

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION MINUTES

Thursday, November 15, 2018
6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front Street, Room 205

Commissioners Present: Clyde Henry (acting Chairperson), Dan Morgan, Erin Prosser, Abbie Stiers

Commissioners Absent: Jackie Barton, Steward Gibboney, Joseph McCabe

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:03 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, December 13, 2018 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Third Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, December 20, 2018 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Room 204 (Hearing Room)
- IV. SWEAR IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Thursday, August 16, 2018.
MOTION: Prosser/Stiers (2-0-2 [Morgan & Stiers-abstain]) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Stiers/Morgan (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
 - **Old Beechwold Storm Sewer, Waterline, and Roadway Improvements**
Mike Griffith, Stormwater Engineer, Public Utilities, Division of Sewers & Drainage
T and M Associates

A brief description of the project was provided:

- There will be no change in the composition of the street material.
- Sanitary sewers to be relined. Lines from houses to street to be addressed at a later date.
- Downspouts on houses to be redirected.
- Rain Gardens to be installed, per the submitted renderings and photographs.
- Two new storm sewer areas to be installed, per submitted renderings and photographs.
- It is understood that some curbing has been installed by residents. This issue will be addressed.
- No sidewalks or curb will be installed. Limited amount of curbing will be installed to help with road improvements and drainage.

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commission will need to see any added lighting, curbs, walls, sidewalks, or any visible features and structures.



- Will want to see consistency of curbing throughout the neighborhood whether historic or non-approved curb installed by residents.
- More information on plantings, bio-swales, etc. will be helpful.
- The Commission is interested to hear comments from the residents.
- It's a good project and the Commission is excited to see the project implemented.

IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 18-11-2

663 Oakwood Avenue

Selemon Abreha (Applicant/Owner)

- **MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**

Old Oaks Historic District

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 18-11-4

11 West Gay Street

Joshua Dalton (Applicant)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-11-4, 11 West Gay Street, Individual Listing/Citizens Savings and Trust, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Signage

- Install one (1) new, halo-illuminated wall sign, per the submitted drawings.
- Sign to measure 7' 2" wide by 1' 3" high (Total 8.96 s.f.).
- New sign to be 4" deep halo channel letters with opaque copper returns and faces.
- Sign to be located in sign band between first and second story windows, per submitted drawings.
- Letters to be mounted to 1/8" polycarbonate backers painted to match existing stone façade.
- Backers are mounted to two 1" aluminum wireways.
- Wireways to be mounted with mortar joint anchors. No fasteners to be inserted into the face of the stone.
- White LED illumination for letters.
- New sign is not to conflict with any egress lighting.
- Install new vinyl graphic, including of property address only, on plate glass window, east of doors, per submitted rendering.

MOTION: Stiers/Morgan (4-0-0) APPROVED

3. 18-11-5

1445 Summit St.

Steven Schwope (Applicant)

Individual Listing/Orton Memorial

Association of College & Univ. Housing Officers, Int. (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-11-5, 1445 Summit Street, Individual Listing/Orton Memorial, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove Retaining Wall & Regrade Slope

- Remove any/all existing modular retaining wall system installed along E. Eighth Avenue, east of the existing concrete service steps.
- Remove any remaining stacked field stone retaining wall along E. Eighth Avenue and along Summit Street.
- Regrade the lawn along E. Eighth Avenue, east of the existing concrete service steps and along Summit Street, utilizing the historic photograph of Orton Memorial Laboratory provided by Historic Preservation Office staff as a guide to reconstruct the historic slope of the front lawn down to the public sidewalk.
- Slope to be planted in grass only.
- Any/all existing concrete sidewalk damaged during construction to be replaced in-like-kind. Any stone curbing to remain or be replaced, in-like-kind.
- Location and type/style of any street furniture to return for review by Historic Preservation Office staff, in coordination with the Department of Public Service.
- Revised drawing showing the grade of the lawn along E. Eighth St. and along Summit St. to be submitted to HPO staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: The stacked field stone retaining wall along E. Eighth St. and along Summit St. was removed prior to review and approval. Removal of the entire wall is based on the deteriorated condition of the stacked field stone retaining wall and a comparison of historic photographs of the building and front lawn.

MOTION: Stiers/Morgan (4-0-0) APPROVED

4. 18-11-6

1298 Bryden Rd.

Quality Swimming Pools, Inc. (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Timothy Shafer (Owner)

- **MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**

5. 18-11-7a

987 Bryden Road

Laura Gunzelman (Applicant)

Right Property Group, LLC (Owner)

Bryden Road Historic District

Following presentation by representative of the Applicant, Kyle Green, and additional discussion and review, comments were provided regarding the conceptual review, and a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, for the variance recommendation, as indicated.

New Construction

- Build a new duplex residence, carriage house, and garage on existing vacant lot, per the submitted drawings.
- Two-story carriage house, with one-story attached garage to include total of five (5) parking spaces.
- Exterior cladding for duplex to be brick; running bond pattern and 4" composite horizontal siding.
- Trim to be 1x, per the submitted drawings.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles from approved list.
- Gutters to be half-round.
- Windows to have brick headers and stone/brick sills on brick section and wood sills/lintels on sided section.
- Front porches to have painted wood columns and painted wood balusters and porch steps.
- Front entrances to be flush panel doors.

