

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

**Tuesday, July 9, 2019
4:00 p.m.**

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, Shannon Fergus, Ben Goodman, David Cooke, Brooke Michl-Smith.

Commissioners Absent: Jason Sudy, Lauren Crosby.

Staff Present: Kimberly Barnard.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:06 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, August 6, 2019 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, August 13, 2019 at 4pm.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, June 11, 2019.
MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (3-0-1) APPROVED. [Cooke]
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. 19-7-11

115 East Fifth Avenue

DaNite Sign Co -Oliver Holtsberry (Applicant)/BFWB Partners LLC (Owners)

Approve application #19-7-11, 115 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install a new double-sided non-illuminated projecting sign.
- Install gooseneck lighting.
- Applicant to work with staff to submit a sign that will be assembled like an “Oreo” with die cut sign with a white core material.
- The sign fabricator will use real Corten or a rusting metal for the sign. Sign will be three layers with the white being the center core and the Corten being the outer edges, like an “Oreo.”
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

2. 19-7-12

1146 North Fourth Street

Mike Maloof (Applicant)/ FK III LP (Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

3. 19-5-26

963 Mt Pleasant Avenue

Michael Maistros (Applicant)/ Francesca Laborie and Thomas O’Farrell (Owners)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

4. 19-6-16

Jeffrey Park Civitas and Dickenson (Phase VI & VII, Central Park)

Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Park New Day, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #19-6-16 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action.

19-6-16a

Approve application #19-6-16a, Jeffrey Park Phase VI & VII, Central Park, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Architecture and Design of Buildings

- Approve the architecture of the two buildings (Keats and Harris) on the east side of the park with the understanding appropriate work to minimize and/or eliminate “dog houses” on the roof and come back with an alternative design.
- No EFIS or break metal, implementing solid stock metals for rail systems and handrails.
- No broken or split lintels.
- Applicant to bring back a ½” to 1’ cross section and elevation drawing of porches/entrances of the Keats.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-1) APPROVED. [Fergus]

19-6-16b

Continue application #19-6-16b, Jeffrey Park Civitas and Dickenson (Phase VI & VII, Central Park), to allow the applicant time to submit additional materials.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-1) CONTINUED. [Fergus]

Commissioner Comments:

- Support for the materials, design, scale, and architecture of the structures.
- Some Commissioners were still concerned about the curb cuts and pedestrian safety.
- Continued study of the four (4) structures in the southwest corner of the area and context of park to the northwest.
- Concerns about how buildings interact with the proposed park.
- Not all Commissioners were in favor of the slab on grade.
- The area feels confusing, piecemeal, and needs connectivity in a community aspect. There were also concerns about how the connectivity to other areas.

NEW APPLICATIONS

5. 19-7-13

Jeffrey Park Dickenson (Phase VIII)

Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Park New Day, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-13 Jeffrey Park Dickenson (Phase VIII), as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Eliminated 20 apartments from previous design to take the opening from 60’ to 90’.
- Half the balconies have been removed and the other half are fully integrated into the buildings.
- Roof parapet will hide the vents and mechanical equipment.
- End caps are stone and brick with clay camelback coping tiles.
- First floor porches will have three steps and an entry door at all 33 locations.
- No EIFS or large metal panels will be used.
- Classic approach on the elevations and materials makes it urban in nature.
- Landscaping will be a future submission.
- Lobby is raised three steps.

- The courtyard entrance that contains the canopy, raised stoop details and handrail detailing, signage, and lighting is withheld for a future investigation and approval at a future Hearing.

MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (4-0-1) APPROVED. [Fergus]

6. 19-7-14

1124 North High Street

Brian Swanson (Applicant)/1122-1124 North High Street, LLC (Owner)

Continue application #19-7-14, 1124 North High Street, to allow the applicant time to submit additional materials.

- Install new accordion style bi-fold windows.
- New windows will be 84" by 125" will be the exact same size as the existing windows.
- Bi-fold windows will fold into the interior.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-1-0) CONTINUED.

Commission Comments:

- Opposed to the wall and modular windows without addressing the store front as a whole.
- Do not support nanowall storefront. Applicant instructed to work with Staff to look below the stone at various locations.
- Heartburn over the middle door.
- Would like to see global vision, with a next step and finish line in sight.

7. 19-7-15

1190 North High Street

Benjamin Stoyka (Applicant)/ Kevin Lykens (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-15, 1190 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install projecting sign on store front using existing mounting holes from the previous sign.
- Install vinyl sign, street number, and hours on the windows, measuring 19 ½" by 18".
- A 2'11" by 13' vinyl decal of store name is proposed in transom windows.
- A 2'6" by 4'8" vinyl decal of the store logo is proposed centered in the store window.
- Ice cream graphic on front window to be frosted vinyl (size is okay).
- The approval does not include the graphics in the transom windows. Applicant is to work with staff for an appropriate solution.

