

City of Columbus
Police Chief
Supplemental Questions – Thomas Quinlan

You are being provided with these supplemental questions in as part of the interview process with the City of Columbus. **Responses are to be sent electronically to Ralph Andersen & Associates no later than 9:00 am on October 30, 2019.** Please email your responses to Hannah Jones at hannah@ralphandersen.com.

Please note that there are no set guidelines for the length of your response and there are no right or wrong answers. This information will be used by the City of Columbus to better assess overall suitability and match for the Police Chief position and will be combined with other information such as career history and accomplishments.

Q1) After reviewing the Matrix report, what do you believe are the top three priorities for the Columbus Police Department? What do you agree with in the report? What do you disagree with? Please be specific.

A1) The Matrix Report consists of 332 pages of material accompanied by 139 recommendations. The top 3 priorities are best identified in buckets using the comprehensive report and 139 individual recommendations to compile agency priorities.

The **first** priority is the opportunity this report provides to enhance and expand policies, practices, staffing, and officer training to incorporate the 6 Pillars of 21st Century Policing particularly as it relates to building community trust and legitimacy. A precision focus must be aimed at reducing crime in our vulnerable neighborhoods and creating a climate where people feel safe to live, work, and play in our city. This can best be achieved through improvements in technology and staffing as identified in the report.

The **second** priority is to focus on Officer Wellness. While this priority might seem misguided on first blush it truly is about serving the community ultimately. Anyone who has flown in an airplane has heard these directions. You must first don your own oxygen mask so you remain alert and decisive allowing you to assist others. Policing is no different. If an officer goes into the community deprived of sleep, training, accountability, compassion, or mental wellness, how are they to help others in need of police services? We must humanize the person behind the badge just as much as we need for the offender and victim behind the crime to be humanized. The outcome is improved service to people and reductions of crime in our neighborhoods, each consistent with the 6 Pillars of 21st Century Policing.

The **third** priority based on the Matrix report itself is to resolve workplace contentment and community dissatisfaction to any degree it exists. This is not a healthy environment for police or the public if the report is to be believed which indicates frequent experiences with bias. I have already partnered with the Anti-Defamation League to provide every officer on the agency with an 8 hour implicit bias course expertly taught by the ADL under a grant, with no costs to the Division.

I have written extensively on the Matrix Report and clearly articulated where I agree and disagree with the report. My position and analysis on the Matrix Report is attached.

Q2) Describe the approach you will use to evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of the City of Columbus Police Department during your first 100 days. Which steps will you take to quickly meet and assess key staff, understand pressing issues, and begin to manage other important day-to-day operational challenges?

A2) The approach I used to evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of the Division of Police during my first 100 days is on full display. Our strengths are found in people. People in our community who offer incredible support and contribute so much to Columbus. Strength in our sworn and civilian personnel who demonstrate unrelenting passion to make our community safer. While interviewing with the Mayor for the Interim Chief position I presented a detailed five category *Opportunity Columbus Plan*. The plan outlined the vision I had for progressing the Division forward by enacting transformational changes within the Division. The majority of the *Opportunity Columbus Plan* has already been implemented. The benefits of the changes is already being realized. I also travelled to Vancouver BC to mentor under the leadership of Chief Adam Palmer who helped guide me through a suggested implementation process. I then directed the following actions occur.

First I became fully briefed on all the operational, investigative, and budgetary matters of the Division not previously shared with me as a deputy chief. Next I instructed all Bureau Commanders to prepare a detailed briefing of their operational component to present to the Executive Staff, at which time a complete written annual report and assessment was required as well. Each Commander was required to bring to the briefing a substantive innovation plan for implementation consideration. The innovation plan had to improve an operational efficiency or positively impact the organization and community. Then I held an Executive Staff retreat using a facilitator and working as an executive team re-shaped the entire organizational structure, mission, and core values of the Division. I eliminated the Vice Section and re-imagined the tasks by implementing an innovative PACT Unit (Police and Community Together). I re-authorized staffing levels, created new Bureaus (Wellness) and Sub-Divisions (Community Services) and re-tooled every other Sub-Division creating a Public Accountability, Criminal Investigations, Patrol Operations Sub-Divisions and more. Many Units were created or re-designed including the creation of generalists' detectives, a public corruption task force, youth services, a cadet program, mobile crisis response teams, an overdose task force, and arguably our most popular innovation being the new police therapy dog unit. In progress is a victim services unit, a community education officer, and police initiated diversion programs. Many policies have been improved and I have continued the U.S. Holocaust trips, completing 2 this year.

All these changes and many more have been implemented with full transparency and with support of critical community advocates. Task force partnerships have been expanded and I have partnered with many leaders in advocating for sensible gun legislation to stem the rise in violence in our neighborhoods. I have successfully anticipated many of the changes ultimately recommended by both Matrix Consulting Group and the Safety Advisory Commission. Collective bargaining issues have been

remedied using the labor relations process. In the descriptions above when sentences begin with “I”, that is inclusive of the entire Executive Staff team led accomplishments. Also important to note, the essential changes implemented are designed for success regardless who is ultimately selected Chief. 2019 will not be a year recorded in our history as a limbo year between chiefs. 2019 will be remembered instead as a transformative year in the Division, one designed to set the permanent chief up for success.

The achievements highlighted above are a fair representation of the actions I have taken in my first 100 days through the present day. The comprehensive reorganization was fully implemented by day 156. Regarding meeting and assessing key staff, understand pressing issues, and beginning to manage other important day-to-day operational challenges I have 30 years of institutional knowledge and experience within Columbus Police and have successfully navigated each of these critical functions. The past 264 days as Interim Chief has clearly revealed my readiness.

Q3) What do you believe are the most difficult challenges facing the new Police Chief for the City of Columbus? Please describe how your leadership and past experience will help you and the City in facing these challenges.

A3) This question begs for an applicant to narrowly tailor a response to the day-to-day operations of the Division of Police. As a chief, the lens must be focused from a 30,000 foot elevated view. While it is tempting to provide an analysis of current operations while circling the city from the vantage point of the helicopter hovering above at 500 feet, there are many other perfectly competent members of the Division who are leading from this vantage point. The next Chief of Police must have the experience and vision to capture not what is occurring directly below, but what is likely to occur in the future with a global view of Policing.

From this perspective the most difficult challenges facing the new Police Chief are more appropriately focused on technology, legislation, and emerging trends in policing, like the 21st Century Pillars identified by the President’s Commission. Technologies being implemented that may contribute to or derail the safety of Columbus residents involve a balance between public order and individual rights. Cloud based solutions and the forensic sciences are rapidly progressing the abilities of police agencies to provide state of the art systems that will revolutionize policing, but at a price both financially and trust in the government. Cold case murders are now being solved by genealogy sites and advances in DNA, but now instead of opt-out requirements a new trend requires people opt-in for sharing family lineage with the police which will certainly impact solvability. Next Generation 911 will enhance emergency services creating a faster, more resilient IP communications system allowing voice, photos, videos, and text messages to flow seamlessly from the public to the 911 network. The infrastructure must be budgeted and installed to realize the success of this technology. Facial recognition technology, drones, autonomous vehicles, and cyber security all require forward looking leadership if used to promote public safety and trust.

Legislative actions addressing gun violence and digital evidence will dictate policing practices in the future. Defense attorneys, judges, and prosecutors all seem to be

advocating for the accused. The police along with other community resources seemingly remain the lone voices for victims. Policies and practices that are inherently the chief's prerogative to enact must anticipate not only today's reality, but tomorrow's probabilities. This is why the next police chief must have one foot on the gas, one on the brake, and a clear view of the horizon to be able to successfully navigate the emerging trends that will impact public safety, ethical decision making, and community trust. Without community trust, or worse only having distrust in police, impacts our community. Felix Baumgartner while making his historic space free fall jump in October 2012 said *"sometimes you have to get pretty high to realize how small you really are"*. The next chief must have a pretty high altitude vantage point to understand how community policing fits in the broader governmental operations as we serve the people who live, work, and play in Columbus.

As the interim chief I have led innovations that addresses needed cultural changes and organizational dynamics within the Division. I have balanced responsiveness to community needs with needs for officer wellness, and been an active voice for technology and legislation that is now just beyond our horizon through my work with international partners from Major Cities Chiefs. I have worked with the U.S. Conference of Mayor's, the Ohio Legislature, and the Governor's office on addressing the scourge of gun violence and our inept laws that perpetuate the crisis. I have worked with the Ohio Attorney General on Human Trafficking solutions and called for use of body worn cameras with our federal task force officers. I am an advocate for shared responsibility involving police, prosecutors, federal partners, health, housing, and education to address community needs. The police know the community better than judges and are taking on the challenge of homeless issues, nuisance abatement projects, marijuana reforms, and teen/gang violence despite the oftentimes laissez-faire attitude regarding those perpetrators who significantly and negatively impact our community by making residents and the police less safe, and the city less robust. I have been open to legislative changes on marijuana and proactively halted police K-9 training that imprints dogs with marijuana. I have headed a committee to create a police-initiated diversion program for juvenile offenders, and a citation-in-lieu-of-arrest program for non-violent offenders.

But as sworn law enforcement officers we have taken an oath and it is our duty to confront violent acts and hold persons responsible to account. Changes now being advocated in technology and legislation support this endeavor. The 21st Century Policing model addressed in the Matrix Report and the Mayor's Community Safety Advisory Commission are indicative of the priorities I have identified as Interim Chief and through self-initiative acted on in the past 264 days since assuming command of the Division.

Q4) Please share your reasons for interest in this position and any barriers to your accepting the position if it is offered. What is your timeframe to begin?

A4) My interest in this position is simple and straightforward. I have committed 30 years, my adult life, to serving the residents of Columbus with a goal of making the community strong and vibrant when it comes to public safety. The successes of our police officers to maintain safety in our community directly impacts the successes of the many other great programs, projects, and people who also serve our community in their own

capacity. Experience Columbus infuses the city with programs that make Columbus a great place to live, work, and play. The infrastructure projects under the leadership of the Mayor, City Council, and our incredible private partnerships are making Columbus a city to envy among comparable cities around the nation. The people who serve this city with distinction, all the workers who equally contribute to the vibrancy of this city from refuse, to health, traffic engineering, and our elected officials all contribute enormously to the success of Columbus. The public safety forces, police, fire, and our extensive homeland security partners, provide a balance where all the other great work becomes possible. Without the dedicated and selfless actions of any cities safety forces the incredible efforts of so many others can collapse. It is imperative the people of our community, who live, work, or play in Columbus, has a strong belief in the safety for themselves and their families before they will invest their futures to this city.

Not every neighborhood in Columbus enjoys the same level of belief in their safety and therefore do not get to partake in all the same rewards of calling Columbus home. The progress in public safety has been growing annually but the challenges facing our most vulnerable neighborhoods continues to evolve and change. A proven leader having first-hand knowledge of the trials and tribulations of the more at-risk communities is critical at this juncture. As the city transforms with all the incredible public works that are currently being implemented, a sure and steady public safety leader is essential to continue on the trajectory of successes the city is now pursuing. I seek this position to ensure the progress of so many across the spectrum who contribute to the city's success are not derailed by a lapse in public safety.

