

1 BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS
2 MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

3 - - -

4

5 In the Matter of:

6 Regular Meeting

7 - - -

8 Grady L. Pettigrew

9 President, Presiding

10 - - -

11 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

12 - - -

13

14 Monday, February 25, 2019
15 12:45 p.m.
16 City of Columbus
17 Civil Service Commission
18 77 North Front Street
19 Columbus, Ohio 43215

20 - - -

21 TRACI E. PEOPLES
22 PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER

23 - - -

24

25 ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
26 1421 West Third Avenue
27 Columbus, Ohio 43212
28 (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President
3 Stefanie L. Coe
4 Delena Edwards

5 PRESENTERS:

6 Richard Cherry
7 Carol Lagemann
8 Charday Litzy-Taylor
9 Tammy Rollins

10 ALSO PRESENT:

11 Wendy Brinnon

12 - - -

13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
2 February 25, 2019
3 12:45 p.m.

4 - - -

5 P R O C E E D I N G S

6 - - -

7 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 25th day of
8 February, 2019, the Municipal Civil Service
9 Commission came for a regular meeting, Grady L.
10 Pettigrew, President. And, the parties appearing in
11 person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth,
12 the following proceedings were had:

13 - - -

14 CHAIRMAN PETTIGREW: Call to order the
15 Municipal Civil Service Commission regular meeting
16 for the City of Columbus, February 25, 2019. And we
17 will proceed with the published agenda.

18 Item No. 1, review and approval of the
19 minutes of the January 28, 2019, regular meeting.

20 MS. COE: Just a point of clarification.
21 My first name is spelled wrong in the minutes. I
22 don't know if it is normally, but I just caught it
23 in this one. But it's Stefanie with an "f," no
24 "ph."

Otherwise, I move to approve the minutes

1 from the January 28, 2019, meeting.

2 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
4 "aye."

5 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

7 Item No. 2, none submitted.

8 No. 3?

9 MS. EDWARDS: I move that we elect Grady
10 Pettigrew president of the commission.

11 MS. COE: I second that.

12 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
13 "aye."

14 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you. Close
16 call.

17 We have no prehearing conference reviews,
18 Trial Board recommendations.

19 So Item No. 6 -- are they going to be
20 joined?

21 MS. ROLLINS: They can be. 6, 7 and 8.

22 CHAIRMAN PETTIGREW: So 6, 7 and 8.

23 6 is a request from the Civil Service
24 Commission staff to revise the specification for the

1 classification Executive Secretary to the
2 Superintendent.

3 7 is the classification Secretary to the
4 Internal Auditor.

5 And 8 is the classification Secretary to
6 the Treasurer.

7 MS. ROLLINS: Each of these three
8 classification we reviewed as part of the effort
9 that we have taken to help bring the Columbus City
10 Schools Class Plan up to date.

11 Each of these classifications has one
12 incumbent. Based on the specification, the
13 questionnaire that was completed by the incumbent,
14 and supervisory review, there are some proposed
15 changes to the specification, primarily to bring the
16 specification up to date with the work that is
17 currently performed.

18 For consistency for these three
19 classifications, it was noted that each of these
20 three classifications are assigned to the
21 unclassified job family. There is no probationary
22 period, as these three classifications are
23 unclassified.

24 And within the Guidelines For Class Use,

1 it is referenced a section of the Ohio Revised Code
2 that authorizes Columbus City Schools having the
3 unclassified classification.

4 MS. COE: Thank you.

5 I move to support the request of the
6 Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of
7 Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification
8 for the classification Executive Secretary to the
9 Superintendent, as well as Secretary to the Internal
10 auditor and, finally, Secretary to the Treasurer.

11 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

12 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
13 "aye."

14 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

16 Item No. 9 is a request of the Civil
17 Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City
18 Schools, to revise the specification for the
19 classification Media Technologies Supervisor,
20 retitle it to read "Media Technologies Specialist,"
21 and to change the probationary period to 365 days.

