BETWEEN THE CITY OF COLUMBUS

MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

- - -

In the Matter of:

Regular Meeting

- - -

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr.

President, Presiding

- - -

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

- - -

Monday, November 26, 2018
12:48 p.m.
City of Columbus
Civil Service Commission
77 North Front Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215

- - -

TRACI E. PEOPLES
PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER

- - -

ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
1421 West Third Avenue
Columbus, Ohio 43212
(614) 326-0177
1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:
  2 Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President
  3 Stefanie L. Coe
  4 Delena Edwards
4 PRESENTERS:
  5 Richard Cherry
  6 Beth Dyke
  7 Nathan Forrester
  8 Carol Lagemann
  9 Charday Litzy-Taylor
 10 Tammy Rollins
 11 Brenda Sobieck
9 ALSO PRESENT:
10 Angela Bennett
11 Wendy Brinnon
MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
November 26, 2018
12:48 p.m.

---

PROCEEDINGS

---

BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 26th day of
November, 2018, this cause came on for regular
meeting before the Municipal Civil Service
Commission, Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President.

And, the parties appearing in person and/or by
counsel, as hereinafter set forth, the following
proceedings were had:

---

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: We'll call to order
the Columbus Municipal Civil Service Regular Meeting
for November of 2018, following the printed agenda.

Item No. 1, review and approval of the
minutes from the October 29th regular meeting.

MS. COE: I move that we approve the
minutes from the October 29, 2018, regular meeting.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
"aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
The next item for actual review is the prehearing conference review, Cheryl Reeves v. Columbus City Schools.

MS. SOBIECK: Brenda Sobieck, with the Civil Service Commission staff.

This hearing is scheduled for January 23, 2019, at 9:00 a.m. This was a demotion. And the school district is represented by an outside attorney, and the appellant is also represented by an outside attorney.

The school district is calling five witnesses. The appellant is calling seven witnesses and potentially an eighth one as a rebuttal witness. So we have already added a second day for that one on the 24th.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you.

MS. COE: Is this yours?

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Yes.

The next item is No. 5, request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of the Columbus City Schools, to revise the specifications for the classification Student Safety Resource Coordinator, retitle it to read Safety and Security
Specialist, and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MR. CHERRY: Good afternoon. Richard Cherry, Personnel Analyst for the Civil Service Commission.

The Civil Service is reviewing this classification on behalf of Columbus City Schools in an effort to make the district's classification more up to date.

The revisions to the "Examples of Work" section are to accurately reflect the duties that are currently being performed by this classification.

It is also recommended that the title be changed to Safety and Security Specialist to be more reflective of what the job is actually doing.

Also, the word "coordinator" in the title is a little misleading because it indicates some level of management, which this classification is not.

It is also recommended that the probationary period be changed to 365 days to be consistent with other noncompetitive classifications.
MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Student Safety Resource Coordinator, retitle it to read Safety and Security Specialist, and change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

Items Nos. 6 and 7, joined together, are the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Personnel Assistant and retitle it to read Human Resources Assistant II.

And No. 7 is the request to revise the specification for the classification Personnel Aide, and retitle it to read Human Resources Assistant I and to change the probationary period to 365 days.

MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Charday Litzy-Taylor,
Personnel Analyst with the Commission.

This request is the result of a classification review initiated as part of the school district's efforts to review all classes. Based on information received, revisions are proposed.

It is proposed Personnel Aide and Personnel Assistant be retitled to read Human Resources Assistant I and Human Resources Assistant II. The new titles are reflective of client vernacular and provide consistency within the series.

Changes are proposed to the definition for Personnel Assistant to better reflect the main responsibilities of the classification.

Within the "Examples of Work" section for both classifications, duty statements have been created and revised to better demonstrate the difference in the level of work between Personnel Assistant and Personnel Aide.

Revisions to the "Minimum Qualification" section are proposed in order to provide clarity in the acceptable required experience and to include a GED as a suitable substitution for completion of the
12th school grade.