The only barriers to accepting this position are inherently personal in nature. I enter this process accepting the risk associated with the five year term limit for the position of Chief of Police. It is my strong desire to continue serving the Columbus community for no less than eight years in an active capacity. This personal risk is more than my own, it is shared by my family. There are no barriers whatsoever from the perspective of city leadership, the community, or the officers who boldly serve both. I am immediately prepared to accept the position without any loss in the momentum that has begun over the past 264 days I have served our community and administration since accepting the role as Interim Chief of Police.



Thomas Quinlan
Applicant for Columbus Chief of Police

TO: NED PETTUS JR.
DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SAFETY

FROM: THOMAS QUINLAN
CHIEF OF POLICE

SUBJECT: RESPONSE TO MATRIX CONSULTING GROUP'S REPORT on the POLICE
DIVISION OPERATIONAL REVIEW - DRAFT

DATE: August 16, 2019

Sir,

Matrix Consulting Group's Report on the Police Division Operational Review – Draft, dated August 8, 2019, identified approximately 140 recommendations for the Division of Police. I have attached a side-by-side document that identifies the recommendations, and where appropriate, provides an explanation on how the issue has been or will be addressed in the future. Several of the issues/recommendations will require substantial analysis; in these instances, specific action plans have not been developed.

To illustrate the Division's progress, the issues/recommendations have been color-coded as follows:

- **Green** - indicates the issue/recommendation has been addressed or will be addressed in the near future.
- **Yellow** - indicates partial progress or the existence of a plan to address the issue/recommendation.
- **Orange** – indicates there is disagreement with the recommendation or there is a lack of specificity in the recommendation to take appropriate action.
- **Red** - indicates the recommendation must be further evaluated, prior to developing a plan of action.

I have attached the projected costs associated with the year 1 (2020) recommendations in the report. These projections include additional sworn and non-sworn positions, the purchase of new case/records management and employee early warning/intervention systems, the purchase of a new armored vehicle, as well as improvements to existing facilities. The projected 2020 costs associated with the employee early warning/intervention and the case/records management systems are likely to decrease after an assessment is conducted to determine the Division's needs; however, there will be recurring annual costs, based on the terms of future contracts.

Director Ned Pettus Jr.

August 16, 2019

2

In the coming weeks and months, the Division of Police will be work diligently to identify potential solutions to the issues identified in the report, as well as the anticipated recommendations from Mayor Ginther's Safety Advisory Commission.

Note: Some of the comments from Executive Staff in the side-by-side document are based on the July 19, 2019 draft of the Matrix Consulting Group's Report on the Police Division Operational Review. The recommendations and figures identified in this letter and the attachments are subject to change, based upon the contents of Matrix Consulting Group's final report, which is expected to be released in the near future.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Thomas Quinlan".

Thomas Quinlan #5000
Chief of Police

Attachments:

Side-by-side – Recommendations & Responses

Financial Impact of Matrix Consulting Group Recommendations

Response to Preliminary Resource Planning Assessment

Executive Staff Summary – Numbered Recommendations

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
109	Transfer 2 Sergeants from IAB to patrol to reduce spans of control in patrol.	Bash	3 IAB Sergeant positions have been reallocated, as a result of Chief Quinlan's reorganization efforts.				
110	Maintain current Administrative Sergeant staffing in IAB.	Bash	Accomplished				
35	Continue to maintain a strong accreditation focus.	Bash	Accomplished				
69	Maintain four (4) Cold Case detectives. Revise the cold case homicide process such that after one year of an "inactive investigation," the homicide is assigned to the cold case files for potential Cold Case Unit follow-up based on the cold case scoring sheet.	Becker	Concur				
71	Assign 19 detectives to the Assault Unit to provide investigative support services currently undertaken. This is equivalent to existing staffing levels.	Becker	Concur				
78	Maintain existing staffing in the Gun Crimes Unit of 11 officers, and 1 Property and Evidence Technician. Fill the currently vacant Office Assistant II position.	Becker	Concur				
85	Maintain existing authorized staffing levels in the Investigative/Administrative Section.	Becker	Concur				
89	Assign 13 detectives to the Physical Abuse Units to provide investigative support services currently undertaken. This is equivalent to existing detective staffing levels.	Becker	Concur				
91	Assign 3 detectives to the Exploited Children Unit to provide investigative support services currently undertaken. This is equivalent to existing detective staffing levels.	Becker	Concur				
92	Assign 8 detectives to the Missing Persons Unit to provide investigative support services currently undertaken. This is equivalent to existing detective staffing levels.	Becker	Concur				
101	Continue to assign the three (3) detectives to the Organized Retail Task Force.	Becker	Concur, but need to ensure that Burglary and Generalists send the proper cases to these TFO's.				
103	Assign 24 detectives to the Narcotics Units B through E to provide the support services currently undertaken. This is equivalent to existing staffing levels and within the norms of specialized proactive units in large policing agencies.	Becker	Concur, minus 4 that were added to DEA TFO positions.				
104	Assign 6 detectives to the Pharmaceutical Unit to provide the support services currently undertaken. This is equivalent to existing staffing levels.	Becker	Agree that positions should stay in Drug Enforcement Bureau, but mission is currently under reevaluation.				
105	Assign 20 detectives to the In-Tac Unit to provide the support services currently undertaken. This is one (1) detective position above existing staffing levels.	Becker	Concur. 20 is current staffing.				
106	Ensure equivalent training and equipment opportunities are provided to all Division specialized weapons team including CDP SWAT and In-Tac operations.	Becker	Concur. Joint quarterly training has been approved prior to receipt of this report.		?		
107	Maintain existing staffing levels in the regionalized task forces of HIDTA, DEA, and HTTF of 16 detective positions.	Becker	Agree, but DEA TFO's increased by 1 sergeant and 4 officers prior to this report.				
108	Maintain existing authorized staffing levels in the Narcotics Administrative Section	Becker	Concur				
119	Maintain current staffing of 2 civilians in the photo lab.	Bodker	Agree				
120	Maintain current staffing of 3 civilians I the print shop	Bodker	Agree				
122	Maintain the sergeant as the day shift and overall unit supervisor.	Bodker	Agree				
128	Maintain current staffing of the DNA Section	Bodker	Agree				
129	Maintain current staffing of the Drug Identification Section	Bodker	Agree				
130	Maintain current staffing of the Firearm Section	Bodker	Agree				
131	Maintain current staffing of the Quality Assurance Section	Bodker	Agree				
10	CDP should continue to ensure the right leadership is in place within the Training Bureau to continue executing 21 st Century Policing concepts in all aspects of recruit and in-service training.	Knight	The Matrix review concludes the leadership and administration within the Training Bureau is presently effective. This recommendation calls for the continuation of current standards.				

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
16	Initiate a collaborative approach to training mandates with OPOTA to address the increasing workload in the interest of state-wide training.	Knight	CDP Training is already attempting to collaborate with OPOTA to address the increase in state-wide mandates that impact training schedules. CDP must react to, and accommodate, these mandates but continues to voice concerns related to this issue.				
21	CDP should maintain its exemplary firearms training and share its training principles and Use of Force statistics with the community.	Knight	I support this recommendation.				
138	Transfer the four (4) officers assigned to the Truancy Unit to regular patrol roles, assigning two (2) officers each to Zone 2 and Zone 3.	Knight	The new Youth Services plan integrates the current number (3) of Truancy officers and expands the mission by filling vacant positions bringing the unit up to full staffing, to include a supervisor. The expanded mission would support youth engagement after school at locations where youth gather, while still providing some truancy services and engagement opportunities with the existing positions. This change should address Matrix concerns regarding the lack of resources assigned to the Truancy Unit and eliminate the need to redistribute these resources to patrol.				
66	Maintain the existing Commander, Lieutenant, and Sergeant management and supervision structure in the Investigations Subdivision.	Becker & Knight	Concur				
79	Maintain existing staffing in Digital Forensics of 6 detective positions. In the future upon any expansion, consider hiring civilian digital forensic technicians to augment capabilities; blended sworn and civilian staff in such a unit is consistent with practices often seen.	Becker & Bodker	Concur, but this function has been transferred to the Support Services Subdivision. Defer further recommendations. - Becker - The addition of civilian forensic technicians was explored in the recent past. The significant training requirements makes civilian personnel with that training, in high demand. Identifying and hiring a complete civilian staff is extremely challenging. – Bodker				
83	Assign 3 sergeants to this new CSI Unit; a reduction of 1 sergeant now assigned to CSSU and the Evidence Recovery Unit.	Becker & Knight	Completed				
102	Continue to staff the Auto Theft Unit with up to 13 detectives; this is equivalent to existing staffing levels. If less proactive Auto Theft efforts are undertaken, the Unit can be downsized.	Becker & Knight	Defer to Community Services Subdivision. - Becker - Evaluate this recommendation against the staffing allocated under reorganization plan which transitioned Auto Theft to Covert Support with a reduction in staffing. – Knight				
27	To enhance its sworn recruiting efforts and create opportunities for greater diversity in the Division, CDP should align the Recruiting Unit within the Human Resources Bureau and work with the Civil Service Commission to achieve those goals as well as expedite the process.	Bash & Knight	I would support placing Recruiting in the HR Bureau - Bash - I do not agree that the current structure fails in any way to support recruiting efforts. There is currently no lack of collaboration between Recruiting and HR and recruiters are well versed in member care, benefits, sick leave etc. Additionally, all recruiting events are frequently attended by HR representative in support of the mission. There is no identified gap resulting from this structural separation of the units when collaboration is so routine. Matrix can point to no specific examples of where a benefit has not been realized based upon the current structure - Knight				
54	Retain supervision and support services staffing levels in the Communication Bureau at the current 16 positions.	Kuebler	Not if we take on fire call taking and/or dispatching – number will be much higher				
90	Maintain existing staffing in the Unit (Physical Abuse) for the CIA and Office Assistant.	Becker	Concur				
40	Maintain the current staffing level of 2 officers assigned to the JTTF.	Kuebler	OK				
41	Add 3 officer positions (transfer) to CTU for a total of 3 Officers, 4 Detectives and a sergeant assigned to the CTU for a total of 8 personnel.	Kuebler	We already moved these three officers so this is “done”. It should be noted that there is no such distinction in CTU between “officer” and “detective”				
42	Maintain current staffing 3 officers assigned to the Mayor’s Security Detail.	Kuebler	OK				
44	Maintain current staffing of 3 SWAT teams (1 Sergeant and 7 officers).	Kuebler	Agreed				
46	Maintain current staffing of 1 Sergeant assigned to SWAT Training	Kuebler	Agreed				
48	Transfer 3 Officers from Unit A to CTU reducing current staffing of unit A by 3 officers leaving a total of 1 Sergeant and 8 Officers assigned.	Kuebler	Done				
49	Maintain current staffing of Unit B of 1 sergeant and 7 Officers.	Kuebler	Done				
50	Maintain current staffing of 2 Sergeants 15 Officers.	Kuebler	Done				
52	Maintain current staffing of 1 Sergeant and 2 officers assigned to Safety and Maintenance.	Kuebler	Done				

