

STAFF REPORT

DATE **February 19, 2019**
PLACE **MICHAEL B COLEMAN GOVERNMENT CENTER**
111 NORTH FRONT STREET, ROOM 205
TIME **3:00 PM**

A CALL TO ORDER

B INTRODUCTION OF NEW BOARD MEMEBER

C APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MEETING SUMMARY – JANUARY 15, 2019

~3:00

MEETING SUMMARY – FEBURARY 12, 2019 (BUSINESS MEETING)

D MEETING PROCEEDINGS OVERVIEW

E OLD BUSINESS - APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

~3:05 1. **APPLICATION:** EF_18-12-003
ADDRESS: 79, 83-85 MCDOWELL ST
PROPERTY OWNER: CITY OF COLUMBUS
APPLICANT: COLUMBUS HOUSING PARTNERSHIP, INC (HOMEPORT)
TO BE REVIEWED: DEMOLITION
NEW CONSTRUCTION

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation Dodge Park
3323.19 – Land Use
3323.21 – EF Development Standards
Code Reference: 3321 – General Site Development Standards
3312 – Off-Street Parking and Loading

Staff Observations:

The Columbus Housing Partnership (Homeport) is proposing to construct a four-story, multi-family development at the corner of State and McDowell within the West Broad Street sub district. The units will be intended for families earning 80% AMI or below, and the project is anticipated to be submitted to OHFA as a 2019 tax credit application. The development includes a mix of one, two and three-bedroom units, for a total of 50 units, and a total of 64 parking spaces – 4 onsite spaces and 60 spaces in the Gravity II parking garage. The project is being developed in conjunction with the approved Gravity II development and will utilize parking and site amenities provided for the larger development.

The site is currently owned by the City of Columbus Land Redevelopment Division (Land Bank) and is occupied by a historic church structure. The church was built in 1911 and has been vacant for approximately seven years.

The application is requesting a conditional approval of the following items:

1. Demolition of the existing church
2. Use (> 4 units multi-family)
3. Development Standards

Demolition Permit Review:

Standard	Staff Comments
Replacement use reviewed and approved by EFRB	Applicant is proposing a 4 story, multi-family development with 50 units.
Is the property eligible for Columbus or National Registers of Historic Places?	Yes, the structure is of historic significance.

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	West Broad Sub-District	Staff Comments
4 + dwelling unit building	Permitted Use	Consistent

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Broad Street District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Consistent
Maximum Front Yard	10' (Except public/private zone)	
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	3'
Minimum Side Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent
Lighting	3323.21	TBD
Graphics	3323.21	TBD
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	52 units * 1.5 spaces = 78	64 spaces provided - 4 onsite and 60 shared spaces (Gravity II) 14 Space Reduction
Bicycle Parking	6 spaces required	6

Overall, the proposal is consistent with the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan.

Staff supports the request for demolition of a historically significant structure based on the following factors: 1. the existing condition of the structure and significant cost burden for restoration; 2. the use of the site to provide affordable housing in the East Franklinton District; 3. A design that is appropriate for the site; 4. A condition of approval for the demolition that there is an award of public financing through tax credits or other financing for the project; 5. A condition of approval to document the historic structure using a cultural resource management consultant – to be coordinated with Historic Preservation Office.

Staff supports the overall proposal, including the request to reduce the number of on-site parking spaces to 4 and to allow a shared parking arrangement with the Gravity II project for an additional 60 spaces.

Staff recommends two motions for the application.

If approved, the Board will grant the following modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards:

1. To reduce the minimum parking setback from 5' to 3'
2. To reduce the required number of on-site parking spaces from 78 to 4

Staff Recommendation: Approval **Approval with Conditions** Table Disapproval
 Motion to Approve the Demolition of the Existing Church with the following conditions:

1. Tax credits or other public financing is awarded to project for the construction of multi-family housing to provide affordable housing
2. Documentation of the existing structure to be coordinated with the Historic Preservation Office

Staff Recommendation: Approval **Approval with Conditions** Table Disapproval
 Motion to Approve the proposed multi-family development with the following conditions:

1. Board review and approval of elevations, materials, landscaping, lighting
2. To provide 60 parking spaces through a shared parking arrangement