Carriage House/Garage

- Carriage house/garage to have asphalt shingles from approved list.
- Exterior cladding to be 4" composite horizontal siding with 1x trim, per submitted drawings.

- Gooseneck light fixtures to be on south and west elevations.
- Overhead doors to be steel, raised panel.
- Service door to be flush panel, steel door.

Following presentation by the Applicant, acting Chairperson Henry opened the discussion and Commission members offered comments to the applicants:

Commissioner Comments

- Looks like this will be a great project.
- Provide additional details of the trim in the gable.
- The front porch columns now look more consistent with the neighborhood.
- On the east elevation – would like to see a more detailed site plan showing the setbacks.
- On the west and south elevations of the carriage house, the square windows seem out of character.
- The façade now has the appearance of one large house. It works well.

NO ACTION TAKEN

18-11-7b

Upon review of Application #18-11-7b, 987 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, the Historic Resources Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as submitted:

Request for Variance Recommendation

- 1) Section 3332.035, R-3 Residential District, to permit a two (2) dwelling unit building and carriage house/garage.
- 2) Section 3312.49, Minimum Numbers of Parking Spaces Required, to reduce parking from six (6) spaces at two (2) per dwelling unit to five (5) spaces for three (3) dwelling units.
- 3) Section 3332.05, Area District Lot Width Requirements, to reduce the lot width from 50 feet to 43 feet (existing).
- 4) Section 3332.18(D), Basis of Computing Area, to increase lot coverage from 50% to 52%.
- 5) Section 3332.19, Fronting, to permit the carriage house to not front on a public street.
- 6) Section 3332.25, Maximum Side Yards Required, to reduce the maximum side yard from 8.6 feet (20% of 43 feet) to four (4) feet for the carriage house/attached garage.
- 7) Section 3332.26, Minimum Side Yard Permitted, to reduce the west side yard from five (5) feet to 1.0 foot.
- 8) Section 3332.27, Rear Yard, to reduce rear yard from 25% of lot area behind each dwelling to rear yards as depicted on the Site Plan.

MOTION: Morgan/Stiers (4-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

STAFF APPROVALS

• **18-11-1**

624 Wilson Ave.

Old Oaks Historic District

City of Columbus (Applicant)

Latricia Sparks (Owner)

Approve Application 18-11-1, 624 Wilson Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated asphalt shingle roof; install new asphalt shingle roof in type and color from Approved Shingle List.
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; to be painted either “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray”.

- Tuckpoint as needed per historic standards (*see below*).

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Spot Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings”, available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

• **18-11-3**

4925 Olentangy Blvd.

Samantha Stover/Aire Flo Heating & Cooling (Applicant)

Old Beechwold Historic District

Laura Williams (Owner)

Approve Application 18-11-3, 4925 Olentangy Blvd., Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Generator

- Install a new 22 kw Generac generator in rear yard, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheet.

• **18-11-2**

663 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Selemon Abreha (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-11-2, 663 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

New Garage

- Construct a new, 20' wide x 24' deep, two-car garage, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be "Smart Side" siding to match siding on house.
- One (1) six-over-six, double-hung sash to be on north elevation.
- One (1) service door to be on east elevation. Mastercraft embossed primed steel, arched, two-panel door, per submitted product cut sheet.
- One (1) carriage style, overhead garage door to be on west elevation. Cut sheet to be submitted to HPO staff for final review and approval.

• **18-11-6**

1298 Bryden Rd.

Bryden Road Historic District

Quality Swimming Pools, Inc. (Applicant)

Timothy Shafer (Owner)

An application, photos, site plan, and product cut sheet have been submitted.

New In-Ground Pool

- Install a new 15' wide by 30' long in-ground swimming pool in rear yard, per the submitted drawings.
- Pool tile to be "Catania" per the submitted product cut sheet. Color to be "Cool Blue."

X. OLD BUSINESS

• **18-11-8**

1110 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Joe Huber (Applicant)

Valor Investments (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-11-8, 1110 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Retain Existing Roofing Shingles

- Retain the existing Owens Corning "Oakridge" dimensional asphalt shingle roof; color is "Estate Gray".

MOTION: Stiers/Prosser (0-4-0) DENIED

Reasons for Denial:

- COA#18-5-8 (May 17, 2018) approved the removal of the slate roof and installation of new asphalt shingles from the "Approved Roofing Shingle List." The shingle that was installed is not on the list and does not reflect the characteristics of slate.

C.C. 3116.11 Standards for Alteration:

- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities.
- (12) In passing upon appropriateness, the Commission shall consider, in addition to any other pertinent factor, the architectural characteristics typical of structures in the District or Listed Property, the historical and architectural value and significance, architectural style, general design, arrangement, texture, material, and color of the architectural feature involved and its relation to the architectural features of other contributing properties in the immediate neighborhood.

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURN

MOTION: Morgan/Prosser (4-0-0) ADJOURNED (7:45 p.m.)