

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

**Monday, November 18, 2019
4:00 p.m.**

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: David Cooke, Brooke Michl-Smith, Jason Sudy, Lauren McNair.

Commissioners Absent: Shannon Fergus, Todd Boyer, Ben Goodman.

Staff Present: Kimberly Barnard.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:04 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, December 3, 2019 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, December 10, 2019 at 4pm. 111 N Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, October 8, 2019.
MOTION: Cooke/McNair (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. IV-19-11-007

158 East Second Avenue

Eric D Martineau (Applicant)/ Lenore & David Paragas (Owner)

Recommend approval of application #IV-19-11-007, 158 East Second Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Variance Recommendation

- 3332.26(C). Minimum Side-Yard setback. Code requires 3' setback on lots 40' wide or less. The existing structure has a side yard setback of 1.5' on the western side.
- 3332.25 Maximum Side Yard. Zoning code provides that the sum of the widths of each side yard shall equal or exceed 20% of the width of the lot. The lot in question is 39' wide. Applied, any construction should have the sum of each side yard equal or exceed 7.8'. The existing non-conforming structure is 1.5' from the western property line, and the new construction would be 3' from the eastern property line, for a total maximum side yard calculation of 4.5', which equals 11.54%.

MOTION: McNair/Michl-Smith (3-0-1) RECOMMENDED [Cooke]

2. IV-19-11-008

Cornelius Street and Civitas

Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Park New Day LLC (Owner)

MOVED TO 11.B

3. IV-19-11-009

184 East First Avenue

Connie Klema (Applicant)/ David Cooke (Owner)

Recommend approval of application #IV-19-11-009, 184 East First Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Variance Recommendation

- 1. 3332.21-Building Setback: To have a front building setback that is less than 10' and is 6'3".
- 2. 3332.26-Minimum side yard permitted: (B) (1) To permit the least dimension between the dwelling and side lot line to be less than 3' and to be 0.8'. (E) To permit the least dimension between the detached garage and the side lot lines to be less than 3' and to be 1.29' and 1.7'.
- 3. 3332.38(E)-Private garage: To permit a private detached garage to occupy more than 45 percent of the total rear yard and to occupy 70.2 percent.

MOTION: Michl-Smith/McNair (3-0-1) RECOMMENDED [Cooke]

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. IV-19-11-010

275 East Greenwood Avenue

House to Home Property Group (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-11-010, 275 East Greenwood Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct a new, single car garage, located behind (south) of the existing house at 275 E Greenwood.
- Exterior materials to match existing house, including GAF Royal Sovereign Nickle Gray Shingles, pine siding to be painted "City Rain."
- Proposed garage will measure 12' by 20' with a 9' garage door.
- Revised accurate building drawings to include gutters, appropriate man door location, and light fixture matching the cut sheet (goose neck).
- Revised drawings to be submitted to staff prior to approval.

MOTION: Cooke/McNair (4-0-0) APPROVED.

5. IV-19-11-011

1050 North Fourth Street

Shremshock Architects –Karrick Sherrill (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-11-011, 1050 North Fourth Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Demolition

- Demolition of the existing Durable Slate Building.

New Construction

- Construct a 66 wood framed apartment building with parking at grade on the first floor.
- Commercial space is proposed on the first floor. Owner is actively seeking a market tenant to occupy the space.
- Approve building floor plans, site plan, and elevation.
- Incorporate stone detailing from the existing Durable Slate Building to be reused in the new construction.
- Exterior will consist of blond and red brick, corrugated siding panels, buff colored block masonry, fiber cement siding,
- Black Airolite louvers to be installed on the south and east elevations.
- Windows need to be from the approved windows list.
- No fake windows are permitted, the spaces which showed the brick filled windows will be flush wall.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to staff prior to approval.

MOTION: McNair/Michl-Smith (3-0-1) APPROVED [Sudy]

6. IV-19-11-012

800 North High Street

WeWork (Applicant)/ Crawford Hoying (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-11-013a, 1144 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Halo-illuminated dimensional letters located at corner of North High Street and East Hubbard Avenue.
 - Overall size will be 18” high by 86” wide.
 - 2” deep HDU letters, painted Matthews MP 18243 Smelted Steel Metallic
 - Internal white halo LED illumination
 - Letters individually mounted
- Temporary graphics, hung from the interior space.
 - Overall size will be 12’1” high by 21’8” wide
 - Digitally printed graphics.
 - Temporary graphics to be displayed for 2-2 ½ months.
- Note: Approval does not include the proposed non-illuminated dimensional letters on North High Street side of building as they are not in line with the Short North Design Guidelines that signage needs to be pedestrian oriented.