22 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Charday Litzy-Taylor,
23 personnel analyst with the Commission.

24 This request is the result of a

1 classification review conducted in an effort to
2 review all of the District's classifications. Based
3 on feedback received, some revisions are proposed.

4 This classification does not perform any
5 supervisory duties. Therefore, it is recommended
6 that the supervisor be revised to read "Specialist,"
7 and the new title read "Media Technologies
8 Specialist."

9 It is recommended that some statements
10 within the "Examples of Work" section be added or
11 revised to better reflect important duties
12 associated with this classification.

13 In regards to the "Minimum
14 Qualifications," it is proposed that the required
15 experience be increased from three years to five
16 years, based on the level and nature of the work
17 being performed. It is also recommended that the
18 required experience be in the multimedia field and
19 that the specific field of study be removed. A
20 substitution allowing years of -- additional years
21 of experience to substitute for up to two years of
22 the required education is proposed.

23 And the "Knowledge, Skills, and
24 Abilities" section has been revised to be more

1 reflective of what is needed to be successful in
2 this classification.

3 Lastly, it is proposed that the
4 probationary period be changed from 180 to 365 days,
5 which is consistent with the anticipated learning
6 time.

7 There are no other changes proposed at
8 this time.

9 MS. COE: Thank you.

10 I move to support the request of the
11 Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of
12 Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification
13 for the classification Media Technologies
14 Supervisor, retitle it to read "Media Technologies
15 Specialist," and change the probationary period to
16 365 days.

17 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
19 "aye."

20 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

22 Item No. 10 is request of the Civil
23 Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City
24 Schools, to revise the specification for the

1 classification Communications Specialist (Print
2 Media), retitle it to read "Print Media
3 Communications Specialist," and change the
4 probationary period to 365 days.

5 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: This request is also
6 the result of a classification review conducted in
7 an effort to review all of the District's
8 classifications.

9 It is proposed that the title for this
10 classification be revised to read "Print Media
11 Communications Specialist" to maintain consistency
12 within the Class Plan.

13 The proposed change simply moves the term
14 "Print Media" to the beginning of the title if.

15 It is recommended that some statements
16 within the "Examples of Work" section be added or
17 revised to better reflect important duties.

18 For the "Minimum Qualifications," it is
19 proposed that the required years of experience be
20 decreased from the five years to three years and
21 that the specific field of study be removed. A
22 substitution allowing for additional years of
23 experience of up -- for up to two years of the
24 education has been added.

1 And, also, it is proposed that the
2 probationary period be revised from 180 to 365 days.

3 No other changes are proposed at this
4 time.

5 MS. COE: Thank you.

6 I move to support the request of the
7 Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of
8 Columbus City Schools, to revise the specification
9 for the classification Communications Specialist
10 (Print Media), retitle it to "Print Medica
11 Communications Specialist," and change the
12 probationary period to 365 days.

13 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
15 "aye."

16 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

17 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

18 Item No. 11, request of the Civil Service
19 Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City
20 Schools, to merge the specification for the
21 classification Radio Station Operator into Radio
22 Host/Producer, revise and retitle it to read "Radio
23 Broadcast Specialist," and change the probationary
24 period to 180 days.

1 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: This request is also a
2 result of a classification review in an effort to
3 review all the District's classifications.

4 After reviewing questionnaire responses
5 and meeting with the party representatives, it was
6 determined that there is no difference in the duties
7 being performed by incumbents working in these two
8 classifications. Employees in both classes are
9 responsible for hosting, production, and technical
10 programming functions at WCBE. Therefore, it is
11 proposed that the classification for the
12 specification Radio Station Operator be merged into
13 Radio Host Producer and be retitled to read
14 "Broadcast" -- "Radio Broadcast Specialist." This
15 broader title is more inclusive of the variety of
16 duties associated with the classification. It is
17 also more encompassing of duties that come about due
18 to continuous evolution of radio programming and
19 radio consumption.

