

1                   BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS  
2                   MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

3                                   - - -

4  
5       In the Matter of:

6                                   Regular Meeting

7                                   - - -

8                                   Grady L. Pettigrew  
9                                   President, Presiding

10                                   - - -

11                                   TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

12                                   - - -

13  
14                                   Monday, November 25, 2019  
15                                   10:18 a.m.  
16                                   City of Columbus  
17                                   Civil Service Commission  
18                                   77 North Front Street  
19                                   Columbus, Ohio 43215

20                                   - - -

21                                   TRACI E. PEOPLES  
22                                   PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER

23                                   - - -

24                                   ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.  
                                 1421 West Third Avenue  
                                 Columbus, Ohio 43215  
                                 (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President  
3 Stefanie L. Coe

4 PRESENTERS:

5 Beth Dyke  
6 Joel Gunn  
7 Laura Hausmann  
8 Carol Lagemann  
9 Liz Reed  
10 Brenda Sobieck

11 ALSO PRESENT:

12 Wendy Brinnon  
13 Jaasiel Rubeck

14

- - -

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 MONDAY MORNING SESSION  
November 25, 2019  
2 10:18 a.m.

3 - - -

4 P R O C E E D I N G S

5 - - -

6 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 25th day of  
7 November, 2019, the Municipal Civil Service  
8 Commission came for a regular meeting, Grady L.  
9 Pettigrew, President. And, the parties appearing in  
10 person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth,  
11 the following proceedings were had:

12 - - -

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: We'll call to order  
14 the Municipal Civil Service Commission meeting for  
15 the City of Columbus, our regular meeting,  
16 November 25, 2019. We will be following the printed  
17 agenda.

18 The first item is review and approval of  
19 the minutes of the October 28, 2019, regular  
20 meeting.

21 MS. COE: I move to approve the minutes  
22 from the October 28, 2019, regular meeting.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

24 All in favor, say "aye."

1 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

2 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

3 The second item, Rule Revisions. We have  
4 the request of the Civil Service Commission staff to  
5 revise Rule XIII(G), pertaining to applicant  
6 appeals; and,

7 Request of the Civil Service Commission  
8 staff to revise Rule VII(B)(7), pertaining to  
9 retests.

10 MS. SOBIECK: Brenda Sobieck, with the  
11 Civil Service Commission staff. I have Rule XIII.

12 This is really just a minor formatting  
13 change. We noticed that the numbering in  
14 section (G) of Rule XIII was not consistent with our  
15 regular numbering. So this change is really just to  
16 change the numbering and make it consistent.

17 MS. REED: Okay. And I am presenting on  
18 Rule No. VII -- I'm sorry -- Rule No. VII(B)(7).

19 And, with this, we're making two changes.  
20 One is more just to regroup those so that, when  
21 we're talking about testing related to police and  
22 fire, that those specific tests are grouped together  
23 in the rule itself.

24 And then the other rule change is the

1 language to align with the exam administration  
2 changes being implemented to enhance the candidate  
3 recruiting and participation efforts.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay.

5 MS. COE: I move to approve the rule  
6 revisions at the request of the Civil Service  
7 Commission staff to revise Rule XIII(G), pertaining  
8 to applicant appeals, as well as to revise  
9 Rule VII(B)(7), pertaining to retests.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

11 All in favor, say "aye."

12 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

14 Next, Items 5, 6 and 7 will be joined  
15 together.

16 Item 5, request of the Civil Service  
17 Commission staff to approve the specification review  
18 for the classification Traffic Maintenance  
19 Supervisor I, with no revisions;

20 No. 6 is to approve the specification  
21 review for the classification Traffic Line Worker,  
22 with no revisions;

23 And for 7, it's to approve the  
24 specification review for the classification Traffic

1 Line Supervisor I, with no revisions.

2 MS. DYKE: Beth Dyke, Personnel Analyst  
3 with the Civil Service Commission staff.

4 The review of the classifications for  
5 Items 5 through 7 was part of the Civil Service  
6 Commission's effort to review every classification  
7 every five years.

8 Based on the feedback received, it was  
9 determined that the current specifications still  
10 accurately reflect the work being performed. It is  
11 recommended that the specifications be approved,  
12 with no revisions.

13 MS. COE: Thank you.

14 I move to support the request of the  
15 Civil Service Commission staff to approve the  
16 specification review for the classifications Traffic  
17 Maintenance Supervisor I, Traffic Line Worker, and  
18 Traffic Line Supervisor I, with no realizations.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

20 All in favor, say "aye."

21 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

23 Items 8, 9 and 10 are joined together.

24 Item 8, request of the Civil Service

1 Commission staff to revise the specification for the  
2 classification Network Manager;

3 Item 9 is to revise the specification for  
4 the classification Network Administrator; and,

5 Item 10 is to revise the specification  
6 for the classification Network Engineer.

7 MS. DYKE: Again, Items 8, 9 and 10 will  
8 be presented together.

9 The review of these classifications was  
10 part of the Civil Service Commission staff's effort  
11 to review all classifications every five years.

