

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

Tuesday, August 13, 2019

4:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, Shannon Fergus, Ben Goodman, David Cooke, Brooke Michl-Smith, Jason Sudy, Lauren Crosby.

Staff Present: Kimberly Barnard.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:06 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, September 3, 2019 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, September 10, 2019 at 4pm.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, July 9, 2019.
MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-2) APPROVED. [Sudy, Crosby]
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. **IV-19-08-008**
279 East Fifth Avenue
R.M. McFadyen Holdings Limited (Applicant)/F.K. IV L.P. (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
2. **IV-19-08-009**
886 North High Street
Brad Parish (Applicant)/United Dairy Farmers Inc. (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
3. **IV-19-08-010**
294 East Fourth Avenue
Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/Brad Clarizio (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
4. **IV-19-08-011**
271 East Greenwood Avenue and 268 East Fourth Avenue
House to Home Property Group –Gary Clark (Owner)
Approve application #IV-19-08-011, 271 East Greenwood Avenue and 268 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:
 - Install a shared concrete driveway between 271 and 275 East Greenwood Avenue to access parking for both 271 East Greenwood and 268 East Fourth Avenue
 - Area by garages will have permeable pavers.

- Construct two matching single family homes at 271 East Greenwood Avenue and 268 East Fourth Avenue.
 - Construct a single story, two –car garage for 268 East Fourth Avenue.
 - Drawings revised to include an appropriate garage door with lighting over it, enlarge the bedroom windows on the back of the house to 6-foot to match the windows on the front elevation, and change the porch detail on one of the houses.
 - Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.
- MOTION: Cooke/Crosby (7-0-0) APPROVED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

5. IV-19-08-012

790 North High Street (First Floor of the Moxy Hotel Building)

Gary Fischer (Applicant)/ Crawford Hoying (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-08-012 was divided into Items ‘a’ and ‘b’ for clarity of action.

IV-19-08-012a

Approve application #IV-19-08-012a, 790 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Townhall blade sign to be installed on west elevation.
- Proposed Townhall sign will measure 20 ¼” by 9’-4 ½”
- Propose the installation of an HVAC grille at the rear, east well of the covered patio.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (6-1-0) APPROVED. [Goodman]

IV-19-08-012b

Continue application # IV-19-08-012b, 790 North High Street, to allow the applicant time to redesign the patio area and submit additional materials.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-1) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners were not in favor of expanding the entire patio 2-feet west. Some Commissioners suggested reworking the idea so that not all of the patio extended further into the public right-of-way. There was particular concern where the cross-walk and pole were located at how slim that area would get, especially with the tree beds in the sidewalk.
- Areas where the patio should be kept at its original lease location included around the patio entrance near the cross-walk due to the existing pole.
- A Commissioner suggested a seasonal patio that could be taken out in the winter.
- The Commissioners recommended looking at the Short North Design Guidelines in regards to keeping area pedestrian friendly and reducing the number of seats on the patio.

6. IV-19-08-013

1060 and 1064 Say Avenue

Mark Rivers (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-08-013 was divided into Items ‘a’ and ‘b’ for clarity of action.

IV-19-08-013a

Approve application #IV-19-08-013a, 1060 and 1064 Say Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Changed garage door from swinging door to track style door.
- Paint trim SW HGSSW4001 “Fundamental White.”

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (7-0-0) APPROVED.

IV-19-08-013b

Continue application #IV-19-08-013b, 1060 and 1064 Say Avenue, to allow the applicant time to submit additional materials.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (7-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commissioners requested that the corners of the fence by the garage be finished including adding in an appropriate gate.
- Requested a scaled plan drawing of the area, including where the closed fence and gate was going to be. Specification sheets need to be provided to staff for the gate detail.
- Commissioners instructed the applicant to work with staff to determine if variances were needed and for determining the fence details.

7. IV-19-08-014

906 North High Street

Signco Inc (Applicant)/Emerald ECP Short North LLC (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-014, 906 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install signage on building.
- Install blade sign on west elevation with business' logo near entry.
- Install the third option which illustrates the halo lighted baffle sign, as per submitted drawings.
- Only one sign on the canopy is approved, the applicant may choose which side is more appropriate.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (7-0-0) APPROVED.