20 It is recommended that language within
21 the "Definition" be updated to reflect the use of
22 multiple formats.

23 The "Examples of Work" section is being
24 revised to reflect aspects of both classifications.

1 A wording change was made to the "Minimum
2 Qualifications" section to reflect current
3 formatting.

4 Also, since this classification is
5 requiring experience in a specific field, the field
6 of study is being removed.

7 The "Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities"
8 section has been revised to be more reflective of
9 what is needed on day one to be more successful in
10 this classification.

11 Lastly, the probationary period, it is
12 proposed that that change from 360 days to 180,
13 which is consistent with other classifications
14 within the bargaining unit.

15 There are no other changes.

16 MS. COE: Thank you.

17 I moved to support the request of the
18 Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of
19 Columbus City Schools, to merge the specification
20 for the classification Radio Station Operator into
21 Radio Host/Producer, revise and retitle it to read
22 "Radio Broadcast Specialist," and change the
23 probationary period to 180 days.

24 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
2 "aye."

3 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

5 Items 12 through 17 are joined, and they
6 are all requests with no revisions.

7 Item No. 12, request of the Civil Service
8 Commission staff to approve the specification review
9 for the classification Financial Management Division
10 Administrator, with no revisions;

11 13 is the classification Golf Course
12 Administrator, with no revisions;

13 14 is the classification Data Management
14 Coordinator, with no revisions;

15 15, the classification Chief Plans
16 Official, with no revisions;

17 16, the classification Water Research
18 Laboratory Manager, with no revisions;

19 And 17, the classification Golf Course
20 Maintenance Manager, with no revisions.

21 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: The review of these
22 classifications is part of the Civil Service
23 Commission's effort to review all classifications
24 every five years.

1 Based on feedback received, it was
2 determined that the current specifications still
3 accurately reflect the work being performed.
4 Therefore, it is recommended that these
5 classifications be approved with no revisions.

6 MS. COE: Thank you.

7 I move to support the request of the
8 Civil Service Commission staff to approve the
9 specification review for the classifications
10 Financial Management Division Administrator, with no
11 revisions; as well as Golf Course Administrator,
12 with no revisions; Data Management Coordinator, with
13 no revisions; Chief Plans Official, with no
14 revisions; Water Research Laboratory Manager, with
15 no revisions; and Golf Course Maintenance Manager,
16 with no revisions.

17 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
19 "aye."

20 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

22 The following requests are to abolish
23 classifications. And it's 18 through 25.

24 Item No. 18, request of the Civil Service

1 Commission staff to abolish the specification for
2 the classification Citizen Member Building
3 Commission;

4 19 is the classification Citizen Member
5 Development Commission;

6 20 is the classification Citizen Member
7 Board of Zoning Adjustment;

8 21, the classification Citizen Member
9 Board of Review of General and Limited Sign
10 Erectors;

11 22, the classification Citizen Member
12 Skilled Trades Review Board;

13 23, the classification Citizen Member
14 Board of Review of General and Home Improvement
15 Contractors;

16 24 is the classification Citizen Member
17 Graphics Commission; and,

18 25 is the classification Citizen Member
19 Property Maintenance Appeals Board.

20 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Individuals serving on
21 these boards are no longer being processed through
22 the City payroll system. Therefore, it is no longer
23 necessary to have these classifications.

24 It is recommended that they be abolished

1 as proposed.

2 MS. COE: Thank you.

3 I move to support the request of the
4 Civil Service Commission staff to abolish the
5 classification for the following classifications:
6 Citizen Member Building Commission, Citizen Member
7 Development Commission, Citizen Member Board of
8 Zoning Adjustment, Citizen Member Board of Review of
9 General and Limited Sign Erectors, Citizen Member
10 Skilled Trades Review Board, Citizen Member Board of
11 Review of General and Home Improvement Contractors,
12 Citizen Member Graphics Commission, and Citizen
13 Member Property Maintenance Appeals Board.

