

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES**

**Tuesday, September 10, 2019  
4:00 p.m.**

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

**Commissioners Present:** Todd Boyer, Shannon Fergus, David Cooke, Brooke Michl-Smith, Jason Sudy (excused 6:10).

**Commissioners Absent:** Ben Goodman, Lauren Crosby.

**Staff Present:** Kimberly Barnard.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:08 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, October 1, 2019 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, October 8, 2019 at 4pm.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, August 13, 2019.  
MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM – Lori Baudro – Provided an update on the proposed art at Hubbard and High.
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS**

**1. IV-19-09-006**

**640 North High Street**

**Lululemon USA Inc. (Applicant)/ Armbrust Properties, Ltd. (Owner)**

Approve application #IV-19-09-006, 640 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install lululemon sign with logo per submitted drawings.
- Signage to be temporary, lease is from June 15, 2019 to June 14, 2020.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (4-1-0) [Cooke]

**2. IV-19-09-007**

**Keats Townhouse**

**Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Park New Day, LLC (Owner)**

Approve application #IV-19-09-007, Keats Townhouse, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Stair well access to the roofs of the Keats Townhomes had been revised so that it slopes from 11' at its front to 3' at its back, per submitted drawings.
- The porch steps alone will be brick to match the houses.
- Provide garage door colors will provide a variety or blend in with the brick so that they become less pronounced.

MOTION: Cooke/ Boyer (4-0-1) [Fergus] APPROVED

**CONTINUED APPLICATIONS**

**3. IV-19-08-018**

**Jeffrey Park Townhouses Universal Awnings**

**Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Park New Day, LLC (Owner)**

Approve application #IV-19-08-018, Jeffrey Park Townhouses Universal Awnings, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Awning styles A (A1 & A2) and C to be installation on the third and fourth floors of the buildings with the colors previously submitted for the canvas and their frames to be black, per submitted drawings. These styles are to be the width of the home structure and stop at the inner face of the parapet wall.
- Awning B (Struxure Outdoor), as submitted during the IVC Hearing, is to be approved for installation. Awning to stop at the inner face of the parapet wall.
- Awning D (Natural Light Patio Covers), as submitted during the IVC Hearing, is to be omitted from the request.
- If fans are installed they must match the awning frames in black.
- Lights will be the warm white lights, no more than 3000 Kelvin, per submitted documentation.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (4-0-1) [Fergus] APPROVED.

**4. IV-19-08-016**

**1090 Say Avenue**

**Joseph A. Moss (Applicant)/ Andrew Klein (Owner)**

Approve application #IV-19-08-016, 1090 Say Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove portions of existing 160 square foot eastern historic addition to the house.
- Construct a two story addition at the east end of the house which would extend past the current north and south elevations.
- Measured and scaled construction drawings, including a construction section are to be submitted to HPO staff.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**5. IV-19-09-008**

**1038 North Sixth Street**

**The New Victorians Inc/Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicants)/ The New Victorians (Owner)**

Continue application # IV-19-09-008, 1038 North Sixth Street, to allow the applicant time to develop a design and submit additional materials.

- Install a curb cut on Sixth Street to allow for vehicle access to the lot which is not available from the neighboring houses.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

**Commissioner Comments:**

- The Commissioners noted that the area has been evolving in a fairly suburban style.
- There is reluctance to approve additional curb cuts due to lousy engineering. Commissioners expressed concerns about the curb cut and drive affecting the sidewalk.
- Commissioners noted that the area had plenty of parking and there wasn't over parking in the area.
- The Commissioners requested to see what the design could be, in addition to the site plan which was previously provided in order to make a more informed decision.
- Commissioners also expressed concern at not being able to see a larger picture with the curb cuts.

**6. IV-19-09-009**

**1149-1151 Summit Street**

**Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/1149-1151 Summit Street (Owner)**

Approve application #IV-19-09-009, 1149-1151 Summit Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove existing dilapidated porch and replace to match the original details, per the submitted drawings.
- The existing concrete slab of the porch is to remain, but the other half will be reframed
- Existing slate roof to be removed and replaced with new English Gray GAF Slateline shingles.

- Repair and replace existing box gutters to match the original.
- Existing windows will be replaced with JeldWen Sitrine aluminum clad 4/1 and 5/1 to match current windows.
- The front doors will be replaced with new ½ lite, 2-pannel doors and transoms to match their original sizes.
- The vinyl siding and aluminum cladding is to be removed.
- Original wood siding and trim is to be repaired, scraped, primed, and painted. Colors will be submitted to staff at a later date.

MOTION: Fergus/Boyer (4-0-1) [Cooke] APPROVED.