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED.

8. 19-7-16

856 Summit Street

Moving Forward Property Group –Bill and Alex Kirke (Owners)

Approve application #19-7-16, 856 Summit Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Paint fence on the property's side to match the house.
- Replace deteriorated windows and broken storms with JeldWen vinyl windows to match the existing windows.
- Add wood trim to maintain the look of the old storm windows.
- If needed, could replace the 4 street facing windows with Marvin Integrity Wood Ultra windows (from the Approved Windows List).

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (0-5-0) DENIED.

Reasons for Denial

- Vinyl windows are not appropriate for the district and all need to be from the Approved Windows List.
- No approval or permit was issued for the windows.
- CC3116:11 – Standards of Alteration: (2) The distinguishing characteristics of the property shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural feature shall be avoided whenever possible.

- CC3116:11 – Standards of Alteration: (5) Distinctive stylistic features and examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be treated with sensitivity.
- CC3116:11 – Standards of Alteration: (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features shall be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures.

9. 19-7-17

750 North High Street

SureSite Consulting –on behalf of Sprint (Applicant)/ SNH Columbus Owner LLC (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-17, 750 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Modify existing telecommunications facility on roof, moving equipment and antennas from the roof to the penthouse roof.
- Adding screening material around the site.
- Installation includes new ship ladder to penthouse roof, installing a 7' by 7' steel platform on penthouse, install 3 new panel antennas on new screening wall, install 6 new RRH's at antenna level, install, 3 new hybrid cables,, install new jumpers on RRH/antennas, install new Sprint PCC and 1 new telco cabinet on H-frame, install new I-Cab and E-Cab cabinets on platform, and install new GPS antenna.
- Relocate existing utilities to platform on penthouse.
- Relocate 3 existing Clearwire antennas, 3 radios, 1 antenna to microwave screening wall.
- Erect one 9' tall FRP screen around wall of entire penthouse.
- Remove existing Clearwire cabinet, cables, and platform.
- The screening material is to match the existing penthouse if repainted by the Graduate Hotel.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED.

10. 19-7-18

750 North High Street

Short North Alliance (Applicant)/ AJ Capital Partners (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-18, 750 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Place three (3) permanent public art murals on the exterior building of 750 North High Street (Graduate Hotel).
- Murals are to be on south side (small wall) of Shake Shack, south wall, and north wall.
- Maintained per submitted maintenance plan.

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (4-1-0) [Cooke] APPROVED.

11. 19-7-19

608 North High Street

Short North Alliance (Applicant)/ Nest Egg Properties –James Harris (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-19, 608 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Place temporary mural (“Reverence” by Melissa Ayote) on south wall of building, per attached material.
- One of ten murals that will be placed throughout the district.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-1-0) [Goodman] APPROVED.

12. 19-7-20

720 North Pearl Street/38 East Lincoln Street

Zach Kendall (Applicant)/ The Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-20, 720 North Pearl Street/38 East Lincoln Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Request to add an additional opening in the North elevation.
- Opening would be an exit-only for private parkers out to Cedar Alley.

- Cars would be directed to turn left toward Pearl Street.
 - Overhead security door will be painted or screened a color that matches the building. Paint color chips or screening for garage door are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint or installation.
- MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.

13. 19-7-21

1050 North Fourth Street

DSC Holdings 1050 N Fourth Street, LLC –Dave Perry (Owner)

Recommend approval of application # 19-7-21, 1050 North Fourth Street,
Variance Recommendation Request

- Section 3333.03, AR-3, Apartment Residential District use, to permit a maximum of 2,500 SF of retail commercial and/or art gallery use.
- Section 3333.15(C), Basis of Computing Area, to increase permitted lot coverage from 50% to 89% coverage.
- Section 3333.18(F), Building Lines, to reduce the calculated building setback line of buildings to the north and south from 20 feet to zero (0) feet.
- Section 3333.24, Rear Yard, to reduce rear yard from 25% of lot area to 2% of lot area.

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (5-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

14. 19-7-22

1050 North Fourth Street

Shremshock Architects –Karrick Sherrill (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Proposed demolition of the existing Durable Slate building.
- Project would be a 67 unit wood-framed apartment building with parking at grade on the first floor.
- Includes commerce space on the first floor.
- Stone detailing from the existing building will be reused to the extent that they are salvage as architectural follies in appropriate locations to be determined.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners as a whole would like to see a submission for the project at Fourth and First Avenues.

