

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION REVISED AGENDA

Tuesday, February 19, 2019
6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-8871, or email zdjones@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, March 12, 2019 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Tuesday, March 19, 2019.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, January 15, 2019.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. **19-2-12**
247 E. Third Ave.
Nicholson Builders (Applicant)/ Andy Fortener (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
3. **19-2-13**
268 E. Fourth Ave.
Joe Huber (Applicant)/ House to Home Property Group (Owner)
An application, siteplan, and photos have been submitted.
Staff Recommended Application
 - Create new lot-split per submitted siteplan.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

2. **19-1-8**
782 N. High St.
Architectural Alliance (Applicant)/ Rajesh Lahoti (Owner)
An application, drawings, and material information have been submitted.
 - Final materiality approval request.
 - Proposed alteration of previously approved design with new enclosure of first & second floor patios with “Nana-walls” and “Crown Doors”.

The following is taken from the January 2019 IVC meeting minutes:

Continue Application #19-1-8, 782 N. High St., to allow applicant time to explore additional design considerations, or submit revised information, per the original approval:

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- *The Commission noted that the revised proposal infills the previously approved openings in a way that conceals the architecture of the existing building and appears boxy.*
- *The Commission recommended that the applicant explore different options for the NW corner, noting that the strong vertical columns made sense when the design was open and make less sense, now that it is infilled.*
- *The Commission requested that the applicant include scaled elevations (e.g., 1/2"=1') in the next submission.*
- *The Commission was generally unsupportive of windows that open into the public right-of-way.*
- *The Commission questioned whether the revised proposal would still incorporate the Columbus postcard mural, previously reviewed.*
- *The Commission recommended that any/all future projecting signage be in line with the architecture of the building.*
- *The Commission was supportive of all proposed materials, except the RockCast ("buffstone"). Concern with the RockCast centered on how it would wear, especially at the street level, and the visibility/number of grout joints.*
- *If RockCast is proposed, the Commission requests a detailed section, showing how corners would be handled.*

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. 19-2-14

866 N. Pearl St.

Flat Black Commercial Visuals (Applicant)/ WC Properties, LLC (Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

5. 19-2-15

45-47 E. First Ave.

Greg Anglin (Applicant)/ Michael Blue (Owner)

An application, siteplan, photos, and material information have been submitted.

- Installation of new parking pad per submitted siteplan.
- Parking area to be composed of pavers designed for parking use.

6. 19-2-16

75 E. Russell St.

Urban Restorations, LLC (Owner)

An application, drawings, and material information have been submitted.

- Change color of brick and concrete block for final phase of previously approved project.
- Brick to be Palmetto Brick Co.; color to be "Whitestone".
- Block to be Schory Block Co.; color to be "Charcoal".
- Windows to be Marvin Infinity; color to be "Black".

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.

7. 19-2-17

770 Hamlet St.

Rhythm Architecture (Applicant)/ Peter Navarro (Owner)

An application, siteplan, and revised drawings have been submitted.

- Revisions to previously approved 2-story carriage house (COA# 17-3-18b).

8. 19-2-18

1056 Hamlet St.

Steve O'Brien (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

- Construct new 2-story addition to side of house.
- Construct new 2-story carriage house in rear yard.

The following is taken from the October 2018 IVC meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- *Commission indicated that removal of aluminum siding should be done with HPO staff present in order to assess the underlying wood siding. Existing wood should be repaired and replaced as needed, not replaced with cementitious siding as proposed.*
- *Commission indicated that a rear addition should be considered instead of a side addition. If moving forward with a side addition, it should be setback and differentiated in terms of materials and should be deferential to the primary structure.*
- *Commission had differing viewpoints on front porch appropriateness – may depend on how proposed side addition is positioned.*
- *Applicant indicated that new windows will be from approved list and would match existing openings. Also asked if larger windows that include sides where existing weights are located would be acceptable. Commissions indicated that it would not be acceptable to utilize existing weight areas as additional window width. The Commission also noted that an existing window is not shown on the concept drawing and that existing openings should be preserved. If additional openings are discovered during removal of aluminum siding, these should be restored as well.*
- *Commission indicated that applicant should review carriage homes within Italian Village for reference and indicated that the proposal as presented is inappropriate in terms of roof pitch and overall design. The inclusion of two single bay doors was viewed favorably, though the positioning of the right garage bay was noted as being too close to the edge of the structure.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:00 P.M.

