

1 BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS
2 MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

3 - - -

4

5 In the Matter of:

6 Regular Meeting

7 - - -

8 Grady L. Pettigrew

9 President, Presiding

10 - - -

11 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

12 - - -

13

14 Monday, March 25, 2019
15 12:57 p.m.
16 City of Columbus
17 Civil Service Commission
18 77 North Front Street
19 Columbus, Ohio 43215

20 - - -

21 TRACI E. PEOPLES
22 PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER

23 - - -

24

25 ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
26 1421 West Third Avenue
27 Columbus, Ohio 43212
28 (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President
3 Stefanie L. Coe

3

PRESENTERS:

4

 Richard Cherry
5 Beth Dyke
 Carol Lagemann
6 Charday Litzy-Taylor

7 ALSO PRESENT:

8 Angela Bennett

9

- - -

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
2 March 25, 2019
3 12:57 p.m.

3 - - -

4 P R O C E E D I N G S

5 - - -

6 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 25th day of
7 March, 2019, the Municipal Civil Service Commission
8 came for a regular meeting, Grady L. Pettigrew,
9 President. And, the parties appearing in person
10 and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth, the
11 following proceedings were had:

12 - - -

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I'll call to order
14 the City of Columbus Municipal Civil Service
15 Commission Regular Meeting for March 2019. We will
16 be following the written agenda for today.

17 And the first item is review and approval
18 of the minutes of the February 25, 2019, regular
19 meeting.

20 MS. COE: I move to approve the minutes
21 from the February 25, 2019, regular meeting.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

23 All in favor, say "aye."

24 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: The minutes are
2 approved.

3 No items under 2, 3 -- 2 or 3.

4 Item No. 4 is the review and approval the
5 findings and recommendations of the Trial Board
6 hearing on Wednesday, November 28, 2018, at
7 9:00 a.m., Nikita Cummings v. Columbus City Schools,
8 Secretary II, discharged, Appeal No. 18-BA-0004.

9 MS. COE: I move to support the Trial
10 Board recommendations for review of the -- of the
11 Trial Board hearing held on November 28, 2018, at
12 9:00 a.m., Nikita Cummings v. Columbus City Schools,
13 Secretary II, discharged, Appeal No. 18-BA-0004.

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

15 All in favor, say "aye."

16 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

17 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

18 Okay. Items No. 5 through 10 are to be
19 joined together; is that correct?

20 MS. DYKE: Yes.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

22 Item No. 5, a request of the Civil
23 Service Commission staff to approve the
24 specification review for the classification

1 Recreation Parks Assistant Director, with no
2 revisions;

3 Item No. 6, the classification Utility
4 Collection Specialist, with no revisions;

5 Item No. 7, the classification Property
6 Maintenance Inspection Trainee, with no revisions;

7 Item No. 8, the classification
8 Fingerprint Technician Trainee, with no revisions;

9 Item No. 9, the classification Machinist,
10 with no revisions; and,

11 Item No. 10, the classification Sewer
12 Telemonitoring Operator, with no revisions.

13 MS. DYKE: Beth Dyke, Personnel Analyst
14 with the Civil Service Commission.

15 The review of the classifications for
16 Items 5 through 10 is part of the Civil Service
17 Commission's effort to review all classifications
18 every five years. Based on feedback received, it
19 was determined that the current specifications still
20 accurately reflect the work being performed. It is
21 recommended that the specifications be approved with
22 no revisions.

23 MS. COE: Thank you.

24 I move to support the request of the

1 Civil Service Commission staff to approve the
2 specification review for the classification
3 Recreation and Parks Assistant Director, with no
4 revisions; as well as Utility Collection Specialist,
5 with no revisions; Property Maintenance Inspection
6 Trainee, with no revisions; Fingerprint Technician
7 Trainee, with no revisions; Machinist, with no
8 revisions; and Sewer Telemonitoring Operator, with
9 no revisions.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

11 All in favor, say "aye."

12 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

14 Item Nos. 11 through 13 will be joined
15 together.

16 Item 11, of the Civil Service Commission
17 staff to revise the specification for the
18 classification Property Maintenance Inspector;

19 Item No. 12 is the classification

20 Property Maintenance Inspection Specialist; and,

21 Item No. 13 is Property Maintenance

22 Inspection Supervisor.

23 MS. DYKE: The review of these

24 classifications is part of the Civil Service

1 Commission's effort to review all classifications
2 every five years.

3 There are several changes proposed within
4 the "Examples of Work" sections of each
5 classification.

6 Overall, the changes proposed are
7 intended to generalize the statements throughout the
8 class series. By doing so, the specifications
9 maintain functionality without losing accuracy,
10 which may occur as specialized programs or
11 initiatives expire.

