BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS

MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

Regular Meeting

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr.
President, Presiding

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

Monday, October 29, 2018
12:41 p.m.
City of Columbus
Civil Service Commission
77 North Front Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215

TRACI E. PEOPLES
PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER

ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
1421 West Third Avenue
Columbus, Ohio 43212
(614) 326-0177
FAX (614) 326-0214
COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President
Stefanie L. Coe
Delena Edwards

PRESENTERS:

Amy DeLong
Jennifer Hutchinson
Carol Lagemann
Charday Litzy-Taylor
Tammy Rollins
Brenda Sobieck

ALSO PRESENT:

Angela Bennett
Wendy Brinnon
MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
October 29, 2018
12:41 p.m.

---

PROCEEDINGS

---

BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 29th day of
October, 2018, this cause came on for hearing before
the Municipal Civil Service Commission, Grady
L. Pettigrew, Jr., President. And, the parties
appearing in person and/or by counsel, as
hereinafter set forth, the following proceedings
were had:

---

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: We'll call to order
the City of Columbus Ohio Municipal Civil Service
Commission regular meeting for October 2018. We
will be following the written agenda.

The first item is review and approval of
the minutes of the September 24th regular meeting.

MS. EDWARDS: I move that we approve the
minutes of the September 24th regular meeting.

MS. COE: I second that.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
"aye."
THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

No rule revisions submitted.

Prehearing conference reviews?

MS. SOBIECK: Brenda Sobieck, with the Civil Service Commission staff. We had two prehearing conferences. The first one was Ruth Campbell v. Columbus City Schools. We're actually right in the middle of that hearing.

So the second one is Nikita Cummins v. Columbus City Schools. It's scheduled for November 7th at 9:00 a.m. I do not have the number of witnesses, but we reviewed the list of witnesses from both the Columbus City Schools and the Union, and they were comfortable that that can be completed in one day, although we did move it to a 9:00 a.m. starting time.

MS. COE: Is that the one I was looking at that --

MS. SOBIECK: Correct.

MS. COE: Okay. Thank you.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. Thank you.

No Trial Board recommendations.
No. 5, request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the background removal standards for police officers, 911 emergency communications employees, and firefighters.

MS. SOBIECK: Commission staff is recommending a change to Standard G(6), to clarify the language regarding two misdemeanor convictions of the first or second degree. We are just adding language to clarify how and when it applies to traffic violations. Historically, the standards had applied to criminal convictions. We’ve had very few with traffic convictions. So we added language that traffic convictions of the M1 or M2 level will be disqualifying for five years, but they will not be a permanent disqualifier. Only having two or more M1 or M2 criminal convictions will be disqualifying permanently.

MS. EDWARDS: I move that we approve the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the background removal standards for police officers, 911 emergency communications employees and firefighters.

MS. COE: I second that.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
"aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Item No. 6, request of the Civil Service Commission staff to amend Rule VII(B)(7)(a), (b) and (c) to expand available opportunities for examination candidates to roll previous exam results to newly administered exams for the same job classification for which they have been approved to test.

MS. DeLONG: Good afternoon. Before you today is a request to amend Rule VII(b)(7)(a), (b) and (c) to expand opportunities when a candidate, having a passing score disposition from a previous exam, rolls forward to use on an upcoming exam for which the candidate has been deemed qualified to take.

Under this proposal, staff is recommending (a) of the rule be considered for readability and understanding and to eliminate the minimum one-week duration between retest opportunities.

For (2), wording has been added that allows an applicant to opt to roll their raw score
under certain conditions to an upcoming exam, even when there is no six-month constraint, as presented in (a).

And, finally, for (c), original wording has been relettered as (d), and a new (c) inserted that allows firefighter and police officer candidates to roll forward a passing disposition for the multiple choice -- and for police officers, also the writing component -- to upcoming administration of exams when it has been determined that the two versions of the exam are the same or comparable in makeup. We are hopeful this change will encourage continued participation by candidates that have previously been tested and were successful on the prior test.

And that pretty much sums it up.

MS. EDWARDS: Thank you.

And I move that we approve the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to amend Rule VII(B)(7)(a), (b) and (c) to expand available opportunities for examination candidates to roll previous exam results to newly administered exams for the same job classification for which they have been approved to test.
MS. COE: I second that.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

Item No. 7 is the review and approval of the 2019 Regular Commission Meeting, Full Commission Hearing and Trial Board Schedule.

