

## HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION MINUTES

Thursday, December 19, 2019

4:00 p.m.

111 N. Front Street, Room 204

**Commissioners Present:** Jackie Barton, Steward Gibboney, Clyde Henry (Chairperson), Joseph McCabe, Dan Morgan (arrived 4:10 p.m./Agenda Item #9), Erin Prosser

**City Staff Present:**

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:00 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, January 9, 2020 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Third Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, January 16, 2020 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Room 204 (Hearing Room)
- IV. SWEAR IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Thursday, September 19, 2018.  
MOTION: Gibboney/McCabe (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Gibboney/McCabe (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

1. **HR-19-12-003**

1551Bryden Road

Bryden Management c/o Laura MacGregor Comek (Applicant/Owner)

Bryden Road Historic District

- **MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**



**CONTINUED APPLICATIONS**

**2. HR-19-09-022a**

**2070-2072 Indianola Avenue  
Nick Nicastro (Applicant)**

**Iuka Ravine Historic District  
2064 Indianola LLC (Owner)**

*The following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # HR-19-09-022a, 2070-2072 Indianola Avenue, Iuka Ravine Historic District, in regard to glass block windows installed prior to review and approval, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the January 16, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Gibboney/McCabe (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**3. HR-19-11-006**

**152 East Northwood Avenue  
Savvas Ramone, LLC./Demolition Contractor (Applicant)**

**Northwood Park Historic District  
Oak Pointe Properties, LLC (Owner)**

*The following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # HR-19-11-006, 152 East Northwood Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, in regard to requested demolition of a garage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the January 16, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Gibboney/McCabe (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**4. HR-19-11-008**

**44 West Jeffrey Place  
Pro Exterior by APCO (Applicant)**  
• **MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL**

**Old Beechwood Historic District  
Debra Heimann (Owner)**

*Agenda Item # 9 was reviewed following Agenda Item #4.*

**5. HR-19-11-009**

**664 Oakwood Avenue  
Jeff Kowalczyk (Applicant)**

**Old Oaks Historic District  
Greensone Dwellings, LLC (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application # HR-19-11-009, 664 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, in regard to new porches and siding, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the January 16, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: McCabe/Barton (6-0-0) CONTINUED

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**6. HR-19-12-004**

**677 Bedford Avenue  
EZ Rebuilds, LLC. (Applicant)**

**Old Oaks Historic District  
Equity Creations (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the representative of the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Continue Application # HR-19-12-004, 677 Bedford Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, in regard to windows and doors installed prior to review and approval, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the January 16, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- The original windows had divided lites, which is a distinguishing original feature, and need to be in the new windows. The corners should not be mitered.
- The window that was enclosed on the rear should be restored even if the window opening is walled over on the interior.
- The fence will need to be flipped so the “good” side faces the neighbors.
- Refer to the Columbus Register of Historic Properties Architectural Guidelines and talk to Historic Preservation staff in regard to rehab of the porch, hand railings, and doors.

MOTION: Gibboney/McCabe (6-0-0) CONTINUED

**7. HR-19-12-005**

**1821 Bryden Road**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Aracelis Rivera (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant and Ohio Metal Roofing representative, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Continue Application # HR-19-12-005, 1821 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, in regard to proposed metal roofing, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the January 16, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commission has to look at what materials are appropriate for the age and style of each building.
- Some houses from this time period originally had porch roofs or dormer roofs that were flat-seam copper or metal. Flat-seam metal on the dormers only may be a solution for this property.
- It can be helpful to provide local installations of metal roofs so staff and Commissioners can look at them.

MOTION: Gibboney/McCabe (6-0-0) CONTINUED

**8. HR-19-12-006**

**1262 Bryden Road**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Jeffrey Konkolewski (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following presentation by the representative of the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application #HR-19-12-006, 1262 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted.

Exterior Painting

- Request to retain the current white paint applied to the previously unpainted stone façade and on the previously painted brick side and rear elevations, or to change the color.