**7. IV-19-09-010**

**289 and 291 East Greenwood (288 and 294 East Fourth Rear)**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Brad Clarizio (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-08-013 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action.*

**IV-19-09-010a**

Recommend approval of variances for application #IV-19-09-010a, 289 and 291 East Greenwood (288 and 294 East Fourth Rear), as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Requests:

- 3332.039 R-4 Residential district to allow for two dwelling units on a single lot for Lots A and B.
- 3332.05 Area lot width requirements. Lots A, B to reduce the required lot width from 50 feet to 32 feet.
- 3332.13 Driveway: Lot A and B to provide a shared driveway with easement access on adjacent parcels. To reduce the minimum width of a driveway from 10 feet to 5 feet ON Lots A and B.
- 3312.25 Maneuvering: To not provide complete on site maneuvering for vehicles. To provide maneuvering on adjacent parcels to access parking.
- 3332.15 R-4 Area district requirements: To provide 1536 sf/dwelling unit in lieu of the required 5000 sf/dwelling unit for the two single family dwellings. (one existing, one proposed).
- 3332.19 Fronting.: To allow a dwelling to not front upon a public street for the two dwellings facing greenwood avenue.
- 3332.27 Rear yard: to provide on Lot A 2111 sf rear yard for fourth street house and 0 sf for the greenwood avenue house and to provide on Lot B 1962.2 sf for the fourth street house and 0 sf for the greenwood avenue house.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (5-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

**IV-19-09-010b**

Approve application #IV-19-08-016, 289 and 291 East Greenwood (288 and 294 East Fourth Rear), as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Demolition of garage at 288 East Fourth (Rear)/289 Greenwood.
- Shared driveway between the two proposed houses.
- Construction of two houses per submitted drawings.
- Garage's man door needs to be changed to single panel and lights be considered on 291 E Greenwood Avenue.
- Windows and shingles from the approved windows list need to be submitted prior to issuance of certificate.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.

**8. IV-19-09-011**

**1056 Hamlet Street**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ Steve O'Brien (Owner)**

Approve application #IV-19-09-011, 1056 Hamlet Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Revision to approved design to include smaller windows on the east and north elevations.
- Wood siding on addition to match the scale of existing aluminum siding which will remain.

- Note: The smaller windows are okay as historic houses could have a mixture of window sizes and the lot is long so the addition is placed far back on the lot, obscuring the windows from view a bit.
- The addition's new siding is to match the original siding's size.
- Windows and shingles from the approved windows list need to be submitted prior to issuance of certificate.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.

**9. IV-19-09-012**

**1140 & 1142 Hamlet Street**

**Philip Herren (Applicant)/ Joel Roby (Owner)**

Approve application #IV-19-09-012, 1140 & 1142 Hamlet Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Enlarge the second floor balcony dormers on the east and west elevations to accommodate a larger door and transom in both dwelling units, per submitted drawings.
- Lights are placed on both sides of the doors.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED.

**10. IV-19-09-013**

**800 North High Street**

**Phil Stiles (Applicant)/800 N High Investments, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-08-013 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action.*

**IV-19-09-013a**

Approve application #IV-19-09-013a, 800 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Move the planter lights up onto the piers, shining downwards on the green screen.
- Change color of "800" to be a tone-on-tone color with the signage band.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED.

**IV-19-09-013b**

Continue Application #IV-19-09-013b, 800 North High Street, to allow applicant time to submit additional materials.

- Remove "Valet" sign and replace with a "P."
- Change the color of the "P" indicators to be black.
- Changes to plant, which were not included in the original application.
- Clarification is required parking/valet sign of the original application.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments:

- Clarification is needed to determine if the parking is public or private.
- If parking is public Commissioners have requested the color blue be incorporated into the signage.
- Changes to planters were brought up at the Commission Hearing. Commissioners requested that a statement from a landscape architect be obtained to confirm the ivy would be able to survive the winter in the reduced planting beds. Concern was that the smaller planter beds would cause the ivy to die over the winter.

**CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

**11. IV-19-09-014**

**158 East Second Avenue**

**Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ David & Lee Paragas (Owner)**

Conceptual Review

- Remove vinyl siding on the existing house and restore the original siding.

- Add a rear addition to the house.
  - Proposed addition will have siding to match the original horizontal siding and a portion to be board and batten.
  - Small second floor balcony to overlook the backyard.
- NO ACTION TAKEN [Cooke –Abstained]

Commissioner Comments:

- A Commissioner suggested that the siding on the new addition could be kept, suggesting that having the new material be a different color so that it didn't blend into the original house.
- A visual evolution of the additions was suggested so that the entire house didn't present as being built at the same time.
- One Commissioner noted that they weren't a fan of second story roof structures, but the hidden location of the proposed second floor balcony is hidden, so they have no issues with it.
- The original house feels like it is very large and the scale of the additions are large.
- There was some confusion from what's happening with the east and west elevations