MOTION: McNair/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED.

7. IV-19-11-013

1144 North High Street

John Ingwersen (Applicant)/ Mary Bohannon, et al. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-11-013a was divided into Items ‘a’ and ‘b’ for clarity of action.

IV-19-11-013a

Approve application #IV-19-11-013a, 1144 North High Street, as submitted:

- Exterior light fixtures were changed.
- Outdoor flat screen TVs and speakers have been installed.
- Installed permanent outdoor furniture.

MOTION: Cooke/McNair (0-4-0) DENIED

Reasons for Denial:

- SNDG feel that design and overall impacts of the speakers, screens in addition to the fact none of this was previously approved. Asking for obvious things to be removed that are having a negative impact.
- Not built to previously approved 2009 plan (COA #09-7-10a).
- City cited code violation, not in compliance with previously approved site plans or Certificate of Appropriateness.
- City Code 3116.11 –Standards for Alteration (3) Each property shall be recognized as a product of its own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.
- City Code 3116.13 –Standards for Site Improvements (A) Landscaping, parking, utility or service areas, walkways and similar improvements should be compatible to each other and to the subject building or structure as well as to adjacent contributing properties, open spaces and the overall environment.

IV-12-11-013b

Continue application #IV-19-11-013b, 1144 North High Street, to allow the applicant time to revise the patio plan to include more greenspace and submit additional materials.

- Two front patio tree planter location added, instead of previously approved four.
- Explore adding or replacing removed unplanted greenery on the site.

MOTION: Cooke/McNair (4-0-0) CONTINUED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

8. IV-19-11-014

59-65 East Russell

Blackfriars Development LLC (Owner)

Continue application #IV-19-11-014, 59-65 East Russell, to allow the applicant time to submit additional materials.

Conceptual Review:

- Develop less than 2000 sq ft of grass surface into 8 asphalt parking spaces.
- Install 270 sq yds (2430 sq ft) of asphalt, strip, and place 8 -7' parking blocks with rebar anchors.
- Install approximately 645 sq ft concrete apron.
- Install 34" high by 24" long bike rack along parking spaces on Kerr Street.

MOTION: Cooke/McNair (4-0-0) CONTINUED.

9. IV-19-11-015

283 Detroit and adjacent parcel (parcels 010-040357 and 010-031575)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ New Victorians for Tom O'Brien (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-08-013 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action.

IV-19-11-015a

Recommend approval of application #IV-19-11-015a, 283 Detroit and adjacent parcel (parcels 010-040357 and 010-031575) as submitted:

Proposed Variances:

- 3332.039 R-4 District: To allow for two single family residences on a single parcel.
- 3332.15 R-4 area district requirements. R-4 area district requirements: In an R-4 area district a single-family dwelling or other principal building shall be situated on a lot of no less than 5,000 square feet in area, whereas the applicant is proposing 2 1-unit dwellings on a 4171sq' lot
- 3332.19 Fronting Detroit is 28' and therefore not considered a public street.
- 3332.25 Maximum sideyard required. To be 11'-4 ¼" while the required is 16'-0".
- 3332.27 - Rear yard: Each dwelling shall be erected so as to provide a rear yard totaling no less than 25 percent of the total lot area; whereas the applicant proposes to have a combined 18.5% of the lot as rear yard for both dwellings.

MOTION: Cooke/McNair (4-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

IV-19-11-015b

Conceptual Review:

- Two proposed single family houses will have an industrial style, masonry products will be used.
- Combine two parcels into a single parcel to allow for alley access for parking to both residences and more greenspace.
- Both houses are proposed with a third stories.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- The grade separation was questioned due to the existing retaining wall on the property and the existing house on the corner requiring steps.
- Commissioners support access from the alley. Happy to see there are no proposed curb cuts along Detroit and thought it was a smart solution to the odd shaped lots.
- A suggestion was made to consider flipping a door to line up with others.
- The offset yards were praised as it created an interesting space.
- Concern was raised about the third story patios and if they were visible from Detroit.