12 To maintain consistency throughout the
13 classification series, a statement from the Property
14 Maintenance Inspector specification regarding the
15 most frequently used special equipment is proposed
16 to be added to each of the specifications within the
17 series as the incumbents continue to utilize such
18 equipment.

19 Lastly, there are some minor revisions in
20 addition being proposed to the "Knowledge, Skills,
21 and Abilities" sections. In order to maintain
22 consistency throughout the class series, the
23 recommendations will further highlight the preferred
24 abilities associated with the current duties.

1 There are no other proposed revisions at
2 this time.

3 MS. COE: Thank you.

4 I move to support the request of the
5 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
6 specifications for the classification Property
7 Maintenance Inspector, as well as Property
8 Maintenance Inspection Specialist and Property
9 Maintenance Inspection Supervisor.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

11 All in favor, say "aye."

12 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

14 Item Nos. 14 through 16 will be joined
15 together.

16 Item No. 14, request of the Civil Service
17 Commission staff to revise the specification for the
18 classification Electric Metering Supervisor I;

19 Item No. 15 is Electric Meter Reading
20 Supervisor II; and,

21 16 is Electric Meter Technician.

22 MS. DYKE: The review of these
23 classifications is again part of the Civil Service
24 Commission's effort to review all classifications

1 every five years.

2 In regards to the Electric Meter
3 Technician and Electric Metering Supervisor I
4 specifications, it is proposed to remove the
5 "Examples of Work" statement referencing work on
6 energized lines up to 1,000 volts. Instead, it is
7 recommended that the current and potential
8 transformers are added to the statement regarding
9 the testing of voltage, phase and polarity. This
10 revision is proposed to better exemplify the various
11 voltages associated with their work.

12 Additionally, with the Electric Meter
13 Technician specification, it is proposed to add
14 updated terminology within several of the "Examples
15 of Work" statements to more accurately describe the
16 duties being performed.

17 Within the "Knowledge, Skills, and
18 Abilities" section, minor revisions are updated --
19 are proposed to update the wording of some
20 "Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities" statements for
21 the Electric Meter Technician and the Electric
22 Metering Supervisor I specification.

23 Lastly, to maintain consistency
24 throughout the class series, it is proposed to

1 remove the "Guidelines for Class Use" section from
2 the Electric Metering Supervisor II specification.

3 There are no other proposed revisions at
4 this time.

5 MS. COE: Thank you.

6 I move to support the request of the
7 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
8 specification for the classification Electric
9 Metering Supervisor I, as well as Electric Metering
10 Supervisor II, and Electric Metering Technician.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

12 All in favor, say "aye."

13 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

15 Item No. 17 is a request of the Civil
16 Service Commission staff to create a specification
17 for the classification Ethics and Campaign Finance
18 Administrator, assign a probationary period of 365
19 days, designate the examination type as
20 noncompetitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly.

21 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel
22 Analyst II with Civil Service, presenting on behalf
23 of Tammy Rollins for this one.

24 The Civil Service Commission staff is

1 requesting the creation of an Ethics and Campaign
2 Finance Administrator in response to City Ordinance
3 3386-2018 that was passed by City Council earlier
4 this year. This classification will be utilized
5 within the Office of Ethics and Campaign Finance in
6 the City Clerk's Office.

7 This proposed classification would have
8 as its primary responsibility the oversight
9 administration of all ethics and campaign finance
10 laws that are applicable to the City of Columbus.
11 The recently passed ordinance speaks directly to
12 several new campaign finance laws that serve to
13 encourage a more transparent and accountable
14 municipal campaign and to prevent dark money from
15 influencing municipal races.

16 Further conversations suggest that the
17 City would benefit from having a position, in
18 addition to administering campaign finance laws,
19 that are also responsible for administering
20 ethics-related laws and programs for the City of
21 Columbus.

