

1 BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS
2 MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

3 - - -

4

5 In the Matter of:

6 Regular Meeting

7 - - -

8 Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr.

9 President, Presiding

10 - - -

11 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

12 - - -

13

14 Monday, December 10, 2018
15 12:40 p.m.
16 City of Columbus
17 Civil Service Commission
18 77 North Front Street
19 Columbus, Ohio 43215

20 - - -

21 TRACI E. PEOPLES
22 PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER

23 - - -

24

25 ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
26 1421 West Third Avenue
27 Columbus, Ohio 43212
28 (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President
3 Stefanie L. Coe
4 Delena Edwards

5 PRESENTERS:

6 Pam Cole
7 Amy DeLong
8 Carol Lagemann
9 Julie Pfeiffer
10 Liz Reed
11 Tammy Rollins
12 Brenda Sobieck

13 ALSO PRESENT:

14 Angela Bennett
15 Wendy Brinnon

16 - - -

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
December 10, 2018
2 12:40 p.m.

3 - - -

4 P R O C E E D I N G S

5 - - -

6 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 10th day of
7 December, 2018, this cause came on for regular
8 meeting before the Municipal Civil Service
9 Commission, Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President.
10 And, the parties appearing in person and/or by
11 counsel, as hereinafter set forth, the following
12 proceedings were had:

13 - - -

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: We will call to
15 order the City of Columbus, Ohio, Municipal Civil
16 Service Commission regular meeting for December
17 2018. We will be following the established agenda
18 for today.

19 And the first item is review and approval
20 of the minutes of the November 26, 2018, regular
21 meeting.

22 MS. COE: I move that we approve the
23 minutes from the November 26, 2018, regular meeting.

24 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
2 "aye."

3 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: The minutes are
5 approved.

6 There are no rule revisions, no
7 prehearing conference reviews.

8 And the next item is the Trial Board
9 recommendations, review and approval of the Trial
10 Board's findings and recommendation regarding the
11 appeal of Ruth Campbell v. Columbus City Schools
12 from the action of Columbus City Schools discharging
13 her from the position of food service helper, Appeal
14 No. 18-BA-0003.

15 MS. COE: Do we need a motion on that?

16 I move to support the review and approval
17 of the Trial Board findings and recommendations
18 regarding the appeal Ruth Campbell v. Columbus City
19 Schools from the action of Columbus City Schools
20 discharging her from the position of food service
21 helper, Appeal No. 18-BA-0003.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

23 All in favor, say "aye."

24 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

2 Item No. 5 is the presentation of the
3 Civil Service Commission 2018 review and -- review
4 of accomplishments.

5 MS. DeLONG: Welcome, and good morning.

6 We had an incredibly busy 12 months, some
7 of which you've seen firsthand because of the
8 results that's presented at our monthly meetings.
9 But there's a lot that goes on behind the scenes and
10 outside of commission meetings. And I'd like to
11 share some of those efforts for the record for you
12 today.

13 Let's start off by seeing the updated
14 Civil Service video that overviews what we do that
15 previously had Mayor Lashutka giving us the welcome
16 statement. And we decided, instead of being quick
17 every time that part came on, that we would finally
18 get it updated, without money. We used our
19 technical services here at the City, Merrari's
20 expertise, and Mike Eccard. And they played a
21 really serious role in finally getting this done,
22 because I couldn't get money approved to do it.

23 (Video played.)

24 MS. COE: That's really good.

1 MS. DeLONG: Pretty nice, huh?

2 It's a huge improvement from where we
3 were at. I think the drone work in the beginning is
4 excellent. It's really updated us to put us in the
5 21st Century.

6 Outside of that, we also put together
7 that one page that's called "Civil Service at a
8 Glance" that I provided to you right before we
9 stepped in. That's -- I think our main purpose in
10 putting that together was not only to educate our
11 new administration, but also the public and the
12 community to give people a better idea of exactly
13 what we do at Civil Service. Because I think
14 there's a presumption that there's one test for
15 everything.

16 And I can go ahead and provide it to you.
17 I've got another copy. Here you go.

18 MS. EDWARDS: Thank you.

19 MS. DeLONG: I think there's a
20 presumption that it's all for one or one for all.
21 And the reality is that we test hundreds of
22 different positions.

23 So that being said, I've asked a few
24 members of my team, as well as an outside guest, to

1 take a few minutes to provide a brief overview of
2 some of the special accomplishments for the year.

3 I'd like to begin by inviting Julie
4 Pfeiffer, the interim Senior Executive Director of
5 Human Resources for Columbus City Schools.

6 MS. PFEIFFER: Good afternoon.

7 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Good afternoon.

8 MS. PFEIFFER: Thank you, Commissioner
9 Pettigrew, Commissioner Edwards, Commissioner Coe
10 and Executive Director DeLong.

11 My name is Julie Pfeiffer. I am the
12 interim Senior Executive Director of Human Resources
13 for Columbus City Schools.

14 As you may know, a little over two years
15 ago, the Columbus City Schools -- with Barbara
16 McGrath at the helm -- and the Columbus Civil
17 Service Commission began an aggressive endeavor to
18 update the Columbus City Schools' classification
19 plan. This entailed conducting detailed reviews and
20 necessary revisions to no fewer than 124
21 classifications.