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
139	In the future, the number of officers assigned to patrol should not be allowed to fall below a basic minimum of 871 filled positions. If necessary, positions should be reallocated to maintain this level unless analysis shows that workload has decreased.	All	871 was the patrol staffing in March of 2019. The total number fluctuates regularly, but usually is near this number.				
63	Based on a new case management philosophy to be finalized by CDP, eliminate assigning certain "lower priority" case types and other kinds of low solvability, misdemeanor reports, to detectives either centrally or in "zones."	Becker & Knight	Agree, but defer to Community Services Subdivision due to transfer of Property Crimes Bureau (PCB). – Becker - This is already occurring in many cases with misdemeanor reports being forwarded to Zone Investigations. It is unclear what additional cases with low priority or low solvability could be handled by ZIU in addition to their current caseload. – Knight				
19	Continue to emphasize de-escalation training and increase training regarding interactions with individuals in mental crisis.	Quinlan & Knight	Stats show a steady decline in number of uses of force incidents between 2013-2017. Matrix has tied this decline to an increased awareness of the necessity of justified force application and the relationship with the community, as well as training provided. This recommendation identifies the benefit of this training but fails to identify a threshold for any increase. - Knight The Division intends to continue its de-escalation training practices. Further, all recruits graduate the academy with CIT training which includes focused de-escalation training and the Mobile Crisis Response Unit is now expanded and a permanent Unit which also meets this need. - Quinlan				
13	CDP should hold Citizen Police Academy for respective minority communities to build awareness of police practices, create understanding and build relationships.	Quinlan & Knight	CPA is regularly advertised, encouraged, and recommended in all communities, and it is open to all members of the community. Is this recommendation suggesting the development of a CPA designed solely for members of the minority communities, and if so what would be the purpose of excluding other community members? - Knight CPA classes have been offered specifically to select communities of diversity and offered in their communities versus the academy and the classes had to be cancelled due to lack of participation. - Quinlan		?		
53	Based on staffing calculations for dispatcher and call-taker staff, authorize 105 positions composed of 75 dispatchers and 30 call-taker positions for the Communications Bureau. This accommodates appropriate workload, fixed posts and reasonable turnover. This is an increase above existing staff of three (3) positions.	Kuebler	These numbers aren't supported. Previous study of Communications staffing puts the number much higher than this. This report does not address the much larger underlying issues related to FAO civilianization. 911 Call Takers have a pay range of \$74,341 - \$91,982. Requests for additional call takers has been included in the budget. Hiring and maintaining personnel has been a challenge.		\$223,024 - \$275,945 Yearly Salary Range for 3 call takers. This is recommended for 2021.		
111	Reduce the number of two-officer cars by requiring officers to deploy individually if sufficient vehicles are available.	Woods	I agree with this recommendations however, as noted the availability of vehicles impacts the ability to accomplish this.		?		
12	Utilize community members to provide cultural awareness education during recruit and in-service training.	Knight	Community members are currently utilized during CIT training for both recruit and in-service training. The addition of community member panels can be integrated into current cultural awareness training .		?		
24	Enlist community members in sharing cultural perspective with members of CDP on an ongoing basis. This community engagement should be facilitated through the use of a neutral third party.	Knight	This recommendation is the same as #12. Community members are currently utilized during CIT training for both recruit and in-service training. The addition of community member panels can be integrated into current cultural awareness training .		?		
137	Create the Crime Analyst Supervisor classification, assigning one (1) FTE position to the role.	Knight	The supervisor position has already been identified as a staffing goal in order to provide direct supervisoion under the reorganization plan that has place each analyst under the respective Zone Commander. This position will also provide additional support when a vacancy occurs, and training continuity for the unit. The salary for a Crime Analyst Supervisor will likely be in the range of \$99,348 - \$136,748.	\$99,348 - 136,748 - Salary range for a Crime Analyst Supervisor			
5	The CDP should update their Bias Based Policing Directive to reflect the City Charter language.	Bash	Research & Development Unit to provide recommendations.				

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
25	Recommendation: CDP should take efforts to fill the vacant HR manager position with someone trained in human resource management and assess where the position should be placed within the Public Safety Framework.	Bash	Working to fill this job – more interviews scheduled for later this month				
26	CDP should prioritize technology advancements in HR practices such as time keeping and payroll functions.	Bash	Central payroll is currently working on this		?		
30	Review all directives relative to member wellbeing and align with best practices and 21st Century policing principles.	Bash	We can access training for R&D personnel to conduct this review				
33	CDP should review its background investigation processes and implement face to face interview for references where practicable.	Bash	Our Background Investigations personnel currently use the Peace Officer Background Investigation Tracking System (POBITS) to reach applicant references. Our Background Investigations Public Safety Manager, Richard Blunt, agreed with MCG's assessment and recommended the Division consider conducting in person reference checks. Richard Blunt to submit a proposal.		?		
34	Adopt a Division wide policy effective utilization of PowerDMS for document distribution and training where appropriate.	Bash	Accreditation Unit will draft policy to address this issue.				
36	Ensure clear policy and understanding relative to the role of Staff Inspections across the Division.	Bash	Staff Inspections Lieutenants to work with the Research & Development Unit to evaluate this recommendation.				
37	CDP and the City should make a concerted effort to streamline work processes in the area of Fiscal Management and ensure financial systems are compatible.	Bash	Fiscal Manager, Mitch Clay, to evaluate and provide recommendations.		?		
38	Work to institute streamlining measures in grants application and ensure staff have the associated financial training.	Bash	Fiscal Manager, Mitch Clay, to evaluate and provide recommendations.				
39	Work to establish stable funding for critical areas of police operations independent of grants.	Bash	Fiscal Manager, Mitch Clay, to evaluate and provide recommendations.		?		
127	Improve the surface conditions of the impound lot.	Bodker	Agree. This project would have a significant cost. Depending on the surface chosen, gravel resurfacing costs will likely range between \$500,000-\$700,000, while the cost to pave the lot is estimated to be up to \$10 million. Requested budget capital improvement funds to add a large pole building to ensure evidence is properly processed, secured, and stored as evidence. - Quinlan	\$500,000 - \$700,000 - Capital Budget			
3	The CDP should increase training on de-escalation and procedural Justice.	Quinlan & Knight	Personnel receive an initial 30 hours of procedural justice, bias, ethics and related training, and these topics are demonstrated to be reinforced throughout other training. Additionally, since 2013, officers have received a minimum over 20 hours of face-to-face ethics and bias classroom training; four hours of de-escalation classroom training (this figure does not include training hours received in annual defensive tactics training), and six hours of classroom training focusing specifically on dealing with the mentally ill and those in crisis. These topics are also covered in annual defensive tactics training. This report is unable to provide where the increase is needed or what the minimum threshold of training should be. - Knight				
14	CDP should assess training at all levels and include additional standards that align with 21st Century Policing to build trust with the community.	Knight	Matrix already indicates CDP infuses elements throughout the curriculum. This appears to recommend written standards that specifically point to "21st Century Policing" principles. This can be added to training standards.				
17	Maintain the high calibre field training program with a concerted effort to increase diversity within the FTO ranks.	Knight	Diversity continues to be a challenge when recruiting FTO's. Patrol commanders work to identify and encourage qualified and willing applicants to apply to the program. The recruitment of FTO's remains largely the responsibility of patrol chains of command.				
22	Provide ongoing operational leadership development across the Division for both Sworn and Civilian members.	Quinlan & Knight	I support continued oportunities for leadership development across the Division. We currently provide ongoing optional leadership classes at the academy, and the Division provides MALT classes each year. - Knight See previous comments provided to Lipp. - Quinlan See pg. 8 of the attached document, Response to Preliminary Resource Planning Assessment of the Columbus Division of Police.		?		

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
82	Consolidate CSSU and the Evidence Recovery Unit into a "Crime Scene Investigations Unit" composed of 15 civilian and sworn staff across three shifts; blended sworn and civilian staff in such a unit is consistent with practices often seen.	Becker & Knight	Partially completed with the reorganization. Defer further to Support Services Subdivision. - Becker - Agree. This transition has begun with the Evidence Techs relocating to the CSSU offices at the property room, as well as assigning a CSSU sergeant to supervise the Evidence Techs.- Knight			Yes	
96	Assign 24 detectives to the Burglary Units to provide the support services currently undertaken. This is three (3) positions below existing detective staffing assignments.	Becker & Knight	Recommend re-evaluating in 12 months due to the reorganization. Defer further recommendation to Community Services Subdivision. - Becker - Concur. Current reorganization staffing levels reduced units in the bureau by 4 positions. - Knight			Yes	
99	Continue to assign 7 detectives to the Generalist Crime Unit to provide the support services currently undertaken. This is equivalent to existing detective staffing assignments. This staff contingent should be revised after enhanced workload tracking efforts are undertaken.	Becker & Knight	Defer to Community Services Subdivision. - Becker - Evaluate this recommendation against the staffing allocated under reorganization plan. - Knight				
100	Assign 13 detectives to the Economic Crimes and Fraud and Forgery Units to provide the support services currently undertaken. This is six (6) positions less than existing staffing levels.	Becker & Knight	Concur that staffing is too high, but defer specific recommendations to Community Services Subdivision. - Becker - Evaluate this recommendation against the staffing allocated under reorganization plan which eliminated Fraud and Forgery Unit and consolidated roles under the Generalist format. - Knight				
2	The CDP needs to continue to work on building community trust	All	The Columbus Division of Police is currently engaged in several initiatives aimed and fostering positive police-community relations.				
8	The CPD should address the concerns raised on the employee and community surveys relating to bias both internally and externally.	All	Deputy Chief Knight plans on assembling a committee to address these issues. Goal is to recognize public and employee sentiment and strive for innovative changes and solutions to resolve actual or perceived biases. - Quinlan				
20	CDP must address the significant statistical disparity of use of force against minority residents by continuing intense training, education, monitoring and reporting on use of force within the Division.	Quinlan & Knight	This analysis appears to be based on a one-dimensional evaluation of the percentage of force used against certain groups. Use of force (UOF) numbers must be evaluated against the numbers of suspects/arrestees involved in the commission of offenses. The demographics of the population which officers have contact with, in an enforcement capacity is also critical to any analysis. This recommendation is misleading if it fails to analyze the demographics of the criminal population against UOF numbers. It is unreasonable to assume that the demographics of Columbus residents closely reflects the demographics of the population that has contact with police in an enforcement capacity. When evaluating the UOF numbers against the population identified in criminal offenses, there does not appear to be a significant statistical disparity as indicated by the Matrix analysis. - Knight Furthermore, officers are encountering an increase in the incidents of shots being fired and the number of rounds being fired. The propensity to fight police is seemingly increasing resulting in more instances of Use of Force in areas of town experiencing the highest crime encounters. Police work with the resources provided and have intensely trained, monitored, investigates, and reports all uses of force. Saturating an area that is identified as higher than average force encounters will also result in greater arrests continuing to negatively impact the neighborhood. - Quinlan				
11	Assess and redirect training efforts, developing clear training measures that include specific elements of 21st Century Policing into all aspects of training.	Knight	Matrix assessment applauds the holistic approach of infusing elements of 21st Century Policing throughout the curriculum, but then recommends development of a more specific elements into training. There is no indication what aspects they believe were absent and from what aspect of training they were missing.				
56	Increase the contact frequency (citations, warnings, etc.) for traffic enforcement units.	Kuebler & Lt. Lipp	Disagree. I don't see any support in the administration or within the Division to increase stops for minor misdemeanors. - Kuebler From September 2017 - August 2018, the time period examined by Matrix, the Division's traffic enforcement units have issued 33,093 citations and 4,071 warnings, compared to 5,863 citations and 1,731 warnings cited by Matrix. Matrix has been provided the correct traffic enforcement statistics. - Lt. Lipp				