12 There are some minor revisions proposed  
13 to the "Examples of Work" sections of each  
14 classification to update the wording related to the  
15 network infrastructure, the network configuration  
16 and operational duties of each respective  
17 classification.

18 For clarification purposes, it is  
19 recommended to simply the minimum qualification  
20 requirements for each of the classifications by  
21 removing the specific education requirements from  
22 the bachelor degree qualification.

23 For each classification, it is proposed  
24 to add a substitution in which experience may

1 substitute for education on a year-for-year basis.

2 For the Network Administer and Network  
3 Manager classifications, it is proposed to increase  
4 the required years of experience and update the  
5 wording surrounding the certification path for  
6 qualification.

7 Lastly, due to the addition of the  
8 education substitution, it is proposed to remove the  
9 associate's degree path for qualification on all  
10 three classifications.

11 There are a few minor revisions proposed  
12 to the "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" sections of  
13 all three classifications so that the sections  
14 remain consistent within the series, and to also  
15 distinguish the individual classifications within  
16 the job group.

17 There are no other proposed revisions at  
18 this time.

19 MS. COE: Thank you.

20 I move to support to request of the Civil  
21 Service Commission staff to revise the specification  
22 for the classifications Network Manager, Network  
23 Administer and Network Engineer.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

1 All in favor, say "aye."

2 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

4 Item No. 11 is the request of the Civil  
5 Service Commission staff to create the specification  
6 for the classification Income Tax Auditor II, assign  
7 a probationary period of 365 days, designate the  
8 examination type as noncompetitive, and amend  
9 Rule XI accordingly.

10 MS. DYKE: 11 and 12, please, will be  
11 presented together.

12 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

13 For No. 12, it's the request of the Civil  
14 Service Commission staff to revise the specification  
15 for the classification Income Tax Auditor, retitle  
16 it to read Income Tax Auditor I, and amend Rule XI  
17 accordingly.

18 MS. DYKE: Thank you.

19 Again, Items 11 and 12 are being  
20 presented together.

21 In conjunction with the five-year review  
22 of Income Tax Auditor, the department expressed  
23 concerns regarding the variance in the levels of  
24 duties being performed within the classification.

1                   After reviewing the classification plan  
2 and meeting with the department, it was determined  
3 the most effective way to address the concerns would  
4 be to model the classification work so that it  
5 aligns more closely with other professional  
6 classification series within the City.

7                   In doing so, it is proposed to revise and  
8 retitle Income Tax Auditor to read Income Tax  
9 Auditor I, and to create a classification titled  
10 Income Tax Auditor II. The revision of Income Tax  
11 Auditor would serve as an entry-level  
12 classification, and Income Tax Auditor II would  
13 serve as a highly skilled and specialized  
14 classification.

15                   It is proposed to revise the definition  
16 of Income Tax Auditor so that the incumbent under  
17 general supervision is responsible for auditing  
18 income tax returns for businesses and individuals  
19 and ensuring compliance with city income tax  
20 provisions.

21                   The definitions for the proposed  
22 classification Income Tax Auditor II would focus  
23 upon performing advanced level, highly skilled  
24 income tax auditing responsibilities and to ensure

1 compliance with city income tax provisions.

2           The "Examples of Work" and "Knowledge,  
3 Skills and Abilities" sections for each  
4 classification would further distinguish the  
5 classifications in regards to the competency and  
6 skill level needed to complete the job duties.

7           Within the "Minimum Qualifications"  
8 section of Income Tax Auditor, it is proposed to  
9 revise the section so that the specified areas of  
10 study be removed from the bachelor's degree  
11 requirement, along with the substitution.

12           Additionally, it is proposed that the  
13 "Minimum Qualifications" section for Income Tax  
14 Auditor II expand upon the bachelor degree  
15 requirement by also requiring two years of  
16 experience auditing tax documents or financial  
17 records.

18           The "Minimum Qualifications" for both  
19 classifications are proposed as such in order to  
20 maintain consistency with the other professional  
21 classification series within the City.

22           Regarding the creation of the Income Tax  
23 Auditor II classification, it is proposed that the  
24 examination type be designated as noncompetitive and

1 the probationary period be assigned as 365 days.

2 It is further recommended that the  
3 classification be assigned to the administrative job  
4 family, the accounting and finance group in the City  
5 of Columbus Class Plan Index and to the professional  
6 EEO/DOJ job category.