22 In addition to these classification
23 reviews, the commission staff and Columbus City
24 Schools staff implemented and executed a plan to

1 review and make necessary updates to the Columbus
2 City Schools civil service testing program.
3 Throughout these projects, the commission staff --
4 including, but certainly not limited to, Michael
5 Eckert, Tammy Rollins, Jennifer Hutchinson, Richard
6 Cherry, Carol Lageman, Charday Litzy-Taylor, Don
7 White, Merrari McKinney, Wendy Brinnon and Angela
8 Bennett -- have been invaluable in this effort.
9 Their collective expertise, professionalism and
10 conscientiousness has been unparalleled as we have
11 moved through this significant process. They have
12 been, and continue to be, trusted advisors and
13 partners in helping the district update its Civil
14 Service practice.

15 Therefore, I would like to express our
16 sincerest appreciation and gratitude to you, the
17 commissioners, Executive Director DeLong and the
18 entire Columbus Civil Service Commission staff for
19 your hard work and dedication. And we look forward
20 to continuing our work together in the future.

21 Thank you again for the opportunity to
22 address you. Best wishes during the holiday season,
23 and may you all have a prosperous new year.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you.

1 And I guess just as a comment, we're glad
2 to see the improvements in our relationship with
3 Columbus City Schools, and certainly I'm sure that
4 some of the stress in your job has been reduced as a
5 result of the collaborative effort that is going on
6 in recent months. So thank you so much.

7 MS. PFEIFFER: Thank you.

8 MS. DeLONG: At this point, I'd like to
9 follow the agenda that I provided to each of you.
10 I'm going to ask Tammy Rollins to come up and speak
11 about the Class Plan update. After that, Pam Cole
12 will talk about community outreach; Liz Reed,
13 workforce diversity; Brenda Sobieck, some
14 administrative changes; and then I will address all
15 of you again at the end.

16 MS. ROLLINS: Hello.

17 So for this year, we have completed --
18 for Columbus City Schools, we have completed the
19 classification work for 57 classes, bringing their
20 Class Plan, or at least the majority of their Class
21 Plan, up to date. This was a commitment that we
22 made that we could do this in two years. And, you
23 know, I think it was all kind of like, "Can we
24 really do it in two years?" But we did. And it was

1 a lot of effort on our part, but it was a lot of
2 meetings with employees and supervisors. Some of
3 these classes hadn't been looked at for nearly 30
4 years. So there was a lot of education in this
5 process. Some of these meetings were originally
6 scheduled for an hour; and it might be three hours
7 later, but there was so much questions and just a
8 lot of information that we were getting because we
9 didn't have very good specs to begin with. So I'm
10 very happy to say that we are where we are.

11 I'm very appreciative there was nobody at
12 Columbus City Schools that wasn't willing to talk to
13 us. You know, as much as we were giving up three
14 hours of our time, they, too, were giving up three
15 hours of their time, because they had questions and
16 they had people in front of them that were able to
17 answer most of them, or at least could direct them
18 for the answers we couldn't give. So that was, you
19 know, very good.

20 It was a very worthwhile project. It's
21 always good to work on a project that, at the end,
22 you feel really good about it. You feel like your
23 efforts were appreciated and the gain was good. So
24 that was excellent.

1 This year, also, you know, we've
2 maintained our Class Plan, you know, at 100 percent.
3 And, once again, our Class Plan will be 100 percent
4 hopefully at the end of this meeting. And, you
5 know, we did 164 classification projects. Myself
6 and my analysts, we looked at all of these
7 classifications that we looked at. And I just
8 wanted to -- we thought this was an interesting kind
9 of tidbit that 25 percent of those classifications
10 had discussions around ability to help with the
11 recruiting for the department and also help and
12 guidance with how they might lay out a
13 reorganization.

14 So, in addition to doing a lot of our
15 class reviews, the five-year schedule review, 25
16 percent kind of landed in the direction of "We need
17 help with recruiting" or "These are some
18 reorganizations that we have planned. How can you
19 help us get there?"

20 From our certification verification team,
21 which often kind of functions in the background, but
22 it's been very busy in the city with hiring. And
23 it's been steadily increasing over the last three,
24 four years. But this year they have verified and

1 certified -- and this is through three quarters --
2 1300 appointments in the city. And that's just the
3 appointments. It's not taking into account all
4 the -- all the other personnel actions that are
5 crossing their desk. So it's very paper heavy, but
6 it's a lot of coordination with other departments,
7 and they do a great job of getting all those
8 transactions processed timely.

9 So thank you very much.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, thank you.
11 Do we take it that there is no need for Civil
12 Service involvement with Columbus City Schools now,
13 because everything is done?

14 MS. ROLLINS: Well, the work is done. I
15 think, Director Pfeiffer, there's a few things.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Just a few things
17 left?

18 MS. ROLLINS: A few things.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. Well, that's
20 good planning also. So thank you so much. I know
21 you're lead. And the team that presents to us every
22 month -- so thank you very much for your work and
23 your team's work.

24 MS. COE: Can I just ask you a question

1 real quick? When you talked about 1300
2 appointments, how often are they sort of -- I don't
3 know what the right word is -- correct and just able
4 to go through the process? Or does there have to be
5 back and forth?