It is recommended that college training be allowed to substitute for up to two years of experience required for the Personnel Assistant.

Statements within the "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" have been reworded for clarity or removed to eliminate redundancy.

It is also proposed that the probationary period for both classifications be revised to reflect the designation of 365 days, which is consistent with the anticipated learning time associated with these classifications.

There are no other revisions proposed at this time.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specifications for the classification Personnel Assistant and retitle it to read Human Resources Assistant II, as well as to revise the specification for the classification Personnel Aide, retitle it to read Human Resources Assistant I and change the probationary period to 365 days.
MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

Items 8 through 11 are joined together.

Item 8, request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of the Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Landscape Maintenance Supervisor to change the exam type to noncompetitive.

And No. 9 is the classification Maintenance Carpenter Supervisor, and to change the exam type to noncompetitive.

10 is the classification Fleet Services Part Supervisor, and to change the exam type to noncompetitive.

And then 11 is the classification Fleet Services Assistant Supervisor, and to change the exam type to noncompetitive.

MR. CHERRY: For the record, I'm Richard Cherry again.

These requests were initiated by Columbus City Schools in order to build consistency within
the supervisory classifications.

A review of supervisory classifications within the district revealed that they are already designated as noncompetitive, and these revisions would be consistent with those.

The qualifications for these jobs also require a significant amount of experience in a relevant field and, given the level and scope of responsibilities associated with these classifications, a noncompetitive examination type would be more appropriate.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Landscape Maintenance Supervisor, as well as the classification Maintenance Carpenter Supervisor and Fleet Services Parts Supervisor and, finally, Fleet Services Assistant Supervisor, to change the exam type to noncompetitive.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."
THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

Items 12 and 13, joined together, are a request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification Fleet Services Mechanic I.

And 13 is to revise the specification for the classification Fleet Services Mechanic II.

MR. CHERRY: Columbus City Schools requested to revise the minimum qualifications for these classifications.

It is proposed that the school bus endorsement be removed from the commercial driver's license requirements. Employees of these classifications are expected to repair and maintain school buses for Columbus City Schools. According to the U.S. Department of Transportation, only drivers that are transporting preprimary, primary or secondary school students from home to school or school to home or to and from school-sponsored events on a school bus are required to have both the passenger and school bus endorsements.

Only a passenger endorsement is required
by drivers delivering school buses from the manufacturer, by mechanics and the drivers operating empty school buses and by drivers transporting students and/or adults to events that are not sponsored by a school. Therefore, these classifications do not need school bus endorsements, and it is recommend that it be removed from the specifications as proposed.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the classification of Fleet Services Mechanic I, as well as the classification Fleet Services Mechanic II.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

Items 14 and 15 are joined together.

14 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification for the
classification Administrative Secretary, retitle it to read Executive Secretary I, change the probationary period to 365 days and designate the examination type as qualifying noncompetitive.

1 is to retitle the specification for the classification Administrative Assistant to read Executive Secretary II.

MS. ROLLINS: Both of those classifications were reviewed as part of an initiation on behalf of the school district to ensure that the classifications within the class plan is up to date. The Administrative Secretary classification has six employees within it. The Administrative Assistant has nine employees.

The work within these classifications is very similar, with the primary differentiation is who each classification reports to, what level of executive within the administrative world of Columbus City Schools.

It is proposed that, in keeping with the secretarial nature of the work, both classifications be retitled and kept in the series. And, therefore, the retitling would be the Administrative Secretary to the Executive Secretary I, and Administrative
Assistant would be retitled to Executive Secretary II.

Within the specification itself, the proposed revisions were largely based on the questionnaires that we received from the employees that were also reviewed by the supervisors. So those changes were incorporated to reflect the work that is currently being performed.

For the series, it is proposed that the minimum qualifications of a high school diploma and three years of experience for Executive Secretary I and then a high school diploma and five years secretarial experience for Executive Secretary II.