14 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
16 "aye."

17 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

19 Requests 26 and 27 are joined.

20 26 is the request of the Civil Service
21 Commission staff to revise the specification for the
22 classification Photography Technician.

23 27 is the classification Photography
24 Laboratory Manager.

1 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: The review of these
2 classifications is part of the Civil Service
3 Commission's effort to review all classifications
4 every five years.

5 Minor revisions are proposed to the
6 "Examples of Work" section for both classes to
7 better reflect the work that is being performed.

8 Since photography technicians work with
9 multiple editing software programs, knowledge of
10 editing software and ability to operate a computer
11 and utilize related software has been added to that
12 specification.

13 There are no other changes proposed at
14 this time.

15 MS. COE: Thank you.

16 I move to support the request of the
17 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
18 specification for the classification Photography
19 Technician, as well as the specification for the
20 classification Photography Laboratory Manager.

21 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
23 "aye."

24 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

2 Item No. 28 is a request of the Civil
3 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
4 for the classification Design and Construction
5 Division Administrator.

6 MS. LAGEMANN: Carole Lagemann, personnel
7 analyst with the Civil Service.

8 The review of this classification is part
9 of our effort to review all classifications every
10 five years.

11 Within the "Knowledge, Skills, and
12 Abilities" section, two more general knowledge
13 statements are proposed to include construction,
14 engineering and practices and maintenance operations
15 for roadways and structures.

16 There are no other changes proposed.

17 MS. COE: Thank you.

18 I move to support the request of the
19 Civil Service Commission staff to review the
20 specification for the classification Design and
21 Construction Division Administrator.

22 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
24 "aye."

1 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

2 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

3 Item No. 29 is the request of the Civil
4 Service Commission staff to abolish the
5 specification for the classification Downtown
6 Development Administrative Coordinator.

7 MS. LAGEMANN: The review of this
8 classification is part of our efforts to review all
9 classifications every five years.

10 This classification has been vacant for
11 more than 10 years, and the department indicated
12 they do not expect the work of this classification
13 to be performed in this classification in the
14 future. Therefore, it is recommended that it be
15 abolished as proposed.

16 MS. COE: Thank you.

17 I move to support the request of the
18 Civil Service Commission staff to abolish the
19 specification for the classification for Downtown
20 Development Administrative Coordinator.

21 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
23 "aye."

24 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

2 Item No. 30 is the request of the Civil
3 Service Commission staff to review the specification
4 of the classification Construction Materials
5 Analysis Coordinator.

6 MS. LAGEMANN: The review of this
7 classification is part of our effort to review every
8 classification every five years.

9 Within the "Examples of Work" and
10 "Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities" sections,
11 references to acronyms are updated for current
12 terminology.

13 Within the "Minimum Qualifications"
14 section, updates are proposed to the substitution to
15 reflect the current and relevant Level II National
16 Institute for Certification in Engineering
17 Technologies (NICET) certification.

18 There are no other changes proposed.

19 MS. COE: Thank you.

20 I move to support the request of the
21 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
22 specification for the classification Construction
23 Materials Analysis Coordinator.

24 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
2 "aye."

3 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

5 Item No. 31 is the request of the Civil
6 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
7 for the classification Industrial Hygienist.

8 MS. LAGEMANN: This action is a class
9 action requested by the Department of Human
10 Resources.

11 We are proposing to amend the minimum
12 qualifications to allow registered sanitarian work
13 as another route to the minimum qualifications.

14 In addition, a revision is proposed to
15 allow for industrial hygienists to have experience
16 that is broader than the places of employment and to
17 describe the hazards of human health hazards.

18 Rearranging the certified industrial
19 hygiene minimum qualification path and substitution
20 in the industrial hygiene path is also proposed.

21 There are no other revisions proposed.

22 MS. COE: Thank you.

23 I move to support the request of the
24 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the

1 specification for the classification Industrial
2 Hygienist.

