

**VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday, September 11, 2019
111 North Front Street – 2nd Floor, Hearing Room**

Commissioners Present: Shawn Conyers, Jack Decker, Jeffery Hissem, Lisl Kotheimer, Erin Moriarty [arr. 6:14pm]

HPO Staff Present: Cristin Moody

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:06pm
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Wednesday, October 2, 2019
111 N. Front St. – Conf. Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Wednesday, October 9, 2019
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Wednesday, August 14, 2019, MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM – Lori Baudro, staff Columbus Art Commission staff, presented a proposal for a new public art sculpture to be installed on North High Street.
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- X. **NOMINATION OF COMMISSION OFFICERS** – MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (4-0-0) CONTINUED.
- XI. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATE

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. VV-19-9-008

1211 Neil Avenue

Jonathan Kimball (Applicant)

Fourth Avenue Christian Church (Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #VV-19-9-008, 1211 Neil Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Parking Lot

- Approve revised parking lot layout and striping following installation of new, previously approved patio, per submitted site plan.

MOTION: Conyers/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

2. VV-19-9-011

170 West Fourth Avenue

Suzanne Godsey (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #VV-19-9-011, 170 West Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Rear Steps

- Remove deteriorated wooden steps at the rear entrance and replace with new poured concrete steps in the same location.

MOTION: Kotheimer/Moriarty (5-0-0) APPROVED.



CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

3. **19-6-14**

177 West Hubbard Avenue

Danny Pease, Ohio Basement Authority (Applicant) House of Hope for Alcoholics (Owner)

At the request of the Applicant, continue Application #19-6-14, 177 West Hubbard Avenue, and place on the October 9, 2019 meeting agenda.

Install Egress Window

- Remove one basement window on the east elevation and enlarge opening below grade.
- Install one new egress window in the opening per submitted plans and specifications.
- New window is to be a 28” x 46”, vinyl, side-hinged single hung window unit.
- Install a Bilco polyethylene window well around the new opening, per submitted specifications.

MOTION: Conyers/Kotheimer (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

4. **VV-19-8-011**

875 North High Street

Jami Gray, Signvision Inc. (Applicant) Pizzuti GM LLC (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #VV-19-8-011, 875 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Signage

- Install new 118” x 16” sign above the storefront entrance, per submitted, approved plans and specifications.
- Sign is to be composed of reverse channel stainless steel letters, faces and returns are to be painted white and halo-lit with white LEDs. Letters are to be attached to flat cut out aluminum “shadow backs” painted white, mounted on a metal raceway painted matte black.
- Install two (2), 22.2” x 3” vinyl window decals on the storefront windows and on the main door.

MOTION: Kotheimer/Hissem (4-1-0) APPROVED [Decker opposed].

5. **VV-19-8-008b**

58-64 West Third Avenue

Grant Geiger (Applicant) Jeremiah 32 Holdings (Owner)

In the absence of the applicant, continue Application #VV-19-8-008b, 58-64 West Third Avenue and place on the October 9, 2019 meeting agenda.

Parking Lot

- Replace deteriorated asphalt on existing rear parking lot with new concrete in the same location, per submitted site plan.

Front Porch

- Remove non-original metal posts on the front porch and replace with new wood porch posts.
- Replace non-original metal railing on the front porch with new 34” h wood railing, per submitted drawings.

Replace Front Doors

- Remove existing metal storm doors and wood French doors and replace with new three-quarter light wood doors. A cut sheet for the replacement doors is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to installation.
- Install new transom windows in boarded up transom window openings above doors. A cut sheet showing the transom window details is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to installation.