8. IV-19-08-015

1120 North High Street

Adrienne Consales (Applicant)/ Chris Corso (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-08-013 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action.

IV-19-08-015a

Approve application #IV-19-08-015a, 1120 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Current exterior awning to be removed.
- New signage to infill existing blade sign. Sign will be moved down its current location near the top of the elevation, to 9'6" above the sidewalk and will be centered over the door.
- Sign should be installed as per submitted drawing, indicating clean push through letters and at the height noted (9'-6").

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (7-0-0) APPROVED.

IV-19-08-015b

Approve application #IV-19-08-015b, 1120 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- 2" galvanized safety rail to be installed in both windows at 3' above the sidewalk.

MOTION: Fergus/Sudy (0-7-0) DENIED.

Reasons for Denial

- The bar has never been approved across by the Italian Village Commission.
- The installation of the bars were part of a previous code violation.
- Do not fit in with character of the Short North.
- CC3116:11 – Standards of Alteration: (5) Distinctive stylistic features and examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be treated with sensitivity.

9. IV-19-08-016

1090 Say Avenue

Joseph A. Moss (Applicant)/ Andrew Klein (Owner)

Continue application #IV-19-08-016, 1090 Say Avenue, to allow the applicant time to submit additional materials.

- Remove portions of existing 160 square foot eastern historic addition to the house.
- Construct a two story addition at the east end of the house which would extend past the current north and south elevations. The second story of the north and south elevations would extend over first story.

MOTION: Cooke/Crosby (7-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commissioners expressed overall favor of the addition.
- Generally supportive of modern approach as it's further back on the site.
- There is some hesitation about the north projection/overhang. Commissioners weren't fond of the north bay window the area feels unresolved.
- Commissioners expressed concerns about roof alignment.
- Suggested bringing the north window back in a classic Oriel window as found in Baltimore row houses.
- Not on board for the reusing of the back door.

10. IV-19-08-017

1047 Hamlet Street

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Steve McCoy and Ji-Young Ann (Owners)

Approve application #IV-19-08-017, 1047 Hamlet Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Removal of flat roofed addition at the rear of the house to be replaced with a new 2-story addition.
- Construction of a new carriage house at the rear of the property.
- Applicant to work with staff to add security lighting on the carriage house.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Fergus/Boyer (6-0-1) APPROVED. [Cooke]

11. IV-19-08-018

Jeffrey Park Townhouses Universal Awnings

Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Park New Day, LLC (Owner)

Continue Application #IV-19-08-018, Jeffrey Park Townhouses Universal Awnings, to allow applicant time to submit additional materials.

- Modify approval for COA #19-5-27 awnings "A" and "C" to include two new awning colors and update the names of the exterior railing colors.
- The fourth floor awnings, the awning size would be limited to the size of the home width and stop at the inner face of the parapet wall.
- Proposal of two new awnings styles on the fourth floor. One awning has the option for three different widths with a polycarbonate twinwall roof and frame colors to match the existing rails. The other option proposes a frame with a fixed ceiling with different variations of covering, with and without lights.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-1) CONTINUED [Fergus]

Commissioner Comments:

- Options B and D are more permanent but the design is better than the previously approved options.
- Commissioners debated which new option was more appropriate. More information about both products has been requested as the small pictures provided did not provide enough details.
- Polycarbonate material is not an option for the awnings.
- Don't want to see the awnings look like a lean-to or an extra room.
- Awning colors for options A1, A2, and C need to be checked. Commissioners did not believe they had approved so many options for the awning.

12. IV-19-08-019

1086 North Fourth Street

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant) Lykens Companies (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-019, 1086 North Fourth Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Rooftop Tent Structure

- Install a demountable tent on the rooftop of the Budd Dairy Building, as per submitted documentation.
- Tent structure will cover the proposed rooftop bar and deck area in the center of the rooftop.
- Tent will be constructed out of clear PVC roof and wall panels with white PVC trim attached to a clear anodized aluminum structure.
- NOTE: Reason for approval: The proposed temporary tent was accepted by tax credit review as the structure is not a permanent installation and can be removed. Meets the criteria for historic credits and the structure cannot be seen from the street.