For the Administrative Secretary classification, it is proposed that the probationary period be increased to 365 days and that the examination type be changed to the qualifying noncompetitive to allow for a pass/fail test so that there is a demonstration of a baseline skill set to perform the secretarial work. This is also consistent with the Executive Secretary II as it is currently written.

And there are no other proposed
1 revisions.
2
3    MS. COE: Thank you.
4
5    I move to support the request of the
6
7    Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of
8
9    Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification
10
11    for the classification Administrative Secretary,
12
13    retitle it to read Executive Secretary I, change the
14
15    probationary period to 365 days, designate the
16
17    examination type as qualifying noncompetitive; as
18
19    well as to revise and retitle the specification for
20
21    the classification Administrative Assistant to read
22
23    Executive Secretary II.
24
25    MS. EDWARDS: I second.
26
27    PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
28
29    "aye."
30
31    THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
32
33    PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.
34
35    Item No. 16, request of the Civil Service
36
37    Commission staff to revise the specification for the
38
39    classification Student Intern II.
40
41    MS. ROLLINS: This request has been much
42
43    discussed within the Department of Public Safety,
44
45    and it is finally ready for presentation today.
46
47    The proposed revision before you would
enable this classification to be used for a cadet program that would be established within the Department of Public Safety. The proposed cadet program is an endeavor by the department to recruit and hire diverse individuals into the job of firefighter or police officer by providing a program that would present a realistic job preview for these individuals.

The program will provide a hands-on learning environment, mentorship opportunities and classroom training, with the aim of preparing individuals for a career in firefighting or law enforcement.

So, once again, the program will be structured as part-time employment for those individuals who, upon completion of the program, would ideally promote via promotional advancement and potentially take an exam on a promotional basis to enter into the respective sworn classification of either a police officer or a firefighter.

For this classification, Student Intern II, to be used for this program, there are some proposed revisions that are necessary, one of which is within the guidelines for class use.
There is language that refers to being enrolled on a full-time basis in a college. In this case, for this classification to be used for the cadet program, they wouldn't necessarily be enrolled full-time in a college, but they would be enrolled in a cadet program with the City of Columbus and the Department of Public Safety. And then as part of this program, and in collaboration with Columbus State, they would be receiving college credits for the work they're doing while they're working towards achieving their goals of becoming a police officer or firefighter.

As always, with this classification, whether, you know, the point in which you graduate or are no longer enrolled, your employment would end. And there's a four-month window for that to happen. So that would be -- remain part of this so that individuals would remain under that program for a longer period of time than they're actually enrolled in the program.

Within the minimum classification, it's simply adding "active enrollment in the cadet program in the Department of Public Safety."

Ideally, this will be used in both police and fire.
I think initially they're planning to start with fire.

So, ideally, the department would do the recruitment. And then once they've done -- made a selection, they would receive -- individuals would receive a congratulatory letter of acceptance to the cadet program. And then that letter would be used as proof of enrollment into the cadet program to meet the minimum qualifications.

MS. EDWARDS: I do have a question. Could students who are interested that were not recruited by the department have a way of participating in the program?

MS. ROLLINS: I mean, there will be a posting that would be, you know, put out for the public interest. And then, just like with all of our postings, those names, whether they have been specifically recruited or they learn about it through other means, would be provided to the department for selection.

MS. EDWARDS: So if they express interest in the fire department?

MS. ROLLINS: Yeah, their names would be shared.
PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: When it provides that they be either actively enrolled in college or school or the cadet program, are there credits that somehow will be earned or accumulated in the cadet program?

MS. ROLLINS: Yes. They -- I mean, the collaboration program with Columbus State, my understanding is, with police, they may actually receive credit that's pretty close to being the equivalent of a full-time student. The fire program is less than what is full-time; which is, when we say "full-time," that's 15 semester hours or 45 quarter hours. There's not too many quarter hours these days.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: So do colleges or universities enter in the development of this cadet program?