7 Lastly, it is requested that both  
8 classifications be approved as proposed and Rule XI  
9 amended accordingly.

10 There are no other revisions at this  
11 time.

12 MS. COE: Thank you.

13 I move to support the request of the  
14 Civil Service Commission staff to create the  
15 specification for the classification Income Tax  
16 Auditor II, assign a probationary period of 365  
17 days, designate the examination type as  
18 noncompetitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly; as  
19 well as the request of the Civil Service Commission  
20 staff to revise the specification for the  
21 classification Income Tax Auditor, retitle it to  
22 read Income Tax Auditor I, and amend Rule XI  
23 accordingly.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

1 All in favor, say "aye."

2 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

4 Item 13 is the request of the Civil  
5 Service Commission staff to revise the specification  
6 for the classification Business Systems Analyst.

7 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel  
8 Analyst with the Civil Service Commission.

9 The review of this classification is part  
10 of our effort to review all classifications every  
11 five years.

12 Within the "Examples of Work" section,  
13 adding script to the activities described in the  
14 "Examples of Work" regarding functional testing  
15 strategies is proposed.

16 Within the "Knowledge, Skills and  
17 Abilities" section, two statements regarding  
18 communication are consolidated into one ability  
19 statement regarding communicating effectively.

20 In closing, it is recommended this  
21 specification be approved as proposed.

22 MS. COE: Thank you.

23 I move to support to request of the Civil  
24 Service Commission staff to revise the specification

1 for the classification Business Systems Analyst.

2 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

3 All in favor, say "aye."

4 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

6 Item No. 14 is the request of the Civil  
7 Service Commission staff to revise the specification  
8 for the classification Solid Waste Inspector,  
9 retitle it to read Solid Waste Investigator, and  
10 amend Rule XI accordingly.

11 MS. LAGEMANN: The review of this  
12 classification is part of our effort to review all  
13 classifications every five years.

14 The title of this classification is  
15 proposed to be revised to read Solid Waste  
16 Investigator, as the work of this classification  
17 involves investigating suspected violations with  
18 regard to the disposal of solid waste.

19 In keeping with the title change, it is  
20 proposed to revise the definition in several  
21 "Examples of Work" statements to reference  
22 investigations instead of inspections.

23 Additional updates are proposed within  
24 the "Examples of Work" and the "Knowledge, Skills

1 and Abilities" to include revisions to some  
2 terminology, flesh out some "Examples of Work"  
3 statements, update some wording throughout, and add  
4 some physical abilities that are applicable to the  
5 work.

6 In closing, it is recommended that this  
7 specification be approved as proposed and, with the  
8 proposed retitle, Rule XI be amended accordingly.

9 MS. COE: Thank you.

10 I move to support the request of the  
11 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the  
12 specification for the classification Solid Waste  
13 Inspector, retitle it to read Solid Waste  
14 Investigator, and amend Rule XI accordingly.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

16 All in favor, say "aye."

17 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

19 Items 15, 16 and 17 will be joined  
20 together.

21 Item 15, request of the Civil Service  
22 Commission staff to revise the specification for the  
23 classification Building Maintenance Worker;

24 Item 16 is to revise the specification

1 for the classification Building Maintenance  
2 Supervisor I; and,

3 Item 17 is to revise the specification  
4 for the classification Building Maintenance  
5 Supervisor II.

6 MS. LAGEMANN: The review of these  
7 classifications is part of the Commission's effort  
8 to review all classifications every five years.

9 Within the "Minimum Qualifications" for  
10 Supervisor II, the experience requirement is  
11 proposed to be increased to two years. They had a  
12 365-day probationary period in the class before, so  
13 adding a -- increasing it to two years from one is  
14 proposed.

15 And within the "Knowledge, Skills and  
16 Abilities" for the Supervisor II, a new abilities  
17 statement is proposed to illustrate physical demands  
18 of the work.

19 In the Supervisor I classification, in  
20 the definition, it is proposed to remove the word  
21 "surveillance," as that is not a defining  
22 characteristic of the work of a Building Maintenance  
23 Supervisor I.

24 Within the "Examples of Work" section for

1 the Supervisor I, one statement is expanded to  
2 describe some of the physical demands associated  
3 with traveling to participate in or inspect work.

4 A statement regarding acting in the  
5 absence of a Building Maintenance Supervisor II is  
6 proposed to be removed, as it does not help describe  
7 the duties of the current classification.

8 It is proposed to include a "Guidelines  
9 for Class Use" in the Supervisor I to explain that  
10 this classification is permitted to be used in  
11 instances where the custodial supervision is over a  
12 large span of control to cover the centralized,  
13 citywide scope of services provided by Department of  
14 Finance and Management.

15 And within the "Knowledge, Skills and  
16 Abilities" section, several new statements are  
17 proposed to better reflect physical demands of  
18 participating in the work.

19 Within the Building Maintenance Worker  
20 classification, the "Minimum Qualifications" are  
21 proposed to be updated so that construction  
22 experience is clarified to specify it's building  
23 construction experience, as this is what is intended  
24 in order for one to be qualified.