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (6-0-1) APPROVED. [Sudy]

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

13. IV-19-08-020

889 N. Fourth St.

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new 4-unit apartment building per submitted drawings.
- Building to have center access stair.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners thought that the design was very close to being something that they could approve.
- The design fits in with the area and pays respect to the previous dwelling that was demolished.
- The proposed gutters may not be the right solution to the roof.
- Some concern was expressed regarding third floor access. A Cathedral ceiling in the front roof was suggested.
- Suggested to look at examples of similar sided houses in regards to the horizontal shiplap and faux half timbering. Wood shingles beneath the eave might be a possibility.
- Concern about the trash/recycling area and where it would be located on the site plan.
- Request to see ½”=1’ scale section of the porch with headers/posts.
- Applicant is asked to consider a more traditional roof overhang as well as a more traditional porch and details.

14. IV-19-08-021

1050 North Fourth Street

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant) Lykens Companies (Owner)

Conceptual Review

Demolition

- Proposed demolition of the existing Durable Slate building.

New Construction

- Conceptual review for the construction of a new 67 unit wood-framed apartment building with parking at grade on the first floor.
- Includes commerce space on the first floor.
- Stone detailing from the existing building will be reused to the extent that they are salvage as architectural follies in appropriate locations to be determined.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Cooke:

- Found this design had significant, favorable changes. The storefront area looks very good.
- The unusual 3/1 window adds a nice variety to the façade. The shapes and sizes of the windows play together nicely.
- Would like to see a few more trees incorporated into the overall siteplan.
- Suggests a limestone base much like the Durable Slate building. Can use manufactured limestone.
- Unclear about a small area on the north elevation, the single brick pier seems to be projecting right at the garage.
- Suggests that a pier or wing wall be used for building signage.
- Also suggests a color switch between two brick hues.

Commissioner Goodman:

- Appreciates the gable roof, parapet and flat roofs back are okay.
- Suggests connecting the tree alignment along the street with the pocket park.
- The header beam reads as break metal in the current renderings.
- The posts in both the buildings look nice.
- Window punches work out well, though the whole area may need to be relieved by half a brick less.
- Widows walk railing may not be appropriate.
- The blonde building's brick wall shows detail, it's appropriate to pay attention to the brick textures. Suggests bringing in two samples.

Commissioner Boyer:

- Thinks the design is headed in the right direction. The piece that should be seen in the next step would be the east elevation.
- Thinks that a parapet instead of a gable is better.
- Has concerns about the brick bond with the vents for the garage at the back of the building. Thinks the area needs more development.

Commissioner Michl-Smith:

- All previous comments are valid, this design is a great improvement from the last one.
- Questioned if the wrought iron fencing has roof equipment on that level (applicant clarified it was the next roof up).

15. IV-19-08-022

1126 & 1130 Say Ave.

Italian Village Say & East 4th Ave. Condo Assoc. (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Install 3-ft retaining wall with associated 30"-36"-tall iron fence.
- Remove existing walkways and replace with stone walkways.
- Replace 77 E. 4th Ave.'s entrance with stairs up retaining wall and stone walkway to front porch.
- Install stone stairs with wood handrail adjacent to the 1130 Say Ave. unit.
- Maintain existing bushes, grass yard, and plant 2-3 specimen trees.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners have requested scaled drawings of the wall and steps.

Commissioner Fergus:

- Noted that there are a lot of smaller retaining walls 2-3 blocks high.
- This design is pretty appropriate as it is.

Commissioner Sudy:

- Thinks the design is basically weird. Most interested and concerned about the details.
- Has concerns about concrete blocks as most scalloped edges or curves can result in visible gaps.
- Product should look more natural. The most successful retain walls in Italian Village are constructed out of stacked stone.
- Stacked stone retaining walls should have crisp edges.

