

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION MINUTES

Thursday, January 17, 2019
6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front Street, Room 204

Commissioners Present: Jackie Barton, Steward Gibboney, Joseph McCabe (arrived 6:07 p.m./Agenda Item #1), Dan Morgan, Erin Prosser

Commissioners Absent: Clyde Henry

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:03 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, February 14, 2019 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Third Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, February 21, 2019 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Room 204 (Hearing Room)
- IV. SWEAR IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Thursday, December 20, 2018.
MOTION: Gibboney/Barton (3-0-1 [Prosser-abstain]) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Gibboney/Prosser (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 19-1-9
630 East Town Street
Kerry Drake/Roger C. Perry Management Co. (Applicant)
 - MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

East Town Street Historic District
Patrician Properties (Owner)



2. 19-1-10

591 Franklin Avenue

Megan Smith/Able Roof (Applicant)

East Town Street Historic District

Patrician Properties (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 19-1-10, 591 Franklin Avenue, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / House

- Remove all slate on the main roof of the brick house, down to the sheathing.
- Remove all existing asphalt shingles on all elevations of all dormers. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Existing flat roofs and newer asphalt shingles on porch roofs to remain, as is.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles on roof and on dormer cheeks and facades. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

Nickel Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Note: Approval is based on photo documentation and testimony provided by the Applicant of attempts to repair and maintain the slate roof over a period of years.

MOTION: Prosser/McCabe (5-0-0) APPROVED

CONTINUED APLICATIONS

3. 18-12-15

251 East Lane Avenue

David Neiderhiser (Applicant)

Iuka Ravine Historic District

D. Fried Triplex, LLC. (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-12-15, 251 East Lane Avenue, Iuka Ravine Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Demolish Garage / Install Parking Pad

- Demolish the existing, deteriorated, frame garage, per the submitted photos.
- Remove existing concrete garage floor.
- Install new, two-car, concrete parking pad in same 12' x 18' footprint.
- Install new, 3-4' High wood fence on west side of new parking pad, to prevent driving onto the lawn.
- Install new 6' High wood privacy fence on, or within, the south property line to provide screening of headlights onto the neighboring property.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-

board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.

- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Applicant is to submit a measured site plan showing the location and dimensions of the new parking pad and fence locations to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Applicant is to submit measurements of the existing garage, including length, width, and height; corner boards and other trim; and siding reveal to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: Approval of demolition is based on submitted photos and a site visit conducted by Historic Preservation Office staff.

MOTION: Gibboney/Erin (5-0-0) APPROVED

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. 19-1-11

1822 Bryden Road

Heather Minor & Mike Powers (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Kevin Sarich (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated. Staff approvable work was separated out and issued as COA#19-1-13.

Approve Application 19-1-11, 1822 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Rear Porch Enclosure

- Retain the existing modifications to the rear porch enclosure, including new wood siding and trim.
- Cut sheet for new rear door to be submitted for review and approval, prior to installation.

New Windows/Full Frame Replacement

- Remove all existing, Marvin Integrity Wood Ultrex insert (aka pocket) replacement windows, as installed prior to review and approval.
- Remove all existing glass block, basement windows, as installed prior to review and approval.
- Remove the existing, four-lite, sliding window on the first floor of the façade.
- Install new, full frame, Marvin Integrity Wood Ultrex windows, per the submitted windows schedule.
- Retain and repair any/all, remaining, original, wood, twelve-lite and sixteen-lite casement windows, if salvageable.
- Repair and reinstall the three (3) original, wood, twelve-lite casement windows on the third floor, if salvageable.
- Any/all new, multi-lite windows to match the existing, original, twelve-lite and/or sixteen-lite casement windows.
- All sashes with muntins to be simulated divided lite sash, with muntins permanently applied to the interior/exterior of the glass, with a spacer bar between the two layers of glass.
- Any/all paired or triple-ganged windows to be separate window units, with dividing mullions built, in place. Install new, wood casings over mullions, to match existing exterior casings.
- Repair existing, wood, exterior window casings, or install new wood casings to match the original.
- Final window schedule for basement windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval.

MOTION: Gibboney/Prosser (5-0-0) APPROVED

5. 19-1-12

706 Kimball Place

Old Oaks Historic District

Next Home For You, LLC./Kathy Morgan (Applicant/Owner)

- MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

STAFF APPROVALS

• 19-1-1

463 North High Street

North Market Historic District

Carol Meyer/Pella Windows (Applicant)

Yankee Trader, LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application 19-1-1, 463 North High Street, North Market Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Windows

- Full frame replacement of twenty-four (24) existing, deteriorated and non-original windows on all elevations, per the submitted photos.
- Install new Pella Architect Reserve, aluminum-clad, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows, per the submitted product cut sheets and drawings.
- All windows to match existing rough openings.
- Exterior color to be "Iron Ore."
- New, aluminum brickmould to be flat, to match existing.