~3:30 2. APPLICATION: EF_18-06-001
 ADDRESS: 435 W TOWN ST
 PROPERTY OWNER: MANHATTAN PROJECT LLC
 APPLICANT: CHRIS SHERMAN
 TO BE REVIEWED: EVENT CENTER

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park
 Code Reference: 3323.21 DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

Staff Observations:
 435 West Town Street was constructed in two phases, the first built in 1921 facing Town Street and the second phase built in 1931 to the south of the first phase. B&T Metals first occupied the building in 1942, and in 1943 produced uranium rods as a part of the Manhattan Project. This building is listed as potentially eligible for historic designation.

At the May 17, 2016 EFRB meeting, the Board approved the demolition of the southern portion of the building with the agreement that the applicant will preserve the northern part of the building on the condition a marker or display is provided on site to describe the history of the building.

At the July 2018 EFRB meeting, the Board approved the use and development standard modifications, including a parking reduction from 227 parking spaces to 82 parking spaces. The applicant is now returning to the board to request full approval, including building elevations and materials, site plan and landscaping. Graphics will be reviewed as a future application.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Consistent
Maximum Front Yard	10' (Except public/private zone)	
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Consistent
Minimum Side Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent

Lighting	3323.21	Consistent
Graphics	3323.21	N/A
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	-227 parking spaces -13 bicycle parking spaces	-Already approved reduction to a minimum of 82 spaces over two (2) lots. Now requesting a reduction from 227 spaces to a minimum of 79 spaces (148 space reduction) -14 bicycle spaces provided

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.	Consistent
Historic and other contributing buildings should be preserved to the extent possible and if necessary, incorporated into new development.	Consistent
All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture).	Consistent
Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors.	Consistent.
Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits.	Consistent
Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester.	Consistent
Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane.	Staff recognizes that wall sconces provide a small amount of upward directed light. The applicant has demonstrated that the lighting levels will not extend past the height of the building.
Ground-mounted or other upward directional lighting should be permissible only where some form of shield or light baffling is provided to create a soft, uniform light quality and minimize light spillage beyond trees, landscaping, walls or signs being illuminated.	Staff recognizes that wall sconces provide a small amount of upward directed light. The applicant has demonstrated that the lighting levels will not extend past the height of the building.

The proposal is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff believes the applicant has appropriately responded to comments at the January 2019 EFRB meeting, and staff recommends Approval.

If approved, the Board will grant the following modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards:

1. To permit a parking reduction from 227 spaces to 79 spaces (148 spaces)
2. To allow parking located on McDowell, Rich and Lucas streets as an accessory use to the approved uses within 201 S. Lucas (Phase I), 431 W Town (Phase II), 401 W Town and 400 W Rich as shown on the previously approved site plan (EF_17-01-001) and the approved uses within 435 W Town (EF_18-06-001). (Total number of spaces is 260)

Parking	(Code required number of parking spaces, loading spaces, and bicycle parking spaces)	Already approved to 0 spaces: Consistent
---------	--	---

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When a proposed use is compatible with adjacent uses, it should be supported. 	Permitted use by code
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Density of infill development should be consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton plan. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building (“foursided” architecture). 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60 percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass, which permits a view of the building’s interior to a minimum depth of four feet. 	Due to the nature of religious use, the applicant has requested to not provide the 60 percent transparency on the first floor. The windows on the north, south, and west elevations provide transparency.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Promote accessibility and “visitability” in all new construction and in rehabilitation and redevelopment of existing buildings. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the building lines of each street. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Between non-residential and residential uses, screening should be a six-foot board-on-board fence or other comparable material; chain link is not acceptable. 	The applicant has discussed the site plan with the adjacent residential property owner. Screening is not proposed adjacent to the single family home, but a landscaped buffer is included on the south elevation.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester. 	Consistent, please coordinate tree selection and placement with the Department of Parks and Recreation.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings. 	Consistent

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane. 	Staff recommends that the spot lights on the south and east elevations be mounted on the building and directed downward. Staff acknowledges that the well lights emit some upward light, but it is not enough to extend past the height of the building. Otherwise consistent.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Light standards (poles) should not exceed 18 feet in height. 	Consistent

