

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

**Tuesday, February 19, 2019
6:00 p.m.**

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: Ben Goodman, Jason Sudy (6:33), David Cooke, Lauren Crosby, Todd Boyer, Shannon Fergus

Commissioners Absent:

Staff Present: Corinne Jones

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:03 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, March 12, 2019 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Tuesday, March 19, 2019.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, January 15, 2019. MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. **19-2-12**
247 E. Third Ave.
Nicholson Builders (Applicant)/ Andy Fortener (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
3. **19-2-13**
268 E. Fourth Ave.
Joe Huber (Applicant)/ House to Home Property Group (Owner)
Recommend approval of Application #19-2-3, 268 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted:
 - Create new lot-split, per submitted site plan.MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (5-0-0) RECOMMEND.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

2. **19-1-8**
782 N. High St.
Architectural Alliance (Applicant)/ Rajesh Lahoti (Owner)
Continue Application #19-1-8, 782 N. High St., to allow applicant time to explore additional design considerations, or submit revised information, per the original approval:
 - Final materiality approval request.
 - Proposed alteration of previously approved design with new enclosure of first & second floor patios with “Nana-walls” and “Crown Doors”.MOTION: Cooke/Crosby (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission was not supportive of enclosing the patio, noting that the openness of the previous approval was more appropriate for Italian Village.
- The Commission noted that the project was originally approved with an open patio, in order to maintain visibility of existing architecture. If an enclosed patio is part of the program, the current proposal, which appears to be a building on top of a building, is not the appropriate way to do it.
- A Commissioner noted that the proposed design appears to have lost its narrative; does not relate to/contribute to High Street; and, looks too much like a corner building.
- A Commissioner noted that the thick mullion at the new entrance seems misplaced- does not appear to follow through vertically.
- There was not consensus on whether the proposed glass window system was an improvement. At least one Commissioner felt that the gull wing windows were sculptural, artful, and added interest.
- A Commissioner noted that the corner solution felt appropriate when it was open; however, if enclosed, a traditional, High Street facing, façade would be more appropriate.
- A Commissioner noted that how the building meets the ground is important, and there is a difference of opinion on whether or not there should be a knee wall facing High Street.

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. 19-2-14

866 N. Pearl St.

Flat Black Commercial Visuals (Applicant)/ WC Properties, LLC (Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

5. 19-2-15

45-47 E. First Ave.

Greg Anglin (Applicant)/ Michael Blue (Owner)

Approve Application #19-2-15, 45-47 E. First Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Installation of new parking pad per submitted site plan.
- Parking area to be composed of pavers designed for parking use.
- Submit a rear yard fence plan that details how the entrance to the rear yard parking area will be defined (e.g., with heavier posts and/or plantings that help define the entrance, and allow cars to safely enter/exist from the alley).
- Submit a front yard fencing and/or planting plan, to make it clear that the existing curb cut is not a driveway entrance. If planting is proposed, they should include evergreens (taxus, spruce, boxwoods, etc.) or similar.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-1) APPROVED. [Fergus]

6. 19-2-16

75 E. Russell St.

Urban Restorations, LLC (Owner)

Continue Application #19-2-16, 75 E. Russell St., to allow applicant time to explore other design options:

- Change color of brick and concrete block for final phase of previously approved project.
- Brick to be Palmetto Brick Co.; color to be “Whitestone”.
- Block to be Schory Block Co.; color to be “Charcoal”.
- Windows to be Marvin Infinity; color to be “Black”.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission was not supportive of different masonry on 1 out of 3 units, opining that it appeared unbalanced/disjointed/as if materials had run out, instead of intentional.

- The Commission was not opposed to the use of alternate materials on the non-primary facades (e.g., the west or south elevations).

7. **19-2-17**

770 Hamlet St.

Rhythm Architecture (Applicant)/ Peter Navarro (Owner)

Approve Application #19-2-17, 770 Hamlet St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Revisions to previously approved 2-story carriage house (COA# 17-3-18b), which include a double garage door with the appearance of two doors, instead of two individual garage doors.
- Alternate garage door design to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of certificate. Door design shall be more urban and Village appropriate (e.g., without the arched panels, which appear more country/suburban).

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (6-0-0) APPROVED.

