

## HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION MINUTES

Thursday, December 20, 2018

6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front Street, Room 205

**Commissioners Present:** Jackie Barton, Steward Gibboney, Clyde Henry, Joseph McCabe, Dan Morgan, Erin Prosser  
(left prior to review of Agenda Item #3), Abbie Stiers (left prior to review of Agenda Item #3)

**Commissioners Absent:**

**City Staff Present:** Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:10 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, January 10, 2019 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Third Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, January 17, 2019 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Room 204 (Hearing Room)
- IV. SWEAR IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Thursday, November 15, 2018.  
MOTION: Morgan/Prosser (5-0-2 [Barton & McCabe-abstain]) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Henry/McCabe (7-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS
- IX. PUBLIC FORUM

### CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. 18-7-18

**1734 Bryden Road**

**Andrew H. Stevens (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application # 18-7-18, Commissioner McCabe noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room.*

*Following presentation by the applicant, Chairperson Gibboney called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.*

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Joe Huber 1110 Bryden Road Area Property Owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Supports the property owner's efforts to beautify the street.</li><li>• Supports reinvestment in the neighborhood.</li></ul>



	• Told the Commission what their duties are based on C.C. 3117.
--	---

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 18-7-18, 1734 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Retaining Wall

- Retain the existing tiered retaining wall and plantings, as installed prior to review and approval, per the submitted application and photographs.

MOTION: Henry/Stiers (0-6-1[McCabe-recused]) DENIED

Reasons for Denial:

C.C. 3116.13 - Standards for site improvements:

(A) Landscaping, parking, utility or service areas, walkways and similar improvements should be compatible to each other and to the subject building or structure as well as to adjacent contributing properties, open spaces and the overall environment.

C.C. 3116.11 Standards for Alteration:

- (2) The distinguishing characteristics of the property shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural feature shall be avoided whenever possible.

NEW APPLICATIONS

**2. 18-12-13**

**1110 Bryden Road**

**Joe Huber (Applicant)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Valor Investments (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application # 18-12-13, Commissioner McCabe returned to the table.*

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 18-12-13, 1110 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install Partial New Roof

- Remove or install new asphalt shingles over the existing Owens Corning “Oakridge” dimensional asphalt shingle roof; color is “Estate Gray”.
- New shingles, from the Approved Roofing Shingles List, to be installed on the front slope of the main, hipped roof, both slopes of the front dormer, and the front-facing slopes of the two side dormers, which are visible from the public right-of-way.
- New shingles to be Owens Corning, standard 3-tab, “Estate Gray,” to match the existing shingles on the garage roof.
- Existing, Owens Corning, “Oakridge” dimensional asphalt shingles to be retained on the two (2) side and one (1) rear slope of the main roof, on the rear dormer, and on the rear-facing slopes of the two (2) side dormers.
- Applicant may choose the option to install new Owens Corning, standard 3-tab, “Estate Gray,” shingles on the entire main roof and all dormers.
- Existing gray, metal ridge roll to be reinstalled on the front slope of the main roof and on the three (3) dormers.

MOTION: Henry/Stiers (5-2 [Morgan and McCabe-against]-0) APPROVED

Commissioners Stiers and Prosser excused themselves from the remainder of the hearing and exited the building. HPO staff noted that Commissioner Stiers was stepping down from the Commission prior to the June 30<sup>th</sup> expiration of her term, and that this would be her final attendance as an HRC Commissioner. Commissioner Stiers' commitment during her five years of service was commended.

3. 18-12-14

730 South Champion Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Andy Wright/Upward Home Solutions (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Gibboney called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Rachel Coleman 750 Wilson Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is important to preserve the character of the neighborhood, including the original window forms/types, in order to retain the historic value of the neighborhood.</li> <li>• Purchased in the neighborhood because of its historic character.</li> </ul>
Anthony Grauso 750 Wilson Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• He and other residents have pride of ownership in their homes.</li> <li>• Appreciates that there is architectural review in this area, and wants to see the guidelines applied consistently.</li> </ul>
Andrew Verhage 677 Oakwood Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lives a block away from this property, and is glad to see it being restored.</li> <li>• Any new windows should be installed to match original openings and window types.</li> </ul>
David Lee Gray 642 Wilson Ave. Area Resident-Past Civic Assoc. President	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The windows that have been installed are a smaller scale than the original windows.</li> <li>• The “ghosting” of the original windows is clearly visible.</li> <li>• The existing windows were installed prior to approval. All applicants need to follow the same standards.</li> <li>• Has gone to considerable expense to correctly replace corbels on his property.</li> </ul>
Michael Herman 633 Linwood Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A resident for 37 years.</li> <li>• The original window openings are clearly visible.</li> <li>• Developers should be held to the same standards as residents.</li> </ul>
Jennifer Thomas 633 Wilson Ave. Area Resident – President-elect of Old Oaks Civic Assoc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Purchased a home in Old Oaks because of the great housing stock and the neighborhood commitment to restoration.</li> <li>• Appreciates Mr. Wright is giving abandoned houses new life, but the windows should be installed per the guidelines.</li> </ul>
Jim Jasperse 654 Wilson Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agrees that the proper windows should be installed.</li> <li>• Does not believe that it would be a hardship for the</li> </ul>