9. 19-2-19

115 E. Fifth Ave. (Beeker Building)

Maletz Architecture + Build (Applicant)/ Borrer Properties (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

- Tenant build-out in Beeker Building for Zaftig Brewing Co.
- Installation of stand-up signage on canopy.
- Installation of blade sign.
- Installation of new double storefront entry door.

The following is taken from the January 2019 IVC meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- *The Commission was supportive of the general location of the proposed blade sign (on north elevation); however, the Commission had the following design related recommendations:*
 - a. The Commission recommended that the applicant consider a bracketed or swing mounted blade sign, which would be more consistent with the architecture of the building.*
 - b. A Commissioner noted that artistic/unique/funky blade sign designs are encouraged over typical suburban branding (i.e., just the business name).*
 - c. A Commissioner recommended mounting the sign higher up, into the frieze area, and reducing its length.*

- A Commissioner questioned whether all of the letters in the “Zaftig” sign would sit on the canopy or if the “g” would hang down, as shown in the drawings. The Commission recommended that the applicant explore all options for the canopy sign, including thickening the canopy, so that the letters could be placed on the front.
- The Commission recognized that the garage doors are being proposed, primarily, in order to bring in the brew tanks and perform any future maintenance on them.
- The Commission noted that if the proposed garage doors match the approved architectural features/fenestration, they would be supportive; however, they encouraged the applicant to also consider other (potentially less costly) alternatives, including: a set of double doors or moveable panels, at the tank room.
- The Commission encouraged the applicant to consider whether a set of double man doors, centered on the middle bay, would eliminate the need for the garage door proposed closest to the main entry.

NO ACTION TAKEN

10. 19-2-20

919 N. Fourth St.

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Laura Dunbar & Eric Hostnik (Owners)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

12. 19-2-22

189 Punta Al.

Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Mansell Investment Properties, LLC (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Construction of new 3-story single-family residence with attached garage.
- Building frontage on Punta Alley with a 10' ROW setback to match adjacent residences.
- Building setback at rear is 5' from lot line and 3' from west lot line.
- There is a 10' access easement for the property directly to the south that will serve as a common driveway.
- Materials to be considered are: brick, fiber cement panels, and corrugated metal.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:30 P.M.

13. 19-2-23

854 Summit St.

Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Amiya Dey (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing single-story 4-car due to non-functioning condition.
- Construct new 2-story 3-car carriage house with living unit.

14. 19-2-24

No Address (Civitas Ave.)

New Avenue Architects & Engineers (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Place New Community Authority (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- New 5-story residential apartment building for the southeast corner of the former Jeffrey Mining site.
- New building conforms to the Council Variance in place of the property (CV12-060, 732 N. Fourth).
- The building is designed to form two (2) separate internal courtyards.
- A future bridge is planned to connect the building to a planned parking garage to the west.

11. 19-2-21

No Address (Corner of Hamlet St. & First Ave.)

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Nate Sampson & Charmaine Sutton (Owners)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 2-story brick duplex with two (2) attached 2-car garages.

The following is taken from the November 2018 IVC meeting minutes:

Commissioner Comments

- *The Commission expressed concerns about the lot coverage being high and requested that the applicant consider revision to the lot coverage through reduced width and/or a revision to a single unit structure.*
- *A Commissioner expressed some concern with the new curb cut and the removal of a large existing tree.*
- *A Commissioner expressed some concern about the proposed deck(s) over the garage.*
- *A Commissioner requested that pervious paving be used for the rear driveway area so that it would have functionality as a patio.*

NO ACTION TAKEN [Sudy Abstained]

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

• **19-2-1**

1030-1032 N. Sixth St.

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ 169 Brandywine, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 19-2-1, 1030-1032 N. Sixth St., for renewal of expired COA #17-12-2 (Expired: 12-19-18), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Approve Application 17-12-2, 1030-1032 N. Sixth St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- *Demolish existing single-story concrete block rear addition and related decks.*
- *Construct new two-story rear addition.*
- *Replace all existing replacement windows with new wood windows.*
- *Replace existing front doors with new wood doors and side doors with new fiberglass doors.*
- *Replace existing front porch posts and railings.*

• **19-2-2**

93 E. Fourth Ave.

Tony Capuano (Owner)

Approve Application 19-2-2, 93 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new 6' wood privacy fence in exact location as previous privacy fence.
- New gate to be installed to match existing fence design.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **19-2-3**

1142 Summit St.

JP Faulkner (Applicant)/ David A/ Sishin

Approve Application 19-2-3, 1142 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair/replace deteriorated wood siding on west elevation as needed to match existing and per submitted specifications.
- Paint residence: body to be Sherwin Williams "Peppercorn" (SW7674), trim to be Sherwin Williams "Natural Choice" (SW7011), and accent to be Sherwin Williams "Tricorn Black" (SW6258).