6 MS. ROLLINS: I would say almost all of
7 them.

8 MS. COE: I thought I knew the answer,
9 but I was curious.

10 MS. ROLLINS: All of them have some level
11 of back and forth.

12 MS. COE: That's what I thought.

13 MS. ROLLINS: Some have a tremendous
14 amount of back and forth.

15 MS. COE: That's what I assumed.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you.

17 MS. ROLLINS: You're welcome.

18 MS. COLE: Hello.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Hello.

20 MS. COLE: My name is Pam Cole. I am the
21 community liaison outreach coordinator for the Civil
22 Service Commission. As the community liaison, I am
23 a point of contact for the community. That's what I
24 call the title. What I do is outreach work. And my

1 job is to engage and to educate the community about
2 the Civil Service Commission, who we are, what we do
3 and why we do what we do. As a matter of fact, I
4 show the video at everything that I go to. I show
5 that video because it kind of sums it up.

6 My main goal is to provide information to
7 the community regarding opportunities with the City
8 of Columbus, because everybody says they want to
9 work for the City. Civil Service is that initial
10 point of contact, so it's my job to let them know
11 that.

12 So some of the events that I have
13 attended and took part in since I took this position
14 in April of 2018: The Neighborhood Pride events,
15 the mayor's community nights, several job fairs,
16 career days at high schools. I've gone to several
17 union meetings to speak with their members. I've
18 connected with several workforce development
19 agencies, such as the Godman Guild, Goodwill, Eckerd
20 Connects, Sisters of Empowerment, New Directions
21 Career Center, and OhioMeansJobs.

22 I've also connected with -- through the
23 Department of Neighborhoods several new American
24 communities, including the Hispanic community, the

1 Nepali community and the Somali community.

2 When I go out and talk with these
3 communities, a lot of the things that I cover
4 include how employment with the City of Columbus
5 works. Because everybody wants a job. They don't
6 know, you know, where to start or where to begin.
7 We talk about the different jobs that they have.
8 One thing I always tell people is "We have
9 everything from doctors to ditch diggers. So no
10 matter what your talent, your skills, your
11 expertise, there's something that would fit you with
12 the City."

13 I also talk about what our current job
14 openings are. I go over the website extensively to
15 show how to navigate that, creating an applicant
16 profile if they've never created a profile with the
17 City, helping them to create that profile and
18 register and how to apply for jobs.

19 We also talk about how to set up job
20 alerts if they -- if there's not something that they
21 want to do that's open, how to set up a job alert so
22 that you can be notified when it does open.

23 I also give information on Restoration
24 Academy if, of course, needed.

1 Another thing that I do is the testing
2 clinics. We hold several -- We've held two this
3 past year through the public. We've posted on our
4 website. And then they can sign up and come to
5 those. We also give testing clinics as some of the
6 HR departments request them for their employees. So
7 part of our outreach is going out to the community.
8 So that's what I want to do, is go out to them. So
9 we actually go out to their workplace and give them
10 testing clinics and cover some of the things that I
11 mentioned before.

12 For the testing clinics that we hold here
13 onsite, it's to get them comfortable with where the
14 test is. Because a lot of times we'll get, you
15 know, "I'm lost. I don't know where it is." We get
16 those calls. So we have it here so that you'll know
17 where the testing is. We also offer free parking
18 for them to make it convenient, but we do explain we
19 don't give free parking for the actual test. That's
20 for the testing clinic. We want to make it
21 convenient for them.

22 And during the testing clinic, we talk
23 about some of our most common subtests, the
24 different kind of tests that we give, how to read

1 exam notices, the types of tests, test prep tips.
2 We talk about test anxiety. And then at the end we
3 give a sample test so they can have an overview of
4 what different kinds of questions look like. And it
5 gives them an opportunity to ask any questions that
6 they may have.

7 So we got really good feedback on those,
8 because I did hand out a survey at the end and ask
9 for feedback. So all of that was really good.

10 MS. COE: How well attended are those?

11 MS. COLE: We can register up to 50. The
12 first one, we had about 30 -- a little bit over 30
13 people, and almost 25 at the second one. So our
14 next one is coming up in February.

15 And we've not had to do any advertisement
16 for those. We just put it on the website, and they
17 usually just fill up.

18 Also, as a part of this job, we do
19 Rule VI testing. In addition to the 82 regular
20 recruitments that we had this year, we do -- I've
21 gotten over 100 requisitions for additional testing
22 requests by the HR department. So it's been a busy
23 year.

24 MS. EDWARDS: Sounds like you've been

1 busy.

2 MS. COLE: I have.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: So the only thing
4 you haven't solved is the downtown parking.

5 MS. COLE: Correct.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, as soon as
7 you do, we can spread the word.

8 MS. COLE: Right.

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. Thank
10 you very much.