8. **19-2-18**

1056 Hamlet St.

Steve O'Brien (Owner)

Continue Application #19-2-18, 1056 Hamlet St., to allow applicant time to explore other design options:

- Construct new 2-story addition to side of house.
- Construct new 2-story carriage house in rear yard.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission commended the applicant for making changes to the setback and carriage house, based on the feedback provided at the last review, but noted that architectural drawings are needed, in order to provide more detailed/informed feedback.
- The Commission noted that the proposed change in roof pitch, over the addition, changes the character of the residence. The second floor plan may need to change, at the addition, in order to accommodate a more steep pitch (or a different roof type) that better aligns with the existing architecture.
- In response to the applicant's suggestion of a flat roof addition, the Commission opined that flat roof additions are more appropriate on the back of a structure (not visible from the street).
- A Commissioner noted that the porch roof should not overhang the house, as shown in the renderings.
- The Commission noted that the carriage house appears big and tall, in the renderings. The Commission recommended reworking the stairwell (e.g., swinging it around the side), in order to decrease the size of the structure and provide more symmetry.

9. **19-2-19**

115 E. Fifth Ave. (Beeker Building)

Maletz Architecture + Build (Applicant)/ Borrer Properties (Owner)

The Commission split the application into two parts: 19-2-19a (Storefront) and 19-2-19b (Signage).

19-2-19a

Approve Application #19-2-19a, 115 E. Fifth Ave. (Beeker Building), as submitted, with the following clarifications:

- Tenant build-out in Beeker Building for Zaftig Brewing Co.
- Installation of new double storefront entry door that matches the previously approved front entrance doors in detail, dimension, and finishes.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVED.

19-2-19b

Continue Application #19-2-19b, 115 E. Fifth Ave. (Beeker Building), to allow the applicant time to consider alternative designs:

- Tenant build-out in Beeker Building for Zaftig Brewing Co.

- Installation of stand-up signage on canopy.
- Installation of blade sign.

MOTION: Cooke/Crosby (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission commended the applicant for the changes made (blade sign location and support, canopy font, etc.), in response to the feedback provided at the last meeting.
- The Commission discussed removing “brewing company” from blade sign; however, they were amenable to it staying, as proposed, if removal creates trademark issues (indicated by the applicant).
- The Commission suggested removing the ball from the end of the blade sign support arm.
- The Commission recommended exploring alternatives for the canopy sign and bringing back the most successful iteration. The following options were discussed by the Commission:
 - Reducing/minimizing the height of the panel, with Zaftig projecting above canopy and brewing company on canopy.
 - Returning the canopy, on the sides, similar to the Standard Hall canopy (on High Street).
 - Including details on the canopy that make it appear finished and in line with the architecture of the building (e.g., crown mold or other ornamentation along the top). The Commission recommended looking at historic canopies for inspiration.
- The Commission noted that regardless of what revisions are made, the canopy should still read as a canopy, not a sign board.
- The Commission was supportive of the proposed lighting for the canopy sign, noting that it appears similar to the Rossi signage (on High Street).

10. 19-2-20

919 N. Fourth St.

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Laura Dunbar & Eric Hostnik (Owners)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

12. 19-2-22

189 Punta Al.

Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Mansell Investment Properties, LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construction of new 3-story single-family residence with attached garage.
- Building frontage on Punta Alley with a 10’ ROW setback to match adjacent residences.
- Building setback at rear is 5’ from lot line and 3’ from west lot line.
- There is a 10’ access easement for the property directly to the south that will serve as a common driveway.
- Materials to be considered are: brick, fiber cement panels, and corrugated metal.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission noted that the grade should be relatively flat, where the driveway intersects the sidewalk, to be pedestrian friendly.
- Given the character of the street, which functions similar to an alley, the Commission was not opposed to the front facing garage door; however, the Commission encouraged the applicant to explore moving the front garage door to the rear auto court, if possible.
- The Commission recommended incorporating a front entrance door onto the front elevation.
- The Commission was supportive of using concrete block (or similar material that speaks to alley location) as a plinth and cantilevering the upper stories, noting that the cantilevered design preserves pedestrian space.

- The Commission was interested to see what material will be proposed for upper floors, noting that if metal is used, measures should be taken to avoid oil canning.
- The Commission was supportive of the recessed outdoor space, shown on the third floor.