Historic Resources Commission

December 20, 2018 Minutes

4

	Applicant to follow the guidelines.
Monna Manning 654 Wilson Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A resident for 24 years.</li> <li>• Has followed the guidelines event though a struggle sometimes to do so.</li> <li>• Loves the housing stock and diversity of the neighborhood.</li> <li>• Investors need to do their homework before purchasing.</li> <li>• It is obvious that the windows, as installed, are not appropriate.</li> </ul>
Richard Vickers 639 Wilson Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A resident for 14 years.</li> <li>• Has made improvements to his home, as neighbors have.</li> <li>• Believes in equal application of the guidelines.</li> </ul>

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 18-12-14, 730 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove Existing Windows

- Remove the existing, triple-ganged, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows on the first floor of the façade, as installed prior to review and approval.
- Remove the existing, triple-ganged, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows on the second floor of the façade, as installed prior to review and approval.

Install New Window/First Floor Façade

- Install one (1), new, cottage style window on the first floor of the façade.
- New window to be sized to fit the original rough opening.
- Cut sheet for new window to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- New windows to include wood casings, cornice, and sill, similar to existing wood windows at adjacent property, 734 S. Champion Avenue. Details to be submitted to HPO staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Trim is to be wood, with no faux grain.

Install New Windows/Second Floor Façade

- Install two (2) new, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows on the second floor of the façade.
- Cut sheet for new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- New windows to include wood casings, cornice, sill, and mullion, similar to existing wood windows at adjacent property, 734 S. Champion Avenue. Details to be submitted to HPO staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Trim is to be wood, with no faux grain.

Retain Windows

- Retain the existing, new, tripartite window on the third floor of the façade, as installed.
- Retain the existing, new, double-hung, and casement windows on the north, south, and east elevations, as installed.

MOTION: Barton/Morgan (5-0-0) APPROVED

**4. 18-12-15**

**251 East Lane Avenue**

**David Neiderhiser (Applicant)**

**Iuka Ravine Historic District**

**D. Fried Triplex, LLC. (Owner)**

*Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application #18-12-15, 251 East Lane Avenue, Iuka Ravine Historic District, for demolition of a garage and installation of a new parking pad, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the January 17, 2019 Historic Resources Commission agenda.

*Note: The Commission requested that HPO staff conduct a site visit to examine the condition of the interior framing of the garage.*

MOTION: Barton/Morgan (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**5. 18-12-16**

**667 Wilson Avenue**

**Cynthia L. Morris & Rachel A. Morris (Applicant/Owner)**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

*Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Gibboney called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.*

<b><u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u></b>	<b><u>Issues/ Comments:</u></b>
David Lee Gray 642 Wilson Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Appreciates that the Applicants followed the appropriate application process.</li> <li>• Old Oaks Civic Association supports demolition and new construction due to unsafe condition of existing garage.</li> </ul>
Michael Herman Livingston Avenue Area Commission 633 Linwood Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• LAVA-C supports demolition and new construction due to unsafe condition of existing garage.</li> </ul>
Jennifer Thomas 633 Wilson Ave. Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports demolition and new construction due to unsafe condition of existing garage.</li> </ul>

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 18-12-16, 667 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

**Demolish Garage / Build New Garage**

- Demolish the existing, deteriorated, frame, single car garage, per the submitted photos.
- Install new concrete slab and apron, per submitted site plan.
- Construct new, 24' x 24', frame, two-car garage.
- Exterior trim, fascia, cladding, to be smooth, LP Smartside lap siding with 5" reveal.
- Exterior trim to be 1x, per HRC guidelines, p. 86, and per submitted elevation drawing.
- Overhang and exposed rafter tails to match existing, per submitted elevation drawing.
- All trim, fascia, cladding to match existing house color: Sherwin Williams "Grizzle Gray" SW7068.
- Roofing to be Tamko Standard 3-tab, "Antique Slate."
- Metal ridge roll to be "Gray."
- Single 16' x 7' overhead garage door on west elevation to have the appearance of two (2) doors.
- One four-light pedestrian door on east elevation to be steel slab, per submitted cut sheet.
- One exterior, gooseneck light fixture to be on west elevation, per submitted cut sheet.