- Flat versions of the retaining wall can make it easier to have a fence on top. But the applicant should think about tie backs. Suggests tying posts through retaining wall. The installation may be costly but its key to how it works.
- Does suggest thinking about a lower stone wall as well.

Commissioner Cooke:

- Paver and fence from Lowe’s is too suburban. Echoes the loose fieldstone construction of other houses in the Italian Village.
- Suggests walking Warren Avenue for examples of retaining walls.
- Likes the entrance off of the side street.
- Materials are the key to success in this design.

Commissioner Goodman:

- Expressed concern in how corners meet. Hinges on the resolution of the retaining wall corners.
- Need to resolve the low wall where it meets the steps, handrail, and other items.
- Does support overall plan, requests a scale drawing to see how things come together.

Commissioner Michl-Smith:

- Questions if the materials are appropriate.
- Notes that the Nantucket stone blocks are not appropriate.
- For a nice retaining wall you would need an iron fence with a really solid wall.
- Steps to the pavers should be limestone, current steps and pavers look too “cottage-y.”

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Andy Klein 1090 Say Avenue Area Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Originally a brick sidewalk that was replaced with cement, just wanted to remind Commission. • Concerned if the proposed project is to replace the existing sidewalks by the street or just the paths to the house.

16. IV-19-08-023

1042 North Sixth Street

Bradley & Kimberly Brown (Applicant)/ New Victorians Inc. (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Construct new three-story single family dwelling on vacant parcel, per submitted conceptual plans.
- Construct new detached two-story garage with an accessory dwelling unit at the rear of the property.
- Exterior finish materials to be presented to the Commission at the meeting.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Michl-Smith:

- Believes that the design is interested. Notes that there is a lot going on with both the house and garage.
- Requests to see floor plan development.

Commissioner Boyer:

- Agrees that there is a lot going on but appreciates the design.
- Likes the reference to the yard in the garage. Also likes the narrative but notes the windows feel weird.
- Also likes that the house and garage go together.
- The brick piece of the design throws things off, not sure why.

Commissioner Goodman:

- Not a fan of compositional architecture. This should be part of the neighborhood, not bring parts of the neighborhood into its design.
- Echoes the previous comments about a lot going on with the structures.
- Recommends simplifying the materials such as getting rid of the shiplap or lose one of the other elements.

- Not a fan of the brick on the house the board and batten gable fit together.
- The yellow brick defers back, suggests two forms of dialog.

Commissioner Crosby:

- For a single family home, this has a lot going on in terms of materials.

Commissioner Sudy:

- Requests that the parking area use permeable pavers.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

17. 19-2-18

1056 Hamlet Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Steve O'Brien (Owner)

Approve application #19-2-18, 1056 Hamlet Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Two story addition to north elevation existing single family house.
 - Windows and shingles to be from approved lists.
 - Rear porch details on the east elevation will match the existing front porch details on the west elevation.
 - New wood siding exposure to match existing.
- Construct single story, two-car garage rear (east) of lot with shingles to be from the approved list and the roof pitch to match the house.
 - Garage door will be metal carriage style.
 - Cut sheets for light fixtures to be submitted.
 - Door on rear (west) elevation will be a 4-panel composite door.
- Repair porch on front (west) elevation. New 1x4 base trim. Wrap bottom portion of the column with chamfered edge detail to match top portion of the existing column.
- Install new windows, from approved windows list, on south and east elevations. New windows will be sized to the existing openings.
- Rear door on south elevation will be replaced with a full lite door.
- Existing basement doors on east elevation will be replaced with new metal doors.
- New roof, shingles from approved list. Tuck point chimney bricks, as needed. New continuous ridge vent with metal ridge roll.
- Repair fascia and eaves, as needed. Details to match existing.
- Install new corner boards at original house and the proposed addition.
- Windows in the addition need to be larger to match current windows throughout house. All windows need to be uniform.
- The approval of the siding has been moved to staff approval pending the August 22, 2019 site visit.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Crosby (7-0-0) APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

18. IV-19-08-024

1060 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Laura and Steven Hoehne (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Construction of new two-story, three car carriage house at the rear (east) of the lot.
- Proposed variances
 - 3332.039 R-4 residential district: to allow for two single family residences on a single lot in an R-4 district
 - 3332.05(4) Area district lot width requirements: to allow for a 51'-0" wide lot in an R-4 district in lieu of the required 50'.
 - 3332.15 R-4 area district requirements: to provide 3647 sf/dwelling unit in lieu of the required 5000 sf/dwelling unit for the two single family dwellings. (One existing, one proposed).