13. 19-2-23

854 Summit St.

Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Amiya Dey (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing single-story 4-car due to non-functioning condition.
- Construct new 2-story 3-car carriage house with living unit.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission was generally supportive of the site plan. There were some questions and discussion regarding the practicality of the one car garage and the dissemination of the trash cans that are currently located in front of the existing garage.
- At least three Commissioners noted that they were supportive of demolition, given the condition of the garage.
- With respect to the carriage house design, the Commission noted that the proposed Juliet balcony and the dormer appear too celebratory (i.e., do not help to subordinate the carriage house).
- The Commission clarified that any protective bollards, proposed in the right-of-way, would have to be approved by the Department of Public Service, but the Commission would be interested to see the proposed design, included in the next submittal.

14. 19-2-24

No Address (Civitas Ave.)

New Avenue Architects & Engineers (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Place New Community Authority (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- New 5-story residential apartment building for the southeast corner of the former Jeffrey Mining site.
- New building conforms to the Council Variance in place of the property (CV12-060, 732 N. Fourth).
- The building is designed to form two (2) separate internal courtyards.
- A future bridge is planned to connect the building to a planned parking garage to the west.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission recommended revising the design and proposing a taller, signature building that takes advantage of the views of downtown and anchors the entire development.
- The Commission was not supportive of the future pedestrian bridge, noting that activating the street is a priority and a pedestrian bridge would detract from that. Incorporating parking into the lower floors of the subject site was suggested, as an alternative that would also work to increase the height of the building.
- The Commission was encouraged by the applicant's plans for a taller building at the adjacent site; however, they noted that if the subject site is meant to be supportive of that (future) taller building, they would like to see a streetscape view that includes the other site.
- The Commission noted that greenspace and open space, facing the street (similar to Greystone Court Apartments, on High Street) would help to provide relief and reduce massing, as viewed from the street.

11. 19-2-21 [Cooke, Sudy]

No Address (Corner of Hamlet St. & First Ave.)

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Nate Sampson & Charmaine Sutton (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 2-story brick duplex with two (2) attached 2-car garages.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission commended the applicant for the changes made and research provided.
- The Commission noted that the proposed architectural style appear to be consistent with the surrounding homes.
- The Commission was supportive of the differentiating material, used on the garages, in the drawings.
- The Commission was concerned with the loss of the significant tree, noting that incremental tree removal changes the neighborhood character.
- A Commissioner noted concern with the combination of the new curb cut, the loss of the tree, and the proposed lot coverage, on a highly visible corner lot.
- At least two Commissioners indicated that their initial concerns regarding lot coverage were assuaged by the research on surrounding lot coverage, provided by the applicant.
- Two Commissioners expressed support for a flat roof deck with tall railings. The two other Commissioners present favored fully screened outdoor space (half gable), but requested more information on the proposed design.
- A Commissioner recommended exploring reducing the width by 2-3 feet, to further reduce lot coverage and provide more space for tree lawn trees.
- A Commissioner recommended exploring any other ways to further reduce lot coverage and make the auto space feel more pedestrian.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

- **19-2-1**
1030-1032 N. Sixth St.
Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ 169 Brandywine, LLC (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-1, 1030-1032 N. Sixth St., for renewal of expired COA #17-12-2 (Expired: 12-19-18), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.
Approve Application 17-12-2, 1030-1032 N. Sixth St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - *Demolish existing single-story concrete block rear addition and related decks.*
 - *Construct new two-story rear addition.*
 - *Replace all existing replacement windows with new wood windows.*
 - *Replace existing front doors with new wood doors and side doors with new fiberglass doors.*
 - *Replace existing front porch posts and railings.*

- **19-2-2**
93 E. Fourth Ave.
Tony Capuano (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-2, 93 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Install new 6' wood privacy fence in exact location as previous privacy fence.
 - New gate to be installed to match existing fence design.Install New Privacy Fence
 - Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **19-2-3**
1142 Summit St.
JP Faulkner (Applicant)/ David A/ Sishin
Approve Application 19-2-3, 1142 Summit St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Repair/replace deteriorated wood siding on west elevation as needed to match existing and per submitted specifications.
 - Paint residence: body to be Sherwin Williams "Peppercorn" (SW7674), trim to be Sherwin Williams "Natural Choice" (SW7011), and accent to be Sherwin Williams "Tricorn Black" (SW6258).Repair/Replace Wood Siding
 - Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
 - Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
 - Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.Exterior Painting
 - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **19-2-4**

700 N. High St.

Monarch Restaurant (Applicant)/ Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve Application 19-2-4, 700 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new black fabric awnings on existing awning frames.
- Design to include “Monarch”.