22 The proposed classification would serve
23 this dual purpose, as indicated in the definition,
24 which states they are responsible for ensuring legal

1 compliance with all ethics and campaign finance laws
2 applicable to City of Columbus elected officials,
3 municipal candidates, candidate committees and city
4 employees.

5 Per specific language included in City
6 Code, the proposed class would reside within the
7 City Clerk's office. And per the same language in
8 the code, it would be included as part of the
9 classified service and, therefore, covered by Civil
10 Service rules.

11 Examples of work were developed based on
12 City Code language and similar positions from other
13 jurisdictions and also some general information
14 received pertaining to how this classification would
15 perform within the City.

16 The "Guidelines for Class Use" is
17 proposed to clarify that it is a single position
18 classification contained within the City Clerk's
19 Office of City Council.

20 And, based on projected knowledge, skills
21 and abilities that would be needed to perform the
22 Ethics and Campaign Finance Administrator and other
23 jobs of similar title in other jurisdictions, it is
24 proposed the minimum qualifications require

1 possession of a juris doctor from an ABA accredited
2 law school and three years of experience providing
3 ethics advice, reviewing or analyzing financial
4 disclosure reports, conducting ethics training, or
5 consulting on ethics-related issues.

6 There are no proposed substitutions in
7 the minimum qualifications.

8 "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" were
9 developed based on content of the proposed
10 specifications.

11 The exam type would be designated as
12 noncompetitive, per Commission policies regarding
13 single-position classifications and based on
14 exceptional qualifications necessary for job
15 performance.

16 The probationary period will be
17 designated as 365 days, as is consistent with both
18 the learning time for the classification and other
19 jobs with similar complexity.

20 The class will be assigned to the
21 administrative job family and general administration
22 group. And the EEO/DOJ job category will be
23 professional.

24 And in the NEOGOV system, the job

1 interest category is best aligned with executive
2 management and legal.

3 It is therefore recommended that the
4 classification Ethics and Campaign Finance
5 Administrator be created as proposed and Rule XI be
6 amended accordingly.

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Has the term "dark
8 money" been defined?

9 MS. LAGEMANN: It is in the legislation,
10 I believe. Yes. It's in the campaign finance
11 legislation. The first paragraph talks about "an
12 effort to encourage more transparent and accountable
13 municipal political campaigns. New laws are
14 designed to prevent dark money campaigns funds from
15 influencing municipal races."

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: So is it, in
17 essence, from donors who have not been identified or
18 organizations where the donors are not identified?

19 MS. LAGEMANN: Yes. They -- Oh, here it
20 is: "In 2018, Mayor Ginther, in cooperation with
21 Council President Shannon Hardin, directed City
22 staff to research and recommend regulation of 'dark
23 money,' as well as the City's first limits on the
24 amounts and sources of campaign contributions" --

1 "establishing limits."

2 Oh, "Research also highlighted the
3 alarming proliferation of dark money, super PACs and
4 independent expenditure campaigns after the Citizens
5 United decision by the United States Supreme Court.
6 The sources behind most of the money raised by
7 candidates and political groups are publicly
8 disclosed. When the source of political money is
9 hidden from disclosure, that is considered dark
10 money."

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. All right.
12 Thank you.

13 MS. COE: Thank you.

14 I move to support the request of the
15 Civil Service Commission staff to create the
16 specification for the classification Ethics and
17 Campaign Finance Administrator, assign a
18 probationary period of 365 days, designate the
19 examination type as noncompetitive, and amend
20 Rule XI accordingly.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

22 All in favor, say "aye."

23 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

1 Item No. 18 is the request of the Civil
2 Service Commission Staff to revise the specification
3 for the classification Deputy City Auditor.

4 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel
5 Analyst II, with Civil Service Commission, again
6 presenting on behalf of Tammy Rollins.

7 While revisions to this classification
8 were made in November of 2018 as part of a five-year
9 review, the City Auditor requested additional
10 changes.

11 It was requested that the definition be
12 clearly noted to reflect that the Deputy Auditor
13 works under the direction of the City Auditor. This
14 should, in fact, always be the reporting
15 relationship and, therefore, has been incorporated.