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **19-2-4**
700 N. High St.
Monarch Restaurant (Applicant)/ Wood Companies (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-4, 700 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Install new black fabric awnings on existing awning frames.
 - Design to include “Monarch”.

- **19-2-5**
186 Warren Ave.
The Roof Detective (Applicant)
Approve Application 19-2-5, 186 Warren Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Install new TPO roofing membrane roof per submitted specifications. Color to be “Gray”.
 - Reinstall historic clay tile, and/or replace as need to match existing in kind, like for like.Install New TPO Roof
 - Remove any/all EPDM, and/or rolled roofing down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
 - Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new TPO (Thermoplastic polyolefin) single-ply roofing membrane in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings. Color to be either “Black” or “Gray”.
 - Re-install any/all deteriorated and damaged roof capping from parapet wall, any required replacement capping is to match existing.

- **19-2-6**
101 E. Fourth Ave.
One Red Slate Roofing Co. (Applicant)/ Steve McCoy (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-6, 101 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing deteriorated asphalt shingle roof.
 - Install new GAF “Slateline” dimensional asphalt shingle roof per submitted specifications; color to be “Weathered Slate”.
 - Install new metal ridge roll, valleys and flashing; color to be “Tinner’s Red”.
 - Install new gutters per submitted specifications.Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof
 - Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
 - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
 - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.

- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **19-2-7**
164 E. Third Ave.
John Chmielewski (Applicant)/ Greg Smith (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-7, 164 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Replace seven (7) deteriorated basement windows.
 - New units to be Pella Architectural Reserve aluminum-clad windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings and per submitted details.

- **19-2-8**
66 E. Fourth Ave.
Joe Huber (Applicant)/ Valor Investments (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-8, 66 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove gravel parking area and plant grass seed in its place to create grass rear yard.

- **19-2-9**
806 Hamlet St.
Gary Katz & Leslie Mihalov (Owners)
Approve Application 19-2-9, 806 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing rear patio and regrade yard.
 - Install new paver patio and steps per submitted drawings and specifications.
 - Install new 12’ x 16’ rough cedar pergola per submitted drawing.
 - Extend north side fence along garage to within 2’ of each side of detached garage to create new dog run.

- **19-2-10**
86 Warren St.
J. Michael Holsinger (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-10, 86 Warren St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Paint newly constructed garage to match existing house paint scheme (COA#18-9-3).Exterior Painting
 - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.

- **19-2-11**
915 N. Fourth St.
Greg Anglin (Applicant)/ Michael Blue (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-11, 915 N. Fourth St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Paint front porch columns and ceiling; color to be Sherwin Williams “Natural Tan” (SW7567).
 - Paint front door and garage door; color to be Sherwin Williams “Rare Grey” (SW6199).Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
 - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
-
- **19-2-12**
247 E. Third Ave.
Nicholson Builders (Applicant)/ Andy Fortener (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-12, 247 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Alter existing window opening on west elevation into entry door, including new stoop and stairway.
 - Extend existing 6-ft wood privacy fence to garage to enclose new doorway and stairs.
 - Install new 32"-tall wrought-iron fence in front yard; to be Fortin Ironworks "F5".
-
- **19-2-14**
866 N. Pearl St.
Flat Black Commercial Visuals (Applicant)/ WC Properties, LLC (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-12, 247 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Request approval to install 9' -6" x 19' -0" temporary vinyl banner for a duration of one (1) year.
 - Applicant to return to renew if longer duration is required.
-
- **19-2-20**
919 N. Fourth St.
Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Laura Dunbar & Eric Hostnik (Owners)
Approve Application 19-2-20, 919 N. Fourth St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Convert existing garage into carriage house including new bathroom and kitchenette.
 - Create additional interior living space by connecting two (2) dormers; all details to match existing.
 - Existing garage was approved in 2015.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS – 4pm Commission meeting start time beginning with April 2019 IVC hearing.

XII. ADJOURNMENT