- **19-2-5**

186 Warren Ave.

The Roof Detective (Applicant)

Approve Application 19-2-5, 186 Warren Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new TPO roofing membrane roof per submitted specifications. Color to be “Gray”.
- Reinstall historic clay tile, and/or replace as need to match existing in kind, like for like.

Install New TPO Roof

- Remove any/all EPDM, and/or rolled roofing down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new TPO (Thermoplastic polyolefin) single-ply roofing membrane in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings. Color to be either “Black” or “Gray”.
- Re-install any/all deteriorated and damaged roof capping from parapet wall, any required replacement capping is to match existing.

- **19-2-6**

101 E. Fourth Ave.

One Red Slate Roofing Co. (Applicant)/ Steve McCoy (Owner)

Approve Application 19-2-6, 101 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing deteriorated asphalt shingle roof.
- Install new GAF “Slateline” dimensional asphalt shingle roof per submitted specifications; color to be “Weathered Slate”.
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys and flashing; color to be “Tinner’s Red”.
- Install new gutters per submitted specifications.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
 - Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
 - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
- **19-2-7**
164 E. Third Ave.
John Chmielewski (Applicant)/ Greg Smith (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-7, 164 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Replace seven (7) deteriorated basement windows.
 - New units to be Pella Architectural Reserve aluminum-clad windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings and per submitted details.
 - **19-2-8**
66 E. Fourth Ave.
Joe Huber (Applicant)/ Valor Investments (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-8, 66 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove gravel parking area and plant grass seed in its place to create grass rear yard.
 - **19-2-9**
806 Hamlet St.
Gary Katz & Leslie Mihalov (Owners)
Approve Application 19-2-9, 806 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing rear patio and regrade yard.
 - Install new paver patio and steps per submitted drawings and specifications.
 - Install new 12’ x 16’ rough cedar pergola per submitted drawing.
 - Extend north side fence along garage to within 2’ of each side of detached garage to create new dog run.
 - **19-2-10**
86 Warren St.
J. Michael Holsinger (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-10, 86 Warren St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Paint newly constructed garage to match existing house paint scheme (COA#18-9-3).Exterior Painting
 - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
 - **19-2-11**
915 N. Fourth St.
Greg Anglin (Applicant)/ Michael Blue (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-11, 915 N. Fourth St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Paint front porch columns and ceiling; color to be Sherwin Williams “Natural Tan” (SW7567).
 - Paint front door and garage door; color to be Sherwin Williams “Rare Grey” (SW6199).Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
 - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- **19-2-12**
247 E. Third Ave.
Nicholson Builders (Applicant)/ Andy Fortener (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-12, 247 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Alter existing window opening on west elevation into entry door, including new stoop and stairway.
 - Extend existing 6-ft wood privacy fence to garage to enclose new doorway and stairs.
 - Install new 32"-tall wrought-iron fence in front yard; to be Fortin Ironworks "F5".
 - **19-2-14**
866 N. Pearl St.
Flat Black Commercial Visuals (Applicant)/ WC Properties, LLC (Owner)
Approve Application 19-2-12, 247 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Request approval to install 9'-6" x 19'-0" temporary vinyl banner for a duration of one (1) year.
 - Applicant to return to renew if longer duration is required.
 - **19-2-20**
919 N. Fourth St.
Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Laura Dunbar & Eric Hostnik (Owners)
Approve Application 19-2-20, 919 N. Fourth St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Convert existing garage into carriage house including new bathroom and kitchenette.
 - Create additional interior living space by connecting two (2) dormers; all details to match existing.
 - Existing garage was approved in 2015.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS – 4pm Commission meeting start time beginning with April 2019 IVC hearing.

XII. ADJOURNMENT - Fergus/Goodman (4-0-0) ADJOURNED. 8:19 p.m.