11 MS. REED: Good afternoon, Commissioners.

12 CHAIRMAN PETTIGREW: Good afternoon.

13 MS. REED: I am going to share with you
14 the work that we have done regarding workforce
15 diversity.

16 The first thing I'd like to share with
17 you is the written policy diversity recruitment
18 council. That is a council that is primarily led by
19 police and fire recruiting teams. We partner with
20 them and attend each of those recruitment council
21 meetings. Those are -- The attendees at those
22 meetings are community members who are interested in
23 helping us try to find -- reduce barriers and try to
24 improve our workforce diversity, specifically with

1 police and fire. And our group has attended those
2 meetings, shared information and just helped the
3 process along with each one of those meetings.

4 With the new police recruiting team that
5 came in this year, we've also lent them support in
6 trying to help them kind of guide what those
7 meetings might look like, so that we're not just
8 giving information, that we're actually gathering
9 information from the community members to help them.

10 The next thing that we've been involved
11 with -- this is commission-wide as well -- has been
12 the Citywide Recruiting Task Force. So with that
13 group, basically it was primarily led by the -- by
14 the Office of Diversity and Inclusion and also
15 included the HR Department as a primary -- and Civil
16 Service as the primary individuals who led those
17 groupings.

18 That council actually -- or, I'm sorry,
19 that task force actually broke up into three
20 different segments: One that worked on internal
21 process improvements, one that worked on branding in
22 terms of recruiting specific branding, and the third
23 one that worked on data collection to have a better
24 idea of what are the actual numbers, what are the

1 targets, and that sort of thing.

2 A lot of the work that we did on -- I
3 personally was involved with the Interpersonal --
4 or, I'm sorry, the Inter- -- Process and Improvement
5 Committee. And with that committee, we worked on
6 several different things throughout the year.

7 One was to remove real and perceived
8 barriers in the selection process; things like
9 simple postings. We have our classification titles.
10 Our classification titles sometimes aren't
11 reflective of exactly what a particular position
12 might do. So in -- That was -- The departments
13 could always put down a different title in there --
14 a working title -- for different positions that came
15 up, especially for their noncompetitive examinations
16 or noncompetitive classifications. So with those,
17 it's really just informing the HR department on how
18 they could post those so that information was there.

19 The same thing is true with extra
20 questions that we might ask on an application that
21 might help guide the HR department in terms of
22 making decisions on those noncompetitive
23 classifications, to help kind of work through those.

24 So they were able to add supplemental

1 questions, for example. So those were -- And they
2 can also add in hyperlinks so that -- With a
3 hyperlink, if they wanted to, on their own
4 website -- so with different departments, put
5 information about what it's like for their -- to
6 work in their departments, to highlight the
7 diversity within their departments, those sorts of
8 things. They could add hyperlinks within their
9 postings so they could -- job seekers could go ahead
10 and find out more information and go to those
11 hyperlinks.

12 So those are just an example of some of
13 the things that we started working through.

14 Another thing that our group worked on
15 was interviewer training. So a lot of -- Citywide,
16 a lot of the people who are actually conducting the
17 interviews are supervisors and managers. Often,
18 they don't have HR training or background. So this
19 was actually led by the health department in terms
20 of creating an interviewer training module. And
21 then we started working with the HR department to
22 offer that training on a regular basis, so that
23 we -- so that people who are conducting interviews
24 can learn best practices, what questions they should

1 be asking in interviews, what questions they should
2 avoid and how to avoid bias in the interview
3 process.

4 So that just rolled out in October, and
5 we're really excited about having that available to
6 all city managers and supervisors.

7 The other thing that we've worked on
8 included actually giving up -- I have Pam's position
9 listed here, so I think she gave you a great
10 overview on that.

11 And then we also, as a group,
12 participated significantly in the first-ever
13 citywide recruitment fair. Civil Service was
14 instrumental in being involved in that recruitment
15 fair. We helped in some of the design and
16 organizing that event. But I think, more
17 importantly, being involved in the event itself by
18 giving people who attended that recruitment fair
19 information about how to access city jobs. We had
20 our testing clinic. We had that available to sign
21 up for. We also helped people navigate of where
22 they can best look in terms of the types of jobs
23 that were available.

24 We also -- Another group of individuals

1 with that task force focused on recruiting and
2 branding. So, through that, we mentioned a
3 brochure, but we also are beginning on spotlight
4 videos of employees. And we finished our first one,
5 and they have five in the queue ready to go.

6 They are also working on how-to videos.
7 So there's a series of those that we're working on
8 that include how to apply, how to set up a profile,
9 and those types of things as we move forward.

10 We're also looking at radio spots for the
11 career fairs and looked at a flyer for the career
12 fair. So all of those things were done through that
13 task force.

14 On the public safety side of the fence,
15 we also were involved in setting up what we call
16 "Firefighter Mile Introduction." With those, what
17 we did is set up the firefighter examination test
18 and allowed candidates or potential candidates to
19 come through and actually practice the physical test
20 event. That is particularly important to female
21 applicants, because they may not -- typically,
22 females don't do as well on the physical components
23 of the examination process. So allowing candidates
24 the opportunity to come in and actually hands-on try

1 each of those events, gives them a shot. They can
2 start learning techniques and really have a better
3 understanding of what the expectations are and
4 hopefully be able to then pass the examination when
5 it comes time next year.

6 And, finally, we're working on our move
7 to 1111 East Brad Street. That has been really
8 actually pretty interesting in the changes that will
9 take place.

