

## ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, March 19, 2019

6:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

**Commissioners Present:** Ben Goodman, Jason Sudy, Lauren Crosby, Todd Boyer, Shannon Fergus, Brooke Michl-Smith (abstaining; observed from audience)

**Commissioners Absent:** David Cooke

**Staff Present:** Corinne Jones

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:05 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, April 2, 2019 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, April 9, 2019 at 4pm.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, February 19, 2019. MOTION: Boyer/Goodman (5-0-1) APPROVED. [Michl-Smith]
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. **19-3-2**  
**919 N. Fourth St.**  
**Eric D. Martineau (Applicant)/ Eric Hostnik & Lauran Dunbar (Owners)**  
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
2. **19-3-3**  
**1124 N. High St.**  
**Brian Swanson (Applicant)/ Judy Chution (Owner)**  
Approve Application #19-3-3, 1124 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:
  - Install new sidewalk patio and fencing per submitted site plan and specifications.
  - Revised drawings, specifying a wrought iron, welded fence to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of certificate.MOTION: Fergus/Crosby (3-2-1) APPROVED. [Boyer, Goodman] [Michl-Smith]
3. **19-3-4**  
**750 N. High St. (Graduate Hotel)**  
**Meyers & Associates Architects (Applicant)/ SNH Columbus Owner, LLC (Owner)**  
Approve Application #19-3-4, 750 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:
  - Exterior lighting per submitted cut sheets and specifications.
  - The Commission approval only includes the following fixtures from the submitted lighting plan: the recessed cans proposed on the west and east elevations; “B” lighting fixtures proposed on the west elevation; “D” lighting fixtures proposed on the north and south elevations; and, all string lights proposed.

- Revised lighting plan to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of certificate.  
MOTION: Fergus/Boyer (5-0-1) APPROVED. [Michl-Smith]

## NEW APPLICATIONS

### 4. 19-3-5

#### 854 Summit St.

#### **Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Amiya Dey (Owner)**

*The Commission split the application into three parts: 19-3-5a (demolition), 19-3-5b (new construction), and 19-3-5c (Variance recommendations).*

#### **19-3-5a**

Approve Application #19-3-5a, 854 Summit St., as submitted, with the following clarifications:

- Demolish existing single-story, 3-car garage due to non-functioning condition.

NOTE: The Commission noted that the existing garage is a not a contributing structure, in a significant state of disrepair, and its demolition would not constitute a loss to the neighborhood.

MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (5-0-1) APPROVED. [Michl-Smith]

#### **19-3-5b**

Approve Application #19-3-5b, 854 Summit St., as submitted, with the following clarifications:

- Construct new 2-story 3-car carriage house with living unit.
- Windows to be taller (approx. 6' tall x 3' wide) and have a more robust sash frame. Cut sheets to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of certificate.
- Drawings to show an apron board under the windows, and a trim board of at least 4-inches, on the sides.
- Drawings to consistently show k-style gutters.
- Drawings to show the bottom band trim removed.
- Drawings to show the light fixtures in a consistent location on/above the trim band.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (5-0-1) APPROVED. [Michl-Smith]

#### **19-3-5c**

Recommend approval of Application #19-3-5c, 854 Summit St., as submitted:

#### Variance Recommendation Requests:

- **3332.039**, R-4 Residential District, to permit two (2) detached dwelling units on the same parcel, consisting of the existing single family dwelling (854 Summit Street) and the proposed carriage house/garage with one (1) dwelling unit.
- **3332.05**, Area District Lot Width Requirements, to reduce the lot width from 50 feet to 30 feet (existing).
- **3332.19**, Fronting, to permit the carriage house to not front on a public street.
- **3332.25**, Maximum Side Yards Required, to reduce the maximum side yard from six (6) feet (20% of 30 feet) to four (4) feet for the carriage house.
- **3332.26**, Minimum Side Yard Permitted, to reduce the north side yard of the proposed carriage house from three (3) feet to one (1) foot.
- **3332.27**, Rear Yard, to reduce rear yard from 25% of lot area behind each dwelling to rear yard(s) as depicted on the Site Plan.

MOTION: Goodman/Crosby (5-0-1) RECOMMENDED. [Michl-Smith]

### 5. 19-3-6

#### 189 Punta Al.

#### **Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)/ Mansell Investment Properties, LLC (Owner)**

Approve Application #19-3-6, 189 Punta Al., as submitted, with the following clarifications:

- Construction of new 3-story single-family residence with attached garage.
- Building frontage on Punta Alley with a 10' ROW setback to match adjacent residences.
- Building setback at rear is 5' from lot line and 3' from west lot line.

- There is a 10' access easement for the property directly to the south that will serve as a common driveway.
  - If an alternate drainage solution is proposed in consultation with other City departments, ensure that it travels under the sidewalk.
  - Provide details for rear screening and the cedar siding, proposed within the recessed balcony area. Details to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of certificate.
  - Drawings to show an increase in the amount of landscape area, at the front entry.
  - Drawings to show the pavers extending continuously, from the driveway apron to the garage entrances (mid-way down the east side of the residence). Existing driveway to remain, from that point to the rear property line.
  - Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of certificate.
- MOTION: Fergus/Crosby (5-0-1) APPROVED. [Michl-Smith]

## CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

### 6. 19-3-7

**750 N. High St.**

**Short North Alliance (Applicant)/ AJ Capital Partners (Owner)**

Conceptual Review

- Permanent placement of public art on building exterior.
- Artists would be engaged to create up to three (3) permanent painted murals on the Graduate Hotel.
- Prospective locations include the north facing wall and two locations on the south facing walls.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission supports all three proposed locations.
- One Commissioner noted that the two larger pieces will be pivotal pieces in re-establishing the neighborhood as an arts district.
- One Commissioner noted that it is important for public art to honor the architecture that it rests on and commented that in this case, extending the artwork edge-to-edge, on the two larger pieces, is appropriate.
- One Commissioner expressed the desire to see something more sculptural/interactive for the pedestrian level piece.