- Final drawings and cut sheets for siding, pedestrian and overhead doors, and exterior lighting to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Appropriate documentation of the existing garage is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Henry/Morgan (5-0-0) APPROVED

6. 18-12-17

**706 Kimball Place**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Next Home For You, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated. Staff approvable work was separated out and issued as COA#18-12-20.*

Approve Application 18-12-17, 706 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Porch Renovation

- Remove the two (2) existing, non-original, stuccoed front porch columns.
- Install three (3) new, resin, tapered, round columns.
- New columns to match the style, dimensions, and placement of the existing front porch columns on the adjacent properties at 710 and 714 Kimball Place.
- Cut sheet for new front porch columns to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Repair existing, parged porch foundation, as needed. Paint to match existing concrete color.

Demolish Garage / Build New Garage

- Demolish the existing, frame garage, per submitted photos.
- Construct new, 20' x 20', frame, two-car garage. Existing setback from alley to remain.
- Retain the existing, front-loading, "Hollywood" driveway, extending from Kimball Place.
- Roof to include clipped gable, to match existing garage, per the submitted drawings.
- New rafter tails to match the existing garage.
- Roofing to be from the Approved Roofing Shingles list, to match house.
- Exterior cladding to be smooth HardiePlank or Smart Side horizontal lap siding with 5" reveal.
- Foundation to be poured concrete.
- Install one (1) overhead garage door on the west elevation, per the submitted drawings.
- Applicant has the option of installing one single-car overhead garage door, two single-car overhead garage doors, or one double 16' x 7' overhead garage door, with the appearance of two doors, on the east elevation.
- Cut sheets for new overhead garage doors on the east and west elevations to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to installation.
- Garage windows to be from the Approved Windows lists. Window cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to installation.

MOTION: McCabe/Henry (5-0-0) APPROVED

7. 18-12-18

**511 North High Street**

**Andy Williams (Applicant)**

**North Market Historic District**

**David Kozar (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application # 18-12-18, Commissioner Henry noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room.*

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 18-12-18, 511 North High Street, North High Street Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Renovate Existing Storefront

- Remove existing, non-original storefront system, per submitted photos.
- Install new storefront systems, per submitted drawings and product cut sheets.
- Storefront materials to be painted aluminum with double-glazed windows.
- Storefront in lounge area to be folding window assembly.
- Existing brick pilasters and other wall materials to remain.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Install New Wall Signage

- Install one (1) new wall sign on the north elevation and one (1) new wall sign on the east elevation, per submitted drawings.
- Individual letters to measure 12" high. Overall sign width to be 22'-7 1/4", per submitted drawings.
- Reverse channel aluminum letters to be pegged-off 1" from building face.
- Faces and edges to be painted white and red, per submitted drawings.
- Light source to be low voltage red and white "halo" illumination.

Install New Projecting Signage

- Install one (1) new projecting sign on the east elevation, per submitted drawings.
- New sign to measure 14" wide x 60" high x 8" deep.
- Opaque aluminum sign cabinet to have routed face with push-through graphics.
- Face and returns to have painted, semi-gloss black finish with white border, per submitted drawings.
- Internal light source to be low voltage, white LED, with light showing through letters only.

Install New Awnings

- Install new, open-end, fabric awnings. "Ruth's Chris Steak House" to be printed on awning flap at main entrance.
- Final drawings for all signage to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: McCabe/Barton (4-0-1[Henry-recused]) APPROVED

8. 18-12-19

**987 Bryden Road**

**Laura Gunzelman (Applicant)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Right Property Group, LLC (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application # 18-12-19, Commissioner Henry returned to the table.*

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 18-12-19, 987 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Street Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Construction

- Build a new duplex residence on existing vacant lot, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding for duplex to be Glen Gery brick, "Cabernet," running bond pattern and 4" fiber composite horizontal siding; Smooth finish.

