BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS
MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

Regular Meeting

Grady L. Pettigrew
President, Presiding

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

Monday, March 25, 2019
12:57 p.m.
City of Columbus
Civil Service Commission
77 North Front Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215

TRACI E. PEOPLES
PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER

ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
1421 West Third Avenue
Columbus, Ohio 43212
(614) 326-0177
COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:
Grady L. Pettigrew, President
Stefanie L. Coe

PRESENTERS:
Richard Cherry
Beth Dyke
Carol Lagemann
Charday Litzy-Taylor

ALSO PRESENT:
Angela Bennett
MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
March 25, 2019
12:57 p.m.

- - -

PROCEDINGS

BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 25th day of March, 2019, the Municipal Civil Service Commission came for a regular meeting, Grady L. Pettigrew, President. And, the parties appearing in person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth, the following proceedings were had:

- - -

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I'll call to order the City of Columbus Municipal Civil Service Commission Regular Meeting for March 2019. We will be following the written agenda for today.

And the first item is review and approval of the minutes of the February 25, 2019, regular meeting.

MS. COE: I move to approve the minutes from the February 25, 2019, regular meeting.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: The minutes are approved. No items under 2, 3 -- 2 or 3.

Item No. 4 is the review and approval the findings and recommendations of the Trial Board hearing on Wednesday, November 28, 2018, at 9:00 a.m., Nikita Cummings v. Columbus City Schools, Secretary II, discharged, Appeal No. 18-BA-0004.

MS. COE: I move to support the Trial Board recommendations for review of the -- of the Trial Board hearing held on November 28, 2018, at 9:00 a.m., Nikita Cummings v. Columbus City Schools, Secretary II, discharged, Appeal No. 18-BA-0004.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Okay. Items No. 5 through 10 are to be joined together; is that correct?

MS. DYKE: Yes.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

Item No. 5, a request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification
Recreation Parks Assistant Director, with no revisions;
Item No. 6, the classification Utility Collection Specialist, with no revisions;
Item No. 7, the classification Property Maintenance Inspection Trainee, with no revisions;
Item No. 8, the classification Fingerprint Technician Trainee, with no revisions;
Item No. 9, the classification Machinist, with no revisions; and,
Item No. 10, the classification Sewer Telemonitoring Operator, with no revisions.

MS. DYKE: Beth Dyke, Personnel Analyst with the Civil Service Commission.

The review of the classifications for Items 5 through 10 is part of the Civil Service Commission's effort to review all classifications every five years. Based on feedback received, it was determined that the current specifications still accurately reflect the work being performed. It is recommended that the specifications be approved with no revisions.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the
Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Recreation and Parks Assistant Director, with no revisions; as well as Utility Collection Specialist, with no revisions; Property Maintenance Inspection Trainee, with no revisions; Fingerprint Technician Trainee, with no revisions; Machinist, with no revisions; and Sewer Telemonitoring Operator, with no revisions.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

Item Nos. 11 through 13 will be joined together.

Item 11, of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Property Maintenance Inspector;

Item No. 12 is the classification Property Maintenance Inspection Specialist; and,

Item No. 13 is Property Maintenance Inspection Supervisor.

MS. DYKE: The review of these classifications is part of the Civil Service
Commission's effort to review all classifications every five years. There are several changes proposed within the "Examples of Work" sections of each classification. Overall, the changes proposed are intended to generalize the statements throughout the class series. By doing so, the specifications maintain functionality without losing accuracy, which may occur as specialized programs or initiatives expire.

To maintain consistency throughout the classification series, a statement from the Property Maintenance Inspector specification regarding the most frequently used special equipment is proposed to be added to each of the specifications within the series as the incumbents continue to utilize such equipment.

Lastly, there are some minor revisions in addition being proposed to the "Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities" sections. In order to maintain consistency throughout the class series, the recommendations will further highlight the preferred abilities associated with the current duties.
There are no other proposed revisions at this time.