16 Within the "Examples of Work" section,
17 there are a few more revisions proposed that are
18 intended to be more descriptive as to the
19 organizational responsibilities charged to the City
20 Auditor's Office and specifically the role and
21 expectations for the Deputy with regard to these
22 overall responsibilities.

23 There are no other changes proposed;
24 therefore, it is recommended that the Deputy City

1 Auditor classification be revised as proposed.

2 MS. COE: Thank you.

3 I move to support the request of the
4 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
5 specification for the classification Deputy City
6 Auditor.

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

8 All in favor, say "aye."

9 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

11 Item Nos. 19, 20 and 21 will be joined
12 together.

13 No. 19, request of the Civil Service
14 Commission staff to revise the specification for the
15 classification Public Utilities Division Assistant
16 Administrator;

17 20, the classification Infrastructure
18 Management Division Administrator; and,

19 21, the classification Citywide
20 Occupational Safety and Health Manager.

21 MS. LAGEMANN: The review of these
22 classifications was completed as part of our effort
23 to review all classifications every five years.
24 Despite being in three different departments,

1 proposed updates for all three classifications were
2 largely within the "Examples of Work" section. They
3 are simply refining or better representing the work
4 that may be performed by the classification.

5 Within only the Infrastructure Management
6 Division Administrator's "Knowledge, Skills, and
7 Abilities," there is an ability proposed to direct
8 and coordinate the work efforts of personnel in
9 geographically separate facilities.

10 And within only the Citywide Occupational
11 Safety and Health Manager, there is an acronym that
12 is fixed.

13 There are no other revisions proposed to
14 the classifications.

15 MS. COE: Thank you.

16 I move to support the request of the
17 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
18 specification for the classifications Public
19 Utilities Division Assistant Administrator, as well
20 as Infrastructure Management Division Administrator
21 and Citywide Occupational Safety and Health Manager.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

23 All in favor, say "aye."

24 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

2 Item No. 22 is the request of the Civil
3 Service Commission staff to amend Rule XI per the
4 abolished classification of Downtown Development
5 Administrator Coordinator.

6 MS. LAGEMANN: This classification
7 abolishment for Downtown Development Administrative
8 Coordinator was presented at the February 25, 2019,
9 commission meeting without requesting Rule XI be
10 amended accordingly. By virtue of this action, we
11 propose to now amend Rule XI accordingly to reflect
12 the abolishment.

13 MS. COE: Thank you.

14 I move to support the request of the
15 Civil Service Commission staff to amend Rule XI per
16 the abolished classification of Downtown Development
17 Administrator Coordinator.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

19 All in favor say "aye."

20 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

22 Item No. 23, request of the Civil Service
23 Commission staff to revise the specification for the
24 classification Compensation Manager.

1 MS. LAGEMANN: The review of this
2 classification was completed as part of our effort
3 to review all classifications every five years.

4 Within the "Examples of Work" section,
5 the addition of two new statements and deletion of
6 one statement are proposed to better represent the
7 work that may be performed by the classification.

8 Removing spaces from the organization's
9 name of WorlDatWork is fixed in the "Minimum
10 Qualifications" to match the branding of that
11 organization.

12 There are no other revisions proposed.

13 MS. COE: Thank you.

14 I move to support the request of the
15 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
16 specification for the classification Compensation
17 Manager.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

19 All in favor say "aye."

20 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

22 Item No. 24 is the request of the Civil
23 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
24 for the classification Traffic Management Division

1 Administrator.

2 MR. CHERRY: Good afternoon. Richard
3 Cherry, Personnel Analyst with the Civil Service
4 Commission.

5 I'm reviewing -- Both of these
6 classifications I'm reviewing today as part of the
7 Civil Service's efforts to review all
8 classifications every five years.

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Do you want them
10 joined?

11 MR. CHERRY: No.

12 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay.

13 MR. CHERRY: The Traffic Management
14 Division Administrator, one thing we're revising is
15 the "Examples of Work" section. We are eliminating
16 duties that are no longer performed and modifying
17 one other one.

18 MS. COE: Thank you.

19 I move to support the request of the
20 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
21 specification for the classification Traffic
22 Management Division Administrator.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

24 All in favor say "aye."

1 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

2 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

3 MR. CHERRY: Do you want to read the next
4 one?

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, go to the
6 classification Traffic Paint and Sign Worker.