MOTION: Conyers/Kotheimer (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

6. **VV-19-9-009**

235 West Third Avenue

Jason Owens (Applicant) Alex Thompson (Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #VV-19-9-009, 235 West Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

New Garage

- Remove existing, non-original porch on the west side of the house and construct new, frame, one car attached garage, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Garage is to have a rubber membrane roof system with a hidden roof deck behind the 5' h parapet wall.
- Exterior materials are to include asphalt shingles from the Approved Shingles List on the sloped portion the roof, smooth, 4" Hardie plank siding, Hardie shingle in a fishscale pattern and smooth Hardie trim; finish colors are to match existing colors on the main house. Gutters and downspouts are to match the style of existing gutters on the house; painted to match color of the adjacent trim and siding.
- Garage door is to be a flush overhead wood door. A cut sheet for the garage door is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to installation.

MOTION: Conyers/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

7. VV-19-9-010

847 Park Street

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)

Regan Walsh & Nick Lanctot (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #VV-19-9-010, 847 Park Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Rear Addition

- Remove existing one story rear sun room addition and construct new two-story frame addition with a new one-story sun room, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Roof on the addition is to be rubber membrane on the flat portion and asphalt shingles from the Approved Shingle List, with a metal ridge roll on the sloped portions. Siding is to be 5" smooth fiber cement lap siding and trim. Foundation is to be split-face concrete block.
- Gutters are to be 5" ogee style aluminum gutters with corrugated metal downspouts.
- Windows are to be Marvin Ultimate aluminum-clad double hung and casement units in sizes and configurations as shown in the plans.
- Door is to be full light Marvin Ultimate aluminum-clad wood door with a transom window above.
- New fireplace chimney on the south elevation is to be clad in thin brick to match the existing brick on the rear elevation of the house.

MOTION: Conyers/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

8. VV-19-9-016

174 West First Avenue

Angela Paolucci (Applicant/Owner)

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application #VV-19-9-016, 174 West First Avenue, and place on the October 9, 2019 meeting agenda.

Retaining Wall

- Install new, 14' long, 12" high retaining wall along the front of the property along existing flower bed.
- Wall is to be composed of Ottawa Buff wall stone.

MOTION: Hissem/Kotheimer (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

9. VV-19-9-014

605 Dennison Avenue

Josiah Myers (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #VV-19-9-014, 605 Dennison Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install A/C Unit

- Install new concrete pad and a/c unit on the south side of the house, per submitted site plan.
- Plant three evergreen bushes, at least 24” high, to screen a/c unit from the right-of-way.

MOTION: Hissem/Conyers (5-0-0) APPROVED.

10. VV-19-9-012

1079 North High Street

Preferred Living (Applicant)

Concept Equity Development, LLC (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #VV-19-9-012, 1079 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Canopies and Awnings

- Amend previously approved COA #18-8-20 for construction of a new five-story, mixed-use building.
- Modify main entrance canopy facing High Street to add LED lighting to the underside.
- Revise sizes and spacing of awnings along the south elevation.
- Modify garage entrance and garage screening on the south elevation. Garage doors are to be transparent; a cut sheet for the garage doors is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to installation. Screening panels on the ground level openings is to be “Nature Screen” or similar product.
- Add simple wrought iron style gate at the opening to the recessed opening on the west elevation.

Utilities/Storage

- Add structure for generator and amenity storage on the north elevation, per submitted plans.

MOTION: Kotheimer/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

11. VV-19-9-013

716 Neil Avenue

Melissa G. & Marcus J. Flinn (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #VV-19-9-013, 716 Neil Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Slate Roof

- Remove deteriorated slate roof and install new metal roofing with a slate profile, per submitted roofing material specifications.
- Remove all material on the main roof, down to the sheathing and dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new Inspire Roofing Products faux slate shingles in “Classic Slate” style and “Wintergreen” color according to the manufacturer’s specifications.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

MOTION: Kotheimer/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

12. VV-19-9-015

985 North High Street

Borrer (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #VV-19-9-015, 985 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Paint Masonry

- Amend previously approved COA # to allow painting exposed CMU on the north elevation on the condition that the applicant returns to the Victorian Village Commission within one (1) year with a proposal for a more permanent finish material.
 - Finish color is to be a matte brown to match the adjacent dark brick, per submitted sample.
- MOTION: Kotheimer/Moriarty (4-0-1) APPROVED [Hissem abstained].