MS. COE:  Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specifications for the classification Property Maintenance Inspector, as well as Property Maintenance Inspection Specialist and Property Maintenance Inspection Supervisor.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW:  Second.

All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS:  Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW:  They are approved.

Item Nos. 14 through 16 will be joined together.

Item No. 14, request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Electric Metering Supervisor I;

Item No. 15 is Electric Meter Reading Supervisor II; and,

16 is Electric Meter Technician.

MS. DYKE:  The review of these classifications is again part of the Civil Service Commission's effort to review all classifications
every five years.

In regards to the Electric Meter Technician and Electric Metering Supervisor I specifications, it is proposed to remove the "Examples of Work" statement referencing work on energized lines up to 1,000 volts. Instead, it is recommended that the current and potential transformers are added to the statement regarding the testing of voltage, phase and polarity. This revision is proposed to better exemplify the various voltages associated with their work.

Additionally, with the Electric Meter Technician specification, it is proposed to add updated terminology within several of the "Examples of Work" statements to more accurately describe the duties being performed.

Within the "Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities" section, minor revisions are updated -- are proposed to update the wording of some "Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities" statements for the Electric Meter Technician and the Electric Metering Supervisor I specification.

Lastly, to maintain consistency throughout the class series, it is proposed to
remove the "Guidelines for Class Use" section from the Electric Metering Supervisor II specification.

There are no other proposed revisions at this time.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Electric Metering Supervisor I, as well as Electric Metering Supervisor II, and Electric Metering Technician.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

Item No. 17 is a request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create a specification for the classification Ethics and Campaign Finance Administrator, assign a probationary period of 365 days, designate the examination type as noncompetitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly.

MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II with Civil Service, presenting on behalf of Tammy Rollins for this one.

The Civil Service Commission staff is
requesting the creation of an Ethics and Campaign Finance Administrator in response to City Ordinance 3386-2018 that was passed by City Council earlier this year. This classification will be utilized within the Office of Ethics and Campaign Finance in the City Clerk's Office.

This proposed classification would have as its primary responsibility the oversight administration of all ethics and campaign finance laws that are applicable to the City of Columbus. The recently passed ordinance speaks directly to several new campaign finance laws that serve to encourage a more transparent and accountable municipal campaign and to prevent dark money from influencing municipal races.

Further conversations suggest that the City would benefit from having a position, in addition to administering campaign finance laws, that are also responsible for administering ethics-related laws and programs for the City of Columbus.

The proposed classification would serve this dual purpose, as indicated in the definition, which states they are responsible for ensuring legal
compliance with all ethics and campaign finance laws applicable to City of Columbus elected officials, municipal candidates, candidate committees and city employees.

Per specific language included in City Code, the proposed class would reside within the City Clerk's office. And per the same language in the code, it would be included as part of the classified service and, therefore, covered by Civil Service rules.

Examples of work were developed based on City Code language and similar positions from other jurisdictions and also some general information received pertaining to how this classification would perform within the City.

The "Guidelines for Class Use" is proposed to clarify that it is a single position classification contained within the City Clerk's Office of City Council.

And, based on projected knowledge, skills and abilities that would be needed to perform the Ethics and Campaign Finance Administrator and other jobs of similar title in other jurisdictions, it is proposed the minimum qualifications require
possession of a juris doctor from an ABA accredited law school and three years of experience providing ethics advice, reviewing or analyzing financial disclosure reports, conducting ethics training, or consulting on ethics-related issues.

There are no proposed substitutions in the minimum qualifications.

"Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" were developed based on content of the proposed specifications.

The exam type would be designated as noncompetitive, per Commission policies regarding single-position classifications and based on exceptional qualifications necessary for job performance.

The probationary period will be designated as 365 days, as is consistent with both the learning time for the classification and other jobs with similar complexity.

The class will be assigned to the administrative job family and general administration group. And the EEO/DOJ job category will be professional.

