

COLUMBUS CITY SAFETY ADVISORY COMMISSION TRAINING SUBCOMMITTEE FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS

Introduction

The Training Subcommittee reviewed the current training curriculum of the CPD, as provided to us by the CPD's Training Bureau Commander, Robert Meader. Overall, the CPD training curriculum meets the obvious needs of new recruits and exceeds the Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy (OPOTA) required minimums. Yet, there is an opportunity and need for expanding portions of the curriculum, modifying portions of the curriculum, and broadening the pool of instructors. Further, this subcommittee submits that the city of Columbus Mayor's Office works with both OPOTA and the Civil Service Commission to adjust the timeline for when applicants' employment status vests and to adjust state requirements to reflect the size and individual needs of the law enforcement agencies throughout the state. The recommendations that follow include both curriculum-specific and general recommendations, including those that would require negotiations between the Mayor's Office and OPATA/the Civil Service Commission.

Review Process

Over the course of more than six months, members of the Training Subcommittee reviewed the full curriculum provided by the CPD Training Bureau, which included outlines of policies and accompanying PowerPoint presentations; met with Commander Robert Meader and other members of the Training Bureau at the Academy, to ask questions about curriculum, hourly requirements, and to hear from the trainers about opportunities and challenges; and met with members of other commission subcommittees, to determine what areas the subcommittees may have overlapping recommendations. The General and Curriculum-Specific Recommendations that follow are those agreed upon by all Training Subcommittee members.

Summary of Subcommittee Recommendations

1. Expand or modify the juvenile justice training to include Adolescent Development.
2. Expand or modify the cultural competence material to include cultural awareness training germane to the diverse residents/communities currently residing in the city of Columbus.
3. Ensure that training materials, including videos, pictures, and PowerPoints are inclusive, and not racially or culturally biased or triggering.
4. Expand or modify the history of policing material to include a broader historical perspective.
5. Include training that addresses officer burn-out/secondary trauma and coping mechanisms.
6. Expand the pool of trainers to include subject-matter-expert civilian instructors.
7. Integrate into each training module the impact of implicit and/or explicit bias (including racism) and strategies for officers to use in recognizing and mitigating their own biases; and, require continuing education in this area following the academy.
8. Integrate into each training module the impact of cultural competence and strategies for officers to use to ensure the equitable treatment of persons regardless of background.
9. Require an overview of Crisis Intervention Training (CIT) for all officers not currently certified.
10. Increase the probationary period for new recruits.
11. Tailor OPOTA training requirements to the size and function of the law enforcement agency.

CURRICULUM-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS

Expand or modify the juvenile justice training to include Adolescent Development: The Juvenile Justice module in the CPD curriculum focuses solely on U.S. Supreme Court jurisprudence on how to properly effect juvenile arrest, search and seizure, and interrogation. While necessary, this does not cover the vital topic of normative adolescent brain development and how that impacts youth and police interaction. The full commission received a presentation about why children are different from adults and how the underlying science that has driven the holdings in those U.S. Supreme Court decisions is informing policy in other police departments.¹ The training subcommittee recommends that the juvenile justice training be expanded to include adolescent brain development, the impact of trauma on the child brain,² and why those topics are relevant to policing.³ Further, officers should be trained on how to modify their behaviors to help de-escalate a situation with youth/teens, as the same tactics that are employed with adults often do not work with children or are expressly harmful to children. The subcommittee recommends that this module include a civilian expert in the area of normative childhood development and adolescent brain development. And, the subcommittee recommends that the CPD adopt a specific youth policy to ensure that officers respond appropriately to youth in a way that promotes youth and public safety.⁴

Expand or modify the cultural competence material to include cultural awareness training germane to the diverse residents/communities currently residing in the city of Columbus: The city of Columbus is diverse and has the highest immigrant population in the state and one of the highest in the country for a city its size.⁵ But, the training curriculum does not adequately address cultural awareness in a way that educates officers on how those various people groups (i.e., African-American, Appalachian, Latinx, Nepali, Somali, etc.) perceive and interact with law enforcement/authority. Given what the full commission learned about how often officers in training, who lack a background where they engaged with a diverse population, are then assigned to a precinct unlike anything they have known before, it is imperative that officers are exposed to these communities and the corresponding cultural norms contained therein, so that new officers have a better understanding of the people with whom they are engaging.⁶ This could be accomplished by having civilian liaisons from these communities come speak directly to the trainees in the Academy during a training session. Officers could also receive a training near the beginning of their assignment

¹ See, National Research Council. 2013. *Reforming Juvenile Justice: A Developmental Approach*. Washington, D.C.: The National Academic Press. <https://doi.org/10.17226/14685>

² S.P. Becker & P.K. Kerig, *Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms are Associated with the Frequency and Severity of Delinquency Among Detained Boys*, 40 J. of Clinical Child & Adolescent Psychol. 765 (2011).

