

**VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES  
Wednesday, February 13, 2019  
111 North Front Street – 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Hearing Room**

**Commissioners Present:** Marc Conte, Shawn Conyers, Jeffery Hissem, Lisl Kotheimer, Erin Moriarty

**Commissioners Absent:** Aaron Borchers, Jack Decker

**HPO Staff Present:** Cristin Moody

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:08 pm
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Wednesday, March 6, 2019 – 111 N. Front St. – Conf. Room 312
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Wednesday, March 13, 2019
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Wednesday, January 9, 2019, MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**1. 19-2-3**

**1025 Dennison Avenue**

**Joan Janning, Flat Black Commercial Visuals (Applicant) WC Properties, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #19-2-3, 1025 Dennison Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications noted.

Signage

- Install three (3) 6' x 6' vinyl banners on the northwest corner of the building, per submitted, revised plans and specifications.
- Banners are to remain on the building for one (1) year.

MOTION: Hissem/Kotheimer (3-2-0) APPROVED [Conte, Kotheimer opposed].

**2. 19-2-4**

**40 West Third Avenue**

**Joan Janning, Flat Black Commercial Visuals (Applicant) WC Properties, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #19-2-4, 40 West Third Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications noted.

Signage

- Install two (2) 7'-4" x 6' vinyl banner on the east elevation of the building, per submitted, revised plans and specifications.
- Banners are to remain on the building for one (1) year.

MOTION: Hissem/Kotheimer (3-2-0) APPROVED [Conte, Kotheimer opposed].



3. 19-2-5

**38 West Greenwood Avenue**

**Matt George (Applicant)**

**Rock City Church (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #19-2-5, 38 West Greenwood Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install Lights

- Install four (4) new exterior light fixtures on the north and east walls of the building to illuminate two alleys, per submitted specifications.

MOTION: Conyers/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

4. 19-2-2b

**1187 Hunter Avenue**

**Thaddeus Jones dba Condesgo (Applicant)**

**Joshua Roby dba Roby Company (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #19-2-2b, 1187 Hunter Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications noted.

Rehabilitation

- Remove rear portion of second story and rebuild, per approved plans and specifications.
- Roof on new addition is to asphalt shingle to match existing main roof, with metal ridge roll; siding, gutters and windows are to match the existing on the house and new rear door is to be a six panel fiberglass unit with a transom window.
- Remove existing deteriorated siding on the house and replace with new 5” smooth Hardie Plank siding with Hardie trim, including window, door, eave, and corner trim to match the original trim in dimensions and profile.
- Remove existing original front porch on the south side of the house as well as the non-original front porch on the front elevation. Replace with new wrap around porch with new asphalt shingle roof, 8” square wood columns and new poured concrete base and step, per submitted plans. The end of the shed roof is to have tongue and groove beaded siding.
- Remove exterior basement steps and doorway on the south elevation. Infill door opening in foundation with new concrete block to match existing; fill in hole to level ground with existing grade.
- Remove brick chimney at the rear of the main roof; cover opening with sheathing and asphalt shingle to match existing.
- Replace front entry door with new three-quarter light wood door; replace rear entry door with new half light fiberglass door. Cut sheets for both doors are to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office for final approval prior to installation.
- Revised plans are to be submitted for final review by a subcommittee composed of Commissioners Hissem, Conte and Conyers.

MOTION: Conyers/Moriarty (5-0-0) APPROVED.

5. 19-2-6

**1187 North High Street**

**David Blair, Shremshock Architects (Applicant)**

**Kevin Lykens (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #19-2-6, 1187 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Marquee/Signage

- Install new canopy over front entrance to theater with a new marquee and signage, per submitted plans and specifications and to match the size and projection of the original theater marquee as closely as possible, based on historic photographs.
- Canopy is to have 2’ x 2’ white aluminum metal ceiling panels with 4” metal trim and recessed down light fixtures.

- Marquee is have chromed accent ribs and green neon borders as well as four (4) internally-illuminated sign boxes on the front and one (1) on each side, to be used for changeable copy in the form of translucent gels to advertise performances. Opaque black gels will be installed when no advertise is needed.
- Main sign is to be a fixed 11.7 sq. ft. sign panel at the center of the marquee with a chromed accent crown.
- Replace/infill tile floor in entry alcove with new or salvaged tile.
- Replace medallions and lights over the two adjacent openings on the north and south side of the entryway. Cut sheets or photographs of the replacement fixtures are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to installation.

MOTION: Kotheimer/Conyers (5-0-0) APPROVED.

6. 19-2-7

**945-951 North High Street**

**Organic Trails, LLC/Andrew Rosenthal, GRA+D Architects (Applicant) Wood Companies (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #19-2-7, 945-951 North High Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted.

Storefront Rehabilitation

- In conjunction with restaurant expansion into neighboring commercial space, remove existing storefront windows and door at 945 and replace with new windows and door to fit the existing opening and match the existing windows and doors at 951, and to wrap the opening in stone trim to match 951.
- Install new gooseneck light fixtures above the new section of storefront, to match existing at 951.
- Remove panels below windows on the storefront at 951 and replace with new material. Replace deteriorated bases of limestone piers with new limestone to match, as necessary.
- Revised plans are to be submitted for final review by a subcommittee composed of Commissioners Kotheimer, Hissem and Conyers.

MOTION: Hissem/Conyers (5-0-0) APPROVED.

7. 19-2-8

**1231 Highland Street**

**Bradley Blumenshied, Rhythm Architecture and Design (Applicant) Peter M. Navarro (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #19-2-8, 1231 Highland Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted.