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
57	Increase the involvement of patrol units in traffic enforcement.	Kuebler & Lt. Lipp	Disagree				
55	Upon potential future consolidation with Fire, consider fully civilianizing the City's dispatch operations. This will require a future 911 consolidation study in order to best facilitate operational transition.	Kuebler	See above. This report is insufficient to draw conclusions on this topic. Previous comment for #54 - <i>Not if we take on fire call taking and/or dispatching – number will be much higher</i>		?		
74	Assign 30 detectives to the Robbery Unit to provide investigative support services currently undertaken. This is eleven (11) positions above existing staffing levels.	Becker	Disagree - the current workload does not justify this massive increase. I recommend maintaining the current level. If approved, this would require Reference page 13 of the Matrix report and attached personnel cost estimations.				
75	Alternatively, create a Major Crimes Section combining Robbery and Assault Units as described in this report. Total staffing contingent for this Section would be 46 detectives, seven (7) positions above existing staffing levels in the separate robbery and assault units.	Becker	Disagree, unless detectives are decentralized. Currently Homicide and Assault are co-located.				
132	Transition the Technical Services Bureau to all non-sworn personnel.	Bodker	I do not agree with this recommendation. The Technical Services Bureau is a unit that must be able to apply law enforcement knowledge in conjunction with technical knowledge. By hiring an entire civilian staff, the training would take a significant amount of time.		\$991,754 - \$1,375,608 - yearly estimate for 5 Programmer Analysts and 5 Info Systems Analysts. Matrix did not specify what type of positions would be suitable for complete civilianization of the unit. This cost could be partially offset by eliminating the 1 Sgt. and 7 Ofc. positions currently in the unit. Recommended for 2021		
80	Reduce officer staffing in the CSSU from 16 positions to 9 positions, a reduction of 7 assigned positions.	Becker & Bodker	I recommend civilianizing the entire unit. However, this function has been transferred to the Support Services Subdivision so I defer further recommendation to them. - Becker - (LION shows a reduction to 14 sworn officer positions - down from 16 prior to reorganization)I do not agree with decreasing the unit to 9 positions, however I do agree that these positions could be civilianized. – Bodker			Yes	?
7	The CDP should increase training on policies.	Quinlan & Knight	Matrix is unable to specify what policies they are referencing where additional training is required. They point to the results of the community survey and recent "high profile" incidents (which are not specified) as evidence of a disconnet between policies and implementation. Without specific examples, this analysis is too general in nature to provide valuable direction. - Knight Policies are revised on an Accreditation schedule and Cmdr. Meader over the Training Bureau religiously "trains to policy". If fact pursuit policy training was just released and mirrored the policy verbatim. - Quinlan				
136	Reduce the number of officers assigned to the Mounted Unit to four (4) authorized positions, down from seven (7).	Knight	It is unclear if Matrix used a metric to evaluate the value of the Mounted Unit resources that included more than the number of events attended in 2018 (230). The benefit of the unit in protest and crowd control situations cannot be overstated. The unit is a substantive force multiplier capable of clearing an area where 20-30 officers would otherwise be required to engage a crowd. In this type of operational environment we experience a higher potential for uses of force when officers, as opposed to Mounted Unit personnel, must engage a crowd. Often times the mere presence of the Mounted Unit reduces or eliminates the volatility of a crowd. Any reduction in staffing should not be approached randomly, given the operational requirements of the unit. The financial costs of the resulting legal challenges, the internal investigations that resulted, and the man hours spent defending CDP actions are factors not evaluated by Matrix.			Yes	?
43	Add a sergeant to the Mayor's Security Detail reduce the span of control.	Kuebler	This is not necessary		\$94,361 Total - \$73,507 A Step Officer Salary...Cost to promote an Officer to a Sergeant is \$20,854 . Recommended for 2022.		

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
113	In order to reach a proactivity level 40% after accounting for turnover, 996 officer positions should be authorized in regular patrol roles, an increase of 76 positions from the number currently allocated to patrol. This recommendation is contingent upon ceasing the deployment of two-officer cars. If the practice of deploying two-person officers continues, 1,051 officer positions would be required.	Woods	I agree with the recommendation to reach the proactivity level of 40%. However the staffing numbers included in the draft do not add up to the recommended allocation of the 884 officers. The total is only 776 officers and even with the recommended increase of 76 officers, that total is only 852, not the recommended new total of 996. Further, Zones 2 and 3 are historically the busiest yet Zone 4 is recommended to have the highest staffing. It is my understanding the Matrix group is re-working these numbers. My comments may change if that occurs.	\$1,900,241 - Although Matrix recommended adding 76 total officers, the number of officers needed is much higher, as they did not account for promoting officers to sergeants. This figure is for 2020 only, and includes 25 new officers and promoting 3 officers to sergeants (sergeant salary-officer salary = \$20,854.	\$1,627,066 (2021), \$1,627,066 (2022), and \$1,532,705(2023) - These projections only include hiring new officers and promoting officers to the rank of sergeant. This does not take into account the addition or subtraction of positions in bureaus outside of Patrol. For instance, Matrix recommends complete civilianization of Policenet, which would make 7 officers available for redeployment elsewhere. However, as indicated in their footnote on pg. 14, the Policenet Officers would not be counted toward the additional staffing needed in patrol.		
114	Independent of other recommendations and using current staffing levels, reallocate patrol officers (using current staffing) among the five zones based on workload in order to eliminate disparities patrol service levels, assigning the existing 871 officers as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Zone 1: 168 officers • Zone 2: 190 officers • Zone 3: 204 officers • Zone 4: 159 officers • Zone 5: 151 officers 	Woods					
28	CDP and FOP should work to create a more sustainable and beneficial rotational model for sworn members.	Quinlan & Bash	Subject for negotiations. - Bash Additional jobs must be identified that can be selected on merit or preference over seniority, such as the PIO who speaks for the Chief of Police but the Chief has no say in who is speaking on behalf of the office of chief. - Quinlan			Yes	
29	Assess the workload of the Industrial Hygienist and provide support to maximize the positive impact of the program.	Bash	Would require an additional civilian employee - Estimated pay range for a Safety Technician is \$74,341 - \$90,651.		\$74,341 - \$90,651 -estimated salary range		
31	CDP should work with the FOP to implement an enhanced merit based promotion system where seniority plays a reasonable role.	Bash	Subject for negotiations		?	Yes	
32	All stakeholders should work to institute a holistic, merit based promotional and transfer system within CDP.	Bash	Subject for negotiations		?	Yes	
58	Ensure Unit Sergeants are consistently reviewing and screening cases for their detective staff. This should be accomplished in all Subdivision Units. Inactive cases identified by the Sergeant can be distributed to detectives for pattern/trend recognition, but should be notably classified as such.	Becker	Concur - Becker Crime analysts evaluate all reports for patterns/trends and report routinely on identified crime patterns. - Quinlan				
59	Throughout CDP, formalize the case screening process using a documented solvability factor methodology that includes a 12-point criteria checklist, or similar, on all assigned detective cases.	Becker	Agree in concept; unfamiliar with specific checklist criteria referenced.				
60	Formalize a detective caseload prioritization system beyond the “three category screening priority” currently in use in some units.	Becker	Concur - Becker Contingent upon funding - Quinlan				
61	To help better balance workload among detectives, use a detective caseload prioritization system as part of the case assignment process using a 7-priority system, or similar, as a framework. Use the priority system to help balance workloads among detectives both numerically and in level of case sophistication.	Becker	Agree in concept; unfamiliar with specific checklist criteria referenced.				
62	Develop a consistent approach to identifying and recording active and inactive cases among all Subdivision investigative units. This will help resolve workload imbalances and develop a clearer picture on resource needs to address active workloads.	Becker	Concur. Case Management Software would greatly assist in this endeavor. A company recently presented their software to the Division. Year 1 cost is approximately \$2,261,800	\$2,261,800 - year 1 cost for services provided by Mark 43.	?		
67	Assign 30 detectives to the Homicide Unit to provide homicide and other investigative support services currently undertaken. This is one (1) position less than existing staffing levels.	Becker	Concur - This represents a loss of 2 detectives from 3rd Shift.				
68	Assign 10 detectives to each of the three shifts.	Becker	Concur - subject to labor relations			Yes	
70	Through effective case management, balance caseload among all homicide detectives, particularly related to the number of homicides per year. This caseload balance issue needs to be of primary concern for the Investigative Subdivision, particularly for person-related crimes.	Becker	I agree in concept, but the complexity of the issue is great. We cannot control the dates or times of crimes, nor the complexity of each crime. Also, with new detectives in training, all are not equally qualified for cases.				