- 3332.19 Fronting: to allow new single family to not front a public street and to front beacon alley.
- 3332.26 (c)(3) to allow for a minimum side yard sum of 3'-3 5/8" on the north for the existing summit street home lieu of the required 5'-0".
- 3332.27 Rearyard to allow for no rear yard for the beacon alley dwelling in lieu of the required 25%.
- 3332.38F Private garage size: to allow for the new dwelling unit footprint to be 1109 sf in lieu of the required 736 sf or 1/3 of dwelling unit.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- The garage is wider than the house and throws off the balance.
- Commissioners have a problem with the mass, find a two-car garage would be more appropriate.
- Requests permeable pavers pad or a carport structure.
- The configuration is okay.

19. IV-19-08-025

Parcels 010-040457 and 010-031575 (283) Detroit Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Hallmark Renovations LLC –Dontae Noel (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct three connected single family homes similar to those at 1126/1130 Say Avenue and SW Corner of Second and Fourth.
- Proposed homes to have attached garages, covering 61.42% of the lots.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- A Commissioner suggested that there only be two curb cuts on Detroit as opposed to three.
- Not all the Commissioners are married to the single family housing.
- Inquiry to the character of the street. A Commissioner suggested considering the industrial buildings being redeveloped by Urbanorder Architecture.
- One Commissioner noted there wasn't a problem with lot coverage.
- Suggested not having parking structures on lot, opting for street parking.

20. IV-19-08-026

1038 North Sixth Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Rick and Vicki Morello (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Construct a new single family home with a detached garage.
- Detached garage has two size proposed with an optional roof top terrace.
- Proposed curb cut on North Sixth Street.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners were not in favor of the curb cut on North Sixth Street.
- Suggested working with neighbor to north to develop a shared drive off of East Alley as the two parcels are in the process of development.
- Take a look at co-developing with adjacent properties.
- A Commissioner noted that the roof-top terrace proposal on the garage was not appropriate.

21. IV-19-08-027

294 E Fourth Avenue (Rear)/291 E Greenwood Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Brad Clarizio (Owners)

Recommend approval of variances for application #IV-19-08-027, 294 East Fourth Avenue (Rear)/291 East Greenwood Avenue, as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Requests (Lot A):

- 3332.039 R-4 residential district: To allow for two dwelling units on a single lot for **Lot A** and Lot B.
- 3332.05 Area lot width requirements: **Lot A** and Lot B to reduce the required lot width from 50 feet to 32 feet
- 3332.15 R-4 area district requirements: To provide 1536 sf/dwelling unit in lieu of the required 5000 sf/dwelling unit for the two single family dwellings (one existing, one proposed).
- 3332.19 Fronting: To allow a dwelling to not front upon a public street for the two dwellings facing Greenwood Avenue.
- 3332.27 Rear yard: To provide on **Lot A** 1179 sf rear yard for Fourth Street house and 0 sf for the Greenwood Avenue house and to provide on Lot B 1665 sf for the Fourth Street house and 0 sf for the Greenwood Avenue house.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (7-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

Conceptual Review

- Construct new, two-story residence with an attached two-car garage.
- NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- Proposed to have the driveway over the sewer to open up without curb cuts.
- Garages facing the street until are not in character with the neighborhood.
- Suggested in flipping one of the roof slopes so they are both not following the same rhythm. The two houses aren't complementary. Consider taking one of the slanted roofs out.
- Design feels tentative.
- One Commissioner suggested a single roof pitch so that the street line might look like a saw tooth that may have been.
- Window punches feel tentative and ambiguous.