Applicable Graphic Design Guidelines:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New signage should be designed to be a logical and complementary component of the overall design of a storefront and/or the associated building's architecture. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Signage should not obscure any significant architectural elements; the installation of a sign should be reversible and should not permanently alter or damage building materials. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The width of building wall signs should not exceed 50 percent of the width of the structure. 	Consistent

Overall, the proposal is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff recommends the board discuss the spot lights on the south and east elevations, as plan recommendations would encourage the lights to be mounted on the building and directed downward. It is recognized that some locations on the site are appropriate for upward facing lights, however, minimization of the upward facing floodlights should be considered. **Staff recommends approval.**

Previously approved modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards include:

- To reduce the number of required parking spaces from 80 to 0
- To increase the maximum front yard setback from 10' to 17.5'
- To reduce the minimum side yard setback from 3' to 0'
- To reduce the minimum parking setback to 0' from the alley
- To increase the maximum height from 35' to 48.5'
- To allow ornamental banners on ground mounted poles to exceed the maximum height of 15'
- To allow an ornamental banner on a building mounted pole to exceed the height of the building

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

F NEW BUSINESS - APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

~4:10 4. APPLICATION: EF_18-06-004A
ADDRESS: 617 W STATE ST
PROPERTY OWNER: UNITED PREPARATORY ACADEMY, INC
APPLICANT: NATHAN GAMMELLA
TO BE REVIEWED: LIGHTING, WINDOWS, AND REAR RAMP

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.21 DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

Staff Observations:

United Preparatory Academy occupies an existing school building located at 617 W State in the Dodge Park sub-district. The applicant is requesting to add a new double-door and ramp for accessibility on the north elevation, as well as exterior wall LED wall sconces on the south elevation. The applicant is also requesting to install a fan and louver system placed within the glass block on the east and west elevations; the block would be selectively removed for this system.

The application includes a site plan, building plans and materials, and building elevations.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Lighting	3323.21	Consistent

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building (“foursided” architecture). 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Promote accessibility and “visitability” in all new construction and in rehabilitation and redevelopment of existing buildings. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane. 	Consistent

The proposal is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff recommends an approval.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

~4:20 5.

APPLICATION: EF_19-02-001
ADDRESS: 245-251 S. GRUBB ST.
PROPERTY OWNER: ERIC ALLEN
APPLICANT: CHARLES M. PAROS, AIA
TO BE REVIEWED: EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.21 – EF Development Standards

Staff Observations:

245-251 S Grubb is a four-unit dwelling located in the Dodge Park sub-district. The applicant is requesting to construct new porches, rear deck, landscaping, parking pad and to install new windows and doors. In November 2018, a conceptual application was reviewed by the board. . The owner began work prior to issuance of a COA and was charged with working without a permit and issued a stop work order. At that point the porches and decks had been removed, and new windows and doors had been installed.

The application includes a site plan, building plans and materials, building elevations, lighting, and graphics.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Consistent
Maximum Front Yard	10' (Except public/private zone)	
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Consistent
Minimum Side Yard	3'	North side yard is 2' 6"
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg. Height	3 stories or 35'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent
Lighting	3323.21	Consistent
Graphics	3323.21	Consistent
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	6 parking spaces 2 bicycle parking spaces	6 spaces 4 bicycle parking spaces

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings with ground-floor residential spaces should have direct access to the public sidewalk and incorporate front stoops or small plazas to contribute to street activity. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Surface parking should be located to the rear or side of street-oriented buildings, with preference for the rear of buildings and screened per code. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for a principal building is zero feet and the maximum setback for a principal building is ten feet, except where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public, semi-public/private, and private spaces should be demarcated clearly through the use of landscape, walls, fences, gates, pavement treatment, signs, and other methods to denote boundaries and/or buffers. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester. 	Consistent: The applicant will reflect street trees along S. Grubb St. in the permit set drawings and will coordinate with the Parks and Recreation Department.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. 	Consistent.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clear boundaries between public, semipublic/private, and private spaces should be defined. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings. 	Consistent.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Off-street parking for bicycles should be provided per code. 	Consistent.