10. IV-19-11-016

**Southeast corner of North Sixth and East Third (988-990 and 994 North Sixth)
Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)/ New Victorians –Joel Roby (Owner)**

Conceptual Review:

- Combine two existing lots into a single lot.
- Construct two new duplexes.
- Five parking spaces are proposed.
- Duplexes will both have a traditional exterior aesthetic.
- Variances to consider will include use/rear yard, setbacks, and lot sized.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- More information is needed on the east balcony.
- Commissioners were not in support of a large second story porch.
- Suggested extending the central porch on the East their elevation.
- Variation was also requested. A Commissioner suggested looking at a similar project on East Second Avenue where variety of design elements was allowed.
- The continuation of sidewalks on these lots was encouraged.
- One Commissioner noted that the water table was a course too high and it looked out of proportion on the house.
- Commissioners requested to keep the existing limestone curbs.
- The Commissioners noted that the previous garage design was preferred over the one provided at the hearing.

11 A. IV-19-11-017

Jeffrey Park Phase IX (Dickenson Street)

Rob Harris, Brent Racer, Dan Hanes (Applicant)/ Jeffrey New Day LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review:

- New Construction mixed used building will contain the following:
 - 7 story parking garage
 - 5 story 200 unit apartment wrapping the garage with fully integrated balconies
 - First floor lobby with reception, leasing, and restaurant
 - Elevator to serve the apartments and rooftop amenity space on the 8th floor
 - Class A office on the 8th-11th floors

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners stated that the applicant could go higher. Few commissioners had a height limit or concern.
- Concerned about how the integrated parking would be addressed when it was no longer needed.
- Requested to keep the building and grounds as urban as possible.
- The fourth level was requested not to have a patio would be used for party nights. Commissioners are concerned about the noise produced if the area would have an outdoor patio based on existing complaints in the Short North.
- Suggested that the parking entrance would be best located on the south elevation to deter traffic going through the existing portions of the development.
- It was noted by one Commissioner that the top level looked like a morgue at the moment.
- Other Commissioners commented that the massing needed further designed as it currently looks blockish with lots happening. Details were needed to flush the design out and make it look less chaotic.

11 B. IV-19-11-008

Cornelius Street and Civitas

Rob Harris (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Park New Day LLC (Owner)

Recommend approval of application #IV-19-11-008, Cornelius Street and Civitas, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Splitting the portion of the lot to separate the park from the approved buildings for Phases VI and VII.
- No physical or visual change will occur.
- Park will be 1.691 acres.

MOTION: Cooke/Michl-Smith (4-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

12. IV-19-11-018

295 East Fifth Avenue and 290 East Greenwood Avenue

Jeanne Cabral (Applicant)/ Michelle Cordle (Owner)

Conceptual Review:

- Replace siding on existing house.
- Replace current shingles on house with Patriot Weathered Wood shingles.
- Front porch cover and posts/trim to be painted and repaired.
- House and proposed garage to be painted olive green with cream trim and downspouts.
- Remove rear (south) porch and add a two story addition.
- Two story addition to add a rear dormer for a finished attic.
- Recombine lot so it is no longer split.
- Construct a three-car garage on south of lot (currently 290 E Greenwood).
- Garage door will be Cloplay brand painted cream.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- Per the Short North Design Guidelines (and Italian Village Design Guidelines) the front door should have a glass panel.
- Doors on the east elevation should match each other.
- Garage doors should include two goose neck lights over it, cut sheet will be needed for the next submittal.
- Commissioners questioned if the proposed colors (applicant provided a more neutral scheme during the hearing) complimented the house. Noted that there were other houses in the district which the applicant could look at for inspiration and encouraged them to explore other options.
- Commissioners requested that the material for the driveway and sidewalk be permeable pavers.
- Commissioners requested that the applicant coordinate with HPO staff to conduct a site visit to determine if the existing wood siding needs replaced or can be repaired.

13. IV-19-11-019

1152 Summit Street

Craig Shively (Applicant)

Conceptual Review:

- Remove the tree on the lot to build house.
- Construct a two-story, single family house on parcel.

Commissioner Comments:

- The tree needs to be planted in an area in the yard where it can successfully root.
- Commissioners requested that the future tree be a minimum of a 3 inch caliber tree.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

• **IV-19-08-008**

279 East Fifth Avenue

R.M. McFadyen Holdings Limited (Applicant)/F.K. IV L.P. (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-08-008, 279 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- Expansion of existing fitness center into additional 6,350 sqft of building.
- Existing parking meets code for the use of the additional space.
- Previous variance for 9,500 sqft is already in place, along with associated parking.
- 3370.05: Permitted Uses – The underlying zoning district allows office and less-objectionable manufacturing uses of the M-Manufacturing District in Chapter 3363 of the Columbus City Code, as listed in the limitation overlay text adopted in Ordinance #498-95 (Z94-097). Applicant requests a council variance to permit 15,850 sqft of fitness center use.
- 3312.29: Parking space. Under this section a parking space shall be a rectangular area of not less than 9 feet by 18 feet. Applicant requests a variance to permit eight parking spaces with reduced area of 8.5 feet by 18 feet, as shown on the site plan.

