

BREWERY DISTRICT COMMISSION MINUTES

Thursday, August 1, 2019
111 North Front Street – 2nd Floor, Hearing Room

Commissioners Present: Cynthia Hunt, Gerald Simmons, Bill Hugus, Jeff Pongonis, Dina Lopez, Rob Moore
Historic Preservation Office Staff Present: Cristin Moody

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:09 pm
- II. NEXT MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – Thursday, August 29, 2019
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Thursday, September 5, 2019
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES – July 11, 2019 MOTION: Pongonis/ (7-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. BD-19-8-005

22 East Frankfort Street

Joseph P. Mayer III (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Certificate of Appropriateness Application #BD-19-8-005, 22 East Frankfort Street, as submitted.

Patio

- Install new 270 sq. ft., at grade paver patio in the side yard, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Pavers are to be charcoal colored Oberfields Plymouth pavers laid in a herringbone pattern.

MOTION: Pongonis/Hugus (7-0-0) APPROVED.

HOLDOVERS

2. 19-5-6

961 South High Street

Plan 4 Land (Applicant)

Michael J. & Barbara J. Ferris (Owner)

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application #19-5-6, 961 South High Street, and place on the September 5, 2019 meeting agenda as a holdover.

Outdoor Dining Area

- Install two (2) flat screen televisions in the outdoor dining area facing the outdoor patio seating area, per submitted plans and specifications. Televisions are to be mounted to existing sign post.
- Remove brick pavers to reveal existing planting strip along the front fence line below the existing sign. Plant five (5) Dark Green Arborvitae to screen televisions from the public right-of-way.

MOTION: Hunt/Moore (7-0-0) CONTINUED.



3. 19-6-7

250 Liberty Street

Donald T. Plank, Plank Law Firm (Applicant)

Liberty Place LLC (Owner)

WITHDRAWN BY STAFF.

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. **BD-19-8-004b**

477 South Front Street

Samuel Rosenthal, Schooley Caldwell (Applicant)

477 Columbus LLC (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

BD-19-8-004b

Approve Certificate of Appropriateness Application #BD-19-8-004b, 477 South Front Street, as submitted.

Demolition

- Remove non-original, non-contributing two-story addition on the east elevation
- Restore newly exposed masonry walls and conduct subsurface investigation to determine conditions in preparation for design of potential future addition in this location.
- Approval of the demolition is based on the proposed redevelopment site plan submitted on August 1, 2019, as well as evidence of funding for the project to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to the demolition.

MOTION: Pongonis/Moore (7-0-0) APPROVED.

BD-19-8-004c

Approve Certificate of Appropriateness Application #BD-19-8-004c, 477 South Front Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Rehabilitation

- Restore window and door openings that were previously bricked-in and boarded-up, per submitted plans.
- Install four inches of rigid foam insulation below new roofing materials, per submitted plans. Increase dimensions of fascia boards, as necessary.
- Create twelve (12) new window openings on the south elevation and nine (9) new window openings on the west elevation and install new windows, as per submitted window schedule and elevations.
- Install new custom aluminum double hung windows with SDL to include permanent muntins affixed to the interior and exterior with spacer bars between the glass panes. New and replacement windows are to be installed in locations, sizes and configurations as shown in the submitted window schedule and elevations. All replacement window configurations are to match the existing window muntin patterns and sash configurations.

MOTION: Moore/Hugus (7-0-0) APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

5. **BD-19-8-006**

768-772 South Front Street

Jeff Stavroff and Brandon Shroy, Stavroy LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant, Commissioners present offered comments and suggestions, as summarized here:

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Hunt noted that lime wash was used mainly on the east coast and was not used in this area historically.
- Commissioner Hugus expressed support for painting the brick due to the bad color match on the non-historic portions. He noted that paint would cover the mismatched brick and tie all of the elements together; lime wash

may not cover the differences in the brick well enough. Other Commissioners agreed that due to the existing conditions, previous inappropriate alterations, and sections of damaged brick, painting all of it to match is an acceptable option.

- Commissioner Hugus recommended replacing the brick veneer on the south one story section that was originally an open porch. Suggested options for the new material included lap siding, board and batten, or making it to look more like an enclosed porch.
- Commissioners suggested restoring the original window opening sizes on the historic structures and installing stone lintels and sills on the openings where possible, to further restore some of the historic character. It was also noted that replacement windows on the historic portions should be one of the double hung, 1-over-1 options from the Approved Windows List.
- Simplifying the center connector and removing the inappropriate 1980s features was encouraged. It was suggested that the header over the front entry doors on the connector be raised so that it aligns with the window headers on the historic structures on both sides, to further unify the façade. Changing the roof over the center connector to standing seam metal roofing is okay.