- Trim to be 1x, per the submitted drawings.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles from approved list. Final choice to be submitted to HPO staff.
- Gutters to be half-round, painted “Black.”
- Windows to be Jeld-Wen Sitrine, aluminum-clad, one-over-one, double-hung windows with flat brickmold.
- Windows to have brick headers and stone/brick sills on brick section and wood sills/lintels on sided section.
- Front porches to have painted wood columns and painted wood balusters and porch steps, per submitted drawings.
- Front entrance doors to be JeldWen smooth finish, fiberglass, half-light doors, per the submitted cut sheet. Glass to be single light with no muntins. Application has the option of using half-light steel doors, with submission of a new cut sheet prior to installation.
- Wall sconces at front door to be per submitted cut sheet.

#### Carriage House/Garage

- Two-story carriage house, with one-story attached garage to include total of five (5) parking spaces.
- Carriage house/garage to have asphalt shingles from approved list, to match dwelling.
- Exterior cladding to be 4” composite horizontal siding with 1x trim, per submitted drawings.
- Windows to be Jeld-Wen Sitrine, aluminum-clad, one-over-one, double-hung windows
- Gooseneck light fixtures to be on south and west elevations, per submitted product cut sheet.
- Overhead doors to be steel, raised panel. Cut sheet to be submitted to HPO staff prior to installation.
- Service door to be JeldWen smooth finish, fiberglass, half-light doors, per the submitted cut sheet. Glass to be single light with no muntins. Application has the option of using half-light steel doors, with submission of a new cut sheet prior to installation.

MOTION: McCabe/Henry (5-0-0) APPROVED

### STAFF APPROVALS

- **18-12-1**

**973 East Broad Street**

**18<sup>th</sup> & East Broad Street Historic District**

**Broad Street Living, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-1, 973 East Broad Street, 18<sup>th</sup> & East Broad Street Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

#### Demolition

- Demolish the existing, non-contributing rear addition and entrance canopy on east elevation, per previous Historic Resources Commission review (COA#18-5-12/May 17, 2018).

#### Install New Door & Stoop/Masonry Repair

- At demolished rear addition, install new door with sidelight in existing masonry opening, per submitted drawing.
- Install new concrete steps and landing.
- Infill existing openings with brick to match existing exterior brick, per submitted drawings.
- Repair exterior brick wall, as needed, to match existing brick and mortar profile and color.

#### Repair & Reinstall French Doors

- Remove the existing, non-original plate glass windows flanking the front entrance door.
- Repair/restore the original, salvaged French doors, as needed, and reinstall in original locations.
- Repair/refinish any/all existing entrance doors on all elevations, as needed.

#### Install New Windows

- Remove existing windows on all elevations, including non-original and deteriorated one-over-one double-hung sash and deteriorated multi-light casements.
- Install new Pella Proline, aluminum-clad, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows and Pella Impervia, multi-lite casements, with muntins applied to exterior, per the submitted product cut sheets and drawings.
- All windows to match existing rough openings.



Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood cornice details and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements and dormer siding on the brick house, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the brick house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to be SW7048 "Urbane Bronze."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick walls, stone foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

• **18-12-2**

**50 West Broad Street**

**Samuel Rosenthal/Schooley Caldwell (Applicant)**

**LeVeque Tower/Individually Listed Property**

**Tower 10, LLC./Dan O'Hara (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-2, 50 West Broad Street, LeVeque Tower/Individually Listed Property, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

Ventilation Equipment

- Modify the existing kitchen ventilation equipment, per the submitted drawings.
- Reroute grease duct outside of building along the existing pedestrian bridge and fire escape, per submitted drawings.
- New exhaust fan to be installed on the bridge of the pedestrian bridge with a new roof hatch to allow for access to the equipment.

• **18-12-3**

**275 East Lane Avenue**

**Iuka Ravine Historic District**

**Rita K. Burns (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-3, 275 East Lane Avenue, Iuka Ravine Historic District, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:  

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **18-12-4**

**1438 Bryden Road**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Aaron Blevins (Applicant)**

**Wilbur Chaney (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-4, 1438 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

Front Porch Repair

- Remove all cracked and deteriorated stucco on and around the front porch columns and header, per the submitted photos.
- Remove all deteriorated wooden columns and porch header, as needed.
- Rebuild columns and header with new treated lumber, in accordance with all applicable building code, like-for-like.
- Apply new stucco to match the texture of existing stucco, like-for-like.
- Paint to match existing colors.

• **18-12-5**

**730 South Champion Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Upward Home Solutions (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-5, 730 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements and/or wood siding on the frame house, as necessary. All replacement wood trim and/or siding to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim and/or siding; like-for-like.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.

- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color to be: Body – Behr “Garbanzo Paste” M290-4 M; Trim – Behr “Off White” 73U.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry to remain, as is, or be painted to match the natural stone/brick/concrete color as closely as possible.**

• **18-12-6**

**673 South Champion Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Rugh’s Remodeling & Restoration (Applicant)**

**Tim Dye/Upward Home Solutions (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-6, 673 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

**Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof**

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- All existing chimneys to remain. Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:  

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
[ ] Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	[ ] Estate Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- **Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.**
- **All half-cove/arrow shaped shakes in the front and side gables and the front dormer are to remain.**

• **18-12-7**

**730 South Champion Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Rugh’s Remodeling & Restoration (Applicant)**

**Tim Dye/Upward Home Solutions (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-7, 730 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

**Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof**

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- All existing chimneys to remain. Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:  

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
----------------------	---------------	---------------

Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

Estate Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
- All diamond shaped shakes in the gables are to remain.

• **18-12-8**

**1403 Bryden Road**

**Arthur Ryel-Lindsey (Applicant)**

Approve Application 18-12-8, 1403 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Erin & Harold Lindsey (Owner)**

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / House & Garage

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof and front porch of the house and the garage roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- All existing chimneys to remain. Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

Nickel Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **18-12-9**

**457 North High Street**

**459 High Street Development, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-9, 457 North High Street, North Market Historic District, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

**North Market Historic District**

New Projecting Sign/Modify Previous Approval

- Install one (1) new, double-faced, blade sign on southeast corner elevation per revised drawings, in consultation with the OHPO and NPS.
- New sign to protrude from the building at a 45 degree angle, per the submitted rendering.
- Structural support brackets to be anchored in the existing building mortar joints per industry and City Building Code standards.
- Opaque “Map Blue” aluminum sign cabinet to measure five feet high, two feet wide, and 6 inches deep (5’ H x 2’ W x 6” D).
- Internal light source to emit through the “White” text and keys logo only.

Note: COA # 18-12-9 modifies COA#18-3-7, approved March 15, 2018.

• **18-12-10**

**1068-1076 Bryden Road (Bryden Row)**

**Laurie Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Gallas Zadeh Development (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-10, 1068-1076 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, to renew COA#17-7-30 (expired July 26, 2018), as Phase III of a development including 13 new townhomes (1068-1086 Bryden Road and 217, 225, 233 S. Ohio Avenue), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Construct Five (5), New, Townhouse Units with Attached Garages per Submitted Plans & Finish Materials List

- ¾ Lite fiberglass entry doors throughout.
- Jeld Wen W-2500 windows throughout.
- Parex Stucco (i.e. fine sand stucco).
- Certainteed Landmark dimensional roof shingles.
- ‘Craftsman’ style iron railings throughout.
- Limestone veneer.
- Fypon PVC Columns—Reduce the interior column dimensions on the interior pedestrian courtyard elevations of units #3 and #8.
- Shake siding treatment where noted on elevations to be taken to grade.
- Signage and landscape plan to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office for placement on a future regular Historic Resources Commission meeting agenda for final review and approval.

MOTION: Henry/Rowan (4-0-0) APPROVED

• **18-12-11**

**851 Bryden Road**

**David Fischer (Applicant/Owner)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

Approve Application 18-12-11, 851 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting / New Garage

- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the new, frame garage for painting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare trim and siding surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color to be: Body – “Roycroft Copper Red” SW2839; Trim & Gable End Shakes – “Craftsman Brown” SW2835.

• **18-12-12**

**37 Jefferson Avenue**

**Katharine T. Moore (Applicant)**

**Jefferson Avenue Historic District**

**Jefferson Center for Learning & the Arts (Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-12, 37 Jefferson Avenue, Jefferson Avenue Historic District, as submitted, with any/all clarifications noted:

Infill Air Conditioner Unit Openings

- Remove twenty (20) through-the-wall air conditioning units, per the submitted photos.
- Infill openings with brick to match the existing as closely as possible in colors, texture, mortar color and profile, per the submitted example brick photo.

Install New Air Conditioner Units

- Install twenty (20) new, roof-top air conditioner units on the flat roof, per the submitted cut sheet.
- New roof-top units to be installed behind the existing parapet, to be as least visible as possible.

Install New Doors

- Remove all exterior doors, per the submitted photos.
- Install new single-panel doors to match existing.

- Cut sheet for new doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation. Paint color to be submitted to HPO staff.