Commissioner Cooke

- Having a hard time with the massing. The massive first floor has negative spaces and doesn't feel like a historic storefront.
- Concerned about "sawed off top" on yellow building, windows on the other building.
- Push the building back so that there can be landscaping on Fourth Street level as High Street has done.
- Doesn't understand the coloration, especially with the dark coloring.
- Landscaping needs work, possibly push back the footprint to allow for more greenery and landscaping.
- Around one of the corners at the first floor level, place a historic plaque on side of the building mentioning the limestone pieces were from a former building and giving a history.

Commissioner Fergus

- Design has come a long way. Appreciates one building has a historic front. Having a modern building to the side creates a nice juxtaposition.
- Not a lot of space for a market type user along North High and North Fourth Street. Does not want another large restaurant just because that's how the market is going.

Commissioner Goodman

- Rendering is not showing the storefront well, would like to see more details.
- In terms of design and archetype it fits in with the area.

- Brick work at datum would soften the look, or a cornice piece with corbeling.
- Supports that the building appears as two different structures with a courtyard in between. Believes that is a good thing.
- Suggests having a pocket park.
- Would like to see more openings including more than one entrance.
- Suggests looking at Kramer Place south on Fourth Street (825 North Fourth Street). There are raised terraces there that may be a good solution to landscaping here.

Commissioner Michl-Smith

- Agrees with Commissioner Cooke's comments about openings in the blonde building.
- Scale of single door entrance feels insubstantial.
- Does not like brick knee wall in front of the door.

Commissioner Boyer

- The red building should have multiple entrances. Suggests removing double-hung punch windows.
- Bring in awnings, canopies to help the scale of this, especially the blonde building. May not be appropriate for the street now.
- From a pedestrian experience it may need a little help.

~~15. 19-7-23~~

~~Jeffrey Park Dickenson Street (Phase IX)~~

~~Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Park New Day, LLC (Owner)~~

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~16. 19-7-24~~

~~88 Brickel Street~~

~~Joseph A. Moss (Applicant)/ Bo Bruns (Owner)~~

~~WITHDRAWN~~

17. 19-7-25

1090 Say Avenue

Joseph A. Moss (Applicant)/ Andrew Klein (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Two phases of work planned. Phase I is this submission which includes the following.
- Remove portions of existing 160 square foot eastern addition to the house.
- Construct a two story addition at the east end of the house which would have the kitchen and sitting on the first floor and a master bedroom on the second.
- Phase II proposes to subdivide parcel and construct a two story residence on the north parcel with a two car garage which will have a studio apartment above. Proposed general massing is shown.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- Overall support for the addition.
- Not concerned about setback as there is some modern buildings on Say Avenue and there is vegetation between the addition and the street that it will soften the addition.
- Couple places in the design that honors or applies a narrative.
- Interesting commentary bridge building; connects the old and new well.
- Suggests expression of a roof pitch instead of it being totally flat.
- One of the Commissioners suggested that a narrative be found of the twisted shape with the same footprint as the existing structure or openings match the brick building as a transition.
- All of the mass on the south side adds a lot of value to the house and the patio is a nice touch.
- One of the Commissioners was lukewarm on the projection to the north as it did not seem necessary. Feels like the piece is the least resolved and that it starts to dominate the design.

- Nicely executed but there are a few things to fix.

18. 19-7-26

84 East Lincoln Street

Mike and Jennifer Brello (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Addition of a second floor master suite to be built over existing kitchen, which was a 1980s addition (1987 COA# 87-5-7).
- Exterior modifications proposed to northwest corner of the first floor kitchen to accommodate second story structure.
- New construction of second story master to include hardi-plank siding, Marvin wood windows with SDL, and painted to match the existing house colors (Downing Sand/Weathered Shingle/Townhouse Harbor Brown).

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners expressed favor in the design and thought it was right on track.
- Questioned if the removal of trees would be something that needed to be done.
- East elevation seemed a bit bland, a Commissioner suggested adding another window.

