

**VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday, March 13, 2019
111 North Front Street – 2nd Floor, Hearing Room**

Commissioners Present: Aaron Borchers, Marc Conte, Shawn Conyers, Jack Decker [arr. 6:10 pm], Jeffery Hissem [arr. 6:07 pm], Lisl Kotheimer, Erin Moriarty

HPO Staff Present: Cristin Moody

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:05pm
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Wednesday, April 3, 2019 – 111 N. Front St. – Conf. Room 312
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Wednesday, April 10, 2019
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Wednesday, February 13, 2019, MOTION: Conyers/Moriarty (6-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

NEW APPLICATIONS

1. 19-3-3b

196 West Fourth Avenue

Steven & Vivian Stofflet (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #19-3-3b, 196 West Fourth Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications noted.

Rear Addition

- Construct new, one-story, 14' x 12'-10" mudroom addition on the rear of the existing two-story house, per submitted plans.
- Roof is to be a flat, membrane roof; siding is to be Hardie panel with Hardie trim, Foundation is to be split-face concrete block.
- Windows are to match the Marvin windows recently installed on the main house; rear door is to be a full light wood door. A cut sheet for the door is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to installation.
- Rear steps are to be limestone with a simple wrought iron hand rail.

MOTION: Borchers/Decker (7-0-0) APPROVED.

2. 19-3-4

711 North High Street

Robert Schorr (Applicant)

711 LLC (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #19-3-4, 711 North High Street, and place on the April 10, 2019 meeting agenda as a holdover.

Signage



- Install one new 2'-11 5/8" x 10'-8" wall sign above the main building entrance, per submitted plans and specifications.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (7-0-0) CONTINUED.

3. 19-3-5

47-49 West Fifth Avenue

Nick Stamos (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #19-3-5, 47-49 West Fifth Avenue, as submitted.

Rear Addition

- Install new plywood roof, windows, corrugated metal and fencing to create an enclosure at the rear of the building under existing exterior stairs.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (0-7-0) DENIED.

Reasons for Denial

City Code 3116.11 Standards for Alteration

(9) Contemporary design for alteration to a property shall not be discouraged when such alteration does not destroy significant, historical, architectural, or cultural material and its design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, its environment and surrounding contributing properties.

(12) In passing upon appropriateness, the Commission shall consider, in addition to any other pertinent factor, the architectural characteristics typical of structures in the District or Listed Property, the historical and architectural value and significance, architectural style, general design, arrangement, texture, material, and color of the architectural feature involved and its relation to the architectural features of other contributing properties in the immediate neighborhood.

4. 19-3-6

201-203 West First Avenue

Clancy Malone, Atlas Roof & Exteriors (Applicant) Michael Cahill (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #19-3-6, 201-203 West First Avenue, as submitted.

Replace Slate Roof

- Remove all damage and deteriorated slate roofing on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be the following from the approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
[] Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via

Remove Box Gutters

- Remove existing crown trim around the eaves and roof over existing box gutters.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary.

- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutters and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new, 5", k style metal gutters and corrugated metal downspouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (0-7-0) DENIED.

Reasons for Denial

City Code 3116.11 Standards for Alteration

(6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features shall be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures.

(12) In passing upon appropriateness, the Commission shall consider, in addition to any other pertinent factor, the architectural characteristics typical of structures in the District or Listed Property, the historical and architectural value and significance, architectural style, general design, arrangement, texture, material, and color of the architectural feature involved and its relation to the architectural features of other contributing properties in the immediate neighborhood.

5. 19-3-7

689 North High Street

Dina Cherney (Applicant)

Shane Hampton (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #19-3-7, 689 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Signage

- Replace existing sign above the storefront with a new 10'-4" x 38" halo-lit wall sign, per submitted plans.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (7-0-0) APPROVED.

6. 19-3-9

206 West First Avenue

Pro Exterior by APCO (Applicant)

Cleve Ricksecker & Lisa Fry (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #19-3-9, 206 West First Avenue, and place on the April 10, 2019 meeting agenda as a holdover.

Replace Door

- Remove second story rear door and transom, partially enclose opening to match size of existing windows on the house and infill remaining opening with new brick to match the existing masonry as closely as possible.
- Install new, Marvin Ultimate Next Generation 2.0 aluminum-clad, 1-over-1, double hung window in the opening.
- Install new wood brick mold to match existing brick mold on the house; prime and paint to match existing trim color.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (7-0-0) CONTINUED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

7. 19-3-8

1128 Harrison Avenue

Michael McLaughlin (Applicant)

Vista Wood Properties (Owner)

Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant, Commissioners present offered comments and suggestions, as summarized here:

Commissioner Comments

- Com. Hissem: He referred to a similar, successful renovation and addition on Hamlet Street in Italian Village that he had mentioned during the last review for this property. He wants to see that kind of solution explored here before considering demolition. He would support adding units at the rear of the property.
- Com. Borchers: He would need to understand the existing structure better. He could get his head around demoing the kitchen to make way for an appropriate addition. He did not see enough evidence that a complete demolition of the site is necessary. He will need to see more information on the proposed replacement project.
- Com. Conyers: He would also want to see an exploration of the opportunities to maintain the presence of the historic structure with adding a secondary element to it as an option. Removing the garage is a no-brainer.
- Com. Conte: Stated he is more in favor of complete demolition. Once the front and back are removed and you shore it up, not sure what you're left with in terms of the historic structure.
- Com. Kotheimer: Disagreed with the idea that it would be an economic hardship to make it livable, or that it is too small. It is viable to make it work, and not worthy of demolishing.
- Com. Decker: The Commission needs to see the plans for reuse of the site. He was not persuaded that there is no market in the neighborhood for a one bedroom apartment. More detailed information needs to be provided about what the options are for using the structure or tearing it down.
- Com. Moriarty: She supported the idea of removing the portions of the structure that are not sound, but thinks it is otherwise a cute house.
- Most Commissioners indicated that they were open to demolition of the entire structure if the replacement project is something they can approve. Commissioner Borchers and Conte clarified that they would look for a replacement structure to reference the massing of the historic structure.

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing one-story single family home and build a new two or three unit residential structure more compatible with the surrounding buildings.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

STAFF APPROVALS

- **19-3-1**

867 Neil Avenue

Joe Huber & Carson Thrush (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #19-3-1, 867 Neil Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Cable

- Secure exterior electric cable to the masonry wall on the south elevation in the corner next to the chimney with appropriate fasteners.
- Installation is to be in accordance with industry standards and Columbus Building Code.

- **19-3-2**

145-147 & 141 West Second Avenue

Reza Reyazi (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #19-3-2, 145-147 & 141 West Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 4' high wood privacy fence along the west property line (facing Dennison Avenue) in the rear yard and install 3.5' high wood picket fence in the front yard, per submitted design and site plan. Replace an existing, deteriorated wood privacy fence in the rear yard at 141 with new 6' high wood privacy fence.
- Wood fencing is to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fencing to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Style of the new privacy fence is to be board-on-board, six foot high (6' h), wood fence with the finished side out-facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside).

• **19-3-3a**

196 West Fourth Avenue

Steven & Vivian Stofflet (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #19-3-3a, 196 West Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications and paint with appropriate exterior paint. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Conyers/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS – 139-141 West Second Avenue update

XI. NEW BUSINESS – 974-976 Hunter Avenue parking area question

XII. ADJOURNMENT– Hissem/Decker (7-0-0) ADJOURNED 8:56pm.