³ Presentation given by Gabriella Celeste, Policy Director, Schubert Center for Child Studies.

⁴ Suggested resources for this type of policy or program can be found at: <http://strategiesforyouth.org/for-police/training/> (Policing the Teen Brain report); and, the CPD's TAPS curriculum could also be used and given to a broader swath of cadets/officers.

⁵ Columbus Ohio is the 15th largest city in the nation. The immigrant population in Columbus is approximately 12%, <https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/columbuscityohio>

⁶ The training subcommittee did not see a copy of the presentation that the ADAM H Board gives to cadets following field training (on cultural competence and addiction). As such, it is unclear to what extent that training covers this recommendation.

to an area of the city that educates them about that neighborhood and its residents and gives the officers an introduction to the space in which they will be working. This would also promote relationship building between the CPD and members of the community. Moreover, the information learned in this module should be incorporated in other relevant training topics as well (i.e., in the areas of tactics, deadly force, subject control, use of force, de-escalation, and crisis intervention, etc.).

Ensure that training materials, including videos, pictures, and PowerPoints are inclusive, and not racially or culturally biased or triggering*:** Review curriculum to ensure that slides, handouts, other materials do not reinforce bias or negative cultural stereotyping. For example, the active shooter training module highlighted two specific instances of active shooters/terrorism that were tied to Muslim perpetrators. Yet, there are other real-life examples of mass shootings, bombings, etc. that involve perpetrators of other races that could have been used instead or along with. Similarly, photos of protesters used in a presentation depicted a city outside of Ohio, and featured primarily non-white protesters, which does not match the demographic of protests that have occurred in Columbus in recent years. Although it may not be intentional, failure to diversify examples and sample scenarios can reinforce negative stereotypes in the mind of the learner (i.e., only seeing African American men labeled “bad guy” in a video or training can unintentionally communicate that African American men are the “bad guys” in real life). Training materials should also include officers of a racially/ethnically diverse background and touch on how officers can fulfill their duties with empathy towards the community in which they serve.

Expand or modify the history of policing material to include a broader historical perspective*:** The ABC’s of Policing training module includes the history of policing in Ohio/Columbus, but it does not detail the history of policing in America as it relates to slavery, Jim Crow, segregation, the 13th Amendment, civil rights, etc.⁷ The training subcommittee recommends that a more broadly-inclusive history of policing in America is adopted, to educate recruits on the roots of policing. This will not only provide officers with a proper historical perspective but will also inform officers on why some members of the community have a negative perception of law enforcement and how that may impact the community’s responsiveness to engagement with law enforcement.

Include training that addresses officer burn-out/secondary trauma and coping mechanisms. In any given shift, an officer can go from responding to a domestic violence case or homicide to a noise ordinance violation—without any space to process the differences in those scenarios. The theme of how much stress an officer takes on day to day is threaded throughout officer training; but, the curriculum does not provide a lot of resources on training officers how to recognize the fatigue that accompanies this type of secondary trauma or how to cope with it. Given the risk that this poses to officer health and community safety, integrating a training module that focuses on this and reiterates its usage is important.

⁷ See www.avaduvernay.com/13th for an example of a documentary that details a broader history of policing in the U.S.

GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

Expand the pool of trainers to include subject-matter-expert civilian instructors*∞:** Each training module has a group of subject matter experts listed in the materials. It appears that those experts were contributors to the materials and/or instructors. Most of the experts listed are law enforcement or attorneys from the Attorney General and City Attorney’s Office. In our discussion with Training Bureau personnel the subcommittee learned that there are a few subject matter experts from other disciplines (i.e., Kirwan Institute staff), they appear in only two of the topics taught during the academy. The subcommittee recommends that the subject matter experts be expanded to include additional instructors who work in the disciplines being taught. For example, one curriculum-specific recommendation above is that the juvenile justice training module be revamped to focus on normative adolescent development and best practices in police and youth engagement. Supplementing the subject matter experts/trainers with a professional who works in this area (i.e., a child psychologist, pediatrician, etc.) will ensure that best practices for understanding, responding, and promoting good outcomes with youth and teens are included, that research is updated, and that trainees know more than simply what is necessary to effect lawful arrests, searches, etc.⁸

Integrate into each training module the impact of implicit and/or explicit bias (including racism) and strategies for officers to use in recognizing and mitigating their own biases:⁹

