'x6' (12 sq. ft.) painted aluminum projecting sign with black painted PVC letters/graphics as per submitted drawing.
 - Install 4 small LED Spot Lights on the wall as per submitted drawing.
 - **18-9-6**
271/281 Neruda Avenue
Rob Harris (Applicant) Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)
Recommend approval of application 18-9-6, 271/281 Neruda Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
Lot Split Correction Recommendation
 - Previously approved Lot Split needs amended due to survey error.
 - Extend Lot 73 to the East 1.50' as shown in submitted survey.
 - Shift Lot 75 to the North 3.00' as shown in submitted survey.

- **18-9-7**

251 Greenwood Avenue

Julie Bullock Architects (Applicant) William Kirk (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-7, 251 Greenwood Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install 6' Horizontal Privacy Fence as per submitted site plan.
- Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Install paver patio as per submitted plan.
- Install landscaping as per submitted site plan.

- **18-9-8**

248 E. Fourth Street

Josh Myers (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-8, 248 E. Fourth Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install 6' Horizontal Privacy Fence as per submitted site plan.
- Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Install paver patio with black pavers.
- Install landscaping as per submitted site plan.

- **18-9-9**

784 Kerr Street

Charles & Mark Smith (Owner)

Approve Application 18-9-9, 784 Kerr Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Perform brick cleaning per historic specifications.

Power Wash Spec

- Clean all unpainted masonry in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes. Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and utilizing a broad fan tip. Should chemical cleaning be proposed by the owner or contractor or be determined to be necessary by Historic Preservation Office staff for paint removal of Previously Painted Masonry: the following procedure is required: Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x2') section in the least visible location possible. Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations. If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings").

Spot Tuck Point-(partial) - Tuck point any damaged areas as needed.

- Check all mortar joints for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings", available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

Porch Rehabilitation - Renovate/repair the porch floor, ceiling, porch railing, and support footing and skirting per historic specifications.

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new 1" x 3" tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Restore the front porch banisters/hand rails/columns as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails/columns; like-for-like.

Replace Porch Ceiling

- Remove and dispose of existing porch ceiling, pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing rafters to insure structural integrity.
- Install a new porch ceiling nailed with galvanized finish nails.
- New material to be 1" x 3", tongue and groove, yellow pine, bead board or 4' x 8' Georgia-Pacific "Classic" style Ply-Bead (with sanded surface and 1/8" beaded pattern approx. 1.6" o.c.); prime exposed surface complete.
- Paint/stain color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Removal & Relaying of Original Brick - Repair brick porch support footings per historic specifications.

- Relay the original brick and masonry with mortar of the exact same color, texture, joint profile and hardness as the original mortar.
- New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings", available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

Exterior Painting - Paint all wooden surfaces per submitted materials.

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Repair the concrete steps like-for-like.

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete service steps, and disposes of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimensions, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Install wrought iron fence per submitted specs and siteplan.

- Remove the current chain link fence at the front of the house, and replace with a black wrought iron fence and gate per submitted materials.

- **18-9-13**

- **1100 N. High Street**

- **John Ingwersen (Applicant) Stelios Giannopoulos (Owner)**

- Approve Application 18-9-13, 1100 N. High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install paver patio and landscaping as per submitted plan.

- Recommend approval of application 18-9-13, 1100 N. High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Variance Recommendation

- **3312.09 – Aisle: Request a 4’ Variance to the Aisle Width from 20’ to 16’**

- An aisle is that portion of the circulation area within a parking lot, excluding the driveway, which provides accessibility to parking, stacking or loading spaces.

- An aisle to serve adjacent loading spaces shall have a minimum width of 15 feet. No part of the loading space may be included in this calculation.

- The minimum width permissible for an aisle to serve adjacent parking spaces shall depend on the smallest angle of parking as measured between the centerline of the aisle and the centerline of the adjacent parking.

- **3312.13 – Driveway: Request a 4’ Variance to the Driveway Width from 20’ to 16’**

- A driveway is any access corridor leading from a public right-of-way to a parking lot, aisle, parking circulation area, garage, off-street parking space, or loading space. The Department of Public Service shall limit points of driveway access from residentially zoned lots abutting both an improved alley and street.

- Each driveway shall be located and designed in a manner that provides for the safety of motorists and pedestrians.

- A. A driveway serving a residential parking area containing one to eight parking spaces shall have a minimum width of ten feet and a maximum width of 20 feet measured at the street right-of-way line.

- B. All other driveways shall have a minimum width of 20 feet and a maximum width of 35 feet measured at the street right-of-way line.

- **3312.25 - Maneuvering**

- Every parking and loading space shall have sufficient access and maneuvering area. The maneuvering area for a parking space may occur anywhere on a lot except in the area between the street right-of-way line and the parking setback line.

- Exceptions: The maneuvering area may include an aisle, circulation area, or improved alley. In single-family or two-family residential districts or in town house developments, the maneuvering area may include a driveway, street, or parking space. The Director of Public Service may waive the requirement for maneuvering area only for a parking lot which has and continues to have an operator on duty during all hours of operation.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Boyer/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT– Goodman/Fergus (3-0-0) ADJOURNED. 7:30 pm.

(Note: Commissioners Sudy and Crosby recused themselves on the last agenda item and left early)