

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

Tuesday, April 9, 2019

4:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer (Acting Chairperson), Lauren Crosby, Shannon Fergus, Ben Goodman, Brooke Michl-Smith

Commissioners Absent: David Cooke, Jason Sudy

Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:05 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, May 7, 2019 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, **May 14, 2019 at 4pm.**
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, March 19, 2019.
MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (4-0-1) APPROVED. [Michl-Smith]
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
 - Chet Ridenour, Short North Foundation
 - Noted some projects SNF has been involved with, including pocket parks, High Street arches, and grants.
 - SNF includes Friends of Goodale Park, Italian Village Society, Italian Village Commission, Victorian Village Commission, and Short North Alliance.
 - SNF meets the first Tuesday of each month at 6pm, and would like an IVC representative to attend.
 - Currently, SNF would like input from IVC regarding the SNF grant program.
 - SNF supports activation of High Street, but does not want to see walkways given over to outdoor seating.
 - Commission would like to provide input when larger or controversial projects arise, but noted the difficulty in setting aside time to attend an additional meeting.
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS - The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Goodman/Crosby (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. **19-4-9**
1047 Hamlet St.
Eric D. Martineau (Applicant)/ Steve McCoy & Ji-Young Ann (Owners)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 19-4-10

958 N. High St.

Tannins of Columbus, LLC (Applicant)/ BBR Holdings, LLC (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 19-4-10, 958 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Sidewalk Seating

- Install new sidewalk seating area and associated railings, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Seating are to provide space for four (4) two-top tables with two (2) chairs each.
- Railings to be 36” High.
- Table and chair design to be per the submitted product cut sheet.

MOTION: Goodman/Crosby (5-0-0) APPROVED

3. 19-4-11

1178-1182 N. High St.

1178-1182 N. High LLC

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 19-4-11, 1178-1182 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Repair/Replace Storefronts / Two Story Building

- Remove any/all deteriorated wood and broken glass or plexi-glass on the two existing storefronts of the two-story, commercial building. Remove the one (1) non-original second-story entrance door.
- Install new, wood, two-panel door on the second-story entrance, per the submitted drawings. Cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to installation.
- Repair and refinish the two (2) existing, single-lite, wooden storefront entrance doors.
- Retain and repair the existing prism glass transom windows on the northern storefront.
- Rebuild the two storefronts on the two-story commercial building, per the submitted drawings.
- Prime all new and bare wood and paint Sherwin Williams “Black Magic” (SW6991).

Repair/Replace Storefront / One Story Building

- Remove the existing T-111 siding and non-original window and door on the one existing storefront opening of the one-story, commercial building.
- Build new storefront, per the submitted drawings.
- Prime all new and bare wood and paint Sherwin Williams “Black Magic” (SW6991).

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

4. 19-4-12

No Address (Civitas Avenue & Dickenson St.)

Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey New Day, LLC (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #19-4-12, Commissioner Fergus noted the need to recuse herself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room.

Conceptual Review

- Jeffrey Park Master Plan Development Discussion
- Phase 8 Discussion – Main courtyard to be open to Dickenson St. with a large pocket park by eliminating 20-units.
- Balconies have been eliminated from the open courtyard to create a more public space, and promote its use at ground level by residents.
- The large skywalk has been eliminated to bring residents down to street level.

- Cast stone and brick end caps with pitched roofs will define the building and hide all mechanicals.
- The land directly south will have two (2) triangular parks, and a dog park will be located to the south and open to the public.
- Balconies will be removed from design and/or engaged into the building like the HUB design.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Acting Chairperson Boyer opened the discussion and Commission members offered comments to the applicants:

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Goodman:

- Appreciates the insight provided for materials, but need to focus on massing and scale first.
- Regarding Phase 8, the Applicants responded well to previous Commissioner comments in the way it opens up to the streetscape. That is good for community building.
- Has concerns about how much “park space” becomes residential development.
- Can buy into having homes along Civitas Avenue, if there is a way to puncture through that development one more time, possibly one larger home and four smaller homes.
- Phase 8 seems to be going in the right direction. Appreciates the use of more concealed balconies. Balconies/open spaces are best as negative space as opposed to projecting space. They have a look of higher quality and items stored there are less visible.
- Always encourages staying away from EIFS and brake metal. Use honest steel and stucco, especially on the 1st and 2nd levels, where more visible.
- Details of lighting and landscaping at the entrances will be important.
- Is okay with the massing. Will be interested in the type of window proposed.
- Regarding Phase 9, is not on board yet. It’s not about the height, would encourage to go higher but with less footprint.
- Would like to see more light coming through to the park and neighborhood. Possibly one tall tower, or two medium sized towers adjacent to each other.
- It is now a “low chunk.” Would be more graceful as a “high spire.”

