

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

**Tuesday, June 11, 2019
4:00 p.m.**

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, Shannon Fergus, Ben Goodman, Jason Sudy, Lauren Crosby.

Commissioners Absent: David Cooke, Brooke Michl-Smith.

Staff Present: Connie Torbeck, Kimberly Barnard.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:07 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, July 2, 2019 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, July 9, 2019 at 4pm.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, May 11, 2019.
MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM – Members of the Jeffrey Park Home Owners Association discussed the proposed office building, concerns with its design and placement in the neighborhood, and parking and traffic issues that could be associated with the development.
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. **19-6-13**
288/294 East Fourth
Julie Bullock Architects (Applicant)/Clarizio Properties –Brad Clarizio (Owner)
 - MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

2. **19-2-19b**
115 East Fifth Avenue
DaNite Sign Co -Oliver Holtsberry (Applicant)/BFWB Partners LLC (Owners)
Approve application #19-2-19b, 115 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted:
 - Install a new canopy wrap sign with open face neon letters and exposed neon lettering.
 - Open face channel letters will be 3” deep and painted white on the inside, black on the outside.
 - Exposed neon will be white.
 - Install crown molding at the top of the canopy wrap.
 - All conduit and power supplies are to be hidden inside the aluminum framework.MOTION: Fergus/Crosby (3-1-0) APPROVED. [Goodman]

3. **19-5-25**

306 East Fourth Avenue

Mode Architects (Applicant)/ Fairfax Homes, Inc. (Owner)

Approve application #19-5-25, 306 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new 2-story, 2258-sqft home with 264-sqft attached one-story garage.
- Construct new 264-sqft detached garage.
- Amend drawings to show a solid rail on the alley (east) side of breezeway and no railing. Leave the railing on the west side of the breezeway, facing the internal courtyard.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Boyer/Fergus (4-1-0) APPROVED. [Goodman]

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. **19-6-14**

770 Hamlet Street

Ingrid and Peter Navarro (Owner)

Approve application #19-6-14, 770 Hamlet Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct a 6 foot wood privacy fence. Stain and seal to match porch and front door stain.
- Construct gate between 770 and 774 Hamlet property line.
- Install a concrete sidewalk and gate entrance on south side of property.
- Install pavers (Oberfields Natural Stone –Slate Grey) rear patio with Rosetta Steps –Scioto blend for rear exit.
- Landscape the front with limelight hydrangeas and an ornamental tree.
- Steps to be cut stone, not rustic/natural.
- Location of gate on the south side of the house should be a minimum of 1 ½ back from the front of the house, in line with neighboring fence at 766 Hamlet.
- Submit details of solid metal fence and sidewalk location to staff.
- Submit elevations of gates and section drawings of fence for both the metal and wood fences.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

5. **19-6-15**

271 East Greenwood Avenue and 268 East 4th Avenue

House to Home Property Group –Gary Clark (Owner)

Recommend approval of application # 19-6-15, 271 East Greenwood Avenue and 268 East 4th Avenue, as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 3332.19- Fronting- With the proposed building plans, a variance is requested to be able to front a new build home on Greenwood Ave.
- 3312.25- Maneuvering- A variance is requested to allow the combination of the space on both parcels to allow for proper maneuverability.
- 3332.05- Area district lot width requirements- To reduce the required lot width from 50 feet to 32 feet.
- 3332.26- Minimum side yard permitted- to build garages closer than 3 feet from the edge of the lot line so that each garage will have 20' of maneuverability space within the lots.
- 3332.15- R-4 area district requirements- A variance is requested to be able to build on a lot size that is smaller than 5,000 square feet.
- 3312.13- Driveway (A)- A variance is requested for the width of the driveway for both 275 E Greenwood (from 10 feet to 2 feet) and at 271 E Greenwood (from 10 feet to 8 feet) because of the division made by the property line.
- 3332.18- Basis of computing area- In the proposed site plan, 268 E 4th Ave has a total lot coverage of 51 percent. A variance is being requested to allow the extra one percent of the lot to be covered.

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (5-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

Conceptual Review

- Install a shared concrete driveway.
- Construct two (2) new single-family homes and associated garages on existing vacant parcel.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners thought the design was fairly appropriate.
- There is a lot of lot coverage. The pavers need to be permeable.
- The rake ends are traditionally straight across.
- 8 inch overhands are okay for the garage, should be more on the house.
- Windows are typically 3 by 6 feet, what is showing is squat and more appropriate for suburban houses. Recommend that the windows on the second floor are the same size as those on the first floor.
- The materials listed throughout the packet need to be consistent and that the vinyl noted was not appropriate. Hardy board would be an appropriate material.
- Commissioners noted that the gutters and goose neck lights that were proposed are appropriate.

6. 19-6-16

Jeffrey Park Phase VI & VII, Central Park

Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Park New Day, LLC (Owner)

Continue application #19-6-18, Jeffrey Park Phase VI & VII, Central Park, to allow the applicant time to submit additional materials:

- New 2-acre central park, open on two sides and surrounded on two sides by 88 for-sale condominiums (60 Harris Flats/28 Keats).
- The Keats will be conventional townhomes that are 7-units buildings.
- The Flats are elevator served with 12 units per building.
- The building materials are brick, cementitious siding, and glass.

MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (4-0-1) [Fergus] CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments:

Goodman:

- The Harris Flats feel flat and the entrance area feels commercial. Can't tell if the modest design will work yet.
- Keats seem appropriate structure. Feels like a townhouse and has real entrances.
- Concerned about the street end on Dickenson.
- Still on board with the metal overhead in the alleys.
- Appreciates how the alleyways meet the park. Suggested there might be seat walls to define space.

Boyer:

- Harris Flats are a different type of living, from an architectural stand point not a big issue.
- Only concern is lighting from the stairwell.
- Does not get the public walkways; doesn't think they'll be used.
- Suggests putting in retail space along the edge as pedestrian walkway.
- Appreciates that the buildings are different. Recommended that the spaces between the buildings be different, suggested it was an opportunity to focus.

Crosby:

- Agreed that the spaces between the buildings could be varied.
- Noted that safety was an issue. Concerned about cars versus people in spaces.

Sudy:

- The edge of the Keats doesn't feel like an edge into the park.
- There are flat ends where there shouldn't be flat ends. Suggested to change shapes to a "U" or "L."
- Understands the Harris Flats with the lobby on the park end.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
------------------------------------	--------------------------

Kirk McHugh 321 Auden Street Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Requested retail space be incorporated. • Noted that the height was cause for concern for the other townhomes in the area.
Scott Leibowitz 296 Cornelius Street Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concern for current plan which would cause traffic and transportation issues. • Requests that work on Dickinson Street be moved back.

7. 19-6-17

1144 North High Street

John Ingwersen (Applicant)/Mary Bohannan, et al (Owners)

Approve application # 19-6-17, 1144 North High Street, as submitted:

- Addition of exterior 16’ by 8’ walk-in cooler on east side of building.
- Construction of screening fence of 2x8 hardy plank on a steel tube frame.
- Painted to match existing wall color.

MOTION: Boyer/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

8. 19-6-18

1144 North High Street

John Ingwersen (Applicant)/Mary Bohannan, et al (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Install a canopy structure that covers a portion of the exterior patio extending from the existing fascia.
- Canopy would have a metal frame with its aluminum fascia to match the existing with neon and marquee bulbs.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

Sudy:

- Does not support the idea of a canopy.
- The original overhangs need to be respected, the proposed design obliterates that.
- Could consider a canopy/awning that is more artistic, which would reflect the artistic nature of the district.
- The proposed awning would have to be a pretty remarkable design.

Fergus:

- Not in favor of the awning either.
- Understands the newer history of the outdoor space.
- The canopy would allow for more outdoor seating, just putting in additional seats in this is a potential problem.

Boyer:

- May be more open to the idea, though there’s no compelling reason why.
- Could clarify the entrances, they are awkward. Suggests to reinforce the original entrance.
- Not sure about the skylights.
- Not quite there yet with the design.

Goodman:

- The design needs to feel like a separate item. Doesn’t like the canopy/awning blended together with the building.
- Not opposed to covering the patio area.
- Proposed the idea of a canopy/awning that is funky auto-cover vernacular. Something like where cars would drive in at a Drive-In restaurant.

Crosby:

- Like the idea behind the proposal but needs to see something different.

9. 19-6-19

88 Brickel Street

Joseph A. Moss (Applicant)/ Bo Bruns (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Exploration of potential addition of third story.
- Approach 1 considers a minimalist glass entablature that would cover the rectangular space of the house.
- Approach 2 considers a cross gable with a narrow terrace that would cover the rectangular space of the house.
- Approach 3 considers a rooftop garden taking up the “L” shape with a mezzanine/roof access filling the currently empty quadrant of the site.

NO ACTION TAKEN

NOTE: The application was continued to July 9TH IVC Hearing at the applicant's request.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

- **19-6-1**

770 Hamlet Street

Ingrid Navarro (Applicant/Owner)

Approve application #19-6-1, 770 Hamlet Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Paint house and trim “HC-154 Ben Moore Hale Navy” and the fascia/soffit white.
- Porch posts and the front door will be stained.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **19-6-2**

698 North High Street

Steve Weis (Applicant)/ 692 & High LLC (Owner)

Approve application #19-6-2, 698 North High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the commercial building for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint colors to be Benjamin Moore “Land of Liberty” and “Essex Green,” per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick piers, stone plinths, stone sills and lintels) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **19-6-3**

1088 and 1090 Mount Pleasant Avenue

Emily Tanoury and Mary Colleen Will (Applicants/Owners)

Approve application #19-6-3, 1088 and 1090 Mount Pleasant Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace existing retaining wall in poor condition.
- Shape of the new retaining wall with match the existing wall.
- Use Oberfields’ rosetta dimensional wall to construct new wall, with an overall height of 22.5 inches.

Repair Masonry Retaining Wall

- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **19-6-6**

638-642 North High Street

Richard Bruggeman (Applicant)/ Armbrust Properties (Owner)

Approve application #19-6-6, 638-642 North High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace 20 windows on the front and northwest side of the building. Second and third floors only.
- New windows to be Weathershield Premium Series 8109.