### 7. 19-3-8

**800 N. High St.**

**Short North Alliance (Applicant)/ Crawford Hoying (Owner)**

Conceptual Review

- Permanent placement of public art on building exterior.
- Artists would be engaged to create permanent artwork on up to two stories of the north wall (west of the main entrance) and temporary artwork on the south wall that was previously approved for placement of art.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission supports artwork on the south side location, noting that they are open to both mural art and/or 3D installations.
- The Commission expressed concern with artwork on the north side location, noting that it might compete with/detract from the Moxy hotel entrance and/or the architectural band on the building. There was further Commissioner discussion about how sculptural entries (like the Moxy's) work best, when they're not "crowded".
- One Commissioner noted that artwork that is experiential, like the 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue birds, or that the pedestrian/public has to "discover" would be most successful in this location- given the surroundings.
- One Commissioner noted that ground-plane art is preferred, in locations, where garages come out to High Street.

**8. 19-3-9**

**275 E. Greenwood Ave. & Lot 010-018038**

**House to Home Property Group, LLC (Owner)**

Conceptual Review

- Renovation of existing home; including new cedar siding, new windows, and roof.
- Construction of new garage for existing home and installation of shared concrete driveway.
- Construction of two (2) new single-family homes and associated garages on existing vacant parcel.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner comments related to the renovation of the existing residence:
  - The Commission recommended that the applicant set up a time to meet HPO staff at the site, to review any/all original siding, windows, and doors.
- Commissioner comments related to the overall site plan:
  - The Commission thanked the applicant for bringing forward a thoughtful and appropriate site plan which provides access to all three houses, via one driveway, off of East Greenwood Avenue.
  - The Commission was concerned with the massing of the three-car garage, proposed at the center of the lot (a visible location), noting that one and two car garages are more typical/appropriate in the Village, and dependency on cars is expected to decrease, in the future.
  - The Commission was supportive of the applicant's suggested alternative: two one-car garages (i.e., one garage space for each new build).
- Commissioner comments related to the proposed design for both new houses:
  - The Commission noted that the proposed massing and height is appropriate for Italian Village.
  - The Commission noted that a two story deck is not appropriate on the front of the residence and recommend that the applicant explore design options on the rear of the house, if a deck is desired.
  - The Commission recommended the following revisions to the proposed design:
    - a. Replace the shake siding with a siding material that is more appropriate (horizontal, vertical, etc.).
    - b. The three windows with a transom above, on the second-story, front elevation, is not typical. Two separate windows without a transom would be more appropriate. The two windows should be similar in width to the windows shown on the rear of the house (height is appropriate).
    - c. Window grids (mullions) are not appropriate on a new build. Simple, double-hung, one-over-one windows would be more appropriate.
    - d. There is a lot of variation in window composition on the lower level, under the porch. The Commission was not opposed to three windows, as proposed, but recommended that the applicant look to other homes in the surrounding area, if they wanted to explore other design options.
    - e. The front porch appears to have appropriate proportions; however, the center post is too wide and should be reduced, so that it does not stand out as much- should be subordinate.
    - f. On the side view, there should not be an off-set between the second-floor floor plate and the first-floor floor plate (i.e., the notch, visible on Sheet A2-1, Detail 2).
  - The Commission requested that the applicant revise the drawings, before returning to the Commission for another review.
  - The Commission requested that the revised drawings include a cross section of the porch (1/2"=1'), for review of the beams, deck, trim details, etc.

**STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS**

- **19-3-1 [Michl-Smith]**

**250 E. Fourth Ave.**

**Myers Property Solutions (Owner)**

Approve application #19-3-1, 250 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Exterior landscaping for new build single-family home per submitted landscaping plans and specifications.

- **19-3-2 [Michl-Smith]**

**919 N. Fourth St.**

**Eric D. Martineau (Applicant)/ Eric Hostnik & Lauran Dunbar (Owners)**

Approve application #19-3-2, 919 N. Fourth St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 3332.039 – applicant seeks a variance to permit separate residence to be constructed on single parcel, which is not permitted in an R-4 district.
- 3332.05 – Lot width. Permit existing lot width of 28.5 feet despite code’s 40 foot minimum.
- 3332.15 – Lot area. Allow the existing lot area of 3,904.5 sf despite code’s requirement of 5,000 sf for 2 dwelling units.
- 3332.19 – Fronting on a public street. Applicant seeks variance to allow the carriage house to front on the public alley.
- 3332.26 – Minimum side yard. Code requires three (3’) feet on lot width of 40’ or less, and the existing historic house (not the carriage house) only has 2.27’ of side yard to the North.
- 3332.27 - Rear yard. Zoning code requires each dwelling to have a rear yard equal to 25% of the gross lot area. 25% of the lot area equals 958 square feet. The yard between the garage/carriage house and the original house is approximately 967.76 square feet. While a large area, this is not enough area to provide each residence with a rear-yard equal to 958 sf (25% of the lot area). Applicant seeks a variance to permit the carriage house to have a rear-yard of 0 square feet, which would leave the original house with 967.76 square feet.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Boyer/Crosby (5-0-1) APPROVED. [Michl-Smith]

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

- a. 4pm Commission meeting start time beginning with April 2019 IVC hearing.
- b. Commissioner discussion regarding ways to offer commendation for well-done projects.
- c. Introduction of new Commissioner: Brooke Michl-Smith.

**XII. ADJOURNMENT** – Goodman/Boyer (6-0-0) ADJOURNED. 8:07 p.m.