New Garage

- Construct new 20' x 20' two car frame garage at the rear of the property, per submitted, revised plans and specifications.
- Roof is to be asphalt shingle from Approved Shingles List with a metal ridge roll; siding is to be smooth 5" Hardie Plank lap siding with Hardie trim; foundation is to be split-face CMU where exposed above the grade.
- Gutters are to be 5" ogee style, metal gutters with corrugated metal downspouts.
- Garage door is to be a 16' wide, paneled steel overhead door; service door is to be a four panel wood door.
- Cut sheets for the doors and light fixtures are to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to installation.

Replace Windows

- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the main house. **Complete documentation of the existing windows to be removed is to be submitted OR a site visit assessment conducted by Historic Preservation Office staff, prior to installation of new windows.**
- Install new double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Applicant is to submit final window selection to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to installation. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved windows list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Series/Model:</u>	<u>Material:</u>
JeldWen	Siteline	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior

Marvin	Ultimate-Next Generation 2.0	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Kolbe	Ultra Series “Sterling”	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Trimline	Legend Eclipse EC300	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Lincoln	Standard Double-Hung	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Loewen	Standard Double-Hung	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Pella	Architect Series Reserve	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Quaker	Brighton LS Series	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Weathershield	Premium Series 8109	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Kolbe	Heritage	Wood Exterior/Interior
Loewen	All Wood	Wood Exterior/Interior
WeatherShield	Primed 610	Wood Exterior/Interior
Marvin	Wood Ultimate	Wood Exterior/Interior
Sierra Pacific	All Wood	Wood Exterior/Interior
Trimline	Liberty L300	Wood Exterior/Interior
JeldWen	Siteline	Wood Exterior/Interior
Pella	Architect Series Reserve	Wood Exterior/Interior
Lincoln		Wood Exterior/Interior

- Revised plans are to be submitted for final review by a subcommittee composed of Commissioners Moriarty, Conyers and Hissem.

MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

#### 8. 19-2-9

**775 North High Street**

**Brad Parish (Applicant)**

**CMH Midtown Properties, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #19-2-9, 775 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

#### Addition

- Remove existing, one-story addition on the east side of the building and construct a larger, 1,096 sq. ft., two-story addition in the same location, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Base of the addition is to be Oberfield’s Design Block with a smooth finish and “Charcoal” color (#2202).
- Second story is to be a metal vertical wall panel system with a random vertical pattern in a charcoal gray color, and with metal coping in a matte black color.
- Install aluminum storefront windows and door system on the first story of the addition, with a black anodized finish, in size and configuration as shown on submitted plans
- Install a flat metal canopy over the main entryway, to wrap around the northeast corner of the addition; color to be black.
- Install two new aluminum scupper boxes on the east elevation ; color to be charcoal gray.
- Install one hollow metal door on the north elevation in a matte black color.
- Paint existing masonry/stucco on the building; finish color is to be Sherwin Williams “Grizzle Gray” (SW 7068).
- Install a new 766 sq. ft. patio adjacent to the new addition with 6’h black aluminum fencing around the perimeter.

MOTION: Moriarty/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

### CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

#### 9. 19-2-10

**775 North High Street**

**Brad Parish (Applicant)**

**CMH Midtown Properties, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant, Commissioners present offered comments and suggestions, as summarized here:*

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners are supportive of making the parking garage floors match the height of the residential floors, so they can be converted to another use in the future, if the full three floors of parking become unnecessary.
- The overall height was a concern; Commissioners suggested that closer to 100' would be better than 130' and referred to the new building at Hubbard Park Place as a good guide for height and massing. This project may need some upper level setbacks as well.
- A concern was also noted that this block is getting very dense; a massing model for the entire block would be helpful to see. The orientation of the building is good, but Commissioners will need to get a better feel for the context and how it will impact the surrounding area.
- More details will also be needed about what will happen at ground level and the traffic patterns around the site.

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 8 story residential building with parking garage over the existing two-story building, for a total of 10 stories.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

**10. 19-2-11**

**196 West Fourth Avenue**

**Steven & Vivian Stofflet (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant, Commissioners present offered comments and suggestions, as summarized here:*

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners noted that the proportions of the paneled siding should be match on both sides of the addition, and on the rear elevation, the door can be shifted off center to make the panels similar in proportion to the sides.
- The handrail on the stoop should be a simple wrought iron railing.
- A single light fixture on one side of the door would be more appropriate.

Conceptual Review

- Construct new mudroom addition on the rear of the existing two-story house, per submitted plans.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

**11. 19-2-12**

**172-174 Buttles Avenue**

**Gary J. Alexander, Architect (Applicant)**

**Adam Sommer, EDS Sommer Properties (Owner)**

*Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant, Commissioners present offered comments and suggestions, as summarized here:*

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners noted that there were too many materials shown. The siding should be all one material, or possibly brick on the lower one third and one type of siding on the top two-thirds, which would be in keeping with the main architectural style of the house.
- The proposed massing is not an issue, although the large scale could be reduced visually with the exterior material suggestions.

Conceptual Review

- Construct a new two-story, three car carriage house at the rear of the property, per submitted plans.
- Carriage house is to have an apartment on the second story and parking for three cars on the first.
- Variances will be required.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

**STAFF APPROVALS**

• **19-2-1**

**940 Neil Avenue**

**Arrow Roofing, Inc. (Applicant)**

**Leonora Fix (Owner)**

Approve Application #19-2-1, 940 Neil Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be the following from the approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
[ ] Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	[ ] Estate Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and VentSure Inflow vents at the ends of the eaves on the front and side, per submitted roof plan and specifications.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Kotheimer/Conyers (5-0-0) APPROVED.

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

**XII. ADJOURNMENT– Conyers/Kotheimer (5-0-0) ADJOURNED 8:25 pm.**