MS. EDWARDS: I move that we approve the 2019 Regular Commission Meeting, Full Commission Hearing and Trial Board Schedule.

MS. CODE: I second that.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

Items 7, 9, 10 and 11 are joined together.

Item 8 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to extend the current eligible list for Employee Benefits Analysis I, for a period of one year, to expire on November 9, 2019.

Item 9 is to extend the current eligible list for Management Analyst I, for a period of one
year, to expire on November 9, 2019.

And Item No. 10 is the eligible list for Relocation Specialist for a period of one year, to expire on November 13, 2009.

And Item 11 is to extend the current eligible list for Personnel Analyst I, for the period of one year, to expire on November 13, 2019.

MS. HUTCHINSON: Jennifer Hutchinson, Personnel Administrative Manager.

These four classifications are part of the entry-level professional examinations. The administration was given in November of 2016. Employee Benefits Analyst I has an eligible list with 78 names, with no appointments being made in the last two years; Management Analyst I has 69 eligible names, with only eight appointments; Relocation Specialist had only one appointment of the original 69 eligible names; and Personnel Analyst I had five appointments of the original 80.

Commission staff is requesting that those lists be extended for one year.

MS. EDWARDS: Thank you.

I move that we approve the request of the
Civil Service Commission staff to extend the current eligible list for No. 8, Employee Benefits Analyst I; and 9, Management Analyst I, each for a period of one year, each to expire on November 9, 2009. And No. 10 and 11, the request to extend the current eligible list for Relocation Specialist and 11, Personnel Analyst I, both -- or each to expire in one year on -- I mean, to extend for a period of one year, to expire on November 13, 2019.

MS. COE: I second that.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

Item No. 12, request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Legal Assistant and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. ROLLINS: Tammy Rollins, on behalf of Columbus City Schools.

It is requested that the Legal Assistant classification be revised based on a review of the specification and questionnaire responses from the
incumbent and -- which included a supervisory review. There are some revisions proposed to the specification.

Most notable, within the "Definition Statement," it is recommended that the term "legal secretarial" be substituted with "paralegal."

And within the "Minimum Qualifications," it is proposed that the experience requirement be increased to three years and then expanded to include office support. And that is with required compliance with Federal, State or Local regulations, contracts or other legal requirements.

There are some substitutions also proposed, such as a paralegal certificate or an associate's degree in paralegal studies, to substitute for some or all of that experience.

It is also proposed that a notary public be possessed upon completion of the probationary period. It is proposed that the probationary period be increased from 180 days to 365 days to allow full exposure to the complement of duties, as well as to be -- provide the learning time needed to perform those duties.

And it is recommended that the
examination type remain unchanged.

MS. EDWARDS: I move that we approve the request of the Civil Service staff on behalf -- of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Legal Assistant, and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. COE: I second that.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Thank you.

Item 13 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the classification specification for General Manager, Radio and Television, retitle it to read "Radio and Television General Manager, unspecification for the classification Legal Assistant, and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Charday Litzy-Taylor, Personnel Analyst with the Commission.

This request was initiated as a part of the school district's efforts to review all classes. Based on the feedback received, some revisions are
It is proposed that the title for this classification be revised to read "Radio and Television General Manager." This is consistent with the Columbus City Schools' current class plan. And the proposed change simply moves the "General Manager" to the end of the title.

There is a minor wording change proposed to the definition to correct the school district's name, and a few statements within the "Examples of Work" have been revised to better reflect the current duties. And the statement was reviewed to eliminate redundancies.

It is proposed that the probationary period be revised from 360 days to 365 days, which is consistent with the anticipated learning time and represents a full calendar year.

Lastly, it is recommended that the class plan be modified and General Manager, Radio and Television be removed from the Radio Station Operator and Radio Host Producer class series. Previously, there were two classifications between the Radio Host Producer and the General Manager, Radio and Television classifications. And since
these classifications no longer exist, and the level of work and minimum qualifications is so vastly different, it would make more sense for us to change the classifications.

There are no other changes proposed.

MS. COE: Thank you. I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the classification specification for General Manager, Radio and Television, retitle it to read "Radio and Television General Manager," and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Item No. 14 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of the Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Underwriting Marketing Associate and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: This is also -- This review is also a result of the school district's
efforts to review all classifications. Based on the feedback received, some changes are proposed.