• 19-1-2

2096 Summit Street

Iuka Ravine Historic District

Jarrett Fuller/Prime Construction (Applicant)

Hou Yu Zhou (Owner)

Approve Application 19-1-2, 2096 Summit Street, Iuka Ravine Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove Vinyl Windows & Install New Windows

- Remove all existing, non-original, one-over-one, double-hung, vinyl windows, as installed prior to review and approval.
- Install new, JeldWen Sitaline, aluminum-clad wood, one-over-one, double-hung windows.
- New windows to be sash paks (aka sash kits), custom sized to fit the original openings.
Note: Installation of an insert (aka pocket) window (upper and lower sashes surrounded by a supporting frame in place of the original sashes) is not allowed, as it reduces the amount of glass due to the added frame around the upper and lower sashes.
- Remove the two (2) existing, non-original, sliding, vinyl windows flanking the chimney.
- Install new, JeldWen Sitaline, aluminum-clad wood, single-light, fixed windows, sized to fit the original openings. Applicant has the option of submitting a stained glass window design for review and approval by Historic Preservation Office staff.

• 19-1-3

1682 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Corey Favor (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 19-1-3, 1682 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / Garage & House

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, front porch, and dormers of the house and the garage roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.

Historic Resources Commission - Minutes

January 17, 2019

5

- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:
Manufacturer: Style: Color:

[] GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

[] Nickel Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Install New Storm Windows

- Install new, low profile, Provia Concord Series, aluminum storm windows on all elevations, per submitted specifications.
- New storm windows to be installed inside the existing window frame.
- Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.
- Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows.

Install New Storm Door

- Install new, Anderson 2000 Series, full view, aluminum storm door on the front entrance doorway.

• **19-1-4**

738-742 Bedford Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Golden Lion Investments, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 19-1-4, 738-742 Bedford Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Repair Stone Retaining Wall

- Remove any/all damaged stone, and replace with stone that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings” <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).
- The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.

Install New Windows

- Remove the two (2) existing, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows on the second floor of the rear elevation, per the submitted photos.
- Install new, Pella Impervia fiberglass windows to fit the existing openings.
- Wood trim and arched header to remain.

Note: The Pella Impervia fiberglass, double-hung window is being approved in this particular instance because they are bathroom windows located on the rear elevation of the building, and may not be used as replacements for the remainder of the building.

Install New Hand Railings

- Install new, wood hand rails at the two rear entrance steps, per submitted photos.

- New railings to be built, per the illustration on page 15 of the *Columbus Register of Historic Properties Architectural Guidelines*.
- New wood railings to be painted.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing wood privacy fence and install a new six-foot high (6' H), wood privacy fence on, or within the north, south, and east (rear) property lines in the rear yard.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Along the side yards (north/south), fence is to end before reaching the first (westernmost) window on each side elevation.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **19-1-5**

666 Oakwood Avenue

Justin Swartz (Applicant)

Approve Application 19-1-5, 666 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Rebuild Chimney

- Remove the one (1) existing, brick chimney on the rear slope of the roof.
- Retain existing bricks, and cut to a thickness of approximately 1/2".
- Reinstall cut bricks over a wood frame structure matching the original shape and size of the existing chimney.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>.)
- New chimney cap or corbelling to match any existing.
- Replace metal flashing and paint "Gray" or "Tinner's Red."

• **19-1-6**

221 Northwood Avenue

Nelson Waight (Applicant)

Approve Application 19-1-6, 221 Northwood Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / Garage & House

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof and dormers of the house and the garage roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.

Old Oaks Historic District

Greg Myers (Owner)

Northwood Park Historic District

A. Crawford (Owner)

- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

[] GAF

[] Slateline (dimensional)

[] Weathered Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **19-1-7**

50 West Broad Street

Samuel Rosenthal (Applicant)

LeVeque Tower / Individual Listing

Tower 10, LLC/Robert Meyers (Owner)

Approve Application 19-1-7, 50 West Broad Street, LeVeque Tower / Individual Listing, for renewal of expired COA # 16-4-21 (Expired: April 21, 2017), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Final Storefront/Streetscape Plan

- Complete streetscape renovation work at the lower levels of the building.
- Install new awnings in exact same awning locations per submitted plans.
- Refurbish or replace in-kind the delivery area gate.
- Replace non-original, non-historic aluminum storefront with a larger, more compatible set of doors for egress.
- Install new signage per submitted plans.
- Convert existing window on south elevation back to original door opening, per submitted drawings.