Applicable Graphic Design Guidelines:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Signs that reinforce the creativity, craftsmanship, and industrial character of the East Franklinton District are encouraged. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Signage should be pedestrian in orientation and scale. Wall and blade signs are preferred. 	Consistent

The proposal is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff recommends approval.

If approved, the Board will grant the following modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards:

- To permit the north side yard setback (between the deck and the site boundary) to be 2' 6" instead of 3'.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

~4:35 6. **APPLICATION:** EF_19-02-003
ADDRESS: 625 W. TOWN ST.
PROPERTY OWNER: HUNTINGTON NATIONAL BANK OF COLUMBUS
APPLICANT: SEAN CLARK
TO BE REVIEWED: SIGN REPLACEMENT

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.21 – EF Development Standards
3375 - Graphics

Staff Observations:

625 W Town Street is located in the Dodge Park sub-district and occupied by Pilot Dogs, Inc. The applicant is seeking to replace 5 existing building signs with 4 new building signs and 1 new roof mounted sign. Signs 1, 3, 4, and 5 are non-illuminated and mounted onto the building canopy. Sign 2 is illuminated with aluminum channel letters.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Graphics	3323.21	Consistent: Signs 1, 3, 4, 5 Not Consistent: Sign 2

Applicable Graphic Design Guidelines:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New signage should be designed to be a logical and complementary component of the overall design of a storefront and/or the associated building’s architecture. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The signage message should be designed in a simple fashion and may include the business name, logo, function and/or street number or address and related artistic treatments. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Signage should not obscure any significant architectural elements; the installation of a sign should be reversible and should not permanently alter or damage building materials. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The width of building wall signs should not exceed 50 percent of the width of the structure. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In addition to signs prohibited in Chapter 3375, the following types of signs shall not be permitted: off-premises signs, billboards, projector based signs, signs with flashing lights or bare bulbs, co-op signs, rotating signs, monopole signs, automatic changeable copy signs, and roof-mounted signs. 	Staff supports the roof mounted sign as it is integral to the sign design and compliments the building’s scale.

The proposal is generally consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. The roof mounted sign is not permitted by the East Franklinton District, however, staff supports the sign as it is integral to the building’s architecture and consistent in scale of the building. Staff recommends approval.

If approved, the Board will grant the following modification to the East Franklinton District Development Standards:

- To permit a roof mounted sign.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

~4:50 7. **APPLICATION:** EF_19-02-004
ADDRESS: 455 W STATE ST
PROPERTY OWNER: GRAVITY PROJECT 2, LLC
APPLICANT: DEVIN CAROTHERS/ KAUFMAN DEVELOPMENT
TO BE REVIEWED: SOLAZZO BUILDING REDEVELOPMENT

Sub-Districts:

West Broad St

Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

Code Reference:

3323.21 – EF Development Standards

Staff Observations:

455 W State is located on the corner of McDowell and State within the West Broad sub-district. The existing building is vacant and being redeveloped as part of the Gravity II project. The applicant came before the Board in September 2018 for approval of Gravity II, which included a mixed use 12 story building, Murphy Building, Garage, Co-Housing Building, parking reduction, and height variance. This approval was contingent on the applicant returning for approval of the landscaping, graphics, lighting, and design and materials for the townhouses, garage, and the Salazzo building.

At this time, the applicant is requesting approval for exterior elevations and building materials on the Salazzo Building. This includes the restoration and repair of the exterior envelope, including new storefront and doors, masonry cleaning and re-pointing, new single roof, new fascia boards, and new gutters and downspouts.

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building’s appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Historic and other contributing buildings should be preserved to the extent possible and if necessary, incorporated into new development. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building (“foursided” architecture). 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Primary entrances to buildings should be oriented to the primary public street with at least one operable door on the primary public street. 	Consistent

The proposal is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff recommends approval.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

G STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

	APPROVED : ITEMS APPROVED	COA ISSUED
8. EF_19-02-002 465 WEST RICH STREET	1/30/2019: Tenant Sign	1/20/2019

H NEXT MEETING

TUESDAY – MARCH 19, 2019 AT 3:00 PM
MICHAEL B COLEMAN GOVERNMENT CENTER
111 NORTH FRONT STREET, ROOM 203