Commissioner Boyer:

- The parks do a good job of connecting to each other.
- Need to take another look at Central Park. It does not connect with Phase 8 right now.
- There is a connection to Phase 9, but would rather see an easier connection for the residential folks.
- The connection between 7a, 6a, etc is pretty lackluster from the south and east. Possibly put all the buildings on the south and nothing on the east. That could connect Phase 8 better to the park.
- The pool courtyard is fine, as it is.
- No comments architecturally at this time. Seems to be a brother or sister to the one already built, which is appropriate.
- Regarding Phase 9, no issues with the height – more development needs to be done.
- Has issues with 6 and 7 right now, but those will be developed further as you go. Need better connection to Phase 8 and the park.

Commissioner Prosser:

- Nothing further to add.

Commissioner Michl-Smith:

- No comments.

NO ACTION TAKEN

NEW APPLICATION

5. 19-4-13

750 N. High St. (Graduate Hotel)

Meyers & Associates Architects (Applicant)/ SNH Columbus Owner, LLC (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #19-4-12, Commissioner Fergus returned to the table.

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #19-4-13 was divided into Items 'a', 'b' and 'c' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

19-4-13a

New Hotel Signage

Approve Application 19-4-13a, 750 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

- Install one (1) new, neon wall sign in the cornice area of the façade, per the submitted drawings.
- New wall sign to include hotel name, “Graduate,” in open-face exposed neon channel letters, measuring 102” W x 44” H.
- Install two (2) new “Graduate- Columbus” signs, located at the front and rear entrances, per the submitted drawings.
- New signs to be painted aluminum letters.
- All fasteners to be into mortar, not into the face of the brick.

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED

19-4-13b

Continue Application 19-4-13b, 1178-1182 North High Street, to allow time for applicants to submit revised drawings for Poindexter Coffee signage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the May 14, 2019 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (5-0-0) CONTINUED

Commissioner Comments:

- The three different signs appear to apply to three different entities.
- Consider better ways to integrate the signage with the architecture, such as stretching out the wall sign to fit the sign band.
- Could “lounge man” be a steel, profile cut projecting sign or window graphic?

19-4-13c

Continue Application 19-4-13c, 1178-1182 North High Street, to allow time for applicants to submit revised drawings for Shake Shack, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the May 14, 2019 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (5-0-0) CONTINUED

Commissioner Comments:

- Consider removing the “burger” from the wall sign and using the burger as a wall sign, or moving the “burger” to the south wall.
- There is a lot of signage clustered in one spot. Perhaps a blade sign could work better on the other side of the door.
- Being creative, while staying within the guidelines, is encouraged.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

• **19-4-1**

1188 N. High St.

1188 N High LS LLC (Owner)

Approve application #19-4-1, 1188 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove broken lintel on 3rd floor window.
- Repair/replace lintel to match existing, in kind like-for-like.
- Spot tuck point as needed to match existing.

Spot Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings", available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

• **19-4-2**

77 E. Lincoln St.

True North Rentals (Owner)

Approve application #19-4-2, 77 E. Lincoln St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint dormer on east façade to match trim.
- Replace two (2) panes of glass to match existing.
- Remove plywood over window opening, paint, and replace glass to match existing.
- Paint window on north elevation to match trim.

• **19-4-3**

200 E. Third Ave.

Shelly And Sands, Inc. (Applicant)/ New Victorians, Inc. (Owner)

Approve application #19-4-3, 200 E. Third Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Create temporary staging area for City of Columbus High Street Improvement Phase 3 & 4.
- Site to be used for material and equipment storage.
- Strip top soil and place stone surface in conformance with all City of Columbus Building & Zoning requirements.
- Approval is good from April 2019 to May 2020; once completed all stone will be removed and top soil reinstalled.

• **19-4-4**

848 N. Pearl St.

New Avenue Architects (Applicant)/ Jungie, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #19-4-4, 848 N. Pearl St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Re-roof existing single-story building per submitted specifications. New roof to be Carlisle TPO "Slate Gray".
- Remove existing skylights.
- Install new gutters and downspouts; to be Uniclاد "Matte Black".
- Paint exterior façade; color to be Sherwin Williams "Tricorn Black". **NOTE: Existing unpainted brick portion of building is to remain unpainted. Paint approval is for the previously painted concrete block portion only.**

Install New TPO Roof

- Remove any/all EPDM, and/or rolled roofing down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new TPO (Thermoplastic polyolefin) single-ply roofing membrane in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings. Color to be either "Black" or "Gray". ("Slate Gray").
- Re-install any/all deteriorated and damaged roof capping from parapet wall, any required replacement capping is to match existing with sample to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval prior to installation.