Although the CPD currently has training modules that focus on bias and cultural competence through a presentation from the Kirwan Institute, the training modules where bias and cultural competence are relevant are lacking reference to those issues.¹⁰ For example, in the trainings on tactics, deadly force, subject control, use of force, de-escalation, and crisis intervention, there is no mention of the need to be aware of how bias may impact an officer’s decision-making or how cultural competence is a necessary component to ensuring safe outcomes in those circumstances. To ensure that academy students understand how their perceptions of what force is necessary *are* impacted by their own biases, it is critical to include in those modules the impact of bias and the need for cultural competence. Incorporating this material across modules will reinforce the idea of measured, fair, and appropriate levels of force, based on culturally competent perceptions. This will allow recruits to still be taught the skills they need for de-escalation and use of force, which promotes public safety, while also ensuring that cultural competence and the impact of bias is integrated into the culture of the CPD. Further, to ensure that the material adequately addresses explicit bias, the sessions on bias and cultural

⁸ Potential Resources: Columbus Community Relations Commission, <http://columbus.gov/crc/> ; Kirwan Institute for the Study of Race and Ethnicity, www.kirwaninstitute.osu.edu ; The Ohio State University ADVANCE Workshops, www.advance.edu/initiatives

⁹ Devine, P.G., Forscher, P.S., Austin, A.J., & Cox, W.T. (2012). Long-term reduction in implicit bias: A prejudice habit-breaking intervention. *Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 1267-1278.

¹⁰ “Single-event training can be forgotten quickly, so it is important for employers to evaluate, test, and follow up effectively to get the maximum return on their training investment.” <https://work.chron.com/advantages-ongoing-training-instead-singleevent-training-6199.html> ;Kang, Y., Gray, J.R., & Dovidio, J.F. (2014). The nondiscriminating heart: Lovingkindness meditation training decreases implicit intergroup bias. *Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 1306-1313. Six weeks of lovingkindness meditation improved implicit attitudes towards African Americans.

competence should also define such terms as: racism, bigotry, prejudice, etc. while also explaining the damaging effects that racism has on the community when used in law enforcement.

Require an overview of Crisis Intervention Training (CIT) for all officers not currently certified*:** The CPD currently requires all new recruits to complete 40 hours of CIT training. This should be maintained, so that all incoming officers are well trained on CIT. In addition, the subcommittee recommends that all current officers, Sergeants, Lieutenants and any special duty officers who have not been CIT certified complete an 8-hour CIT Awareness Training to ensure that those officers have an awareness level of crisis intervention required to deal with the public when a CIT certified officer is not available. This may also encourage officers to recognize when a situation with a community member qualifies as a CIT issue and to apply the principles learned in the awareness training in their engagement with that person.

Increase the probationary period for new recruits*∞:** The CPD's training window is tight. There is little room for real adjustments to be made after graduation and being assigned to a Field Training Officer. Part of this is because a recruit has a limited amount of time under which they can be considered a "probationary" employee. Once their employment status vests, it is more difficult for the CPD to sever employment with a recruit who is not fit to be retained full-time. The training subcommittee recommends that the Mayor's Office work with the Civil Service Commission to start the probationary period later in the process, preferably upon Academy graduation, so that there is sufficient time to adjust the curriculum and add necessary components before vesting takes place. One suggestion is to create a separate employment classification for the Academy period (i.e., a "cadet" classification), so that probation starts on graduation, rather than at the start of the Academy. Doing this would not only add space for additional field training time, but it would also allow more time for corrective action to be taken in response to any deficiencies noted during field training

Tailor OPOTA training requirements to the size and function of the law enforcement agency*:** OPOTA training requirements are uniform across the board, regardless of agency size or job duties. As such, CPD recruits receive hours of training that either a) they will not need, based on their assignment; or b) are more well suited for advanced training. The fact that OPOTA trainings are not tailored to the specific needs/functions of each department throughout the state puts a significant amount of pressure on CPD to get through material while also making it difficult to adjust curriculum when a need arises to do so. The training subcommittee recommends that the following be permitted so that the Training Bureau can adjust and expand its city-specific training:

- Create flexibility in the training curriculum required, based on size of law enforcement agency and type of municipality;
- Limit the 125 hours on traffic instruction to the state highway patrol, and reduce the amount of traffic instruction for municipal jurisdiction officers;
- Create field training standards;
- Make the "Blue Courage" training an advanced officer training, not a recruit training;
- Reduce the number of hours that city officers must complete on RADAR and LIDAR training (currently 40 hours are required);
- Reduce the number of hours that municipal jurisdiction police officers spend on crime scene investigation and convert the remaining hours for advanced officer training for those who are working towards becoming a detective;
- Permit local departments to determine the ordering of the curriculum.

