

**VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

Wednesday, December 11, 2019

111 North Front Street – 2nd Floor, Hearing Room

Commissioners Present: Shawn Conyers, Jack Decker, Jeffery Hissem, Erin Moriarty.

Commissioners Absent: Lisl Kotheimer.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:09pm
- X. NEXT MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – Thursday, January 2, 2020
- XI. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Wednesday, January 8, 2020
- XII. SWEAR IN STAFF
- XIII. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES – November 13, 2019 MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (7-0-0) APPROVED.
- XIV. PUBLIC FORUM
- XV. STAFF APPROVALS
- XVI. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. VV-19-11-017

867 Neil Avenue

Carson Thrush (Owner)

Approve application #VV-19-11-017, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Carriage House

- Amend previously approved COA #17-12-14a for rehabilitation of the existing, historic carriage house, to increase the height of the three garage doors by one foot (1') to nine ft. (9'), and to approve the submitted Clopay Coachman Collection insulated steel overhead doors.
- Remove the existing hayloft doors on the west (alley facing) elevation and install a 3' x 5' window in the opening; create a new window on the second story, west elevation and install a 3' x 5' window, per submitted plans.
- Replace eight (8) remaining windows on the carriage house with new double hung windows to fit in the existing openings exactly.
- All new windows are to be 10-over-1, Crestline Elite aluminum-clad wood units. Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.
- All glass is to be clear, with no decorative patterns or texture.
- All composite, fiberglass, or aluminum surfaces are to be smooth, without faux-wood texture.
- Any sashes with muntins are to be simulated divided lite sash, with muntins permanently applied to the interior/exterior of the glass and with a spacer bar between the two layers of glass.
- Rebuild carriage house's roof.
- Rebuild north and west walls on carriage house
- Install half round gutters.
- Tuck point and repair all walls, as needed.
- Add exterior lights, per submitted cut sheet.



- Add dentil molding to the carriage house, per submitted rendering.
- The roof of the carriage house is to be rebuilt to match the previous existing height.
- Dentil molding of “Option 2” is approved with the detail to be revised to the appropriate scale to allow for proper window dimensions.
- New windows per “Option 2” sized at 3’-2” x 48” on 2nd floor as shown on drawing; first floor windows to remain the same size.
- Garage doors as submitted, sized at 9’W x 8’T to match submitted elevations.
- Brick plan as submitted.
- Light: 3 recessed can lights located in the soffit on the rear/alley elevation, centered over the garage doors. Same location on the interior/yard elevation. A gooseneck fixture is to be added to above the new man door on the north elevation.
- Final revisions including all specified requirements to be submitted to HPO for review and approval by Architectural Sub-Committee prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (4-0-0) APPROVED.

2. VV-19-11-013b

989 & 997 North High Street

Tom Linzell, M+A Architects (Applicant)

The Robert Weiler Company (Owner)

Approve application #VV-19-11-013b, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Dumpster Enclosure

- Install new nine foot (6’) high dumpster enclosure with double gates at the southwest corner of the property, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Enclosure is to be composed of cedar with added vertical trim. Cedar and trim to be stained “Harbor Mist” (SW3541).

Light fixtures

- Add new gooseneck light fixtures to the front of the building, per submitted specifications. Revised with different fixtures on and colors for 989 & 997 N. High facades.
- Light fixtures approved per updated elevation submitted at meeting.
- No external conduit is approved; all work will be interior.
- All fasteners will be located in mortar joints only.

MOTION: Hissem/Conyers (4-0-0) APPROVED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

3. VV-19-12-005

910 Dennison Avenue

Heidi Bolyard/Simplified Living Architecture + Design (Applicant)

Continue application # VV-19-12-005:

- Add new 5’8” x 12’ vestibule at the front door of the commercial building.
- Cladding to be 7” HardiePlank lap siding, Cedarmill Texture, prefinished in “Pearl Gray.”
- All trim to be HardiBoard trim and fascia, prefinished in “Pearl Gray.”
- Windows and door to be prefinished black metal.
- Roofing to be Landmark dimensional shingles, “Moire Black.”

MOTION: Hissem/Conyers (4-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- More glazing preferred.
- A false storefront design with transom above and a shallow shed roof (1/12 or 2/12 slope) should be developed.
- Both submitted elevations are too residential.

4. VV-19-12-006

1140 Harrison Avenue

Heidi Bolyard/Simplified Living Architecture + Design (Applicant)

Approve application #VV-19-12-006a, as submitted:

- Demolish existing concrete block garage.
- The Commission finds that the existing garage has no architectural significance and its current condition is compromised.

MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (4-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve application #VV-19-12-006b, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new two-car garage with storage above.
- Cladding to be HardiePanel and HardieTrim Batten Boards, color to match existing house.
- HardieTrim (trim, fascia, rake, soffits) color to match existing house.
- Service door to be half-lite, steel with privacy glass.
- Roofing to be from approved roofing shingles list.
- Windows to be from Approved Windows List.
- There are to be 2 (two) separate garage doors.
- The dormers are to be moved to front and rear elevations.
- Lighting fixtures to added to elevations.
- Final revisions including all specified requirements to be submitted to HPO for review and approval by Architectural Sub-Committee prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (4-0-0) APPROVED.

5. VV-19-12-011

685-689 N High Street

Short North Development, LLC/George Ypsilantis (Applicant)

Continue application # VV-19-12-011, due to absence of applicant:

- Replace storefront glass from three (3) panels to one (1) panel.
- Install new entry door at Parallel to storefront (change from angled).
- Remove existing green awning to expose to expose existing signage, above. Create one flat panel above store.

MOTION: Hissem/Conyers (4-0-0) CONTINUED.

6. VV-19-12-007

966 Highland St.

Urban Restorations LLC (Applicant)

Approve application #VV-19-12-007, as submitted:

- 6' privacy fence as installed.
- Front concrete service walk as installed.
- Alteration of front entry to as built condition.
- Omit low wall.
- Approval of handrail as installed.
- Approval of Marvin Infinity windows installed on Main House and Garage. Windows were chosen from 2018 Approved Windows List without submission of cut sheet/selection to Staff prior to installation per the approved COA.
- Rear service walk as installed.
- Alteration of garage alley elevation as built. Low wall was to face alley per approved COA.
- Approval of concrete drive as installed.
- Approval of main house colors as painted.

MOTION: Hissem/Moriarty (4-0-0) APPROVED.

7. VV-19-12-008

242 Buttles Ave.

Urban Restorations LLC (Applicant)

Approve application #VV-19-12-008, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Change windows from the previously approved to Weathershield Premium Series 8109 Aluminum Clad, exterior color to be black.
- Main body brick to be Glen Gery Cedarville Full Flash Modular.
- Limestone detailing to be changed from limestone to Reading Rock, rock cast. Color similar to limestone.
- All cast stone Reading Rock, rock cast in the color similar buffstone.
- Accent brick around windows will be Glen Gery Battlecreek Modular.

MOTION: Hissem/Conyers (4-0-0) APPROVED.

8. VV-19-12-009

242 Buttles Ave.

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Approve application #VV-19-12-009, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new retaining wall per submitted drawings.
- Wall is required due to significant grade change for new 3-story apartment building.
- A future submission will include landscaping that will partially obscure the new retaining wall.
- Parged finish removed from application in anticipation of the landscaping plan submittal.

MOTION: Hissem/Conyers (4-0-0) APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

9. VV-19-12-010a

960, 962, and 966 Hunter Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Conceptual Review

- Second conceptual design review for one (1) new, frame, single-family dwelling and garage (962) and additions to two (2) existing houses (960 & 966).
- Demolish a non-original addition to one house.
- Build a new carriage house at 966 Hunter Avenue.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The development is changing from two (2) dwelling units to five (5) dwelling units.
- The scale of the carriage house on the northern lot is not appropriate. The existing garage to remain is preferred.

VV-19-12-010b

Recommend approval of application VV-19-12-010b:

Variance Recommendation Request

- 966 HUNTER CURRENT SITS ON TWO SEPARATE LOTS OF RECORD. REMOVE NON ORIGINAL ADDITION, AND RELOCATE SOUTHERN LOT LINE NORTH. RELOCATE NORTH LOT LINE OF 960 HUNTER SOUTH TO CREATE A BUILDABLE PARCEL BETWEEN 960 AND 966 HUNTER (CURRENT ADDRESS IS 962 HUNTER FOR THE VACANT LOT).
- 3333.02 ARLD: TO ALLOW FOR TWO DUPLEXES AND ONE SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCES ON A SINGLE LOT IN AN ARLD DISTRICT FOR 960 HUNTER. TO ALLOW FOR A SINGLE FAMILY HOME ON A SINGLE LOT IN AN ARLD DISTRICT FOR 962 HUNTER.