MOTION: Gibboney/Prosser (0-6-0[Barton-abstain]) DENIED

Reason(s) for Denial:

- C.C. 3116.04 - Certificate required:  
Except in cases excluded by C.C. 3116.23, no person shall construct, reconstruct, alter, change the exterior color of or demolish any listed property or architectural feature thereof or any structure or architectural feature now or hereafter in a district or make site improvements thereon without first applying for a certificate of appropriateness therefor and obtaining either such certificate of appropriateness or a clearance.
- C.C. 3116.11 Standards for Alteration:  
(7) The gentlest means possible shall be used to clean the property’s surface if necessary. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building material are prohibited.

*Agenda Item # 10 was reviewed following Agenda Item #8.*

**9. HR-19-12-007**

**700 South Champion Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Fleming & Rocha Investments, LLC. (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application #HR-19-12-007, 700 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted.

Exterior Painting

- Request to retain the current red paint applied to the previously unpainted brick front, side, and rear elevations.

MOTION: Barton/Prosser (0-5-1[Morgan-abstain]) DENIED

Reason(s) for Denial:

- C.C. 3116.11 Standards for Alteration:

- (2) The distinguishing characteristics of the property shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural feature shall be avoided whenever possible.

*Agenda Item # 6 was reviewed following Agenda Item #9.*

**10. HR-19-12-008**

**511 North High Street**

**North Market Historic District**

**Stanley W. Young III (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application #HR-19-12-008, 511 North High Street, North Market Historic District, as modified, and with all clarifications, as noted.

New Projecting Sign

- Remove the existing 5.8 sf, projecting sign.
- Install new 12 sf, opaque aluminum sign cabinet with routed faces and push-thru graphics.
- Face and returns painted semi-gloss black finish.
- Inset border painted white satin finish.
- Letters to be red and white, per the submitted drawings.
- Support bracket to be aluminum tube supports welded to mounting plate with painted black finish.
- All fasteners to be placed into mortar, not into the face of the brick.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: McCabe/Gibboney (6-0-0) APPROVED

**11. HR-19-12-009**

**182 East Long Street**

**Winder's Motor Sales/Individually Listed Property**

**Kevin Jones, Jr. (Applicant)**

**Del Monte Holdings, III LLC.**

*Following presentation by the representative of the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Continue Application # HR-19-12-009, 182 East Long Street, Winder's Motor Sales/Individually Listed Property, in regard to replacement of storefronts, windows, doors, etc., and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the January 16, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- Conceptually, this is a great project. Appreciate that the building is being rehabbed.
- Need a more complete package of materials for final approval including, window schedule (# and location of windows, window elevations, rough opening and new window opening measurements);

measured drawings for storefronts (appears dark bronze would be more appropriate color than anodized aluminum); paint colors for any previously painted stone (new paint color should match the natural stone color);

- Any cut sheets for exterior lighting could be submitted later, but prior to installation.
- The guidelines do not support infill of any original window openings (west elevation).
- The existing glass block infill does not appear to be from the period of significance. HRC cannot require existing glass block to be removed (unless done recently), but would support removing it and installing a window to match other new windows.

MOTION: Morgan/Prosser (6-0-0) CONTINUED

**12. HR-19-12-010**

**353 Northwood Avenue**

**Bradley Blumensheid/Rhythm Architecture (Applicant)**

- **APPLICATION WITHDRAWN**

**Iuka Ravine Historic District**

**John & Doreen Sauer (Owner)**

**13. HR-19-10-023**

**602 East Town Street**

**David Blair/Shremshock Architects (Applicant)**

**East Town Street Historic District**

**Joe Collins Property, LLC (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the representative of the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application #HR-19-10-023, 602 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing carriage house at the rear of the property.

Addition/New Construction

- Retain the existing, brick apartment building, as is.
- Build new, three-story addition at the rear of the existing apartment building. To be separated from existing by breezeway and stairs.
- Proposed new 24 units to be walk-up flats.
- Materials include dark brick adjacent to rear wing of existing building with clapboard.
- Windows to be four-over four double-hung sash windows.
- To include 14 new surface parking spaces and 4 new interior parking spaces.
- Exterior cladding to include masonry and composite clapboard siding.
- Includes removal of existing Town Street curb cut and entry driveway.