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
72	Develop consistent reporting on the workloads assigned to each detective in order to facilitate effective case management processes.	Becker	CMS would assist, but as with Homicides, this is a complex issue.				
73	Re-visit the staffing by shift in Assault upon understanding total workloads for each detective within each shift.	Becker	Concur - subject to labor relations			Yes	
76	Re-visit the staffing by shift in Robbery upon understanding total workloads for each detective within each shift.	Becker	Willing to Evaluate			Yes	
77	Given the sophistication of many of these person crime types, similar to Homicide and Economic Crimes consider requiring 'Exceptional Qualifications' for all major person crime detective assignments excluding the Family Crimes Section.	Becker	Agree, but this is a Collective Bargaining Issue.			Yes	
81	Maintain existing civilian staff of 6 positions in the Evidence Recovery Unit.	Becker	Concur; defer further to Support Services Subdivision. - Agree - Bodker				
86	Assign 32 detectives to the Sexual Assault Units to provide sex assault and other investigative support services currently undertaken. This is one (1) position more than existing staffing levels.	Becker	Concur - Reference page 13 of the Matrix report and attached personnel cost estimations.		\$73,507 - Annual salary for A Step officer, which would be needed to replace an officer (possibly from patrol) moving into this unit.		
87	Given the sophistication of many of these sex crime types, similar to Homicide and Economic Crimes, requiring 'Exceptional Qualifications' for these detective assignments is strongly encouraged.	Becker	Concur, but this is a collective bargaining issue.				
93	Re-allocate Cold Case work from the specifically assigned detective to the newly assigned sexual assault Cold Case "specialists." Re-distribute Unit work among all eight detectives accordingly.	Becker	Concur - possible CBA issue				
94	Assign 10 detectives to the core Domestic Violence investigation to provide the support services currently undertaken. This is two (2) positions above existing detective staffing assignments.	Becker	Concur - cost is increase of Reference page 13 of the Matrix report and attached personnel cost estimations. (currently 10 assigned to the unit, but next recommendation calls for an increase to 12)				
95	Continue to assign 2 detectives exclusively to stalking cases resulting in a Domestic Violence detective staffing contingent of 12 positions.	Becker	Concur - Becker Subject to labor relations - Quinlan				
117	Add 1 Sergeant to the Court Liaison Section	Bodker	Agree: Reference page 13 of the Matrix report and attached personnel cost estimations.		\$94,361 (\$20,854 cost to promote an F Step Officer to Sergeant and \$73,507 A Step Officer replacement.) - This additional position is not accounted for on pg. 14 of the Matrix report.		
118	Add a civilian fleet coordinator position to assist in the management of the CDP fleet.	Bodker	Agree: This position would likely be at the MA II level. I will work with HR to determine the average MA II wage. Estimated cost of a Management Analyst II position = \$99,175 - \$137,561.		\$99,175 - \$137,561 - Salary range for an Management Analyst II. Matrix did not specify what year to add this position or specify what classification it should be.		
121	Add a non-sworn afternoon shift supervisor to property control to reduce the span of control. This supervisor should be given administrative tasks as well.	Bodker	Agree: Estimated cost of a Management Analyst II position = \$99,175 - \$137,561	\$99,348 - \$137,561 - Matrix did not specify the classification of civilian employee. It is recommended the position be a Management Analyst II		Yes	
123	Add a non-sworn position to address the backlog of items to be disposed.	Bodker	Agree. This position should also account for property dispositions that are sent to sworn personnel. Estimated cost of a Property Clerk position - \$63,003 - \$85,196.	\$71,730 - \$91,982 - Matrix did not specify the classification of civilian employee. It is recommended the position be a Property Clerk		Yes	
124	Conduct audit of items that are eligible for destruction or could be returned to an owner.	Bodker	Agreed, however this suggestion is made more difficult when we apply 2933.82 of the ORC-Retention of Biological Evidence.		?		
125	Change the Mid-watch Sergeant position to a full time day shift Impound Unit supervisor.	Bodker	I'm a little unclear with this suggestion. Does this infer that the sworn sergeant position should be a civilian supervisor?			Yes	
126	Add a non-sworn afternoon shift supervisor position to the Impound Unit with additional administrative tasks.	Bodker	Agree: Estimated cost of a Management Analyst II position = \$99,175 - \$137,561		\$99,175- \$137,561 - Matrix did not specify the classification of civilian employee. It is recommended the position be a Management Analyst II - Recommended for 2022	Yes	

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
133	Add two position to the Records Section to increase the ability to keep current with reduced use of overtime.	Bodker	Agree - Estimated cost of a Records Technician position = \$69,143 - \$91,982		\$138,285 - \$183,963 - Salary range for 2 records technicians at \$85,195 each.		
134	Work with the city administration to make an exception to the two pay period wait before posting critical positions.	Bodker	Agree				
135	Maintain current staffing in Identification, but work with the city administration to by-pass the two period waiting period before posting openings.	Bodker	Agree				
4	The CDP should adopt an Early Warning / Intervention program.	Knight	I agree this would be valuable. I recommend funding be set aside in the 2020 budget to purchase software that would support this goal. Estimated cost is \$300,000/year. - Knight This is also subject to labor relations - Quinlan	\$300,000 - year 1 cost for services from Benchmark Analytics	\$300,000 - yearly cost		
18	CDP and the FOP should evaluate the training framework and assess the validity of the probationary period with a view to increasing it one-year post academy training.	Knight	This is a contractual issue that requires agreement between the parties.			Yes	
64	Re-visit the existing use of the PremierOne software solution as a case management system and identify methods for further consistent utilization among all detective units. If the CMS is inadequate, explore definitive work-arounds to be universally applied or alternatively another software solution.	Becker & Quinlan	Concur - Premier 1 is totally inadequate for active case management. Request that an RFP is advertised for realistic solutions. Once a legitimate CMS product is identified then funding will be required. - Becker Any new RMS system must be tied to a CAD system and justice tracks, court Matrix to function across all platforms and create greater efficiency; the current RMS and current CAD do not speak to each other and both are wholly inadequate. Increases in efficiencies here may decrease the need to hire additional officers. - Quinlan		?		?
65	Include in the Subdivisions existing Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) all important investigative work-related protocols discussed herein including the further formalization of the case management process.	Becker & Knight	Concur				
84	Fully cross-train all CSI staff to respond to all scenes for evidence collection purposes.	Becker & Knight	Defer to Support Services Subdivision - Becker - Agreed, however the suggestions for civilian and sworn CSI/Evidence Recovery/CSSU staff is challenging with the existing CBA, especially if sworn and civilian staff are combined, but with the same duties – Knight				
97	In lieu of distributing detectives equally between North and South and the two shifts, distribute the 24 detectives among the locales/shift based on actual caseload. This will require effective case management tracking.	Becker & Knight	Defer to Community Services Subdivision due to reorganization of Generalists. - Becker - Evaluate this recommendation against the staffing allocated under reorganization plan. – Knight				
98	Track proactive time efforts and outcomes for the Generalist Crime Unit, in addition to caseload tracking as part of effective case management. This will help determine the appropriate staffing size for the unit.	Becker & Knight	Agree in concept, but defer further recommendations to Community Services Subdivision. - Becker - Evaluate this recommendation against the staffing allocated under reorganization plan. – Knight				
112	Establish a standardized minimum ratio of serviceable patrol vehicles to the number of patrol officers by zone, using the shift with the highest staffing total to do so (including mid watch overlaps).	Woods	I agree with the recommendation. To accomplish this ratio the new patrol staffing numbers will need to be established. Any additional purchase of vehicles will require an increase in General Funds and will cause an increase in maintenance costs.				
115	Revise patrol district and cruiser district boundaries by the end of 2020 in order to reflect recent growth and service environment changes.	Woods	I agree and recommend including mid-watch cruiser districts in the changes.				
116	Increase the number of sergeants allocated to the patrol zones by 17 authorized positions in order to keep supervisory spans of control for all watches at or below a ratio of nine officers per sergeant.	Woods	I agree an increase in the number of sergeants is needed. The deployment of the sergeants should be considered as the new patrol staffing plan is established. Reference page 13 of the Matrix report and attached personnel cost estimations.	\$62,562 - This figure represents promoting 3 F Step Officers to the rank of sergeant. The difference in annual salary + benefits between officer and sergeant is \$20,854 Matrix recommended adding a total of 5 sergeants in 2020 (4 patrol and 1 K9) but reducing Sergeant staffing in IAB by 2.	\$83,416 for 2021 (4 sgts.), \$83,416for 2022 (4 sgts.), and \$62,562 for 2023 (3 sgts.)		
45	Add second armored vehicle to the SWAT fleet.	Kuebler	Agreed – projected cost is \$450,000	\$450,000 - Capital Budget			

ISSUE#	MATRIX ISSUE/RECOMMENDATION	RESPONDENT(S)/ SUBDIVISION RESPONSIBILITY	RESPONSE	2020 COSTS	FUTURE BUDGET	SUBJECT to COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	EFFICIENCY
47	Add 1 K9 Sergeant and 1 K9 officer to the K9 unit for a total of 2 Sergeants and 8 Officers.	Kuebler	Concur, in part. This should just be two additional officers – the sergeant is not needed. Cost – 2 A Step Officers @ \$73,507 each, two \$18,000 dogs, two \$60,000 cruisers. - Kuebler These expenses are in addition to the unexpected expenses caused by the legalization of hemp, which redereed the existing canines obsolete. - Quinlan	\$78,000 - Cost for dog and cruiser. There is no 2020 cost associated with promoting an officer to the rank of sergeant, as Matrix recommended reducing Sergeant staffing in IAB by 2 in 2020.	\$151,507 - A Step Officer Salary, cruiser, and dog. Recommended for 2022.		
51	Allow unit to overstaff in anticipation of retirements so that the unit does not go below 90% of authorized pilot staff.	Kuebler	OK				
1	The Division needs to develop a prioritized plan to implement 21st Century Policing Concepts as recommended throughout the report	All	Further anaysis is needed.				
6	The CDP should reduce supervisory spans of control to provide more effective and immediate supervision.	Quinaln/All	Some spans of control improved with the current reorganization. Further improvement can be attained through a future patrol restructuring. This is something Chief Quinlan is willing to consider if he were to be appointed to the Chief's position. This is something the permanent chief will need to authorize so not to disrupt assignments and transfers twice in 12 months. Chief Quinlan is currently assigning a committee to prepare a staffing distrubution plan to address spans of control should he be appointed permanently so not to cause further delay in implementation.				
9	The preceding broad recommendations on Community and 21st Century policing are supported by specific recommendations in subsequent chapters of the report. To be effective Community and 21st Century policing should be supported throughout the organization.	All	Further analysis needed.				
15	Officers should be assessed on their ability to proactively engage with all sectors of the community.	All	Further analysis needed.			Yes	
23	Institute a formal mentorship program within the Division.	All	Further analysis needed.				
88	As part of caseload balancing among detectives, assign one detective to each Unit to maintain a Cold Case active backlog. As a result, new caseloads should not be assigned beyond 5 cases monthly.	Becker	Concur				
Note: Each recommendation must also be evaluated against CALEA Accreditation standards and the Ohio Collaborative for compliance. Many recommendations not only impact the police officers union (FOP) but affects civilian labor unions and must be collectively bargained.							

TO: NED PETTUS JR.
DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SAFETY

FROM: THOMAS QUINLAN
CHIEF OF POLICE

SUBJECT: RESPONSE TO MATRIX CONSULTING GROUP'S PRELIMINARY
RESOURCE PLANNING ASSESSMENT OF THE COLUMBUS DIVISION
OF POLICE

DATE: AUGUST 16, 2019

Sir,

On May 28, 2019, the Matrix Consulting Group, from this point forward, referred to as MCG, provided me with their Preliminary Resource Planning Assessment of the Columbus Division of Police. The report highlighted several of our achievements and successes, such as patrol officer training, to which MCG stated, *"The topics covered are the most relevant in policing today. The Columbus Division of Police Patrol Training is consistent with the most up to date training on working with the community currently available."* The assessment also identified several opportunities for improvement, which are highlighted in this response. In this letter, I have provided a preliminary response to the issues identified by MCG; however, in many instances, it is appropriate to wait for the anticipated recommendations from Mayor Ginther's Safety Advisory Commission, as well as those in MCG's final Draft Report. At the conclusion of MCG's study and after receiving recommendations from Mayor Ginther's Safety Advisory Commission, I anticipate taking further action, based on a variety of factors, including available funding.

It is important to note it is my desire to maintain the Division's current accreditation status with the Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies (CALEA). The Division has been accredited with CALEA since 1999, which signifies our commitment to adhering to industry best practices. All current and future organizational initiatives will be made with the intent of maintaining our current accreditation status.

Director Ned Pettus Jr.

AUGUST 16, 2019

2

In the following pages, the issues identified by MCG are categorized as follows:

- Office of the Chief of Police
- Administrative Subdivision
- Investigative Subdivision
- Homeland Security Subdivision
- Support Services Subdivision
- Patrol North and South Subdivisions

Although we are in the process of restructuring our organizational chart, MCG is conducting their comprehensive analysis of the Division of Police using the current organizational structure. To avoid confusion and to maintain continuity, this response has been organized by the subdivisions reflected in the Division's current organizational chart.