10 The first is the change that took place
11 with the Firefighter Mile. We are now currently
12 revalidating that because we actually moved the
13 equipment to its new home, which will be at the Fire
14 Training Academy. We got that set up. We are, as
15 we speak, running firefighters through those events
16 to revalidate to make sure we have the test on its
17 new surface set up correctly and will function well
18 next year when we're in that facility for that exam.

19 Also with that move, we are in the
20 process of getting brand-new oral board suites set
21 up that will work very well with our -- both our
22 promotional and entry-level exams. And we'll have
23 12 of those suites available for us. And then
24 those -- which are designed specifically for that

1 type of testing, which we do for all of our uniform
2 ranks.

3 Another piece of that is our smaller size
4 for the written exams, which actually created, in
5 trying to solve that problem -- we're talking about
6 police and fire. Next year we're anticipated to
7 have up to 4,000 people apply for firefighter. We
8 typically have 2,000 to 2,500 apply for police
9 officer. So just accommodating that number of
10 people through the testing process with the space
11 limitation of about 50, 57 really adds on the number
12 of days in terms of administration.

13 So with that problem in mind was when we
14 came up with the idea of the change that you -- that
15 the commissioners just approved last year -- or last
16 month. I think it was last month -- which was to
17 allow candidates who have already taken their
18 written examinations for both police and fire, they
19 have demonstrated their capability by passing those
20 exams, they will not have to retake those. As long
21 as we don't make a major change to those
22 examinations, once they apply, they will -- their
23 passing score from the last time will apply to their
24 new exam, and we won't have to test those.

1 We're estimating that there will be --
2 based upon last time around, there were 500 people
3 for firefighter that applied that wouldn't have had
4 to take the exam. Of those, 350 actually showed up
5 that we actually scored and had to seat and retest.

6 For police officer, the same type of --
7 the numbers are a little bit lower for that group,
8 but we're still talking about 250 candidates. And
9 with that, we're talking about the written exam,
10 which is multiple choice, and the writing sample,
11 which is labor-intensive in terms of scoring. So
12 that's -- Those are significant savings in terms of
13 space, people, time. And even the candidates, I'm
14 sure, will appreciate not having to retake the
15 examination. So we're really excited about that
16 change. But it was all prompted by the fact that we
17 had a smaller space to work with.

18 MS. EDWARDS: I do have a question.

19 MS. REED: Sure.

20 MS. EDWARDS: If a candidate wanted to
21 retest so they could improve their score, do they
22 have that option?

23 MS. REED: It actually wouldn't be
24 helpful, because it's scored on just a pass/fail

1 basis. So even if they improve their score, it
2 really doesn't make a difference in the end. So the
3 answer would be we prefer not to retest anyone.

4 MS. EDWARDS: Okay.

5 MS. REED: And that's all I have to
6 cover. So if you have any questions before I step
7 away.

8 MS. DeLONG: If you could just explain
9 that the only thing -- it's the oral part that's
10 actually where they get ranked into the --

11 MS. REED: Yeah. So for both police and
12 fire, we do have oral components to each of those
13 examinations. Those are video-based exams. So what
14 candidates do is, they'll go into a video room.
15 They'll be by themselves. They'll watch different
16 scenarios or vignettes that come up on a computer
17 screen. And, as those come up, they'll have a
18 response time. They verbally respond to those
19 scenarios or vignettes. And we record those
20 responses, and then we score those at a later date.

21 So with those exams -- we call it "FOAM"
22 for fire, Fire Oral Assessment Mechanism. We call
23 it "COPE" for police, Columbus Oral Police Exam.
24 With those examinations, those are then scored at a

1 later point. But it is actually those score results
2 that determine where candidates finish in the
3 overall process.

4 One of the wonderful advantages of that
5 is, typical with those types of oral examinations,
6 you don't see any differences in performance. If
7 anything, there is maybe a slight difference in
8 terms of improvement or better results from both
9 females and minority candidates.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. Thank
11 you very much.

12 MS. REED: Thank you.

13 MS. SOBIECK: Liz covered the changes to
14 Rule VII, which was the retest rule, so I will just
15 briefly touch on background standards.

16 Every year, we do review the background
17 standards. We discuss any changes that we might
18 need with Public Safety, the Division of Fire and
19 the Division of Police. If we feel like we're
20 losing good candidates and we need to make a change,
21 we discuss that or if we think something is missing.

22 The only change we made this year was
23 actually at the recommendation of the Commission.
24 We added some language just to clarify the

1 misdemeanor removal standard. And that was one
2 where two M1 or M2 convictions can disqualify
3 someone forever for police and fire.

4 We just added some language to address
5 the traffic convictions, so that it was clear that
6 those two M1 or M2 traffic convictions would really
7 only be disqualifying for five years, but criminal
8 convictions would be disqualifying forever.

9 And that allowed a diverse fire candidate
10 who really had a clean background -- he didn't have
11 anything else on his background. His traffic
12 misdemeanors were, I believe, 9 and 12 years ago.
13 And they were driving under -- driving with an
14 expired license. And I think the other one was due
15 to a suspension. And that allowed him to qualify,
16 and he is still in the process.

17 That was the major change we made this
18 year, and we'll review them again next year.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. Thank
20 you.