MOTION: Gibboney/Prosser (6-0-0) APPROVED

**STAFF APPROVALS**

• **HR-19-12-001**

**2043-2057 Waldeck Avenue**

**Hometeam Properties (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application HR-19-12-001, 2043-2057 Waldeck Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Rubber Roof / Front Porch

- Remove any/all rubber membrane or rolled roofing on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's

**Indianola Forest Historic District**

specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.

• **HR-19-12-002**

**912 Bryden Road**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Christine Donaldson (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application HR-19-12-002, 912 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Replace Basement Doors

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, wood basement doors, per the submitted photos.
- Install new, steel, Bilco basement doors to existing frame, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- New doors to be painted “Dark Tan” to match existing trim.

• **HR-19-12-003**

**1551 Bryden Road**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Bryden Management c/o Laura MacGregor Comek (Applicant/Owner)**

Upon review of Application # HR-19-12-003, 1551 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, the Historic Resources Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as submitted:

Request for Variance Recommendation

1. 3349.03 Use – to legitimize the current use of up to 165 units as multi-family use without senior living restrictions.
2. 3349.03 Use - To permit commercial uses and storage use for on-site units. Commercial uses limited to office uses unrelated to the apartment units and not otherwise permitted, storage area as principal use for an aggregate area of 25,000 sq.ft. with commercial and storage permitted on first floor only and being specifically a barber shop, beauty salon, financial institution office or automatic teller machine, pharmacy, dry cleaner (depot only) storage space for hospital, medical clinic and office uses.
3. 3371.01 (f)(1) and (2) Landscape buffer - To eliminate landscape buffer between site lots, eliminate required landscaping for internal and external property lines. Existing conditions to remain, including fencing.
4. 3371.02 To reduce building lines for internal lots to zero.
5. 3371.03 (c)(2) Building Lines - To allow 10-foot building and parking setback for 226 feet of Rich Street frontage. To reduce front yard setbacks from 50 feet to 35 feet for Bryden Road frontage and reduced parking and building setback to 10 feet for the Kelton Avenue frontage. This variance also eliminates side and rear yard setbacks as between lots.  
3349.04 - to eliminate the required 50-foot rear yard requirement (existing conditions).
6. 3349.04 - to reduce the side yard requirements to reflect existing conditions from 20 feet to 10 feet along Bryden Road, zero (0) feet for the east setback (vacated alley) and Tiffin St. and to 20 feet along the Kelton Avenue frontages.
7. In addition to the variances (from those already provided in the 1990 council action) are requested only to reconcile current code requirements to the existing legal non-conforming building/site as developed:
  - CCC 3349.04 (a) to allow the existing building height to remain at approximately 55 ft which exceeds the 35 ft height limit;
  - (b) to increase lot coverage from 60% required by code to the approximate 80% that exists;
  - (c) to reduce the front yard setbacks from 50 ft to 37 ft for Bryden Road and 10 feet for Kelton Avenue, and to eliminate side and rear yard setbacks (all conditions as is).

8. The prior Council Variance approved a parking space variance (now in CCC Section 3312.49) of 8 spaces for the main site, with an aggregate not less than 137 from off premise parking lots (from 224 required at that time). Because variances run with the land, no new variance is needed. Rather, this application seeks to affirm the existing variance, now codified by

- CCC Section 3312.49. Currently there are 8 on site spaces and not less than 137 parking spaces aggregated among the parcels subject of this request (248 required by current code for residential units and up to 100 spaces for commercial).

- **HR-19-11-008**

**44 West Jeffrey Place**

**Pro Exterior by APCO (Applicant)**

**Old Beechwold Historic District**

**Debra Heimann (Owner)**

Approve Application HR-19-11-008, 44 West Jeffrey Place, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove the existing steel casement windows as follows:
  - Living Room (Front)
  - Dining Room (Front)
  - Living Room (Rear)
  - Kitchen (Rear)
- Install new Marvin Ultimate (clad wood) windows, per the submitted window schedule.

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

**XII. ADJOURN** Gibboney/Prosser (6-0-0) 5:31 p.m.