Since this classification is only utilized by the district's NPR radio station, WCBE, and the marketing and underwriting activities are to fund the radio station specifically, it is proposed that the language in the definition be more specific to WCBE.

The main function of this classification is to raise funds through membership, donors, underwriting partnerships and fundraising initiatives that financially support the radio station. It is recommend that a few statements within the "Examples of Work" section be added or revised to better reflect these responsibilities.

Currently, the minimum qualifications require an associate's degree in business, marketing, communications or a closely related field, and one year of sales or fundraising experience. Since these classifications require the experience to be in a specific field, it is proposed that the field of study be removed.

Also, a couple of statements have been added to the "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities."
The -- It is recommended that some knowledge of Federal Communications Commission regulations, as it pertains to underwriting and National Public Radio, be added, as well as the ability to operate a computer and utilize latest software and the ability to communicate effectively.

Lastly, it is proposed that the probationary period be revised from 270 days to 365 days, which is consistent with the anticipated learning time.

And no other changes are proposed at this point in time.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Underwriting Marketing Associate and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.
Item No. 15 is the request of Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Environmental Systems Technicians Supervisor, retitle it to read "Plumber Supervisor," and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst for Civil Service Commission.

This request is the result of a classification review initiated as part of the school district's efforts to review all classes. The current title is proposed to be revised to Plumber Supervisor to better describe the primary purpose of the classification that exists.

The definition is proposed to be updated to focus on plumbing systems.

Within the "Examples of Work" section, revisions are focused on the plumbing duties, with some updates to wording to better describe the work. Work with contractors is referenced, and one statement is deleted since it is outdated.

Within the "Minimum Qualifications" section, the experience is proposed to be modified to build on the years of required commercial
plumbing experience which is gained by those in the lower class in this series.

The possession of a State of Ohio plumbing contractor's license is updated with the current title of the license. And the possession of the certificate -- the Backflow Tester Certificate and the Automatic Sprinkler and Standpipe System Certificate by the end of the probationary period is proposed.

The probationary period is currently 180 days. It is proposed to increase to 365, such that a full year of probation affords the incumbent the full range of duties.

Within the "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" section, the updates proposed better reflect the work. There are no other changes proposed.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Environmental Systems Technician Supervisor (Plumbing/Insulating/Fire Safety Systems), retitle it to read "Plumber
Supervisor," and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Item 16 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Environmental Systems Technician (Insulation) and retitle it to Insulation and Asbestos Abatement Technician.

MS. LAGEMANN: This request is the result of a classification review initiated as part of the school district's efforts to review all classes. The current title is proposed to be revised to Insulation and Asbestos Abatement Technician to better describe the primary work of the classification and to more plainly reference that work with asbestos abatement is critical.

The definition is proposed to be revised to remove examples as to where the work may be conducted, as it is redundant with information in
the "Examples of Work."

Within the "Examples of Work," revisions are proposed to better reflect the work of the classification.

The "Minimum Qualifications" section is proposed to be revised to two years of experience, and the experience must have included some asbestos abatement. In addition, allowance for completion of a vocational training program or for significant postsecondary coursework is -- in insulation, construction trades or related field may be substituted for one year of the required experience.

In order to perform asbestos abatement work, an individual must be certified. It is proposed to add the Asbestos Hazardous Abatement Specialist Certification to the minimum qualifications but to allow for attainment by the end of the probationary period.

Within the "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" section, wording revisions are proposed to better reflect the work.

And within the Class Plan Index, this classification was in the series with the plumbers, within the crafted trades job family and building
trades group. And, while the family and group are consistent, there is no connection to plumbing classes; and, therefore, we propose that this classification be a single classification series. There are no other changes proposed.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission Staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specifications for the Classification Environmental Systems Technician (Insulation) and retitle it to Insulation and Asbestos Abatement Technician.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Item 17 is a request from the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Electronics Repairer and retitle it to Electronics Technician.

MS. LAGEMANN: This request is the result of a classification review initiated as a part of
the school district's efforts to review all classes.

It is proposed to retitle Electronics Repairer to Electronics Technician to better describe the level of the work. The definition is proposed to be revised to remove examples of the type of work and reference more global electronic equipment and electronic systems.

Within the "Examples of Work" section, the revisions are proposed throughout that provide more global terms, followed by examples that are performed in the work. And additional updates are proposed to better reflect the work.

The "Minimum Qualifications" section is proposed to be updated to three years of experience, with the specificity of the experience for radio or television proposed to be updated to electronics repair.