MS. ROLLINS: Columbus State has been working with the Department of Public Safety. Like I said, this has been talked about for quite a while. And they're just now kind of hoping to get the first cadet program moving for the next year.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. One other thing. Many of the recruits for the safety division
in Columbus come from other areas, not just Ohio --

MS. ROLLINS: Uh-huh.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: -- but other states.

Is that a consideration in this proposal?

MS. ROLLINS: I mean, they would have to live here.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. But if they are recruited, they could be recruited from wherever.

MS. ROLLINS: Yes.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: And then if they were in college, and it's not here where we have similar -- where we have programs that are consistent with this design, would that be an element that's required for them to get credit for that?

MS. ROLLINS: You mean --

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: If they were in Pennsylvania going to school, but they didn't have a model program like this one, would they still get credit for what they did there?

MS. ROLLINS: They do have to actually be in our program. There's part of it that's college
credit that they'll be getting through Columbus State, but also a lot of it is working within our Department of Public Safety.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. Thank you.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Student Intern II.

MS. EDWARDS: Second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Items 17 through 22 are joined together. 17, request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Assistant Auditor I. 18 is Assistant Auditor II. 19 is Assistant Auditor III. 20 is Assistant Auditor IV. 21 is Assistant Auditor V. And 22, Deputy City Auditor.
MS. ROLLINS: All of these classifications were reviewed this year as part of the five-year review. As a part of this review, a meeting was scheduled with the management team within the City Auditor's office to discuss potential changes that they think are important, especially with a new auditor in place.

Based upon this review, there are some proposed revisions to the classification. Of the changes proposed within the definition, it is reflecting fiscal and payroll as major work categories that are within the City Auditor's office.

And then also, within the "Examples of Work," there have been some revisions throughout to reflect the work that is currently performed at each of these different levels. There were efforts made to try to keep the differentiation between each of these levels because we have so many.

And then those were all the revisions that we have for today.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
specifications for the classification Assistant Auditor I, as well as Assistant Auditor II, Assistant Auditor III, Assistant Auditor IV, Assistant Auditor V, and Deputy City Auditor.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

MS. ROLLINS: Thank you.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Item No. 23, a request of the Civil Service Commission staff to change examination type for the classification Automotive Mechanic Helper to noncompetitive, to change the probationary period to 365 days and amend Rule XI accordingly.

MR. CHERRY: Richard Cherry again.

This request was initiated by the Department of Finance and Management in order to change the examination type to noncompetitive. Automotive Mechanic Helper is an entry-level feeder classification through the Automotive Mechanic series and is utilized to assist mechanics to also learn the mechanic job.
Unfortunately, the department has had some recruitment challenges into the fully skilled mechanic classification, which is competitive. In an effort to address this issue, the department feels that the best course of action to attract and retain fully skilled mechanics would be to develop them internally by hiring individuals into the Automotive Mechanic Helper classification. They would then train them to gain the required experience necessary to qualify and sit for the Automotive Mechanic examination.

Changing the examination type for Automotive Mechanic Helper to noncompetitive would help facilitate the process by hiring individuals into this unskilled classification who will be trained to work on city vehicles, while learning the City's process involved in repair and maintenance of light and heavy vehicles.

A review of other similar classifications within the City with relatively low-to-middle qualifications and low salary ranges, such as laborer, facility worker and refuse collector, which are all within the AFSCME bargaining unit, revealed that they are largely designated as noncompetitive,
and this proposed revision would be more
appropriate, as well as consistent with those.

It is also recommend, in conjunction with
the noncompetitive designation, that the
probationary period be changed to 365 days. This
revision is consistent with the Civil Service
internal operational policies and procedures
concerning probationary periods of noncompetitive
classifications.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move that we support the request of the
Civil Service Commission staff to change the
examination type for the classification Automotive
Mechanic Helper to noncompetitive, change the
probationary period to 365 days, and amend Rule XI
accordingly.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
"aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

Item No. 24, the request of the Civil
Service Commission staff to revise the specification
for the classification Water Service Technician II.
MR. CHERRY: A review of this classification was part of the Civil Service Commission's efforts to review all classifications every four to five years.