19. 19-7-27

141 East Third Street

Laurie Gunzelman (Applicant)/ Eric Harter (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Exterior alteration and site improvement to existing residential structure.
- Clean and tuck point existing brick façade.
- Paint exterior rowlock brick sill and existing metal coping.
- Replace twelve 9-lite fixed windows at upper level with 9-lite fixed windows, paint exterior casing.
- Replace two 20-lite fixed/awning windows with 2 -12 lite casement windows and 2 -8 lite fixed windows.
- Replace 2-panel glazed entry door with flush panel door sash, transom to remain.
- Replace garage door above with flush steel door and replace wood panel above.
- Remove concrete steps and concrete driveway beyond existing concrete sidewalk.
- Install new hardscape of brick pavers and raised brick step/landing to entry door with new metal railing.
- Replace exterior light fixtures.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Cooke

- Overall positive reception of design.
- Expressed slight concern about the infill material and its size.
- Suggested that the patio brick in front of the building be red but there be gray for the sidewalk/drive.
- Turning the steps towards the drive to give the resident the entire patio and extend the handrail.

Commissioner Goodman

- Suggested using a contrasting material.
- The handrail needs to be real steel with solid components.

Commissioner Boyer

- Understands the pavers, but not following. It looks like there would be a lot of small pieces.
- The west end of the drive becomes a drop off, suggests that area be played with.
- Concerned about the replacement of the front windows as the three separate windows would hurt the building. That would give it a residential feel which wouldn't work with the building.
- Suggests two large windows with mullions to honor the transom windows and mimic the industrial style.

Commissioner Michl-Smith

- Agrees with previous comments.

20. 19-7-28

1086 North Fourth Street (Budd Dairy)

Shremshock Architects –David Blair (Applicant)/ 1086 North Fourth St LS LLC -Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Proposed installation of a demountable tent on the rooftop of the Budd Dairy Building.
- Tent structure will cover the proposed rooftop bar and deck area in the center of the rooftop.
- Tent will be constructed out of clear PVC roof and wall panels with white PVC trim attached to a clear anodized aluminum structure.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- Concern was expressed about wheelchair access on the roof and if the piece was truly temporary.
- Request for what the structure would look like without the elements.
- Set back of the structure is nice and so is the proposed lighting.
- Request to see what the frame would look like when the tenting is down.
- A sample of the materials was requested as the Commission wants to ensure that quality materials are being approved.
- The frame needs to be the same color as the material per the Short North Design Guidelines, don't want high contrast.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

• **19-7-1**

933 Hamlet Street

St. Joseph Montessori School (Applicant)/ Diocese of Columbus (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-1, 933 Hamlet Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair retaining wall at the corner of 2nd Avenue and Summit Street to its original condition.
- Original stones will be used for repair.

Repair Masonry Retaining Wall

- Remove any/all damaged stone and replace with stone that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings" supplied by staff.)
- The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.

• **19-7-2**

933 Hamlet Street

St. Joseph Montessori School (Applicant)/ Diocese of Columbus (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-2, 933 Hamlet Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install a 6' tall fence as a dumpster screen which would be 20' in length.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **19-7-3**

1190 North High Street

Benjamin Stoyka (Applicants)/ Kevin Lykens (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-3, 1190 North High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint wood trim around windows SW6258 Tricorn Black, per submitted paint chip.
- Paint front door Valspar 2010-2 Island Orange, per submitted paint chip.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **19-7-4**

69-71 East First Avenue

Maurice Madry (Applicant)/ Maurice Madry and Tonette Rollo (Owners)

Approve Application 19-7-4, 69-71 E. First Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove/replace damaged and rotten wood on porch, dormer, fascia, and soffit as needed to match existing.
- Remove/replace porch, lattices, hand rails, porch deck, and steps to match existing.
- All new work to be primed and painted to match existing; any new paint colors to be submitted for review and approval.

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new 1" x 3" tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Restore the front porch banisters/hand rails/columns as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails/columns; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.

- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **19-7-5**

- **103 East Third Avenue**

- **Classic Exteriors –Cole Thompson (Applicant)/ Sebra Webber (Owner)**

- Approve application #19-7-5, 103 East Third Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Re-pour concrete porch foundation to match existing porch.
- Replace existing 4 by 4s posts with like material and paint to match existing wood siding.
- Install new flashing where the current material has rusted.
- New shingles to be installed on back porch from the approved list.
- Downspout tied into the existing drain.
- Remove and replace existing sidewalk.

- Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingles to be Owens Corning 3-tab in Estate Grey.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- Repair Downspouts

- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public and service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

NOTE: This staff approval does not include new exterior light. Additional material detailing what the proposed fixture will look like is required.

• **19-7-6**

85 East First Street #5

Able Roof (Applicant)/ Shelly Bulman and Kathleen Lewis (Owners)

Approve application #19-7-6, 85 East First Street #5, for renewal of expired COA #16-7-21 (Expired: September 14, 2017), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Item # 6 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the September 13th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting:

Install New Windows

- Remove the nine (9) existing, wood, three-over-one, double-hung sash windows.
- Install new, Marvin Integrity Wood-Ultrex, windows, three-over-one, double-hung sash windows and brickmold, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Three-over-one muntin pattern and dimensions to match existing window muntin pattern and dimensions.
- Exterior color to be “Stone White,” and interior to be Bare Pine.
- New windows to fit the existing window openings.
- Existing wood mullions between paired windows are to be retained, or replaced, in-like-kind.
- Installation to be done in phases.