1                   In closing, it is recommended that these  
2 specifications be approved as proposed.

3                   MS. COE: Thank you.

4                   I move to support the request of the  
5 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the  
6 specification for the classifications Building  
7 Maintenance Worker, as well as Building Maintenance  
8 Supervisor I and Building Maintenance Supervisor II.

9                   PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

10                  All in favor, say "aye."

11                  THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

12                  PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

13                  Now, the items to be joined now are 18,  
14 19, 20 and 22?

15                  MS. HAUSMANN: Yes.

16                  PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Item 18, request of  
17 the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the  
18 specification for the classification Fire Deputy  
19 Chief;

20                  For Item 19, it is to revise the  
21 specification for the classification Fire Battalion  
22 Chief;

23                  For 20, to revise the specification for  
24 the classification Fire Chief;

1                   And 22 is to revise the specification for  
2 the classification Fire Lieutenant.

3                   MS. COE: I think 20 is Fire Captain.

4                   MS. HAUSMANN: Yes.

5                   PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: What did I say?

6                   MS. COE: You said Fire Chief. I believe  
7 5.

8                   It was for Fire Captain.

9                   PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Oh, I'm sorry.

10                  22 is to revise the specification for the  
11 classification Fire Captain.

12                  MS. HAUSMANN: I'm sorry. 20 is Fire  
13 Captain, and 22 is Fire Lieutenant.

14                  PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: That's -- I said  
15 that, the last part.

16                  MS. COE: I think you said the number 22.  
17 So 20 was Fire Captain.

18                  PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: 20 is Fire Captain,  
19 and 22 is Fire Lieutenant. Right?

20                  MS. HAUSMANN: Correct. Thank you.

21                  Laura Hausmann, City of Columbus Civil  
22 Service Commission staff.

23                  These four classifications have been  
24 reviewed as part of the Commission's efforts to

1 review all classification once every five years.

2 After receiving feedback from incumbents  
3 and discussion with the department, we have  
4 recommended changes.

5 A change to the "Examples of Work" for  
6 all four of these classifications ensures -- covers  
7 ensuring that subordinates are acting in accordance  
8 with the law, regulations, policies and directives  
9 applicable to the Division and the City of Columbus.

10 In addition, for Fire Battalion Chief, we  
11 are recommending changing the wording throughout  
12 from the word "District" to "Battalion." This  
13 updates the wording to those that are used by the  
14 Division.

15 We also have a second "Examples of Work"  
16 proposed to be added to the Battalion Chief spec,  
17 and that deals with critiquing of emergency scene  
18 responses and training.

19 For Fire Captain and Fire Lieutenant, in  
20 the "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" section, we  
21 are proposing to update the wording that describes  
22 the level of the height at which individuals may  
23 have to work while using equipment on the scene.

24 And, also, for the Lieutenant

1 specification, we are proposing a second "Examples  
2 of Work" to be added. This deals with directing the  
3 operation of one company on an assigned unit day.

4 The other recommendations are just to  
5 update the language and to more accurately reflect  
6 the work done by these job classes.

7 MS. COE: Thank you.

8 I move to support Requests 18, 19, 20 and  
9 22 of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise  
10 the specifications for the classifications Fire  
11 Deputy Chief, as well as Fire Battalion Chief, Fire  
12 Captain and Fire Lieutenant.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

14 All in favor, say "aye."

15 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

17 The next item is Item 21, which is the  
18 request of the Civil Service Commission staff to  
19 revise the specification for the classification  
20 Firefighter.

21 MR. GUNN: All right. I'm Joel Gunn, a  
22 Personnel Analyst II with the Civil Service  
23 Commission.

24 The review of this classification is part

1 of the Civil Service Commission's effort to review  
2 all classifications every five years.

3 After consulting with incumbents, the  
4 updates proposed within the "Knowledge, Skills and  
5 Abilities" section will make one minor edit to the  
6 phrase that previously said "Some knowledge of  
7 personal computers." We have proposed to add "and  
8 tablets," as they use those a lot on the job.

9 And, also, we have added "the ability to  
10 work in inclement weather" to the "Knowledge, Skills  
11 and Abilities" statements.

12 There are no changes to the "Minimum  
13 Qualifications" or "Examples of Work."

14 In closing, it is recommended these  
15 specifications be approved as proposed.

16 MS. COE: Thank you.

17 I move to support the request of the  
18 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the  
19 specification for the classification Firefighter.

20 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

21 All in favor, say "aye."

22 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

24 Thank you.



1

2

3

4

5

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

6

7

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a

8

true, correct and complete written transcript of the

9

proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the

10

25th day of November, 2019, and transcribed from my

11

stenographic notes.

12

13

*The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 10:39 a.m.*

\* \* \*

---

*Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President*

---

*Date*