21 MS. DeLONG: As you can see, it's been a
22 very busy and productive year. We've been working
23 collaboratively with many departments to accomplish
24 the goals of our mayor, Andrew Ginther, which is

1 neighborhoods, neighborhoods, neighborhoods.

2 And so a little deeper, as you can tell a
3 lot by our conversation, we really focused on two of
4 the deeper goals, which is diversity and inclusion,
5 and innovation and efficiency. So moving was a part
6 of it, but also coming up with the innovative idea
7 to allow us to have some efficiency even in moving
8 buildings was a part of that. Because we want to
9 make sure that we show him that we want to help him
10 accomplish his goals and we're all moving in the
11 same direction. I'm hoping that we can accomplish
12 that as a city.

13 I am very proud of our consistent quality
14 and quantity of work that our staff puts in every
15 year. And, you know, really, we look forward to
16 continuing with that in 2019.

17 But I did want to mention two large
18 projects that you will hear more about as the year
19 goes on.

20 One is that we are going to be working
21 with the auditor's office implementing a new
22 payroll/HR system. Tammy and her staff are going to
23 be, unfortunately for her -- I'm sorry -- feeling
24 the brunt of that on top of their daily duties

1 because, of course, this doesn't allow us the
2 opportunity to hire more people to come in and do
3 their work while they're being pulled off on that.
4 So they will be doing double duty. And I'm trying
5 to vouch to them now, we're not going to allow this
6 to be CHRIS, if you -- for those of you who --
7 because that's, of course, the fear of starting
8 something new like this.

9 I think the auditor's office put in some
10 good time into this, and I think we are headed into
11 the direction we need to. We have two great
12 vendors. I think, in either case, that we'll be
13 able to do what we need to do. And I think people
14 are now willing to, more than ever, change. And I
15 think that's a good thing to help us move this
16 forward.

17 And last but not least, I'm going to be
18 working on a nine-month project with a lot of the
19 mayor's staff for the Bloomberg Harvard Government
20 Innovation Project. I will be going to a two-day
21 boot camp December 19th and the 20th --

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Is that the Smart
23 City?

24 MS. DeLONG: No. It's -- The mayor

1 was -- The group of mayors went and did it, the
2 Bloomberg Harvard Innovation. And, as a result,
3 they could submit a problem. And the problem --
4 again, unfortunately or fortunately, however you
5 want to look at it -- was ours. And it was my
6 suggestion that we look at how to get more females
7 and minorities to test. And so the mayor then said,
8 "How do we recruit for females and minorities for
9 police?" And I think at the boot camp that we're
10 at, that will get further defined into what the
11 actual question is going to be and then how we're
12 going to attack that, and I will be able to share
13 some more of this information with you.

14 Unfortunate for Liz, or fortunate, again,
15 one of the things, however you look at it, she'll be
16 on vacation, so she won't be able to attend that
17 with me. But we will select four people from our
18 team as we further define what that problem is going
19 to be.

20 So thank you so much. And there will be
21 more in 2019 to share.

22 MS. COE: Is the new HR and payroll
23 system going to eliminate current systems? Or is
24 there, like, a plan to run both?

1 MS. DeLONG: (Shakes head.)

2 MS. COE: Okay. So it's a full
3 replacement of what's out there.

4 MS. DeLONG: Yes. We hope.

5 It's either that or an interface for what
6 we're doing, into it. And the two systems that we
7 have, they're looking at, I think, will replace
8 some, but not all.

9 MS. COE: Okay.

10 MS. DeLONG: Any other questions?

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Do you have
12 anything else?

13 For a lot of you, we see you every month
14 and sometimes more often. And one of the
15 opportunities this session has provided is the
16 opportunity to tell the story. There are a lot of
17 things that we want people to know. And our
18 discussions are, if you don't tell them -- that
19 neighborhood -- the commission that we went to --
20 There are people who do not know what Civil Service
21 does. That's number one.

22 Number two, Civil Service has been blamed
23 for a number of things that managers don't do in
24 their own departments. And so telling this story is

34

1 important for the entire community. And we
2 appreciate -- We, as commissioners, appreciate the
3 work you do, both the quantity and the quality. And
4 it's interesting that you're volunteering for
5 additional assignments.

6 2018, obviously --

7 MS. DeLONG: Involuntarily.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Involuntarily.

9 And 2018 was an ambitious agenda for
10 Civil Service Commission. And I only see 2019
11 offering more opportunity for more ambitious work.
12 The issue is, service the citizens of Columbus well
13 and, obviously, from our perspective, you do that;
14 not just as the executive director, but your entire
15 staff.

16 MS. DeLONG: Absolutely.

17 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: And some of the
18 things will continue to be present and show benefits
19 as they go on. The neighborhood meetings that I've
20 attended, information on Civil Service is so
21 important. So addressing that is important.

22 But everyone who tests or who applies
23 wants to know that they were fairly treated. And
24 that's why telling this story is so important. It's

1 not just made up all the way back to the charter and
2 the history. That's why that's so important to be a
3 part of this. Because there are a lot of people who
4 think that the stuff that this was created to avoid
5 only happened in Washington, D.C. Given the
6 opportunity, there are many people who would abuse
7 the process in Columbus. And so we are watch guards
8 against that as well.

