

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

Tuesday, October 16, 2018

6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: Ben Goodman, Shannon Fergus, Todd Boyer, Jason Sudy (6:10), David Cooke (Excused 7:30), Lauren Crosby. **Staff Present:** Christopher Lohr

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:02 pm
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, November 13, 2018 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, November 20, 2018.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, September 18, 2018. MOTION: Cooke/Crosby (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 18-10-7

750 N. Fourth St.

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

Approve application #18-10-7, 750 N. Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

Staff Recommended Application

- Construct new 22' x 30' single-story pump-room and mail center per submitted drawings.
- Materials to match the brick, details, and base of approved apartment building.
- Gutters to be square profile, flat bottom.
- Doors to be painted to match proposed brick. Final color to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) APPROVED.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

2. 18-9-10

45-47 E. First Ave.

Michael Blue Kirk (Owner)

Continue application # 18-9-10, 45-47 E. First Ave., to allow the applicant time to submit additional information:

- Install an approximately 38' x 75' asphalt parking lot at rear of property.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commission requested that applicant develop site plan & landscaping plan in consultation with HPO staff

3. 18-9-12

201 E. Fourth St.

Julie Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Andrew Loinske (Owner)

Approve application #18-9-12, 201 E. Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Revisions to previously approved drawings to match as-built conditions
- Approve existing exterior ductwork to remain.
- Replacement of rear door with ¾ lite wood door with double panels at the bottom.
- Revise front door to be ¾ lite wood door with double panels at the bottom.
- Install landscaped screening along north fence line. Details to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval.
- Paint side of building and exposed ductwork to match existing color on front of building.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (6-0-0) APPROVED.

Commissioner Comments

- Applicant clarified that the requested rear and front doors are wood, not steel. This is noted in the description of work above.
- Applicant to install dumpster enclosure doors as previously approved.
- Applicant to revise parking area to conform with previously approved. Incorrect striping was contractor error.
- Applicant to remove pavers in rear yard.
- Applicant clarified that gaps in north fence were due to shrinkage of wood – gaps are not present along western edge of property due to differing quality of wood.

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. 18-10-8

1160 N. High St.

Stonewall Columbus, Inc. (Owner)

Approve application #18-10-8, 1160 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install one brand logo vinyl applications on the glass per submitted drawing on High Street elevation. Logo to be 48”x14.4”
- Install one brand logo vinyl applications on the glass per submitted drawing on E. 4th Avenue elevation. Logo to be 48”x14.4”
- Install painted aluminum “Stonewall” sign per submitted drawing. Sign to be 96”x10.25” and shall not be LED back-lit.
- Install white vinyl “1160” address per submitted drawing. Sign to be 18”x6”
- Install Cornerstone Mark. Zinc channel mounted, back-lit with RGB-LED Tape Lighting. Sign to be 72”x63.5”.
- Install Clock Sign with Brand Logo per submitted drawing. Sign to be 96”x39.5” and Clock to be 30”x42”.
- Install Mission Letter Forms per submitted drawing. Signs to be vinyl application of “CONNECT” (72”x10.25”), “UPLIFT” (52”x10.25”), and “THRIVE” (60”x10.25”).

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

5. 18-10-9

1056 Hamlet St.

Victor Properties, LLC. (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 2-story addition to side of existing house.
- Construct new 2-story, 2-car garage/apartment.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commission indicated that removal of aluminum siding should be done with HPO staff present in order to assess the underlying wood siding. Existing wood should be repaired and replaced as needed, not replaced with cementitious siding as proposed.
- Commission indicated that a rear addition should be considered instead of a side addition. If moving forward with a side addition, it should be setback and differentiated in terms of materials and should be deferential to the primary structure.
- Commission had differing viewpoints on front porch appropriateness – may depend on how proposed side addition is positioned.
- Applicant indicated that new windows will be from approved list and would match existing openings. Also asked if larger windows that include sides where existing weights are located would be acceptable. Commissions indicated that it would not be acceptable to utilize existing weight areas as additional window width. The Commission also noted that an existing window is not shown on the concept drawing and that existing openings should be preserved. If additional openings are discovered during removal of aluminum siding, these should be restored as well.
- Commission indicated that applicant should review carriage homes within Italian Village for reference and indicated that the proposal as presented is inappropriate in terms of roof pitch and overall design. The inclusion of two single bay doors was viewed favorably, though the positioning of the right garage bay was noted as being too close to the edge of the structure.