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

13. VV-19-9-017

984 Delaware Avenue

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)

Anthony Meyer & Tyler Mason (Owner)

Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant, Commissioners present offered comments and suggestions, as summarized here:

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Hissem stated that he thinks the addition needs to be articulated more, especially on the section that is visible from the front. The second story balcony looks too different. The first and second story doors are skewed; it would look better if they were lined up. He believes that the existing house will always be seen, and read as a cottage, just with a backdrop.
- Commissioner Kotheimer stated that the second story porch looks odd and the garage needs windows to break up the blank wall. She said that she thinks the roof of the garage will recede behind the house, more that it seems to on the elevation drawing. The roof transition from the existing house to the garage, with the extended hip out to the new roof is not good.
- Commissioner Decker stated that he has a problem with the addition's roof orientation and size and thinks it overwhelms the existing cottage in front of it. In his view, this can only succeed if the two parts read as two separate structures, the connection between them is minimizes.
- Moriarty suggested considering a different exterior material on the new garage, to further make it look like a separate structure.
- Commissioner Conyers commented that the connection between the two needs refinement; it needs to show two separate masses connected, with a sense of transparency between the two, so you don't read the whole volume at once as a single house.

Conceptual Review

- Remove an existing one-story rear addition and construct a new one-and-a-half story addition to include an attached, two car garage with additional living space above.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

14. VV-19-9-018

Various Locations

Short North Alliance (Applicant)

Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant, Commissioners present offered comments and suggestions, as summarized here:

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners are supportive of the new murals locations presented along High Street.
- The murals proposed for Wall Street, to be painted directly on brick walls, pose a problem due to the Short North Design Guidelines stating that they should not be placed on unpainted masonry walls.
- Several ideas were suggested including attaching something to the walls, through mortar joints, and the painting murals on that surface.
- Several Commissioners expressed potential support for painting only on sections of the walls or a certain percentage, in order to accomplish the goal, without covering all of the historic brick walls. Ideas discussed included having smaller murals in series or using sections to create a larger composition.

- Commissioners noted that it would be helpful to have more information about the existing conditions of the walls and masonry, and how any necessary repairs would be done prior to any painting.

Conceptual Review

- New locations for installation of art murals in the commercial corridor.
- Paint a series of murals on unpainted brick walls along Wall Street between Fifth Avenue and Greenwood Avenue.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

NEW APPLICATION

15. VV-19-9-019

25 West Fifth Avenue

Terese Loudner & Amy Aspey (Applicants)

Capital Area North West Ohio North (Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #VV-19-9-019, 25 West Fifth Avenue, and place on the October 9, 2019 meeting agenda,

Install Kitchen Hood

- Install new fire suppression steel ductwork on southeast alley side of the church.

MOTION: Moriarty/Conyers (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioners suggested moving the vertical portion of the vent to the interior and the exterior hood higher on the wall, at the second story.

STAFF APPROVALS

• **VV-19-9-001**

253 West Hubbard Avenue

Dunkel Company (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-9-001, 253 West Hubbard Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Repair/replace Porch Steps

- Repair or replace deteriorated concrete front porch steps, as necessary, and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation with appropriate slope for water drainage, according to all applicable industry standards and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new black metal handrails on front porch steps in accordance with all applicable Columbus Building Codes. Style of rails to be a manufactured rail system per Fortin Welding & Mfg. Inc. (or like manufacturer) Model RSS (Picket Style).

• **VV-19-9-002**

162-164½ West Hubbard Avenue

Frank Seebode (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-9-002, 162-164½ West Hubbard Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace wood shingle siding and trim in the gable on the east elevation as needed, with new, wood Shakertown cedar shingle panel to match existing shingle width and exposure exactly, and to match the original angle of recessed window opening.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace two (2) deteriorated nine light casement windows in the gable with two all wood, nine light casement windows of the same size and shape, to fit in the existing opening exactly.

- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer’s specifications; finish colors are to match current colors on gable siding and trim on the south (front) elevation.

Replace Deteriorated/Altered/Non-Original Windows

- Replace eight (8) deteriorated windows on the east elevation and two (2) deteriorated windows on the south elevation, as per City HPO staff determination.
- Install new 1-over-1, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Manufacturer and model to be the following from the approved windows list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Series/Model:</u>	<u>Material:</u>
Trimline	Legend Eclipse EC300	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
- Replace deteriorated brick mold as necessary. Any/all new brick mold is to match existing in dimensions and profile.
- All glass is to be clear, with no decorative patterns or texture.
- All aluminum surfaces are to be smooth, without faux-wood texture.

- **VV-19-9-003**

951 Delaware Avenue

Edward McIntyre (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-9-003, 951 Delaware Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Repair Asbestos Cement Siding

- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing asbestos cement siding with new, straight edge fiber cement siding of exact same style and dimension, as necessary, in accordance with industry standards and all City of Columbus Building Codes.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, siding and wood surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications and paint with exterior paint. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be Sherwin Williams “Light French Gray” (SW 0055) for the siding and “Extra White” (SW 7006) for the trim.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **VV-19-9-004**

1260 Neil Avenue

1260 Neil Avenue, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-9-004, 1260 Neil Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Spot Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Replace any/all missing damaged material and replace with new or used brick of the exact same shape, dimension, and color; like-for-like.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar matching the **original mortar in color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.**
- New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland

cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white Portland cement formula approved by the National Park Service. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings”, available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia, include the original corbels in the eaves, on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements and wood over third story window on the north elevation, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications and paint with exterior paint. Paint color for finish coat is to match existing.
- **Any previously unpainted masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Repaint Metal Staircase

- Prepare existing metal staircase on the south elevation for repainting; remove rust and repair as necessary, per industry standards.
- Prime and repaint staircase; finish color is to be black, to match existing color.

Install Stair Handrail

- Prior to the installation of the new handrail, examine the existing front porch stone steps, the side concrete stoop and steps and the front yard concrete service steps, and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation for the existing steps with appropriate slope for water drainage.
- Install a new black metal handrail on the steps in accordance with all applicable Columbus Building Codes. Style of handrail is to be Fortin Welding & Mfg. Inc. (or like manufacturer) Model RNP or Picket Style.

- **VV-19-9-005**

1131 North High Street, Unit 304

Allison Srail (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-9-005, 1131 North High Street, Unit 304, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Deteriorated/Non-Original Windows

- Replace all six (6) deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the south and west elevations of the third story condominium as per HPO staff determination.
- Install new 1-over-1, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Manufacturer and model to be the following from the approved windows list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Series/Model:</u>	<u>Material:</u>
Marvin	Ultimate-Next Generation 2.0	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in profile and dimensions.
- All glass is to be clear, with no decorative patterns or texture.
- All aluminum surfaces are to be smooth, without faux-wood texture.

- **VV-19-9-006**

867 Neil Avenue

Carson Thrush (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-9-006, 867 Neil Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Front Porch Rehabilitation

- Repair or replace deteriorated front porch banisters/hand rails/columns as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails/columns; like-for-like.
- All new and bare wood is to be primed and painted with an appropriate exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish color is to match existing, or if new colors are chosen, paint chips are to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to applying the finish coat.

• **VV-19-9-007**

711 North High Street

Jim McFarland, Zoning Resources LLC (Applicant) Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-9-007, 711 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Sign Graphics

- Install new building name graphic on previously approved sign panel above the main entrance to the building, per submitted drawing and specifications.
- Graphics to include 1” deep push-thru white acrylic letters with internal white LED lights.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

XII. OLD BUSINESS

XIII. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT– Conyers/Kotheimer (5-0-0) ADJOURNED 9:54pm.