Note: The Marvin Integrity Wood-Ultrex window is being approved based on the setting and circumstances of this particular property and discussion of the project at the July 19, 2016 Italian Village Commission.

• **19-7-7**

30 Warren Street

Jason Rowland (Applicant)/ Casa Di Citta, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #19-7-7, 30 Warren Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace wood retaining wall, like for like.

Replace Retaining Wall

- Remove any/all damaged wood and replace with wood that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- The height, thickness, and length of the wood wall is to remain the same.

• **19-7-8**

252 East Fourth Avenue

Myers Property Solutions –Josh Myers (Applicant)/ Lisa and Jessica WintonLi (Owners)

Approve application #19-7-8, 252 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
[] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[] English Gray Slate
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”

- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Exterior Painting

- Paint siding “Deep Ocean” by James Hardie
- Paint windows, fascia, and corner trim “Iron Gray” by James Hardie
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.

Landscaping

- Install new plantings and pavers per the submitted landscape plan.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6’ wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **19-7-9**

321 Auden Avenue

Kirk McHugh (Applicant/Owner)

Approve application #19-7-9, 321 Auden Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install Awning

- Install new canvas awning on third floor terrace per Jeffrey Park Townhome Roof Awning “C” drawing (COA # 19-5-27) and submitted materials.
- Install awning within the parapet wall and not to exceed that size.
- Awning to be installed with a straight valence in solid mocha/linen tweed fabric color.
- Frame to be installed will be a bronze/black to match the black railings.
- All connections are to be into mortar joints and not into the face of the brick.

- **19-7-10**

993 Summit Street

Shawn Khemsurov (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 19-7-10, 993 Summit Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Repair Box Gutters

- Repair/replace the existing box gutters, per the submitted specifications.
- Examine all box gutters on the brick house, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **19-7-12**

1146 North Fourth Street

Mike Maloof (Applicant)/ FK III LP (Owner)

Approve Application 19-7-12, 1146 North Fourth Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing concrete steps and block wall on south elevation of building.
- Install steel switchback stairs, landing, and railing in the same location and dimensions of the existing concrete stairs.
- Platforms, tracks, stringers, and railings will be installed per submitted documentation.
 - Top stair platform will be 48” by 36”, sub-frame 6” channel, and 1”x3/16 bar grating (flooring)

- Bottom platform will be 48” by 48”, sub-frame 6” channel well, and 1” by 3/16 bar grating.
- Tracks will be 45” by 12” wide by 2,” bullnose with 3/16 bar grating.
- Stringers will be 10 inch channel (8.4).
- Railings will be double-line pipe rail. 1 ¼” sch. 40 pipe at 36” high.
- Metal staircase will be primed and painted black.
- Column posts will be 4” square tube 11 gage

Remove Existing Concrete Steps and Install Concrete Steps

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete service steps, and disposes of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new metal steps in the exact same location and of the exact same dimensions, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

21. 19-5-26

963 Mt Pleasant Avenue

Michael Maistros (Applicant)/ Francesca Laborie and Thomas O’Farrell (Owners)

Approve Application 19-5-26, 963 Mt Pleasant Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- New dormer to be constructed in a similar fashion to the existing façade dormer with the exception of using painted horizontal cedar siding on the sides to match the original single story “bump-out” on the rear of the house. New dormer window to match existing dormer window on front of house.
- Cedar siding detail shall replace the sides of the existing front dormer to take the place of the current asphalt material.
- All exterior windows to be replaced with Jeldwen Sitrine Chestnut Bronze Aluminum Clad to match the original sizes before the fire. Windows will be 1-over-1 with the exception of the fixed windows in the dormers.
- Front and rear doors to be replaced with wood doors per submitted materials.
- Replace wood soffit and fascia to match existing, paint to match Musket Brown.
- Replace cedar lap siding and paint to match existing color.

Install New Doors

- Install new, solid core door in existing door jamb in front and rear of house. New door to be either a four-panel or half-lite wood door.
- Set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides.
- Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission

Replace Deteriorated/Altered/Non-Original Windows

- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the house as per City Staff site visit determination.
- Install new, 1-OVER-1 and fixed dormer windows, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.

- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (5-0-0) ADJOURNED.