Note: The page number, corresponding to the location of the issue identified in MCG's report, is listed in parentheses after each identified issue.

OFFICE OF THE CHIEF OF POLICE:

- ***Division's Mission Statement*** – MCG suggested the Division's mission statement should be revised to mention the community/public. (p. 9)
- **Response:** The overall goal of a mission statement is to succinctly state the organization's purpose. I agree with MCG's assessment of our current mission statement; during my executive staff retreat in April 2019, I created a new mission statement, which better aligns our organization with the principals associated with 21st Century Policing.
 - *The men and women of the Division of Police serve our community guided by our core values: Integrity, Compassion, Accountability, Respect, and Excellence.*

INTERNAL AFFAIRS BUREAU (IAB):

- ***IAB's Webpage*** - MCG suggested IAB's webpage makes it difficult for a community member to make a complaint online. (p. 11)
- **Response:** As mentioned in MCG's report, IAB's hours of operation allows for very good citizen accessibility for walk-in complaints. In an effort to ease the complaint filing process for citizens, I have taken the following steps: First, the IAB Commander will work City of Department of Technology to create a simple button to assist citizens wishing to file a complaint online. Second, citizens are now able to file a complaint on their smartphone, with the Division's recently released mobile app.
- ***IAB – Bias Based Complaints*** – MCG suggested the instances of withdrawn and/or canceled bias-based profiling citizen complaint dispositions are unusually high. (p. 14)
- **Response:** MCG's report cited inaccurate statistics on bias-based profiling complaints. MCG has since been provided the IAB's 2016 – 2017 Bias Based Profiling Report, which has accurate bias-based profiling complaint data. As indicated in the IAB's 2016-2017 Bias-Based Profiling Report, the total number of withdrawn complaints was 0 and the total number of canceled complaints was 2, or 14.3 % of total bias-based policing complaints, which is significantly lower than the 24% reported by MCG.
- ***IAB – Caseload*** - MCG stated, "In larger agencies such as CPD, where IA investigators are fully dedicated to investigations, 2 cases per month is on the low end of workable cases per investigator. Typical caseloads for standalone IA investigations is 2 to 6 per month, however, CPD is very effective at meeting case closer rates in the allotted time." (p.123)

- **Response:** With the organizational changes currently underway, I have eliminated three IAB Sergeant positions to address span of control issues in other areas of the organization. I anticipate this change will bring the IAB investigator caseload in line with the industry standard MCG cited in their report.
- ***IAB – Internal Complaint Data*** – MCG suggested the Division’s internally initiated complaint data is not included in the IAB Annual Report. (p. 124)
- **Response:** MCG’s assessment is correct; internally initiated complaint data has not been included in recent IAB Annual Reports. This practice does not align with my desire to increase transparency. The IAB Commander will include this information in next year’s IAB report. Further, the Division will update the IAB Standard Operating Procedures to require this information be included in all future annual reports.
- ***Social Media*** – MCG indicated our social media is not widely followed by the community. (p. 11)
- **Response:** The social media followers reported by MCG were erroneous. Although the figures associated with social media frequently fluctuate, our social media follower count is as follows:
 - Twitter: 39.9K (compared to 39.1K reported by MCG)
 - Facebook: 127.6K (compared to 15,431 reported by MCG)

Even with the correct follower counts, it appears that the Division is lagging, when compared to cities with similar population bases. For instance, although we have a larger Facebook following than Cleveland (127k vs 76k), our Twitter following is substantially less (72k vs 40k). Our Public Relations Specialist, Denise Alex-Bouzounis, has been with the Division for approximately 5 years. During her tenure, the Division has improved its social media presence. With Denise’s regular social media postings, the Division has observed a significantly improved social media presence. Denise regularly provides followers with up-to-date and relevant content to maintain engagement with the community.

Further, the Division’s recently released smartphone application will make our social media pages more widely accessible, which should have a significant positive impact on community engagement. As of July 5, 2019, the mobile app has been downloaded 5,421 times, which, according to MobilePD Inc., is the most successful launch of an app in terms of downloads in the first week.

ADMINISTRATIVE SUBDIVISION:

PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS BUREAU:

- ***Use of Chemical Agents Policy*** – MCG suggested our policy on use of chemical agents on non-violent or passive protesters is a low threshold for use of chemical agents and is not in line with industry best practices. (p.10)
- **Response:** As part of the Division's regular policy review process, Directive 2.04, Chemical Agents and Intermediate Weapons Regulations, is currently in the concurrence stage. Our Chief Legal Advisor, Jeffrey Furbee stated, *"The language in II.A.5 needs clarified as to when mace can be used against non-violent protestors/gatherers who are only being non-compliant, and presumably only passively resisting. It needs clarified that there would have to be a public safety concern/hazard (blocking traffic which was creating a safety hazard) in order to support a use of mace against passive resisters. Non-compliance alone does not equate to active resistance and using force against someone who was only non-compliant would be unconstitutional."*

Mr. Furbee's proposed revision to the policy is appropriate, as it allows for low-level use of force (mace) in circumstances where there is a concern of physical harm to the protester(s) or others. For instance, a group of protesters who walk or congregate on the freeway would put themselves and others at substantial risk of physical harm. Although I disagree with MCG's assertion that use of chemical agents is not appropriate, unless there is an aggressive act, I will take any specific recommendations from MCG into account.

- ***Employee Action Review System (EARS)*** – MCG suggested EARS is somewhat ineffective at early intervention since reviews are not automatically triggered, as they are with some early warning systems. (p. 12)
- **Response:** In recent years, EARS Committee members have discussed the desire to add more automatic triggers to the system; however, we currently lack the internal mechanisms to accomplish this. The purchase of an outside program or service would likely result in a more robust early warning system. MCG indicated they will evaluate this issue further in their Draft Report.

HUMAN RESOURCES BUREAU:

- ***Division's Timekeeping System*** – MCG suggested the Division's timekeeping system is antiquated. (p. 116)

➤ **Response:** Improvements to the Division's time keeping system are ongoing, as explained by Jennifer Dieringer, acting Human Resource Manager:

"The Division of Police is required to utilize the system that has been established for payroll reporting/processing by the City Auditor. The current MS-DOS based system (Bridge) is slated to be replaced by a web-based system by the end of 2020. A vendor and system has been selected by the City Auditor. The Division currently supplements Bridge with the web-based system LION to capture attendance, overtime and leave usage. This system is under constant review and is upgraded to meet the needs of the Division, within the capabilities of the system. The Bridge system does not permit for data to be transmitted from LION.

We also utilize Precinct Manager to capture a variety of information related to timekeeping. The use of both LION and Precinct Manager is cumbersome and upgrades are being established in LION which will allow for the elimination of Precinct Manager. However, prior to this occurring, Division directives will need to be revised and FOP buy-in will have to be obtained since long standing processes will need to be changed or eliminated to match the capabilities within LION."

- ***Personnel Transfer Process*** – MCG suggested the Division's manual paper transfer process is laborious and inefficient. (p. 116)

➤ **Response:** As explained by Ms. Dieringer, *"If this is referring to our payroll process... Agreed. The City's payroll system (Bridge) has rules built around it that are based on MS-DOS programing. The Division has to follow the City Auditor's rules, which requires all time to be hand written on a designated form and then entered into Bridge. This will be corrected upon implementation of the new system by the City Auditor. In the meantime, we can look for redundancies in the process which may be eliminated.*

If this is referring to our personnel transfer process...we have recently implemented an approval process via email which has shortened the overall process. Additionally, we have set up a posting & transfer schedule to set deadlines to better manage the workload. We are also currently exploring a job approval process through LION, which would be nearly 100% electronic."

- **Hiring Process Efficiencies** – MCG suggested there are opportunities to improve efficiencies in the hiring process through better alignment with the Civil Service Commission. (p. 116)

➤ **Response:** As explained by Ms. Dieringer, *“Civil Service rules specify hiring processes. We could meet with CSC representative to collaborate on process improvements. The Division relies on several layers of approval which reside outside of the Division and department. Time to hire after a vacancy is dependent upon this movement before HR can begin the Civil Service process. These approvals are dictated to us and are not able to be addressed at the division level. Internal processes can be evaluated to determine effectiveness and efficiency prior to and after all external processes have been completed.”*

In their “Next Steps in the Study” section, MCG indicated they are going to evaluate the Division’s alignment with the Civil Service Commission. Based on MCG’s forthcoming recommendations, we will work with the Civil Service Commission to identify opportunities to increase efficiencies in the hiring process.

- **Current Promotional Framework** – MCG suggested the Division’s promotional framework does not appear to prepare officers for meeting the leadership responsibilities of 21st Century Policing. (p. 116)

➤ **Response:** Newly promoted sergeants attend a three week Basic Supervisory Development Course and participate in two on-the-job training periods (1 week each), prior to taking their first permanent supervisory assignment. We believe the classroom and on-the-job training received by our new supervisors provides them with the resources necessary to be impactful leaders in our organization. However, if MCG provides actionable recommendations in their final report, we will take them into consideration.

- **Mid-Management Leadership Training** – MCG suggested that the Division provides little leadership training for mid to upper level management. (p. 116)

- **Response:** The Division of Police strongly encourages all personnel, especially supervisors, to seek out professional development opportunities. Every year, we approve several supervisors to attend long term leadership schools, including Police Executive Leadership College (PELC), Certified Law Enforcement Executive (CLEE), Ohio State Patrol – Public Safety Leadership Academy, Southern Police Institute, Senior Management Institute for Police, Northwestern University School of Police and Command, and the FBI Academy. Although our sergeants are not discouraged from pursuing these leadership opportunities, they are intended for the level of lieutenant and above. Below is a count of Division supervisors who have attended these schools.

- **Police Executive Leadership College (PELC)**
 - 5 – Deputy Chiefs
 - 9 – Commanders
 - 7 – Lieutenants
 - 1 – Sergeant
- **Certified Law Enforcement Executive (CLEE)**
 - 5 – Commanders
 - 4 – Lieutenants
 - 1 – Sergeant
- **OSP-Public Safety Leadership Academy**
 - 4 – Commanders
 - 7 – Lieutenants
- **Southern Police Institute Admin. Officers Course**
 - 1 – Commander
 - 1 – Lieutenant
- **Senior Management Institute for Police**
 - 1 – Deputy Chief
 - 1 – Commander
- **Northwestern University School of Police and Command**
 - 2 – Deputy Chiefs
 - 4 – Commanders
 - 2 – Lieutenants
- **FBI Academy**
 - 1 – Chief of Police
 - 4 – Deputy Chiefs
 - 9 – Commanders

- **Police Executive Leadership Institute (PELI), via Major Cities Chiefs Association (MCCA)**
 - 1 – Chief of Police
 - 3 – Deputy Chiefs

In addition to approving our personnel to attend long-term, police specific training, we also encourage all Division of Police personnel to take advantage of the City's generous tuition reimbursement program. The Division has long recognized the benefits and importance of supporting lifelong learning. Just as our organization benefits from the diverse backgrounds and experiences of our employees, we recognize the benefits associated with a multi-disciplinary approach to continuing education. Our employees choose to pursue a variety of educational opportunities, not limited to a focus in law enforcement. For instance, several Division employees have attained advanced business, sociology, computer science, law, and doctoral degrees.