3 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
5 "aye."

6 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

8 Item No. 32 is the request of the Civil
9 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
10 for the classification Code Enforcement Division
11 Administrator.

12 MR. CHERRY: Good afternoon. Richard
13 Cherry, personnel analyst with the Civil Service
14 Commission.

15 A review of this classification was part
16 of our efforts to review all classifications every
17 five years.

18 The only proposals we have for this
19 classification is the addition of one example of
20 work and the modification of another one.

21 MS. COE: Thank you.

22 I move to support the request of the
23 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
24 specification for the classification Code

1 Enforcement Division Administrator.

2 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
4 "aye."

5 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

7 Thank you.

8 Item No. 35 is background removals,
9 pre-exam. I have these in writing.

10 Levi Adams, reinstate.

11 Lane Applin, do not reinstate.

12 Cole Beason, do not reinstate.

13 Steven Belvin, reinstate.

14 Ira Bryant, reinstate.

15 Chaz Byers, reinstate.

16 Victoria Carafelli, do not reinstate.

17 Benjamin Colon, do not reinstate.

18 Hayden Cook, do not reinstate.

19 Conner Cua, do not reinstate.

20 Alisha Crosler, reinstate.

21 Derek Davis, do not reinstate.

22 Woodrow Davis, do not reinstate.

23 Shannon Dixon, reinstate.

24 Nathan Downing, reinstate.

1 Arthur Franklin Jr., reinstate.
2 Conner Hamer, do not reinstate.
3 Timothy Higginbotham, do not reinstate.
4 Deon Holder, reinstate.
5 Hezekiah Jackson, do not reinstate.
6 Ezekiel Jones, do not reinstate.
7 MS. EDWARDS: Reinstate.
8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I'm sorry,
9 reinstate. Ezekiel Jones, reinstate.
10 Sidney Latham, do not reinstate.
11 Derrick Lewis, reinstate.
12 Alexander Love, do not reinstate.
13 Alex Marcum, do not reinstate.
14 Matthew Michel, do not reinstate.
15 Justin Mooney, reinstate.
16 Mika Mori, reinstate.
17 Michel Nugent, do not reinstate.
18 Paul O'Brien, reinstate.
19 Josh Poole, reinstate.
20 Joseph Ramsey, reinstate.
21 Martia Reed, reinstate.
22 Daniel Robinson II, do not reinstate.
23 Drew Short, reinstate.
24 Russell Snyder, reinstate.

1 Zachary Space, do not reinstate.
2 William Stanley, reinstate.
3 David Stewart --
4 MS. EDWARDS: Daniel Stewart.
5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Daniel Stewart, do
6 not reinstate.
7 Daak Super, reinstate.
8 Jack R. Walter, do not reinstate.
9 Christopher Warman, reinstate.
10 As to applicants removed post-exam:
11 Gregory Scott Wolfman, do not reinstate.
12 Juwaun Patterson, do not reinstate.
13 Dwight Diggs, do not reinstate.
14 Robert Dysant, reinstate.
15 And David Gambill, reinstate.
16 And with that, we have completed the
17 agenda.
18 We are adjourned.
19 MS. BRINNON: Mr. Pettigrew, there is an
20 item after the -- we have the jurisdictional review.
21 MS. COE: After?
22 MS. BRINNON: Item No. 36.
23 MS. COE: 36 is to approve the letter.
24 CHAIRMAN PETTIGREW: Oh, approve the

1 letter.

2 MS. EDWARDS: Yes.

3 CHAIRMAN PETTIGREW: All right. The
4 letter will be -- 36, the letter will be approved
5 and submitted.

6 All right. Are we done?

7 We are adjourned.

8 - - -

9 And, thereupon, the proceeding was
10 concluded at approximately 1:09 p.m.

11 - - -

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 25th day of February, 2019.

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 1:09 p.m.

* * *

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

Date