Allowance for completion of vocational training programs or for significant postsecondary coursework in electronics in a related field is proposed to substitute for one year of the required experience.

In the "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" section, wording revisions are proposed to better
reflect the work.

There are no other changes proposed.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Electronics Repairer and retitled it to Electronics Technician.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

The Items 18 through 23 are with no revisions.

Item 18 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Recreation Service Representative, with no revisions.

19 is the classification Power Distribution Load Trainee, no revisions.

20 is the classification Power Distribution Load Operator, with no revisions.
21 is the classification Power Distribution Load Dispatcher, with no revisions.

22 is the classification Utility Services Coordinator, with no revisions.

And 23 is the classification Utility Revenue Manager, with no revisions.

MS. LAGEMANN: A review of these classifications was completed as part of the Civil Service Commission's effort to review all City of Columbus classifications every five years.

After reviewing the specifications, incumbent questionnaires and/or discussions with department representatives, it was decided that the current specifications adequately describe the work.

It is therefore recommended that the review of the specifications for Agenda Items 18 through 23 be approved with no revision.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request for 18 through 23 -- the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review of the classifications Recreation Service Representative, with no revisions; as well as Power Distribution Load Trainee, with no revisions; Power
Distribution Load Operator, with no revisions; Power Distribution Load Dispatcher, with no revisions; Utility Services Coordinator, with no revisions; and Utility Revenue Manager, with no revisions.

MS. EDWARDS: Second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

Item No. 24, the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Power Distribution Assistant manager.

MS. LAGEMANN: The review of this classification was completed as part of our effort to review all classifications every five years.

Within the "Examples of Work" section, a statement that lists the kinds of work that may be monitored is updated to remove storeroom and dispatching, as those two functions are no longer under the responsibility of this classification.

Also, the phrase that states "recommends pay increases" is proposed to be removed, because it would be in the process of performance review, which
is already referenced in the specification.

Within the "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" section, it is proposed to add a knowledge about principles and practices of management and add the ability to read and interpret union contracts. These additions are representative of work performed by this classification.

There are no other revisions proposed.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Power Distribution Assistant Manager.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Item No. 25 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create the specification for the classification Sports Field Maintenance Worker, assign a probationary period of 365 days, designate the examination type as competitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly.
MS. COE: My book says that was deferred. Is that not true?

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I have 26 is deferred.

MS. BRINNON: I'm sorry. You didn't get an updated statement. It should be -- It is now on.


PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay.

MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: The Civil Service Commission staff received a request from the Recreation and Parks Department to create the specification for the classification Sports Field Maintenance Worker to fulfill an operational need as a result of tremendous growth within the department's sports section.

The proposed classification would be responsible for maintaining and preparing the City's athletic fields for a variety of sporting events. Sports Field Maintenance Worker would be placed in the series with and report directly to the Sports Field Maintenance Supervisor. Currently, the department is using the Laborer and Rec and Park Aide Seasonal classifications to perform these duties. However, this has been problematic due to
the growth of the program and the specialized skill set and knowledge required to perform the scope of work.

The department currently does not have the staff or the resources available to train individuals coming in without the specific sports field maintenance experience.

By definition and accompanying this classification, working under general supervision, will be responsible for performing fully skilled landscaping and ground maintenance work specific to athletic fields.

The proposed "Minimum Qualifications" require one year of sports field maintenance experience and the possession of a motor vehicle operator's license. Some positions may require the possession of a commercial applicator's license, Turf Pests, Industrial Vegetation and/or Landscaping category.

The proposed "Minimum Qualifications" would allow for internal employees working in this section currently to acquire the experience.

It is proposed that the examination type be designated as competitive, and the probationary
period be assigned 365 days, which is consistent with the anticipated learning time, due to the nature of seasonal sports.

It is requested that the classification for Sports Field Maintenance Worker be created as proposed, and Rule XI amended accordingly.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create the specification for the classification Sports Field Maintenance Worker, assign a probationary period of 365 days, designate the examination type as competitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Thank you.

The remaining items, we have the applicants removed post-examination. There is -- under the residency hearing review, the application Aaron Hicks is reinstated.

The other administrative and
jurisdictional reviews, the letters as to Adrian Mayo and Matthias Carson are approved as written.

And with that, we are adjourned.

And, thereupon, the proceeding was concluded at approximately 1:10 p.m.
I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 29th day of October, 2018, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.