Further, the Division of Police is frequently asked by other law enforcement agencies to assist with providing assessors for their promotional exams. Each year, we approve our personnel to travel across the county, with expenses paid by the requesting agency, to assist with these exams. Participants not only gain valuable experience that may assist them with future promotional opportunities, they also learn about other law enforcement organizational cultures, industry trends, best practices, and have an opportunity to network with other police professionals.

In addition, each of the Division's employees receives an annual evaluation from their direct supervisor. As part of the evaluation, the employee and supervisor discuss the employee's performance over the previous year, as well as future career goals and professional development opportunities.

The Division also provides supervisors with regular Management and Leadership Training (MALT). Since 2011, supervisors have been provided training on a variety of leadership and operational topics, such as project management, incident command, cultural sensitivity, employee development, and recognizing Post Traumatic Stress Disorder in veterans.

- ***Current Promotional Practice*** – MCG suggested the practice of promoting officers after three years should be evaluated. Further, they indicated the seniority-based system was consistently seen as an impediment to optimal functioning of the Division, as it relates to HR practices and policies and undoubtedly impacts the entire organizational and leadership culture. (p. 116)
- **Response:** The three year provision is a contractual issue that can be addressed in the next negotiation period.

- **Manual Work Processes – 56 Day Rotation** – MCG suggested there are significant manual work processes that have a negative impact on productivity. In addition, the ability of officers to rotate every 56 days adds to the workload. (p. 116)
- **Response:** Aside from the 56 day transfer policy, MCG did not identify additional work processes that negatively impact productivity. It is anticipated additional processes will be identified in MCG's final Draft Report. The 56 day transfer policy is a contractual issue, which can be explored during the next negotiation period.
- **Background Investigations** – MCG has identified three issues related to the Background Investigations Unit. The issues and my corresponding responses are as follows:
 - **In-Person Reference Checks** – MCG suggested there is some level of liability associated with not conducting in-person reference checks. (p. 116)
 - **Response:** Our Background Investigations personnel currently use the Peace Officer Background Investigation Tracking System (POBITS) to reach applicant references. Our Background Investigations Public Safety Manager, Richard Blunt, agreed with MCG's assessment and recommended the Division consider conducting in person reference checks.
 - **Sworn Personnel in Background Investigations** – MSG suggested there is not a clear need for sworn personnel to be involved in the current police background investigation process. (p. 116)
 - **Response:** Using sworn personnel, as opposed to civilians, to conduct in-person background checks, is preferred for safety reasons, as well the increased likelihood of open communication between background investigations staff and interviewees.
 - **Polygraphist Workload** – MCG suggested the workload for Division polygraphists appears to be excessive. (p. 116)
 - **Response:** Mr. Blunt agreed with MCG's assessment. At the conclusion of MCG's study, Mr. Blunt will assess MCG's recommendations for Background Investigations and will recommend an appropriate course of action.

FISCAL MANAGEMENT BUREAU:

1. ***Fiscal Management Bureau – Manual Work Processes*** – MCG suggested the Bureau has heavily manual work processes which have a negative impact on workload.

➤ **Response:** According to the Division's Fiscal Operations Manager, Mitchell Clay, there are two processes which have the most significant negative impact on workload: 1, the approval/letter routing process and 2, electronic scanning of documents.

A future policy change and the utilization of existing technology, PowerDMS, could improve efficiencies associated with the approval process. Additionally, Fiscal Management personnel suggested the Division purchase additional document scanners to improve unit efficiency. At the conclusion of MCG's study, Mr. Clay will submit a proposal to address any identified inefficiencies and further recommendations made by MCG.

INVESTIGATIVE SUBDIVISION:

- **Case Management** – For several investigative units, MCG suggested a need for improved case management policies and procedures. (p. 4)
- **Response:** I recently attended a presentation by Mark43, a software and data analytics company, where they demonstrated a product aimed at improving case management inadequacies, as well as other inefficiencies experienced by many law enforcement organizations. While we await the anticipated recommendations in MCG's final report, the Division will continue to evaluate in-house options, as well as outside opportunities.
- **Annual Report Data** – MCG suggested, reporting of investigative information is inconsistent among the varied Bureaus, which is reflected in the prior data, Annual Reports, etc. (p. 73)
- **Response** – Bureau Commanders will be provided with specific instruction on the expected structure and content of future annual reports.

NARCOTICS BUREAU:

- **Vice Activity** – MCG suggested a repurposed Vice Unit, with improved management, is preferred over the elimination of the entire unit. (p. 73)
- **Response:** Enforcement and investigation of Vice related activity will now be performed by a newly formed unit, Police And Community Together (PACT), as summarized below by Acting Deputy Chief Jennifer Knight:
 - PACT Unit (Police And Community Together). This unit will be formed to address prostitution related crimes and liquor violations that directly impact the quality of life in affected neighborhoods. This unit will consist of a sergeant, a training officer, and approximately 10 officers rotating periodically, that already work in the affected neighborhoods and are familiar with the issues and element that is contributing to the problem. The PACT Unit will take a multifaceted approach as follows:
 - Address street level prostitution from both a supply and demand side, to include identifying and interrupting prostitution transactions through enforcement.
 - PACT officers will use a uniformed and plainclothes presence designed to identify, arrest, or cite, "Johns" and interrupt the demand for prostitution.

- PACT officers will use a uniformed and plainclothes presence designed to identify, arrest, or cite, persons engaged in prostitution. PACT officers will work with CATCH court to interrupt the cycle of prostitution so that those arrested have alternatives to returning to the street.
 - Identify and provide resources for suspected victims of human trafficking and coordinate with the HTTF.
 - Identify and develop private partnerships designed to provide resources to persons wanting to escape the cycle of prostitution. Continue the Linden Model working with area churches.
 - Work to identify area houses used as “flop Houses” or brothels. These locations can create epicenters of crime in neighborhoods where they attract both prostitution and drug related activity. PACT officers will identify these locations and work with the Narcotics and the City Attorney’s office to abate these locations and eradicate the associated criminal activity.
- ***“Unusual Investigative Units”*** – MCG suggested, the Division currently fields “unusual” investigative units (e.g. Pharmaceutical) compared to their national law enforcement counterparts. MCG indicated there is no benchmark caseload metrics for such a proactive unit. Further, MCG stated, “... and no other law enforcement agency with which we have worked has had such a dedicated unit”. (p. 72)
 - **Response:** The Division’s Pharmaceutical Unit works with the Ohio Medical and Pharmacy Boards, as well as other law enforcement and healthcare service providers to investigate criminal activity in instances where there is a nexus to the opioid epidemic. Further, detectives may be given expanded duties for homicide investigations involving drug overdose deaths. Given the impact of the opioid crisis in Central Ohio, I believe this specialized investigative team is well suited for the needs of the Division of Police. Although I will take any recommendations made in MCG’s Draft Report into consideration, I do not believe any changes need to be made to this unit at this time.
 - ***In-Tac Performance Metrics*** – MCG suggested, In-Tac does not have specific performance metrics noted in the Annual Report. (p. 72)
 - **Response:** During their initial information gathering phase, MCG was not provided with any performance metrics for In-Tac. MCG has since been provided with all relevant performance metrics for 2016 – 2019.

CRIMES AGAINST PERSONS BUREAU:

- ***Performance Management*** – MCG stated, *“The availability of detailed data, by Person Crime Section, appears to be different, as information for Homicide, Assault, and Robbery all report different kinds of data. This issue of “performance management” will be discussed further in the draft report.”* (p. 60)
- **Response:** Similar to the issue of inconsistent reporting of performance measurements in the bureau annual reports, this issue can be addressed, at least in part, through consistent statistical reporting throughout the Division’s investigative units. Further, a new case management solution would improve the efficiency and consistency of statistical reporting. I will review the anticipated recommendations in MCG’s Final Report, prior to taking further action to address this issue.

SPECIAL VICTIMS BUREAU:

- ***Sexual Assault*** – MCG indicated there is no formal cold case unit within the Sexual Assault Section. This will be further discussed in the draft report. (p. 68)
- **Response:** Sexual Assault Detectives routinely investigate cold cases, as well as examine the conviction integrity of old cases; however, there is no specialized unit for these investigations. Although there are no specific plans to create a cold case unit within Sexual Assault, this option could be explored, if given compelling reasons to do so in MCG’s Final Report.

HOMELAND SECURITY SUBDIVISION:

COMMUNICATIONS BUREAU:

- ***Communications Bureau – Best Practice*** - MCG suggested Division of Police and Fire E911 Dispatch are not consistent with best practice. (p. 87)
- **Response:** After reviewing MCG's assessment, and a response to the report from Communications Bureau Commander, Christopher Bowling, the Division cannot take any specific action at this time. Although it is anticipated MCG will make specific recommendations in their Draft Report, there are no specific issues or recommendations, with regard to best practices, identified in this preliminary assessment.
- ***Communications Bureau - Operations*** – With regard to operations, MCG has identified several issues, which are identified below, along with a corresponding response. (p. 87)
 - **Consolidation of police and fire dispatch services.** (p. 87)
 - **Response:** As stated by Commander Bowling, *"... Steps were initiated in the past to consolidate these services but remain stalled due to needs for upgraded technology and increased staffing for bureau personnel. A large number of Communications Bureau personnel will again have to recertify this year with Priority Dispatch/International Academies of Emergency Dispatch (IAED) for EFD/EMD so that they can take and process calls for fire or emergency medical services at some planned time in the future."* Call taking systems are currently being examined, although there are no plans to consolidate Columbus Division of Fire and Police Dispatch services. The skillsets of firefighters and police officers are unique, as are the skillsets of their respective dispatchers. Consolidating the two services would create new liabilities for the Division of Police.
 - **Address ergonomic-related issues.** (p. 87)
 - **Response:** MCG did not identify any specific ergonomic-related issues in their preliminary report. The Division is aware of some of the current inadequacies of the communications facility. Many of these issues are long-term projects with funding yet to be identified. However, lower level issues, such as the purchase of workstations and chairs, is already underway.

- **Address technology-support issues.** (p. 87)
 - **Response:** Again, MCG did not identify any specific issues related to technology/support. However, there is a project currently being overseen by the city's Department of Technology to obtain up-to-date technology for the communications center, which includes upgrades to the CAD system. Further, additional funding should be considered for a real time crime center, which could address many of the technology and support issues experienced by the Communications Bureau.
- **Full civilianization of operation.** (p. 87)
 - **Response:** As with several of MCG's previously mentioned recommendations for civilianization, I will wait for their Final Report to evaluate the need for full civilianization of the Communications Bureau.
- **Potential opportunity for specialized call-takers to answer non-emergency lines.** (p. 87)
 - **Response:** Based on Commander Bowling's assessment of the issue below, I do not recommend hiring specialized call-takers for non-emergency lines at this time.
 - Commander Bowling – *"We reject this assertion or recommendation as we believe it would lead to the hire of additional personnel who would be less efficient. There are already two Civil Service Classifications in the Communications Bureau. The first is a 911 Emergency Call Taker (ECT) who is only trained to answer either 911 or administrative phone calls. The second is a 911 Emergency Dispatcher (ED) who is trained to do what the ECTs do and also trained to dispatch police and other services to persons in need and control the units on a specific radio channel."*

The system in this emergency communications center (ECC) is designed to flow 911 calls to certain assigned 911 ECTs or EDs and administrative calls via the Division of Police's non-emergency number to other assigned 911 ECTs and EDs. If a 911 call spike occurs, all 911 ECTs and EDs will take 911 calls until the spike is over and the consoles are set up as such. The only opportunity to divert non-police calls away from the ECC operated by the Division of Police would be to remove the administrative phone number and direct all non-emergency calls to the city's 311 call center. That center could then use either human operators or an automated attendant to direct those needing non-emergency police services back to this ECC and to a 911 ECT or ED for action."