And in the NEOGOV system, the job
interest category is best aligned with executive management and legal.

It is therefore recommended that the classification Ethics and Campaign Finance Administrator be created as proposed and Rule XI be amended accordingly.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Has the term "dark money" been defined?

MS. LAGEMANN: It is in the legislation, I believe. Yes. It's in the campaign finance legislation. The first paragraph talks about "an effort to encourage more transparent and accountable municipal political campaigns. New laws are designed to prevent dark money campaigns funds from influencing municipal races."

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: So is it, in essence, from donors who have not been identified or organizations where the donors are not identified?

MS. LAGEMANN: Yes. They -- Oh, here it is: "In 2018, Mayor Ginther, in cooperation with Council President Shannon Hardin, directed City staff to research and recommend regulation of 'dark money,' as well as the City's first limits on the amounts and sources of campaign contributions" --
"establishing limits."
Oh, "Research also highlighted the alarming proliferation of dark money, super PACs and independent expenditure campaigns after the Citizens United decision by the United States Supreme Court. The sources behind most of the money raised by candidates and political groups are publicly disclosed. When the source of political money is hidden from disclosure, that is considered dark money."

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. All right.

Thank you.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create the specification for the classification Ethics and Campaign Finance Administrator, assign a probationary period of 365 days, designate the examination type as noncompetitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.
Item No. 18 is the request of the Civil Service Commission Staff to revise the specification for the classification Deputy City Auditor.

MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II, with Civil Service Commission, again presenting on behalf of Tammy Rollins.

While revisions to this classification were made in November of 2018 as part of a five-year review, the City Auditor requested additional changes.

It was requested that the definition be clearly noted to reflect that the Deputy Auditor works under the direction of the City Auditor. This should, in fact, always be the reporting relationship and, therefore, has been incorporated.

Within the "Examples of Work" section, there are a few more revisions proposed that are intended to be more descriptive as to the organizational responsibilities charged to the City Auditor's Office and specifically the role and expectations for the Deputy with regard to these overall responsibilities.

There are no other changes proposed; therefore, it is recommended that the Deputy City
Auditor classification be revised as proposed.

  MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Deputy City Auditor.

  PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

  All in favor, say "aye."

  THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

  PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Item Nos. 19, 20 and 21 will be joined together.

No. 19, request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Public Utilities Division Assistant Administrator;

  20, the classification Infrastructure Management Division Administrator; and,

  21, the classification Citywide Occupational Safety and Health Manager.

  MS. LAGEMANN: The review of these classifications was completed as part of our effort to review all classifications every five years.

Despite being in three different departments,
proposed updates for all three classifications were largely within the "Examples of Work" section. They are simply refining or better representing the work that may be performed by the classification.

Within only the Infrastructure Management Division Administrator's "Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities," there is an ability proposed to direct and coordinate the work efforts of personnel in geographically separate facilities.

And within only the Citywide Occupational Safety and Health Manager, there is an acronym that is fixed.

There are no other revisions proposed to the classifications.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classifications Public Utilities Division Assistant Administrator, as well as Infrastructure Management Division Administrator and Citywide Occupational Safety and Health Manager.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor, say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
19

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

Item No. 22 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to amend Rule XI per the abolished classification of Downtown Development Administrator Coordinator.

MS. LAGEMANN: This classification abolishment for Downtown Development Administrative Coordinator was presented at the February 25, 2019, commission meeting without requesting Rule XI be amended accordingly. By virtue of this action, we propose to now amend Rule XI accordingly to reflect the abolishment.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to amend Rule XI per the abolished classification of Downtown Development Administrator Coordinator.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Item No. 23, request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Compensation Manager.
MS. LAGEMANN: The review of this classification was completed as part of our effort to review all classifications every five years. Within the "Examples of Work" section, the addition of two new statements and deletion of one statement are proposed to better represent the work that may be performed by the classification. Removing spaces from the organization's name of WorldatWork is fixed in the "Minimum Qualifications" to match the branding of that organization. There are no other revisions proposed.