Replace Deteriorated/Altered/Non-Original Windows

- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the second and third floor of the front and northwest side of the building as per City Staff site visit determination.
- Install new, 1-OVER-1, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

- **19-6-7**

295 East Fifth Avenue

Xhevair Brakaj (Applicant)

Approve application #19-6-7, 295 East Fifth Avenue, for renewal of expired COA #17-4-16 (Expired: April 18, 2018), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Approve application 17-4-16a, 295 & 301 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:
301 E. Fifth Ave.

- *Remove existing rear fire escape, and return non-original door to a window.*
- *Repair siding as needed to match existing.*
- *Remove deteriorated windows and install new all-wood interior/exterior DHWs sized exactly to fit the existing openings.*
- *The first floor bay window is to be modified to be a bay with transom.*

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (7-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve application 17-4-16b, 295 & 301 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:
301 E. Fifth Ave.

- *Remove porch infill and restore open porch per submitted drawings.*
- *An engaged column is to be added against the house.*

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (7-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve application 17-4-16c, 295 & 301 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:
301 E. Fifth Ave.

- *Approval of 'Phase I' siteplan with parking plan.*
- *The duration of 'Phase I' site condition is not to extend past 18 months from the time of issuance.*

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (7-0-0) APPROVED.

- **19-6-8**

301 East Fifth Avenue

Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

Approve application #19-6-8, 301 East Fifth Avenue, for renewal of expired COA #17-4-16 (Expired: April 18, 2018), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Approve application 17-4-16a, 295 & 301 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

301 E. Fifth Ave.

- Remove existing rear fire escape, and return non-original door to a window.
- Repair siding as needed to match existing.
- Remove deteriorated windows and install new all-wood interior/exterior DHWs sized exactly to fit the existing openings.
- The first floor bay window is to be modified to be a bay with transom.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (7-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve application 17-4-16b, 295 & 301 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:
301 E. Fifth Ave.

- Remove porch infill and restore open porch per submitted drawings.
- An engaged column is to be added against the house.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (7-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve application 17-4-16c, 295 & 301 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:
301 E. Fifth Ave.

- Approval of 'Phase I' siteplan with parking plan.
- The duration of 'Phase I' site condition is not to extend past 18 months from the time of issuance.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (7-0-0) APPROVED.

• **19-6-9**

243 Detroit Avenue

Logan Fitch (Applicant)/ LS Development Systems LLC (Owner)

Approve application #19-6-9, 243 Detroit Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair all exterior trim and siding, like for like.
- Paint exterior trim "SW 7005 Pure White."
- Paint exterior siding and gable siding "SW 7019 Gauntlet Grey."

Repair Wood Siding

- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

• **19-6-10**

1076-78 Summit Street

Logan Fitch (Applicant)/LS Development Systems LLC (Owner)

Approve application #19-6-10, 1076-78 Summit Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint doors and trim Sherwin Williams "Tricorn Black."

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips. Paint color to be Sherwin Williams "Tricorn Black" for the doors and trim.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **19-6-11**
665 Kerr Street
Christopher Premanandan (Owner)
Approve application #19-6-11, 665 Kerr Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Repair individual pickets and replace sections using dog eared cedar pickets or panels (Home Depot SKU #559087) surrounding the rear of the parking area.
 - No changes will be made to the location of the fence.Install New Privacy Fence
 - Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to match the existing fence.

- **19-6-12**
792 Summit Street
Cathleen & Zach Graves (Owners)
Approve Application 19-6-12, 792 Summit Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
Install New Trim / Front Porch
 - Install new, scroll-sawn, wood trim along the bottom of the frieze board to match the existing trim on the front porch at 796 Summit Street, per the submitted photos.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer, according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint to match the existing "Green" trim.

- **19-6-13**
288/294 East Fourth
Julie Bullock Architects (Applicant)/Clarizio Properties –Brad Clarizio (Owner)
Approve Application 19-6-13, 288/294 East Fourth, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
Variance Recommendation Request
 - 3332.039 R-4 Residential District, to split two (2) residential lots (288 and 294 E. 4th) into four (4) parcels for the purpose of building two (2) new single family homes.
 - 3332.05 Area lot width requirements. Lots A, B, C, D : to reduce the required lot width from 50 feet to 32 feet
 - 3332.14 R-4 Area district requirements to reduce the minimum lot area from 5000 square feet to 2877 square feet for lots A and B and to 2848 square feet for lots C and D.
 - 3332.19 Fronting. Lots A & B: To allow a dwelling to not front upon a public street.
 - 3332.13 Driveway lots B, C, and D: To not provide a driveway to an off street parking space or garage on the same parcel as the dwelling; to provide a shared driveway with easement access on adjacent parcels.
 - 3332.25 Maneuvering: Lots B, C and D: To not provide complete on site maneuvering for vehicles and to provide maneuvering via easements on adjacent parcels to access parking.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Goodman/Crosby (4-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (5-0-0) ADJOURNED.