TRAFFIC BUREAU:

- **Traffic Enforcement** – MCG suggested there are opportunities to increase the enforcement presence of traffic units. MCG stated, *"While recognizing that personnel assigned to traffic enforcement units in the City (including both freeway and motor units) have other roles, enforcement actions (both citations and warnings) are at a relatively low level."* (p. 89)
- **Response:** It was discovered that MCG only used traffic enforcement data in the CAD to determine the productivity level of traffic units. Much of the productivity associated with traffic units is not captured in the CAD. For instance, MCG indicated our Traffic Operations Section only issued 5,863 citations when they actually issued 33,093 citations for the period under review. MCG was provided with updated enforcement statistics for all traffic units, which show a drastic increase in productivity when compared to the stats originally cited by MCG. In addition, a uniform Crash Investigation Unit is being explored that will increase traffic safety and will likely impact the number of traffic citations issued.

SPECIAL SERVICES BUREAU:

- **SWAT Training** – MCG stated, *"The unit may need additional support since it is a one person operation with additional back up duties."* (p. 80)
- **Response:** MCG has indicated they are going to analyze this issue further in their study. Based on input received from Special Services Commander, Robert Strausbaugh, and SWAT Section Lieutenant, Paul Ohl, there may be a need for additional support in SWAT Training; however, it appears there is a greater need for a second lieutenant's position in the SWAT Section. After receiving MCG's anticipated future recommendations, I will make an appropriate determination, with regard to SWAT staffing.

- ***Canine Unit Staffing*** – In their report, MCG stated, *“Providing the 20 hours of coverage, seven days a week, with 9 sworn members, leaves the unit without sufficient personnel on some days.”* (p. 80)
 - **Response:** One of my current initiatives includes the addition of two canines and two handlers. The reporting hours of these new positions will be tailored to fill any gaps in coverage for the unit. The expansion of the Canine Unit has been approved and budgeting for the new canines is in progress.
- ***Aviation Unit Retirements*** – MCG stated, *“During the course of unit interviews, the project team learned that several pilots/officers are eligible to retire in the next few years. It can take two years to fully train a new pilot which means there could be a shortage of trained pilots.”* (p. 84)
 - **Response:** Commander Strausbaugh and Aviation Section Lieutenant, Jack Harris, both recommend adding additional pilots to the section. Although there are no immediate plans to add pilots to the section, the Division will continue to encourage aspiring pilots to attain their certification. Further, former aviation officers are also encouraged to maintain their certification and to assist the Aviation Section as an observer, which can augment current staffing.
- ***Aviation Unit – In-House Maintenance*** - Assess whether another ***in-house maintenance*** would be less expensive or a better option. (p. 85)
 - **Response:** As part of their “Next Steps in the Study”, MCG is going to further analyze the option of in-house maintenance. There is a plan to move forward with two in-house mechanics; Civil Service is currently working on classifications for these positions. MCG’s final analysis/recommendations will be taken into account before moving forward with this plan.

SUPPORT SERVICES SUBDIVISION:

SUPPORT OPERATIONS BUREAU:

- ***Property Control*** – MCG suggested the property and evidence warehouse and the impound lot are near capacity. Further, MCG indicated the Property Control Unit is behind on the destruction or disposition of unneeded evidence or property. (p. 98)
- **Response:** These issues could be addressed, at least in part, with additional staffing at the property room and impound lot. These issues will be further addressed at the conclusion of MCG's study.
- ***Impounding Unit*** – MCG noted several concerns with the Impounding Unit, which are listed below, along with a corresponding response.
 - The impound lot is required by city code to contact owners within seven days of a vehicle being impounded; however, the impound lot does not always meet the deadline. (p. 98)
 - **Response:** This is a potential staffing issue that we will address at the conclusion of MCG's report.
 - There are blind spots in the impound lot that cannot be monitored by current surveillance methods.
 - **Response:** There are no current plans for surveillance improvements at the impound lot. At the conclusion of MCG's study, I will ask the Subdivision Deputy Chief for plans to address the issues identified in MCG's report.
 - The condition of the surface lot is in poor condition.
 - **Response** – The Department of Public Service (Street Department) has already begun making improvements to the impound lot's surface.
 - Community members are unescorted when retrieving their vehicles.
 - **Response** - Due to current staffing levels, it is difficult for Impound Lot personnel to escort all citizens who are there to retrieve their vehicles. Personnel are able to assist individuals with health related or mobility issues. This issue will be further addressed at the conclusion of MCG's study.

Director Ned Pettus Jr.

AUGUST 16, 2019

20

- ***Print Shop Processing Video Evidence*** – MCG stated, *“The print shop manger processes video evidence using video evidence software along with a member of the photo lab. Though these individuals are trained through LEVA (Law Enforcement Video Association), it is unusual to have a unit outside of investigations assigned to process video.”* (p. 96)
- **Response** – I have considered the option of assigning the tasks associated with processing video evidence to the Crime Lab; however, I will wait for MCG’s anticipated recommendations to make a final determination.

PATROL NORTH & SOUTH SUBDIVISIONS:

- ***Patrol Proactivity Levels and Span of Control*** - MCG suggested that patrol officer proactivity levels vary significantly at the zone level, particularly on Zones 2 and 3. Further, MCG suggested proactivity is inconsistently available during daytime hours. (p. 37, 38, & 43)

MCG also suggested the span of control for patrol supervisors is higher than the recommended span of control of no more than seven to nine officers per sergeant, as recommended by the Police Executive Research Forum (PERF) and the International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP).

- **Response:** I have tasked a committee with examining span of control and operational issues identified by MCG and developing near-term solutions to bring span of control to appropriate levels. A mid to long-term solution is to restructure patrol to address span of control and other operational issues. The last redistricting of the Patrol Subdivisions occurred in 2010. Since that time, the City of Columbus has expanded in size and increased in population. In their "Next Steps in the Study" comments for the Patrol North & South Subdivisions, MCG indicated a further analysis of the staffing needs and spans of control is forthcoming. A patrol redistricting performed now would be premature, as MCG and/or the Mayor's Safety Advisory Commission will undoubtedly make specific recommendations, with regard to patrol staffing and operations. Further, a patrol restructuring should only occur after a permanent Chief of Police is approved. A patrol restructuring would be impactful to many of our personnel and should only be done after a decision is made on the Chief's position.
- ***Mounted Unit*** - MCG suggested the Division of Police examine the productivity of the Mounted Unit, which they describe as "*inherently limited*", as well as overtime and any capital improvements that may need to be made to existing facilities.
- **Response:** The Mounted Unit's positive impact on crowd management at public protests and events cannot be overstated. The Mounted Unit can be used to move large groups of protesters from an area, with a diminished risk of injury or escalation, when compared to moving protesters with field force officers. With the frequency and size of protests and events, and with the upcoming election cycle, the Mounted Unit will continue to see an increase in deployment activity. Further, the Mounted Unit serves a unique role in fostering positive police-community relations. The Mounted Unit is always one of the most popular units at every community function and they receive frequent requests to attend these events.

When possible, the unit adjusts its schedule to accommodate events, which reduces overtime expenditures. At this time, overtime costs associated with the unit do not appear to be concerning.

In regard to capital improvements for the Mounted Unit, there are no significant projects that have not already been taken into account. The barn's roof was recently replaced, and improvements to the pasture are in the works.

For the aforementioned reasons, I do not believe there is a need to make significant changes to the Mounted Unit.

- ***Criminal Intelligence Analysts*** – MCG suggested the Criminal Intelligence Analysts would benefit from the creation of a new supervisory position. MCG stated, *“Given that these skillsets require a time investment to acquire, the supervisory position of a crime analyst unit does not benefit from the frequent rotation of assignments that is often the case with a lieutenant position. Moreover, the unit is comprised entirely of civilian staff, and does not require a sworn manager to manage effectively.”*
- **Response:** One of my current organizational initiatives is to have all of our Crime Analysts work out of the same office in Police Headquarters, as opposed to having satellite workstations. This move will bring analysts and their respective Patrol Zone Commander closer together, which will enhance the sharing of information and the development of strategies to address criminal activity. This also eliminates the need to hire a supervisor for the Crime Analysts, as each analyst will report directly to their commander. However, a Crime Analyst Supervisor can be tasked with all National Integrated Ballistic Information Network (NIBN) activity related to ShotSpotter.
- ***High School Resource Unit*** – MCG suggested the span of control for the High School Resource Unit Sergeants is high. (p. 46) MCG stated, *“Another issue is the current span of control handled by the HSRO sergeants, who also supervise the Juvenile Truancy Unit. Even without the personnel assigned to the Truancy Unit, these sergeants each have 10 officers reporting to them. With the Truancy Unit officers added, this represents an exceptionally high span of control.”*
- **Response:** As part of ongoing reorganization efforts, the Truancy Unit will transition to the Youth Services Unit. The unit will increase to 10 officers, overseen by a sergeant, which will eliminate the need for High School Resource Sergeants to oversee the unit. This will leave each High School Resource Sergeant with 10 direct reports, which is slightly higher than the ideal span of control, cited by MCG; however, this span of control has proven satisfactory in fulfilling the unit's mission.

- ***Patrol Traffic Enforcement*** – MCG suggested patrol units are not significantly contributing to traffic enforcement in the City, as evidenced by enforcement actions. (p. 89)
- **Response:** As indicated in MCG's report, available proactivity time amongst patrol personnel varies greatly, based on geographic location and time of day. Patrol's focus on traffic enforcement is largely dependent upon free time, which has diminished in recent years, as officers have assumed a more prominent role in community engagement and are occupied with increasingly specialized activities associated with the position. Additionally, the Division's highly inefficient Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) & Records Management System (RMS) compounds the lack of proactive policing. However, Patrol Commanders exercise discretion on how to deploy their Community Response Teams (CRT) and officers assigned to their zones. Where appropriate, patrol personnel are assigned to address specific traffic complaints, such as speeding in school zones, which are typically routed through 311.

CONCLUSION:

MCG's Preliminary Resource Planning Assessment of the Columbus Division of Police has provided our organization with several opportunities for improvement while highlighting many areas where we are currently aligned with best practices. As Interim Chief of Police, I look forward to seeing specific recommendations from MCG and Mayor Ginther's Safety Advisory Commission and taking action to set a standard of excellence all other law enforcement organizations strive to achieve.

Respectfully Submitted,



Thomas Quinlan #5000
Chief of Police