22. IV-19-08-028

288 E Fourth Avenue (Rear) & 289 E Greenwood Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Brad Clarizio (Owners)

Recommend approval of variances for application #IV-19-08-027, 294 East Fourth Avenue (Rear)/291 East Greenwood Avenue, as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Requests (Lot B):

- 3332.039 R-4 residential district: To allow for two dwelling units on a single lot for Lot A and **Lot B**.
- 3332.05 Area lot width requirements: Lot A and **Lot B** to reduce the required lot width from 50 feet to 32 feet
- 3332.15 R-4 area district requirements: To provide 1536 sf/dwelling unit in lieu of the required 5000 sf/dwelling unit for the two single family dwellings (one existing, one proposed).
- 3332.19 Fronting: To allow a dwelling to not front upon a public street for the two dwellings facing Greenwood Avenue.
- 3332.27 Rear yard: To provide on Lot A 1179 sf rear yard for Fourth Street house and 0 sf for the Greenwood Avenue house and to provide on **Lot B** 1665 sf for the Fourth Street house and 0 sf for the Greenwood Avenue house.

MOTION: Fergus/Crosby (7-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing garage.
 - Construct new, two-story residence with an attached two-car garage.
- NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- Proposed to have the driveway over the sewer to open up without curb cuts.
- Garages facing the street until are not in character with the neighborhood.
- Suggested in flipping one of the roof slopes so they are both not following the same rhythm. The two houses aren't complementary. Consider taking one of the slanted roofs out.
- Design feels tentative.
- One Commissioner suggested a single roof pitch so that the street line might look like a saw tooth that may have been.
- Window punches feel tentative and ambiguous.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

- **IV-19-08-001**

141 Warren Street

Stan Liu (Applicant/Owner)

Approve application #19-8-1, 141 Warren Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace metal handrail with wood rail on both sides of stairs.
- Install wood lattice skirting around porch, to be painted Valspar Semi-gloss 790220 White per submitted documentation.
- Paint the columns white (previously gray) to match the window trim.
- Replace the garage door.

Install Stair Handrail

- Prior to the installation of the new handrail, examine the existing front porch service steps and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation for the existing steps with appropriate slope for water drainage.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **IV-19-08-002**

144 Warren Street

Sam Gorant (Applicant/Owner)

Approve application #19-08-002, 144 Warren Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace second story front elevation windows (leaving the first and third story windows as are) and side first floor windows with Pella Reserve Clad/wood double hung windows.
- Windows exterior to be painted "Iron Ore".
- Exterior sashes are "putty" glazed.

Replace Non-Original Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the front second story, rear second story bathroom, and west side first story windows with new, Pella Reserve aluminum clad 1-OVER-1, wood windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

Exterior Wood Trim Painting

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. All replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Owner has the option of selecting one (1) of the following appropriate painting methods: a) paint all wood trim, windows, doors, etc. the exact same color as currently exists on the wood trim or, b) submit a new paint schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **IV-19-08-003**

856 Summit Street

Moving Forward Property Group LLC, -William Kirke (Applicant/Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-003, 856 Summit Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint property side of wood fence with building's colors.
- Remove existing JeldWen vinyl windows and install them with all new sash pack Marin Integrity Wood Ultrex windows. All windows sized to fit the existing openings.
- Replace wood cellar door with new Bilco door, per submitted documentation.
- Install black metal handrail by stairs front porch (west elevation), per submitted documentation.

Replace Vinyl Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the house with new, Marin Integrity Wood Ultrex 1-OVER-1, wood windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.
- Original windows to remain in place (located on the first story front elevation and in the front/rear gable ends).

Install New Cellar Door

- Remove existing deteriorated cellar door.
- Install new Bilco door to cover the existing basement access.

Install Stair Handrail

- Prior to the installation of the new handrail, examine the existing front porch service steps and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation for the existing steps with appropriate slope for water drainage.
- Install a new black metal handrail on west elevation to front porch in accordance with all applicable Columbus Building Codes.

- **IV-19-8-004 [Sudy]**

930 Hamlet Street

Greg Anglin (Owners)

Approve Application IV-19-08-004, 930 Hamlet Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace damaged floor boards and repaint porch with grey paint to match existing.