Exterior Painting

- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

- **19-4-5**

298 E. Fourth Ave.

Fairfax Homes, Inc. (Owner)

Approve application #19-4-5, 298 E. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new 6' wood privacy fence per submitted site plan and specifications.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and site plan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **19-4-6**

Multiple Addresses (Fifth to Goodale avenues)

Short North Alliance (Applicant)

Approve Application 19-4-6, Multiple Addresses (Fifth to Goodale avenues), as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Installation of temporary murals on multiple locations for the "Short North Arts District Mini Mural" program for 2019.
- The submission includes every possible mini mural location as identified by the Mini Mural Committee, which upon approval of locations will identify which site will be used for the 2019 program.

- **19-4-7**

1180 N. Pearl St.

Strategis LLC (Applicant)/ Verizon Wireless (Owner)

Approve application #19-4-7, 1180 N. Pearl St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Modification of existing telecommunication tower and equipment platform behind penthouse per submitted drawings and specifications.

- **19-4-8**

166 Punta Aly.

Steve & Michelle Vander Stouw (Owners)

Approve application #19-4-8, 166 Punta Aly., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence: siding and garage doors to be Sherwin Williams “Valspar’s Waters Edge” (5003-6A), window casings, trim, porch posts, railings, spindles, soffit, gutters and downspouts to be Sherwin Williams “Moderne White (SW6168), window frames, screens, newel post caps, and molding to be Sherwin Williams “Tricorn Black” (SW6258), front, back and garage doors to be Sherwin Williams “Coral Reef” (SW6606), and front porch and rear porch floors to be Sherwin Williams “Web Gray” (SW7075).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **19-4-9**

1047 Hamlet St.

Eric D. Martineau (Applicant)/ Steve McCoy & Ji-Young Ann (Owners)

Approve application #19-4-9, 1047 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- Summary: tear off and rebuild prior 60+ years old addition and construct new 2 car garage with single dwelling unit on the second floor (carriage house).
- 3332.039 – applicant seeks a variance to permit separate residence to be constructed on single parcel, which is not permitted in an R-4 district.
- 3332.05 – Lot width. Permit existing lot width of 25 feet despite code’s 50 foot minimum.
- 3332.15 – Lot area. For density purposes, 3332.18(c) states if the depth of a lot is more than three times the width of such lot, a depth of only three times such width shall be used in computing density. The lot herein is 25.5’ wide and 129.67’ deep. For density purposes, the lot dimensions are 25.5’ x 76.5’, giving a lot size of 1,950.75 SF. Variance is requested to allow the existing lot area of 1,950.75 SF despite code’s requirement of 5,000 SF for 2 dwelling units.
- 3332.19 – Fronting on a public street. Applicant seeks variance to allow the carriage house to front on the public alley.
- 3332.25 – Maximum Side Yard – side yards for each residence (existing house and proposed carriage house) would be required to have the sum of each side yard equal or exceed 20% lot width. The lot is 25’ wide, which would require 5’ of total side yard. The house and the new addition have 6.1’ of total side yard, so no variance is required for that structure. However, the proposed carriage house would have 4.0’ total side yard. Applicant seeks a variance to permit the carriage house to have a total side yard of 4.0.
- 3332.26 – Minimum side yard. Code requires three (3’) feet on lot width of 40’ or less, and the existing historic house has as well as the proposed carriage house have only has 1’ of side yard to the North.
- 3332.27 - Rear yard. Zoning code requires each dwelling to have a rear yard equal to 25% of the gross lot area. 3332.18(D) states that in calculating coverage area, the lot shall be deemed to extend to the center of any alley adjoining the rear lot line of the lot. Under this calculation, the existing house has 917 SF of rear yard (27.7%), so

no variance is required for the main house. The carriage house would be required to have its own rear yard, so a variance to 0 SF is required for the carriage house.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

- Commissioner Goodman noted that the sign code requires projecting signs to be 10' above the sidewalk, which is not always happening along the corridor.
- IVC has allowed signs at a lower height, but some national sign companies have insisted they could not do that based on code.
- Would like to have some clarification on this point.
- Briefly discussed the possibility of giving recognition for outstanding projects.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (5-0-0) ADJOURNED