9 So, on behalf of the Commission, thank
10 you. Thank you, Ms. DeLong, for your leadership.
11 And to the staff, those who are present, and then
12 please pass it on to those who are not, that we
13 appreciate the work that you do on behalf of
14 Columbus, Ohio. And we look forward to 2019. And
15 at the end of 2019, we'll see if you surpass all of
16 this. But, again, thank you, thank you, thank you.

17 And we'll go back to our remaining
18 agenda.

19 MS. EDWARDS: Thank you.

20 MS. COE: Thank you.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you.

22 So, No. 6: Request of the Civil Service
23 Commission Staff to revise the specification for the
24 classification to Police Officer.

1 MS. COLE: I'm Pamela Cole again. How
2 are you?

3 So a review of this specification of the
4 classification Police Officer is part of the Civil
5 Service Commission's effort to review every
6 classification at least once every five years.

7 It is proposed that two statements be
8 added to the examples of work. Other than that,
9 there were no other changes.

10 MS. COE: Thank you.

11 I move to support the request of the
12 Civil Service Commission Staff to revise the
13 specification for the classification Police Officer.

14 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
16 "aye."

17 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

19 Thank you.

20 Item No. 7: The request of the Civil
21 Service Commission Staff to revise the specification
22 for the classification Information Technology
23 Account Coordinator.

24 MS. ROLLINS: This is a request we

1 received from the department of technology. They
2 had requested that the classification be slightly
3 broadened to enable it to also be used within the
4 same area, but would oversee all of the
5 technology-related spending and contact and
6 purchasing that occurs in the city departments.

7 The Information Technology Account
8 Coordinator classification is part of a two-level
9 class series. It consists of an account manager and
10 the account coordinator. Both classifications work
11 very closely with departments and liaison with the
12 department of technology. But they assist with all
13 of their technological needs and maintaining service
14 level agreements and helping them find solutions to
15 their operational issues.

16 The account managers are generally
17 assigned specific departments, and they have a broad
18 scope, as it's meeting the technology needs of those
19 particular departments.

20 The technology account coordinator is
21 generally responsible for supervising and
22 coordinating the work of the account managers.

23 The department has a position that they
24 would like to have somebody who is a contract

1 expert, specifically with technology in mind, to
2 ensure that all of the contracts that the City
3 enters into are written consistently and include the
4 necessary language, you know, that is needed to
5 ensure projects are on time, are on budget and, you
6 know, if needed, there's exit clauses included
7 within these contracts.

8 It's also important to kind of have a
9 single position overseeing who has an idea of what
10 all the different technology spending is within the
11 City so there isn't duplicate spending happening
12 over here and over here. You know, sometimes
13 there's redundancies that someone can just add a
14 couple things to meet two departments' needs instead
15 of just the one department's needs.

16 The proposed position, while it would not
17 supervise the account managers, it would have that
18 broad oversight, which, from looking at
19 classifications, the Information Technology Account
20 Coordinator looked like it would be a good fit. It
21 is at the level that the department is looking for.
22 And, with a slight revision in the definition that
23 it's coordinating and/or supervising, we thought
24 that this would be a good classification for them to

1 use for that particular need.

2 For the most part, there's just that
3 minor revision in the definition. I think there's a
4 line in the definition that's redundant in the
5 "Examples of Work." And so we just took out what's
6 already covered. So, basically, the proposed
7 revision today is a revision to the definition.

8 MS. COE: Thank you.

9 I move to support the request of the
10 Civil Service Commission Staff to revise the
11 specification for the classification Information
12 Technology Account Coordinator.

13 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
15 "aye."

16 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

17 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

18 Thank you.

19 Carol, do these need to be dealt with
20 separately?

21 MS. LAGEMANN: Yeah, they're kind of
22 separate.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

24 The next item, 12, is the request of the

1 Civil Service Commission Staff --

2 MS. EDWARDS: It's 11.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I'm reading it, but
4 it's 11.

5 Item 11 is the request of the Civil
6 Service Commission Staff, on behalf of Columbus City
7 Schools, to impose a moratorium on the specification
8 for the classification Facilities Maintenance
9 Scheduler.

10 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel
11 Analyst, Columbus Civil Service Commission.

12 On behalf of Columbus City Schools, we
13 request to impose a moratorium on the specification
14 for the classification Facilities Maintenance
15 Scheduler. The work performed by the current
16 incumbent, and the only incumbent, reflects more of
17 a security focus and is not representative of the
18 work reflected by the current classification. The
19 school district expects this review could be the
20 impetus for the creation of a new classification
21 that's more representative of the work being
22 performed. Once this classification is vacated, we
23 would recommend it for abolishment.

24 MS. COE: Thank you.

1 I move to support the request of the
2 Civil Service Commission Staff, on behalf of
3 Columbus City Schools, to impose a moratorium on the
4 specification for the classification Facilities
5 Maintenance Scheduler.

6 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
8 "aye."

9 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

11 Item No. 12, for real. Request of the
12 Civil Service Commission Staff, on behalf of
13 Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification
14 for the classification Preventative and Maintenance
15 Painter Supervisor, assign a probationary period of
16 365 days, and designate the examination type as
17 noncompetitive.