7 MR. CHERRY: Yes. Again, we're reviewing
8 these every five years.

9 On the "Examples of Work" section, we are
10 adding one example of work that talks about
11 "installs, repairs and removes raised curbing,
12 channeling systems and ground-mounted traffic flex
13 posts." Those are those temporary curbs you might
14 see in the street and posts that lean over back and
15 forth. They install those.

16 And, also, in the "Minimum
17 Qualifications" section, we want to eliminate
18 referring to qualifying experience as a -- as
19 specific city job titles, because those do
20 frequently change. So instead of doing that, we
21 want the experience to be laid out. So we revised
22 those sections to actually lay out the type of
23 experience needed instead of just listing city
24 titles.

1 MS. COE: Thank you.

2 I move to support the request of the
3 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
4 specification for the classification Traffic Paint
5 and Sign Worker.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

7 All in favor say "aye."

8 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

10 Items 26 and 27 will be joined together.

11 Item 26 is the request of the Civil
12 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
13 for the classification Fingerprint Technician; and,
14 27 is the classification Fingerprint
15 Technician Supervisor.

16 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Charday Litzy-Taylor,
17 Personnel Analyst with the Commission.

18 The review of these classifications is
19 part of the Civil Service Commission's effort to
20 review all classifications every five years.

21 Two minor revisions are proposed to the
22 "Examples of Work" section for Fingerprint
23 Technician to better reflect the work being
24 performed.

1 Since Fingerprint Technician Supervisors
2 must access the LEADS BCI database on a regular
3 basis, it is proposed that the minimum
4 qualifications require the LEADS BCI certification
5 upon completion of the probationary period. This
6 allows time for the incumbent -- for incumbents
7 coming from agencies outside of the City to obtain
8 the certification.

9 There are no other changes proposed at
10 this time.

11 MS. COE: Thank you.

12 I move to support the request of the
13 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
14 specification for the classifications Fingerprint
15 Technician, as well as Fingerprint Technician
16 Supervisor.

17 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

18 All in favor say "aye."

19 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

20 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

21 Item No. 28 is the request of the Civil
22 Service Commission staff to reallocate designated
23 positions currently classified as Recreation Program
24 Specialist and Recreation Program Assistant to

25

1 Rental Services Supervisor and to allow the affected
2 employees to retain their current classification
3 status and seniority.

4 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: In May 2018, the Civil
5 Service Commission approved a request to create the
6 Rental Services Supervisor classification as
7 requested by the Recreation and Parks Department.
8 Prior, the department had been using the Recreation
9 Program Specialist and Recreation Program Assistant
10 classifications to supervise rental service staff
11 and oversee and monitor a variety of rental
12 services -- I'm sorry, rental facilities. However,
13 neither of these classifications work particularly
14 well.

15 Now that pay and bargaining unit have
16 been assigned, it is proposed that the four
17 positions identified in the rental services section
18 that have been performing rental services
19 supervisory duties be reallocated to the new
20 classification.

21 It is further requested that these
22 employees retain their classification, seniority and
23 status upon reallocation. The affected employees
24 are: Jesse Oddi III, Recreation Program Specialist;

1 Kelly Price, Recreation Program Assistant; Thomas
2 Davis, Recreation Program Assistant; and Frederick
3 Hall, Recreation Program Assistant.

4 MS. COE: Thank you.

5 I move to support the request of the
6 Civil Service Commission Staff to reallocate
7 designated positions currently classified as
8 Recreation Program Specialist and Recreation Program
9 Assistant to Rental Services Supervisor and to allow
10 the affected employees to retain their current
11 classification, status and seniority.

12 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

13 All in favor say "aye."

14 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

16 The remaining items for today are the
17 background removals.

18 Applications removed post-examination:

19 Sean Baltimore, do not reinstate;

20 Brett Oxley, do not reinstate.

21 Robert Holmes, reinstate.

22 And as to the letter for Stacey James, it
23 is okay and proved.

24 And with that, we are adjourned for the

1 day.

2 - - -

3 And, thereupon, the meeting was

4 concluded at approximately 1:20 p.m.

5 - - -

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 25th day of March, 2019, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 1:20 p.m.

* * *

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

Date