6. 18-10-10

245 E. Fourth Ave.

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 34-unit 4-story wood-framed apartment building with parking at grade and below the first floor.
- All parking to meet the Short North parking guidelines.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Applicant detailed revisions including reduced height on the north
- The Commission expressed concern with the middle of the north elevation being a blank face and disruptive to rhythm of townhome type units. Additionally, the shared entrances were noted as being disruptive to the rhythm and character of the townhome units and that they should be separated from one another.
- Commissioner Goodman noted that this site is further from Fourth Street and should therefore be stepping down in density, height, and massing. Three sides of the building feature lower intensity residential uses. The Applicant noted the industrial uses to the east as a mitigating factor for density. Commissioner Fergus indicated that form is more of a concern than density.
- The Commission noted that the single story parking garage seemed out of place in context with the 4 story building to the east, and that the gable roof lines on the 4 story building should potentially be redesigned.
- The Commission noted that opportunities for publicly accessible open space should be explored for this site

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

- **18-10-1**

943 Mt. Pleasant Ave.

Jennifer Reed (Applicant)/ Mildred Stanton (Owner)

Approve Application 18-10-1, 943 Mt. Pleasant Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair/replace deteriorated porch flooring to match existing.
- Repair existing porch panels as needed to match existing.
- Paint cornice, columns, lattice, cap, and panel inset; color to be Behr Paints “Carbon” (N520-2).
- Paint porch ceiling, panel border, and floor; color to be Sherwin Williams “Lazy Gray” (SW6254).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Repair Porch Flooring

- Remove all damaged and deteriorated flooring; pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing joists to insure structural integrity.
- Replace with new, tongue and groove, yellow pine, porch flooring of same dimensions as existing.
- Match existing flooring overhang. If applicable, match all damaged and deteriorated barge molding with new material of same dimension and profile.
- Blind nail with galvanized finish nails only.
- Prime new flooring on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with appropriate material prior to installation. After installation, topcoat entire porch floor with same porch floor enamel according to manufacturer's specifications for finish coat.

- **18-10-2**

808-810 Summit St.

Marion Roberts (Owner)

Approve Application 18-10-2, 808-810 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence to match existing. Color to be Benjamin Moore “Simply White” (OC-117).

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.

- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- **18-10-3**
952-958 N. High St.
Amy Rupp (Applicant)/ High St. Condo Assoc. (Owner)
Approve Application 18-10-3, 952-958 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Replace windows on the 2nd and 3rd floors of the west elevation (*4 condo units*).
 - New windows to match existing design and to be Weathershield Premium Series aluminum clad; color to be "Obsidian".
 - Replace rear doors per submitted specifications; new doors to be Therma Tru steel 4-panel.
- **18-10-4**
48 E. Fourth Ave. (The Burwell)
Cathy Walsh (Applicant)/ The Burwell Assoc. (Owner)
Approve Application 18-10-4, 48 E. Fourth Ave. (The Burwell), as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Install new Sunbrella awning over rear entry door of each condo (*4 total*) per submitted specifications.
- **18-10-5**
940-942 Hamlet St.
Michael Blue (Owner)
Approve Application 18-10-5, 940-942 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing asphalt shingle roof.
 - Install new CertainTeed standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be "Nickel Gray".
 - Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; to be painted either "Tinner's Red" or "Gray".

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

 - Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
 - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
 - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
 - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
 - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
 - Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
 - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
- **18-10-6**
940 N. High St.
Danite Sign Co. (Applicant)/ The Brunner Building, LLC (Owner)
Approve Application 18-10-6, 940 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Install new 60" x 15" double-sided, non-illuminated hanging sign per submitted drawings and specifications.

- Sign to be located north of the entry door per submitted elevation.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT – Goodman/Fergus (3-0-0) ADJOURNED. 7:36 pm.

(Note: Commissioners Sudy and Crosby recused themselves on the last agenda item and left early. Commissioner Cooke was excused prior to the last agenda item as well)