18 MS. LAGEMANN: Civil Service Commission
19 Staff conducted its review of the specification for
20 this classification for Columbus City Schools as
21 part of their effort to review all classes within
22 their Class Plan.

23 Within the "Examples of Work" and the
24 "Knowledge, Skills, Abilities" section, statements

1 are modified or updated to better reflect the work
2 for the knowledge, skills and abilities that are
3 required.

4 Within the "Minimum Qualifications"
5 section, the experience is proposed to be modified
6 to remove specific class titles and to be inclusive
7 of the kinds of work that may segue into this role.
8 "The supervisor painter must work as a painter on
9 commercial buildings" is also included.

10 The probationary period is currently 180
11 days. It is proposed to increase the probationary
12 period to 365 days, such that the incumbent would be
13 afforded the full range of duties associated with
14 variations in schedule and supervisory tasks.

15 It is proposed to update the exam type to
16 noncompetitive. As a supervisory-level
17 classification, which requires some advanced
18 experience in a relevant field, the noncompetitive
19 exam type would be more appropriate for the level of
20 work and scope of responsibilities.

21 There are no other changes proposed.

22 MS. COE: Thank you.

23 I move to support the request of the
24 Civil Service Commission Staff, on behalf of

1 Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification
2 for the classification Preventative and Maintenance
3 Painter Supervisor, assign a probationary period of
4 365 days, and designate the examination type as
5 noncompetitive.

6 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
8 "aye."

9 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

11 Thank you.

12 Item No. 13 is a request of the Civil
13 Service Commission Staff, on behalf of Columbus City
14 Schools, to revise the specification for the
15 classification Maintenance Mechanic and retitle it
16 to read "Food Service Equipment and Refrigeration
17 Mechanic."

18 MS. LAGEMANN: Again, this is a request
19 of our Civil Service Commission for Columbus City
20 Schools as a part of their effort to update all of
21 their classes within their Class Plan. The current
22 title is proposed to be retitled to read "Food
23 Service Equipment and Refrigeration Mechanic" to
24 better describe the primary work of the

1 classification.

2 It is proposed to update the definition
3 to simply remove HVAC, as this is not the primary
4 purpose for the classification to exist and would be
5 misleading in the definition.

6 Within the "Examples of Work" and
7 "Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities" sections,
8 revisions are proposed to better describe the work
9 or to improve wording in the statement.

10 In the "Minimum Qualifications" section,
11 it is proposed to be revised to remove the 12th
12 grade education requirement in favor of focusing on
13 experience. Since this is intended to be a fully
14 skilled level of work, three years of experience
15 repairing or maintaining food service equipment or
16 appliances or HVAC equipment is proposed.

17 They also will need to possess the
18 Section 608 EPA certification by the end of the
19 probationary period.

20 There are no other changes proposed.

21 MS. COE: Thank you.

22 I moved to support the request of the
23 Civil Service Commission Staff, on behalf of
24 Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification

1 for the classification "Maintenance Mechanic" and
2 retitle it to read "Food Service Equipment and
3 Refrigeration Mechanic."

4 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
6 "aye."

7 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

9 The 14th item is a request of the Civil
10 Service Commission Staff, on behalf of Columbus City
11 Schools, to revise the specification for the
12 classification Preventive Maintenance Worker and
13 retitle it to read "HVAC Service Worker."

14 MS. LAGEMANN: Again, this is our
15 request, a Civil Service Commission request, on
16 behalf of Columbus City Schools, as part of their
17 effort to update all classes within their Class
18 Plan.

19 The current title is proposed to be
20 revised to read "HVAC Service Worker" to better
21 describe the primary work of the classification. It
22 is proposed to update the definition to focus on the
23 responsibilities for servicing and cleaning HVAC
24 systems.

46

1 Within the "Examples of Work" and
2 "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" section, revisions
3 are proposed to better describe the work or to
4 improve wording of the statement.

5 The "Minimum Qualifications" section is
6 proposed to be revised to focus on having six months
7 of experience in the general maintenance of building
8 HVAC systems. A substitution that allows for
9 education to substitute for experience is also
10 proposed.

11 Within the Class Plan Index, this
12 classification was in series with that Preventative
13 Maintenance Painter Supervisor, within the craft and
14 trades job family, building trades group. While the
15 family and group are correct, this classification
16 fits better into the first level of entry into the
17 HVAC series of classifications.

18 There are no other changes proposed.

19 MS. COE: Thank you.

20 I move to support the request of the
21 Civil Service Commission Staff, on behalf of
22 Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification
23 for the classification Preventative Maintenance
24 Worker and retitle it to read "HVAC Service Worker."

1 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

2 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
3 "aye."

4 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

6 Item 15 is deferred.

7 The only item remaining on our agenda
8 today is Item 19, the administrative and
9 jurisdictional reviews. And the letter proposed is
10 approved -- the letter as to Andrew Bartnikowski, if
11 that's pronounced correctly.

12 And with that, we are adjourned. Thank
13 you.

14 - - -

15 And, thereupon, the proceedings were
16 concluded at approximately 1:35 p.m.

17 - - -

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 10th day of December, 2018, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 1:35 p.m.

** * **

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

Date