- 3333.09 AREA DISTRICT LOT WIDTH REQUIREMENTS: TO ALLOW A 38.66 SF WIDE LOT FOR 966 HUNTER; 21.11' WIDE LOT FOR WEST PROPERTY LINE AND 18.96' FOR EAST PROPERTY LINE FOR 962 HUNTER ; AND 49.22' WIDE LOT FOR 960 HUNTER IN AN ARLD DISTRICT IN LIEU OF THE REQUIRED 50'.
- 3333.11 ARLD AREA DISTRICT REQUIREMENTS: TO ALLOW FOR 1579 SF/DWELLING UNIT FOR 966 HUNTER, AND 2152.6 SF /DWELLING UNIT FOR 960 HUNTER.
- 3333.16 FRONTING: TO ALLOW EXISTING SINGLE FAMILY HOME AT 960 HUNTER TO NOT FRONT A PUBLIC STREET AND TO FRONT AN ALLEY.
- 3333.22 MAXIMUM SIDE YARD REQUIRED: TO ALLOW FOR A MAXIMUM SIDEYARD OF 8.33' IN LIEU OF THE REQUIRED 9.844' FOR 960 HUNTER.
- 3333.23 (A) TO ALLOW FOR A MINIMUM SIDE YARD OF 4.52' ON THE NORTH AND 3.33' ON THE SOUTH FOR 966 HUNTER FRONT HOUSE 3' ON THE NORTH FOR THE REAR HOUSE AT 966 HUNTER; 3' ON THE NORTH AND SOUTH FOR 962 HUNTER; 3.33' ON THE NORTH FOR THE EXISTING HOME AT 960 HUNTER ALL IN LIEU OF THE REQUIRED 5'-0".
- 3333.25 SIDEYARD OBSTRUCTION: TO ALLOW THE PARKING SPACE IN THE SOUTH SIDE YARD OF THE CARRIAGE HOUSE ON 966
- 3333.23 (C) MINIMUM SIDE YARD FOR GARAGE: TO ALLOW 1.33' SETBACK ON THE NORTH PROPERTY LINE AND 2.92' SETBACK ON THE SOUTH PROPERTY LINE FOR THE GARAGE AT 962 HUNTER IN LIEU OF THE REQUIRED 3'
- 3333.24 REAR YARD TO ALLOW A REAR YARD OF 0 SF LIEU OF THE REQUIRED 25% FOR THE REAR HOMES AT 960 HUNTER. TO ALLOW FOR A REAR YARD OF 824.5 SF IN LIEU OF THE REQUIRED 1183.5 SF FOR THE FRONT HOME AT 966 HUNTER.

MOTION: Conyers/Hissem (4-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

- **VV-19-12-001**

978-982 Hunter Avenue

Rhonda Phillips, Rugh Remodeling (Applicant)

Bill Elkins (Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-12-001, 978-982 Hunter Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be the following from the approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
[] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[] English Gray Slate
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

- **VV-19-12-002**

222-224 West Hubbard Avenue

Alex Yeazel (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-12-002, 222-224 West Hubbard Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Chimney

- Remove all deteriorated, non-original and inappropriate mortar from brick chimney with the appropriate hand tools to a depth of no less than one inch (1").
- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Park Service. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings” supplied by staff.)

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all membrane roofing on the flat roof over the front porch down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff

Repair/replace Porch Trim

- Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood trim on the front porch as necessary, according to industry standards. **All replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.**
- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Owner has the option of selecting one (1) of the following appropriate painting methods: a) paint all wood trim the exact same color as currently exists or, b) submit a new paint schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **VV-19-12-003**

989 & 997 North High Street

Jeff Snively, M+A Architects (Applicant)

The Robert Weiler Company (Owner)

Approve Application #VV-19-12-003, 989-997 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Deteriorated/Altered/Non-Original Windows

- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the buildings as per City Staff determination.
- Install new windows windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. All new windows are to match the muntin pattern and configuration of the existing windows to be replaced; 1-over-1 for 989 and 9-over-1 for 997. Manufacturer and model to be the following from the approved windows list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Series/Model:</u>	<u>Material:</u>
Pella	Architect Series Reserve	Wood Exterior/Interior

- Exterior colors for the Enduraclad paint coating is to be “Iron Ore” for the windows on 989 and “Tan” for all of the windows on 997.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- All glass is to be clear, with no decorative patterns or texture.

- Any sashes with muntins are to be simulated divided lite sash, with muntins permanently applied to the interior/exterior of the glass and with a spacer bar between the two layers of glass.
- **VV-19-12-004**
732 Park St.
Pella Windows + Doors –Carol Meyer (Applicant)/ Charles S. Boggess (Owner)
Approve Application #VV-19-12-004, 732 Park St., as submitted, with all clarifications noted.
 - Remove existing windows on first floor, consisting of 5 openings with 17 windows total.
 - Install Pella Impervia windows matching the existing windows.Replace Non-Original Windows
 - Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the first floor of 732 Park St. with new, Pella Impervia 1-OVER-1 and 3-wide single hung with transoms above, wood windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
 - Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: (7-0-0) APPROVED.

XVII. OLD BUSINESS

XVIII. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT– (7-0-0) ADJOURNED 8:23 PM