• **18-12-20**

**706 Kimball Place**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Next Home For You, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 18-12-20, 706 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Siding and Painting

- Remove existing layers of cement siding and Insulbrick siding to reveal original wood siding.
- Repair/replace any deteriorated or missing wood siding, as needed, with new siding to match existing profile and reveal.
- Paint new siding Functional Gray SW7024. Paint existing stucco “Shark” MEN7130-2, per submitted color chips.  
Paint trim “Extra White” SW7006.

Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Remove existing aluminum wrap from soffit and fascia.
- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood soffit and fascia on all elevations, as needed, with new wood to match original.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

#### Replace Porch Ceiling

- Remove and dispose of existing porch ceiling, pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing rafters to insure structural integrity.
- Install a new porch ceiling nailed with galvanized finish nails.
- New material to be [ ] 1" x 3", tongue and groove, yellow pine, bead board or [ ] 4' x 8' Georgia-Pacific "Classic" style Ply-Bead (with sanded surface and 1/8" beaded pattern approx. 1.6" o.c.); prime exposed surface complete.

#### Repair/Replace Doors

- Remove the two (2) existing, non-original doors on the north elevation, and install new, wood or fiberglass doors. Cut sheets for new doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to installation.
- Original wood, multi-light front door and wood storm door to be repaired/refinished, as needed, and reinstalled.

#### Spot Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints on the brick foundation for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

#### Window Repair

- Retain all existing, original wood windows on all elevations, and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows.
- Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.

#### Window Replacement

- Remove the one, non-original, inappropriate glass block window on the second story of the south elevation.
- Install new window from the Approved Windows Lists. Final window choice to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval, prior to installation.
- New window is to be full frame replacement or sash kit. Insert (aka pocket) window replacements are not allowed.

#### Install New Light Fixture

- Install new exterior light fixtures at front and side entrances.
- New fixtures to be Brimfield Aged Iron Outdoor Wall Lantern, per the submitted product cut sheet.

#### New Privacy Fence

- Install new privacy fence in rear yard, per submitted cut sheet and site plan.

## **X. OLD BUSINESS**

## **XI. NEW BUSINESS**

### Nomination and Election of New Officers

- Nominations for Chairperson
  - Clyde Henry nominated by Steward Gibboney and seconded by Dan Morgan
- Nominations for Vice-Chairperson

- Daniel Morgan nominated by Clyde Henry and seconded by Abbie Stiers

On the matter of Clyde Henry for Chairperson

MOTION: Stiers/Prosser (7-0-0) Clyde Henry voted in as Chairperson for a term of one (1) year.

On the matter of Daniel Morgan for Vice-Chairperson

MOTION: Barton/Stiers (7-0-0) Daniel Morgan voted in as Vice-Chairperson for a term of one (1) year.

### **Historic Resources Commission By Laws**

#### **Article IV**

##### **Officers**

**\*\*Section 1.** The officers of the Historic Resources Commission shall be a Chairperson, a Vice-Chairperson, and Secretary. These officers shall perform the duties prescribed by these By-laws and by the parliamentary authority adopted by the Commission. The Historic Preservation Officer and Recording Secretary shall be provided by the Jobs Development Department and shall not be members of the Commission.

**Section 2.** The Chairperson shall preside at all meetings of the Commission, shall appoint any committee, standing or ad hoc, and be an ex-officio member thereof, and shall have a vote on all issues. The Chairperson shall also have the authority to act as spokesperson for the Commission.

**Section 3.** The Vice-Chairperson shall assume the duties of the Chairperson in the absence of that officer. The Vice-Chairperson shall also be considered the Chairperson-Elect.

**Section 4.** The Secretary shall assume the duties of Chairperson in the absence of the Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson. The Secretary shall also oversee all record keeping procedures of the Commission.

**Section 5.** As soon as convenient after members have been appointed and approved, and annually thereafter at the regular meeting held on the third Thursday in March, a nominating committee of three shall be appointed by the Chairperson to nominate a candidate for each office to be filled at the regular meeting in May. The nominating committee shall report at the Regular meeting in April. Before the election at the meeting in May, additional nominations from the floor shall be permitted.

**Section 6.** The officers shall be elected by majority vote to serve for one (1) year or until their successors are elected, and their term of office shall begin at the close of the regular meeting at which they are elected.

**Section 7.** No member shall be eligible to serve more than two consecutive terms in the same office or serve more than one office at the same time.

## **XII. ADJOURN**

MOTION: McCabe/Barton (5-0-0) ADJOURNED 8:15 PM