Conceptual Review

- Replace asphalt shingle roof on center connector with new standing seam metal roof.
- Apply lime wash to mismatched brick masonry walls.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

STAFF APPROVALS

- **BD-19-8-001**

994 South Front Street

Darin Grimm (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #BD-19-8-001, 994 South Front Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Deteriorated Windows

- Remove deteriorated, non-contributing aluminum windows on the second and third story openings on the condominium unit.
- Repair and/or replace any damaged and deteriorated structural elements within the wall, exterior siding and trim with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile to match existing.
- Install new Marvin Infinity full height fiberglass windows with single light awning style sashes at the bottom. Second story windows are to have transoms. All new windows are to match configuration of existing windows and be sized exactly to fit the original openings.
- All glass is to be clear, with no decorative patterns or texture.
- All fiberglass surfaces are to be smooth, without texture.

- **BD-19-8-002**

525 Short Street

Matt Rootes (Applicant)

ROI (Owner)

Approve Application #BD-19-8-002, 525 Short Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Patio

- Install approximately 525 sq. ft. concrete patio area in front of the restaurant on the east elevation, as built, per submitted site plan.
- Replace deteriorated canvas on awning above the patio area with new canvas mounted on the existing metal frame.
- Install simple, black wrought iron metal fence around the perimeter of the patio area, as installed.

- **BD-19-8-003**

831 South Pearl Street

Douglas & April Huffman (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #BD-19-8-003, 831 South Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Painting (Mineral Fiber Siding)

- Prepare all exterior, mineral fiber, shingle siding and wooden surfaces on the house using the appropriate hand tools.
- Repair/replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wooden trim with new wood of exact same profile and dimension as the original.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish coat all exterior siding and trim with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish colors are to be Behr "Nature's Gift" (N410-4^M) for the body, "Casual Khaki" (N300-3^M) for the trim and "Spiced Berry (S150-6^D) for accent color.
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **BD-19-8-004a**

477 South Front Street

Sam Rosethnal, Schooley Caldwell (Applicant)

477 Columbus LLC (Owner)

Approve Application #BD-19-8-004a, 477 South Front Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Clean Previously Unpainted Masonry

- Clean all unpainted brick and stone using water and low pressure wash in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes.
- Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and a broad fan tip is to be used.
- **Should chemical cleaning be proposed, the following patch test procedure is required:** Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x2') section in the least visible location possible. Patch test to be approved by Historic Preservation Office staff prior to proceeding with the complete job.
- Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations.
- If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "Assessing Cleaning and Water-Repellent Treatments for Historic Masonry Buildings," <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/1-cleaning-water-repellent.htm>)

Tuck Point Exterior Masonry

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Replace any/all missing damaged material and replace with new or used brick or stone of the exact same shape, dimension, and color; like-for-like.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.
- New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white Portland cement formula approved by the National Park Service. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings", available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the sloped portions of roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.

- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

- CertainTeed
- GAF

Style:

- Carriage House (dimensional)
- Slateline (dimensional)

- (standard 3-tab)
- Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)

Color:

- Stonegate Gray
- English Gray Slate
- Weathered Slate
- Nickel Gray
- Nickel Gray
- Estate Gray
- Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

Install New Membrane Roof

- Remove any/all membrane roofing on the flat portions of the roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color.
- Re-install intact, reusable terra cotta coping on parapet walls. Any/all deteriorated and damaged roof capping to be replaced with new terra cotta cap to match, per submitted plans.

Restore Windows

- Examine existing, intact wood windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of all sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows to maintain the original operation, glass area and details. Replace deteriorated materials as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.

Install Box Gutters

- Remove deteriorated box gutters and replace with new box gutter system with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile, per submitted plans.
- Line with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.

- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Remove deteriorated half round gutters and round downspouts and install new, metal, half-round gutters and round, metal down spouts of the appropriate size on all elevations, as noted in the submitted plans. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile systems needed to insure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

The Brewery District Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approval items above as listed, and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: (6-0-0) APPROVED.

IX. OLD BUSINESS –

19-2-4c

250 Liberty Street

Donald T. Plank, Plank Law Firm (Applicant) Liberty Place, LLC (Owner)

Following a discussion about the existing sign condition and previous variance recommendation, a motion was made, vote taken and results recorded as indicated.

Recommend approval of revised variance request #19-2-4c, 250 Liberty Street.

- C.C. 3377.17(A) – To allow one existing permanent ground sign to sit 4.4' from the right-of-way.

MOTION: Pongonis/Hunt (7-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

X. NEW BUSINESS

VI. ADJOURNMENT – 8:06pm - MOTION: Hugus/Moore (7-0-0) ADJOURNED.