There are some minor recommendations for the "Examples of Work" section. This would be more reflective of the current duties performed by this classification.

It is also recommended that the minimum qualifications be revised to read: "Completion of 12th school grade and two years of experience reading water meters and devices, planning water meter routes or assisting with installation, maintenance, testing, inspection, repair or replacement of water metering systems, backflow devices or related items and to have possession of a valid motor vehicle operator's license. Some positions require a valid Operator Training Committee of Ohio Backflow Certification."

There are no other recommendations to this specification.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I moved to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
specification for the classification Water Service Technician II.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

Item No. 25 is a request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Substation Maintenance Technician, change the probationary period to 265 days and amend Rule XI accordingly.

MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst, Civil Service.

The review of this classification was completed as part of our effort to review all classifications every five years.

Within the "Examples of Work" section, it is proposed to add wording regarding data reading and add a new statement regarding helping troubleshoot basic issues with data connectivity.

Within the "Minimum Qualifications," it is proposed to add completion of a vocational training program, in order to include another route
for workers to enter the power distribution field.

In addition, it is proposed to expand the language regarding "in power distribution" to "related to power distribution." There can be multiple wording for how the programs are worded.

Within the "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" section, revisions are proposed. A new ability statement reflects the ability to interpret control wiring schematics. This reflects the local control in the substation, but also can apply to helping troubleshoot communications back to SCADA.

Additional updates are proposed to mirror physical demands and ability statements that were updated in the other classifications in this series in the last review.

It is proposed to increase the probationary period from 180 days to 365 days, a full year to experience a variety of work.

And there are no other revisions proposed; therefore, it is recommended the classification be approved as proposed.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
specification for the classification Substation Maintenance Technician, change the probationary period to 365 days, and amend Rule XI accordingly.

MS. EDWARDS: Second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Item 26 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Electrical Inspector I.


Civil Service staff requests that the classification Electrical Inspector I be revised. During a recent minimum qualifications review, the Civil Service Commission discovered that the State of Ohio offers an Electrical Safety Inspector Interim Certificate. Conversations with the Ohio Department of Commerce confirmed that the Board of Building Standards will issue an Interim Electrical Safety Inspector Certificate to those individuals who have met an experience requirement and have also completed the examination.
Therefore, to maintain consistency with the Trade Inspector classification that allows the interim certificate substitution, it is being proposed that a substitution be added to the minimum qualifications section to allow for the Electrical Safety Inspector Interim Certificate to substitute for the Electrical Safety Inspector Certificate.
The incumbent would then have until the end of the probationary period to complete the Ohio Building Code Academy requirements to obtain the Electrical Safety Inspector Certificate.

There are no other proposed revisions at this time.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Electrical Inspector I.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

Item No. 27 is the request of the Civil
Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Police Sergeant.

MR. FORRESTER: Hi. Nate Forrester here, Personnel Analyst with the commission. I am presenting the Police Sergeant spec review on behalf of Joel Gunn, who could not be here today.

The classification of Police Sergeant was reviewed as part of the Commission's effort to review all classifications every five years.

The main reason for the proposed changes includes making the "Examples of Work" more reflective of the current duties performed and equipment being used on the job by police sergeants.

In the second-to-the-last example of work, the word "citizens" has been changed to "residents." This recommendation was made at the departmental level at the time the department signed this class specification; therefore, it is recommended that the specification for Police Sergeant be approved as proposed.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Police
Sergeant.

MS. EDWARDS: I second.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

The last item is the background removals, applicants removed post-exam.

As to the applicants, Drew Schmidt, reinstate; Scott Guroy, do not reinstate; Tyler McIntosh, do not reinstate.

With that, we are adjourned.

---

And, thereupon, the proceeding was concluded at approximately 1:18 p.m.

---
I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 26th day of November, 2018, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.
The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 1:18 p.m.

***

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

Date