MS. COE: Thank you. I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Compensation Manager.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second. All in favor say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved. Item No. 24 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Management Division
MR. CHERRY: Good afternoon. Richard Cherry, Personnel Analyst with the Civil Service Commission.

I'm reviewing -- Both of these classifications I'm reviewing today as part of the Civil Service's efforts to review all classifications every five years.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Do you want them joined?

MR. CHERRY: No.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay.

MR. CHERRY: The Traffic Management Division Administrator, one thing we're revising is the "Examples of Work" section. We are eliminating duties that are no longer performed and modifying one other one.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Management Division Administrator.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor say "aye."
THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

MR. CHERRY: Do you want to read the next one?

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, go to the classification Traffic Paint and Sign Worker.

MR. CHERRY: Yes. Again, we're reviewing these every five years.

On the "Examples of Work" section, we are adding one example of work that talks about "installs, repairs and removes raised curbing, channeling systems and ground-mounted traffic flex posts." Those are those temporary curbs you might see in the street and posts that lean over back and forth. They install those.

And, also, in the "Minimum Qualifications" section, we want to eliminate referring to qualifying experience as a -- as specific city job titles, because those do frequently change. So instead of doing that, we want the experience to be laid out. So we revised those sections to actually lay out the type of experience needed instead of just listing city titles.
MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Paint and Sign Worker.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Items 26 and 27 will be joined together.

Item 26 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Fingerprint Technician; and, 27 is the classification Fingerprint Technician Supervisor.

MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Charday Litzy-Taylor, Personnel Analyst with the Commission.

The review of these classifications is part of the Civil Service Commission's effort to review all classifications every five years.

Two minor revisions are proposed to the "Examples of Work" section for Fingerprint Technician to better reflect the work being performed.
Since Fingerprint Technician Supervisors must access the LEADS BCI database on a regular basis, it is proposed that the minimum qualifications require the LEADS BCI certification upon completion of the probationary period. This allows time for the incumbent -- for incumbents coming from agencies outside of the City to obtain the certification.

There are no other changes proposed at this time.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classifications Fingerprint Technician, as well as Fingerprint Technician Supervisor.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

Item No. 28 is the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to reallocate designated positions currently classified as Recreation Program Specialist and Recreation Program Assistant to
Rental Services Supervisor and to allow the affected employees to retain their current classification status and seniority.

MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: In May 2018, the Civil Service Commission approved a request to create the Rental Services Supervisor classification as requested by the Recreation and Parks Department. Prior, the department had been using the Recreation Program Specialist and Recreation Program Assistant classifications to supervise rental service staff and oversee and monitor a variety of rental services -- I'm sorry, rental facilities. However, neither of these classifications work particularly well.

Now that pay and bargaining unit have been assigned, it is proposed that the four positions identified in the rental services section that have been performing rental services supervisory duties be reallocated to the new classification. It is further requested that these employees retain their classification, seniority and status upon reallocation. The affected employees are: Jesse Oddi III, Recreation Program Specialist;
Kelly Price, Recreation Program Assistant; Thomas Davis, Recreation Program Assistant; and Frederick Hall, Recreation Program Assistant.

MS. COE: Thank you.

I move to support the request of the Civil Service Commission Staff to reallocate designated positions currently classified as Recreation Program Specialist and Recreation Program Assistant to Rental Services Supervisor and to allow the affected employees to retain their current classification, status and seniority.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

All in favor say "aye."

THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

The remaining items for today are the background removals.

Applications removed post-examination:
Sean Baltimore, do not reinstate;
Brett Oxley, do not reinstate.
Robert Holmes, reinstate.

And as to the letter for Stacey James, it is okay and proved.

And with that, we are adjourned for the
day.

And, thereupon, the meeting was concluded at approximately 1:20 p.m.
C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 25th day of March, 2019, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 1:20 p.m.

***

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

Date