Training Subcommittee Review of Matrix Recommendations

Members of the training subcommittee reviewed the Matrix Report in full, and conferred about the 140 recommendations made therein. The information below details only the recommendations that members either only Agreed in Part or Disagreed with.

- Recommendation 110 (page 11 of Matrix Report, under *Administrative Subdivision*): we agree that the Training Bureau needs to ensure the “right leadership” but since that is currently undefined, we recommend including that “right leadership” means a team that remains committed to the recommendations contained in this and the Matrix report, as well as the training-related recommendations from the other subcommittees.
- Recommendation 116 (page 11 of Matrix Report, under *Administrative Subdivision*): the wording here is vague. We agree that FTO ranks need to reflect diversity, but we are not sure how that interplays with high caliber program.
- Recommendation 120 (page 12 of Matrix Report, under *Administrative Subdivision*): this recommendation feels too broad—it covers two topics that should be separated (i.e., firearms training vs. use of force statistics). The firearms training seems to be related to cadets/recruits, while the sharing training principles seems community focused.
- Recommendation 127 (page 12 of Matrix Report, under *Administrative Subdivision*): we agree with this in general, but the lack of specificity does not indicate a direction for a “sustainable and beneficial rotational model” or more guidance on what that means.
- Recommendations 133 and 137 (pages 12 and 13 of Matrix Report, under *Administrative Subdivision*): we are not familiar with PowerDMS or the “role of Staff Inspections” so we are not able to make an Agree, Agree in Part, or Disagree with Alternative Recommendation on this point.

ADDITIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS

As noted above, the following recommendations are a placeholder for an anticipated separate document that will be generated apart from the Subcommittee Recommendations. It includes recommendations that commission members have made that fall outside the four subcommittees' charge.

Drug Testing of Officers*:** Officers are not currently required to immediately submit to drug testing following a use of force incident. The lack of this type of accountability creates mistrust between the CPD and the community and provides a protection for officers that does not allow for equity of service to the residents of Columbus. During future contract negotiations between the FOP and CPD, the city of Columbus should submit a change that would implement a protocol of mandatory drug testing immediately after all deadly uses of force. Subcommittees vary on whether drug screening should also be mandated for *all* uses of force and/or randomized screening for all officers.

Independent Civilian Review Board*:** During the commission's community sessions, a common theme was that the community would like to see the creation of an independent civilian review board in Columbus. Modeled after boards that exist in other major metropolitan areas such as Baltimore, New York, Los Angeles, etc., the board would function as a place for community members to file complaints related to instances of excessive force, abusive language, harassment, etc. The board would review such claims and make recommendations to the Mayor's Office and/or Civil Service Commission. This would increase the sense of accountability of the CPD and would build trust with the community. *This recommendation may overlap with other subcommittee recommendations.*

Morality Clause/Good Faith Oath: Many private companies around the world require employees to sign a "morality-clause" which is an agreement that they will act within good faith and provide services while in a sober state of mind and for the good of the company. This should apply to all Columbus police officers upon new hire and for existing officers. This statement is an expansion of the Oath currently required. This clause should include a statement that explicitly requires officers to agree to equal protection to all citizens (regardless of race, class or creed), the denunciation of any cultural supremacist groups, and to report other officer's malfeasances to the office of Internal Affairs. *This recommendation may overlap with other subcommittee recommendations.*

Discipline Protocols: Officer discipline needs to be reviewed for the length of time discipline is maintained in his/her file and upon what timeframes and decisions would remove this from the file.

Increase the awareness of and the size of the Mobile Crisis Unit (MCU)*:** The Mobile Crisis Unit serves a very specific purpose in the police department and the community. There are two areas in which the MCU can be better implemented: 1) increase awareness of the MCU's capabilities and purpose to new Academy classes to highlight the program and encourage officers to use the unit on its calls; 2) because the current staffing of the MCU is not effective, increase the size of the MCU team, which will increase shift availability and promote better response services within the city.

Felony-Murder Statute: Many jurisdictions across the country are moving away from enforcement of felony-murder statutes. The Mayor is encouraged to work with city officials, prosecutors, and/or the legislature to eliminate use of such statutes.

Continuation of the Safety Advisory Commission: The commission should remain intact, either in part or in full, to ensure that the recommendations of this report are implemented and to assist with implementation where necessary. Without continued oversight, the research and efforts to compile recommendations to improve CPD services and improve the relationship between the community and the CPD may not come to full completion.

The following recommendations were referenced during past meetings by other subcommittees:

Departmental Cultural Assessment

Implicit Bias Training – Investigate Why It Is Not Absorbed

Problematic Practices in Polygraph

Incentive Programs

Uniform Standards to Allow for Head Coverings

∞Also recommended by matrix.

***Also recommended by another subcommittee.