Repair Porch Flooring

- Remove all damaged and deteriorated flooring; pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing joists to insure structural integrity.
- Replace with new, tongue and groove, yellow pine, porch flooring of same dimensions as existing.
- Match existing flooring overhang. If applicable, match all damaged and deteriorated barge molding with new material of same dimension and profile.
- Blind nail with galvanized finish nails only.
- Prime new flooring on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with appropriate material prior to installation. After installation, topcoat entire porch floor with same porch floor enamel according to manufacturer's specifications for finish coat. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

- **IV-19-08-005**

288 East Fourth Avenue

Clarizio Properties –Bradly Clarizio (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-005, 288 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint exterior siding SW 2839 –Roycroft Copper Red.
- Paint exterior trim and porch SW 7038 –Tony Taupe.
- Paint front, side, and rear exterior doors SW 6258 –Tricorn Black.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

*NOTE: This staff approval does **not** include approval of the garage demolition. The garage demolition will need to go before the Italian Village Commission.*

- **IV-19-08-006**

738 Kerr Street

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Dana Williams (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-006, 738 Kerr Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Existing fence from the garage to the house, as well as the main entrance will be repaired or replaced with cedar wood to match the existing fence, like for like.
- Repair the spalled portions of the existing concrete block to match existing.
- Replace deteriorated wood siding on the existing garage with new James Hardie smooth cement siding with an exposure to match the existing wood siding. Color will be iron gray.
- The T-111 on the west side of the garage is to be replaced with James Hardie horizontal cement siding to match all other elevations.

Repair Existing Fence

- Repair existing fence with new cedar wood, matching existing fence like for like. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Replace Wood Siding

- Replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.

• **IV-19-08-007**

294 East Fourth Avenue

Clarizio Properties –Bradly Clarizio (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-007, 294 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repaint exterior siding SW 2834 "Birdseye Maple", exterior trim SW 7008 "Alabaster", and the exterior doors (front, back, and side) SW 7605 "Gale Force."

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- **Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.**

Note: This staff approval does not include approval for replacement of the existing porch.

23. IV-19-08-008

279 East Fifth Avenue

R.M. McFadyen Holdings Limited (Applicant)/F.K. IV L.P. (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-008, 279 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- Expansion of existing fitness center into additional 6,350 sqft of building.
- Existing parking meets code for the use of the additional space.
- Previous variance for 9,500 sqft is already in place, along with associated parking.
- 3370.05: Permitted Uses – The underlying zoning district allows office and less-objectionable manufacturing uses of the M-Manufacturing District in Chapter 3363 of the Columbus City Code, as listed in the limitation overlay text adopted in Ordinance #498-95 (Z94-097). Applicant requests a council variance to permit 15,850sqft of fitness center use.

24. IV-19-08-009

886 North High Street

Brad Parish (Applicant)/United Dairy Farmers Inc. (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-009, 886 North High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install Exterior Lighting

- Proposed lighting along exterior of building.
- Fixtures will allow lighting along sidewalk and accent lighting higher up, per submitted documentation.
- Light fixtures to be installed per submitted elevation drawings.
- Fasteners to be placed into mortar, not into the face of the brick.

25. IV-19-08-010

294 East Fourth Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/Brad Clarizio (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-010, 294 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Exterior siding to be repaired as required, to match existing.
- Repair existing fascia and gutter to match existing.
- Remove existing metal handrail and porch railing. Replace handrail with simple wrought iron handrail.
- Existing roof and concrete porch to remain.

Repair existing gutter

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the porch and make any repairs.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Porch Repair

- Replace existing metal porch columns with three new 4x4 wood posts. Columns to include capital and base, per submitted drawings.
- Remove existing metal railing.

Install Stair Handrail

- Prior to the installation of the new handrail, examine the existing front porch service steps and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation for the existing steps with appropriate slope for water drainage.
- Wrought iron handrails to be installed per submitted drawing, replacing existing metal handrails.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (6-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (7-0-0) ADJOURNED.