MOTION: Henry/Clark (5-0-1) [Morgan] APPROVED

- **19-1-8**

108 West Jeffrey Place

Dianne Radigan (Applicant/Owner)

Old Beechwold Historic District

Approve Application 19-1-8, 108 West Jeffrey Place, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install Radon Mitigation System

- Install new radon mitigation system on the rear elevation (northwest corner) of the house, per the submitted site plan and photographs.
- Any/all exhaust piping to be painted to match the stone color on the house, to blend in visually with the building surface as much as possible.
- All work to be as per the submitted rendering and specifications, in accordance with industry standards, and all applicable City Building Codes.

- **19-1-9**

630 East Town Street

Kerry Drake/Roger C. Perry Management Co. (Applicant)

East Town Street Historic District

Patrician Properties (Owner)

Approve Application 19-1-9, 630 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Door

- Remove the existing, deteriorated and damaged, non-original, wood, 15-light front entrance door and side lights, per the submitted photos.
- Install new, custom, 15-light, aluminum-clad wood front entrance door.
- Dimensions of styles, rails, and muntins to match the existing door.
- New door to be simulated-divided lite, with muntins permanently applied to the exterior/interior of the glass, and

with a spacer bar between the two layers of glass.

- Existing wood sidelights to remain.
- Measurements of existing door, and cut sheet for new door, including dimensions for stiles, rails, muntins, and panes of glass to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: At such time when the existing sidelights are to be replaced, a new application and cut sheet will be required, including five (5) panes of glass to match the original sidelights.

- **19-1-12**

706 Kimball Place

Old Oaks Historic District

Next Home For You, LLC./Kathy Morgan (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 19-1-12, 706 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Brick Foundation

- Clean and tuck point unpainted, rear porch, brick piers and infill brick foundation, as needed. Unpainted brick to remain unpainted.

Apply Stucco over Existing Stucco

- Check the existing stucco on all elevations for structural integrity. Remove any loose stucco and debris.
- Apply bonding agent over existing stucco and allow to dry, according to manufacturer's instructions.
- Mix and apply new stucco, according to manufacturer's instructions and industry standards.
- New stucco surface to match texture of existing stucco.
- New stucco to be tinted color equal to Pittsburgh MEN7130-2 "Shark," per submitted paint color chip.
- Thickness of new stucco to allow for all existing wood trim to project at least ¼" to ½" above the surface of the new stucco.

Cover Door/Windows on Rear Enclosed Porch

- Remove existing, non-original door on north elevation of the two-story, rear enclosed porch.
- Remove the two (2), multi-light windows on the north and east elevation of the two-story, rear enclosed porch.
- Frame in new wall to fully enclose the north wall.
- Install existing, wood siding from inside the porch on the north and east exterior walls.

Soffit, Fascia & Rafter Tail Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood soffits, fascia, and rafter tails on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.
- New soffit material to be either 1" x 3", tongue and groove, yellow pine, bead board or plywood, ply-bead panels.

- **19-1-13**

1822 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Heather Minor & Mike Powers (Applicant)

Kevin Sarich (Owner)

Approve Application 19-1-13, 1822 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Door/House

- Remove the existing plywood covering on the rear entrance doorway of the one-story, rear addition.
- Install a new, half-light steel door, per the submitted product cut sheet.

Install New Cellar Door

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, steel cellar door at the rear elevation of the house.
- Install a new, steel cellar door, per the submitted product cut sheet.

Install New Door/Garage

- Remove the existing service door on the concrete block garage.
- Install a new, half-light steel door, per the submitted product cut sheet.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the brick house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be as follows: Porch ceiling - Benjamin Moore PM-31 "Lancaster White;" Cellar doors, Wood siding on rear mud room, Windows, Soffit and Fascia – Benjamin Moore PM-8 "Charcoal Slate;" Exterior door on rear of house and garage service door - Benjamin Moore PM-9 "Black."
- Finish coat colors for the front and rear gables and side dormer to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to application of paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., exterior brick walls; stone window/door sills and lintels; porch columns and stone coping on front porch railing) is to remain unpainted.**

Paint Front Porch Floor

- Prepare the previously painted, concrete front porch floor for repainting.
- Power wash concrete floor with a maximum pressure of 300 lb./p.s.i., as needed, and allow to dry completely.
- Sand off any old paint or other uneven areas, as needed. Vacuum and wipe with tack cloth to remove any residue.
- Fill any/all cracks and holes, as needed.
- Prime and paint with appropriate paint for concrete flooring. Color to be Benjamin Moor PM-31 "Lancaster White."

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURN 7:22 PM