**12. IV-19-09-015**

**782, 906, and 1160 North High Street  
Short North Alliance (Applicant)**

- Install three additional mural locations along North High Street.
  - Mural locations would be of various sizes.
  - These locations would have a call for artists and the final design would be reviewed by the Commission.
- NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commission suggests **not** having one of the murals be a vintage postcard theme with "Welcome to Columbus" that have been popping up across the country.
- The original mural program had buildings by vacant lots being painted.
- At 906 North High there is a frame in the brick designed for a mural. Some Commissioners encouraged the design to go beyond the frame boundary, within reason. While other Commissioners stated that the modern building had enough going on and appreciated the breath of blankness.
- The Commissioners noted that 1160 North High's proposed wall is bordered by a parking lot and a renegade mural. Commissioners suggested that the proposed location across the parking lot not fight with the existing mural and that mirroring the dimensions might be appropriate.
- Commissioners were excited to see 782 North High's location proposed as it faces Hull Alley and encouraged the application to use the full space.
- The Commissioners as a whole expressed interest in dimensional artwork and noted that they were flexible on proposed designs for the locations.

**13. IV-19-09-016**

**375 East Fifth Avenue  
Kevin Lykens (Owner)**

- Removal of existing building and remainder of a slab from a previously demolished structure.
- Proposed construction of a 200 unit apartment complex on a portion of the existing Clark Grave Vault manufacturing site which fronts Fifth Avenue.
- Apartment buildings would be four stories.
- First level of apartment would be a tall first story to accommodate the volume for amenity spaces and elevate that level of apartments above the below grade parking.
- Second phase is also noted in the plans to include additional 50 units.
- Site plan includes open green spaces and an at grade pool for residents of the development.
- Site is currently zoned M-H-60 but is expected to rezone the property to an apartment district.

NO ACTION TAKEN. [Sudy –Abstained]

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners stated that the proposed design is appropriate because of the apartments constructed at Second Avenue (Station 324) and this plan keeps with the previous approval for other large scale apartments in the district.
- Concern was raised if the lot could have apartments on it due to contamination.
- Commissioners suggested that the building design be more a more industrial style as this was residential infill and did not need to be super fancy.
- The Commission wants to see green space incorporated into the design and encouraged the applicant to add more.
- There was talk of extending Grant Avenue through the site and rearranging the site plan, if necessary, to reconnect Grant from East Fifth Avenue to East Second Avenue.
- One Commissioner noted that having a large sign for the proposed apartments was not appropriate, noting there was other ways to do signage.

~~14. IV-19-09-017~~

~~59, 61, 63, 65 East Russell Street  
Blackfriars Development LLC (Owner)  
WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT~~

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

*(The following applicants do not need to attend.)*

- **IV-19-09-001**  
**926 Mount Pleasant Avenue**  
**Absolute Assurance Restoration LLC –Jason Jones (Applicant)/ Terrence Wheeler (Owner)**  
Approve application #IV-19-09-001, 926 Mount Pleasant Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
  - Remove existing roof shingles and replace with GAF Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab) shingles in Nickel Gray.
  - Install ventilation per submitted specifications.
  - Install metal ridge roll for hips and ridges.Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof
  - Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
  - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
  - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
  - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
  - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
  - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
  - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
  - Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
  - Ventilation will be installed per submitted specifications.
- **IV-19-09-002**  
**184 East First Avenue**  
**David Cooke (Owner)**  
Approve application #19-09-002, 184 East First Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
  - Replace six windows on the south and west elevations of the house.

- Windows are to be replaced with Marvin Ultimate –Next Generation 2.0.

Replace Non-Original Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the south and west elevations with new, 1-OVER-1, wood windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

[Cooke, Sudy]

- **IV-19-09-003**

**90 Brickel Street**

**Henry Song (Owner)**

Approve application #IV-19-09-003, 90 Brickel Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace wood fence on top of retaining wall with a 4-foot wood fence per submitted siteplan and specifications.
- New gate to be installed to match fence design.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 4' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **IV-19-09-004**

**294 East Fourth Avenue**

**Clarizio Properties -Bradley Clarizio (Owner)**

Approve Application #IV-19-09-004, 294 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace side (west) and rear (north) doors with a half lite smooth fiberglass doors per submitted cut sheet.

Install New Doors

- Remove existing deteriorated/non-original exterior doors. Two half lite doors.
- Standard doors to be half-lite smooth fiberglass doors per submitted cutsheets.
- Install new, solid core door in existing door jamb.
- Set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides.
- Paint doors SW 7605 "Gale Force" per COA #IV-19-08-007.

- **IV-19-09-005**

**105 East First Avenue**

**David Sharvin (Owner)**

Approve application #IV-19-09-005, 105 East First Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint exterior of house and garage with same base, trim, and accent colors.
- Base color to be Nevermore Gray HGSW1443. Window trim and columns will be Fundamental White HGSW4001. Accent trim for details Victorious Red HGSW1071.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.

- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Exterior Wood Trim Painting

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. All replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see above), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

**XII. ADJOURNMENT** MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-0-0) ADJOURNED.