• **IV-19-11-001**

247 East Third Avenue

Andrew Fortener (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-11-001, 247 East Third Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint privacy fence to match the existing color scheme on the roof deck.
- The privacy fence will be painted Sherwin Williams 7069 Iron Ore.

Exterior Painting

- Paint privacy fence to match existing color scheme of the rooftop deck. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

• **IV-19-11-002**

846 North High Street

DaNite Sign Co –Sean Clark on behalf of Schiff Properties/ One Short North LLC (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-11-002, 846 North High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Move existing “sole classics” projecting sign from its current location 20’ south, per submitted documents.
- Sign graphics and height will be kept the same.
- The projecting sign will be located 10’ above the sidewalk and measures 2’ by 3’.
- Masonry at the previous sign location will be filled, sealed, and dusted with material from the new holes.

- **IV-19-11-003**

140 Warren Street

Mike Navarro (Applicant)/ Leah and Jon Ford (Owners)

Approve application #IV-19-11-003, 140 Warren Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace 35 windows with one-over-one, Jeld Wen W5500 Series (aka Jeld Wen the Siteline series).
- Windows to be installed will have plain transparent glass, no frosting or etching.
- Brick mold on the exterior side will be replaced like for like if needed.

Replace Non-Original Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the house with new, Jeld Wen W5500 1-OVER-1, wood windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.
- Exterior window trim color for all windows to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **IV-19-11-004**

175 East First Avenue

Allan Gardner (Applicant)/ Brandon Childers (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-11-004, 175 East First Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace 16 windows total. 15 windows will be replaced with Lincoln Standard Double Hung 2-over-2 on the first and second floor. 1 slider window will be installed on the second floor bathroom, it will be replaced with a Lincoln window.
- The 2-over-2 windows will have a center grip with simulated divider and the aluminum will be “Classic Black,” per submitted documentation.
- Window trim and porch will be painted Sherwin Williams PPG1001-7 “Black Magic,” per submitted documentation.
- Eaves of house and porch will be painted Sherwin William PPG1001-1 “Delicate White”, per submitted documentation.

Replace Deteriorated Windows

- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the house as per City Staff consultation determination.
- Install new, Lincoln Standard Double Hung 1-OVER-1, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

Exterior Wood Trim Painting

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. All replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Owner has the option of selecting one (1) of the following appropriate painting methods: a) paint all wood trim, windows, doors, etc. the exact same color as currently exists on the wood trim or, b) submit a new paint schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **IV-19-11-005**

102 Warren Street

Mark W. Knapke (Applicant)/ Ashley Manella and Michael Babamov (Owners)

Approve application #IV-19-11-005, 102 Warren Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace 12 windows on the west, south, and east elevations. Two fixed windows on the east elevation are remaining as are the windows in the laundry room “bump out.”
- Replacement windows will be one-over-one Quaker Brighton LS Series, aluminum wood windows.
- Windows will be clad in “Telegrey,” per submitted documentation.

Replace Deteriorated/Altered/Non-Original Windows

- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the east, west, and south elevations.
- Install new, Quaker Brighton LS Series (1-OVER-1), all-wood interior/ aluminum clad wood exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

• **IV-19-11-006**

192-210 Warren Street

Elite Investments One LLC –Mason Sherman (Applicant)/ Rob Rafferty (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-11-006, 192-210 Warren Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove EPDM roof and install gray TPO roof, per submitted material.
- Repair and replace any broken ceramic caps, like for like.

Install New TPO Roof

- Remove any/all EPDM, and/or rolled roofing down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new TPO (Thermoplastic polyolefin) single-ply roofing membrane in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings. Color to be either “Black” or “Gray”.
- Re-install any/all deteriorated and damaged roof capping from parapet wall, any required replacement capping is to match existing with sample to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval prior to installation.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/McNair (4-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT MOTION: Cooke/McNair (4-0-0) ADJOURNED. 5:57PM