

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION AGENDA

Tuesday, January 14, 2019
4:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-8871, or email zdjones@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, February 4, 2020 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, February 11, 2020 – 111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, December 10, 2019
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. STAFF APPROVALS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. **IV-20-01-013**

283 Detroit Ave.

Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

Staff Recommended

- Construct two -3 story houses on a single parcel (two parcels were approved to be combined during the November 2019 hearing), per submitted designs.
- Two proposed single family houses will have an industrial style, masonry products will be used.
- Siding will consist of hardiboard panels
- Both houses are proposed with a third stories with accessible second story patios, per submitted drawings.
- Garage doors will be 9'x8' metal doors.

The following is taken from the November 2019 IVC Meeting Minutes:

Commissioner Comments:

- *The grade separation was questioned due to the existing retaining wall on the property and the existing house on the corner requiring steps.*
- *Commissioners support access from the alley. Happy to see there are no proposed curb cuts along Detroit and thought it was a smart solution to the odd shaped lots.*
- *A suggestion was made to consider flipping a door to line up with others.*
- *The offset yards were praised as it created an interesting space.*
- *Concern was raised about the third story patios and if they were visible from Detroit.*

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

2. IV-19-12-019

59-65 East Russell

Blackfriars Development LLC (Owner)

- Develop less than 2000 sq ft of grass surface into 8 asphalt parking spaces.
- Install 270 sq yds (2430 sq ft) of asphalt, strip, and place 8 -7' parking blocks with rebar anchors.
- Install approximately 645 sq ft concrete apron.
- Install 34" high by 24" long bike rack along parking spaces on Kerr Street.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:30 P.M.

NEW APPLICATIONS

3. IV-20-01-014

67-71 E Fifth Ave./1181 Say Ave.

5th & Say Condos, LLC (Applicant)

- Approve installation of parking sign (18"x24") mounted on post in parking lot near entrance and rental signage (18"x48") without lighting on front of buildings facing E Fifth Ave at 10' at center line of sign.
- Approve removal of fence removal.
- Installation of basement stairway handrail, cut sheets to be submitted to HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.
- Parking lot paved with asphalt.

4. IV-20-01-015

854 Summit St.

Laurie Gunzelman (Applicant)/ Amiya Dey (Owner)

Addition of Exterior Door

- Add an additional exterior door to previously approved garage design for mechanical room access off of north elevation.
- Proposed door to be solid and match other doors.

5. IV-20-01-016

184 E First Ave.

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ David Cooke (Owner)

Demolition

- Demolish existing concrete block garage.

Construct New Garage

- Construct a new garage with second story.
- First floor of new garage will be red brick to match neighboring construction, second floor to be board and batten siding. Roof to be asphalt shingles from the Approved Shingles List.
- Add French doors to First and second floors with a French balcony on second floor.

Rear Addition

- Add a two story addition to the rear (north) elevation.
- Addition will be brick with casement windows, per submitted drawings.
- Windows to be wood framed (Jeldwen Siteline from Approved Windows List).

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:00 P.M.

6. IV-20-01-017

295 E Fifth Ave.

Jeanne Cabral -Architect (Applicant)/ Michelle Cordle (Owner)

Exterior Alterations

- Replace existing side with wood lap siding.
- Install new 6' cedar fence between new garage and rear addition, per submitted site plan.
- Paint exterior a gray, white, and black color scheme, paint chips to be submitted to HPO prior to issuance of Certificate.
- Front stained glass window to be retained and repaired.
- Front door and porch trim/posts are to be retained.

Rear Addition

- Two story addition to the rear (south) elevation.

Construction of New Garage

- New three-car garaged proposed at rear of the lot after re-combining separated lot.
- Install new concrete driveway and concrete path from east elevation of garage to rear of house.

The following is taken from the December 2019 IVC Meeting Minutes:

Commissioner Comments:

- *The dormer on the east/west elevation appears awkward and needs to be resolved.*
- *Consider a hipped roof as it may be more appropriate.*
- *Wood railings are needed on the porches.*

7. IV-20-01-018

285 E Fourth Ave.

Logan Fitch (Applicant)/ New Victorians 5 LLC (Owner)

- Restore original wood louver window on the west elevation. Interior brick to be filled in behind.
- Louver window on north elevation to be replaced with a new (black) aluminum clad window.
- Repair/restore existing second story arched wood window located on turret, existing wood arched window above the church's front door.
- Front door to be replaced with a similar style nine panel door.
- All new windows of either Quaker or Kolbe will be installed on remaining elevations.
- New Fortin iron handrail installed on east and west of building.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:30 P.M.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

8. IV-20-01-019

251 E Third Ave.

Ethan McGory (Applicant)/ Eric Altneu and Brookes Hammock (Owner)

Conceptual Review:

- Addition of a 7" deck/walk out from the home.
- Installation of a black metal pergola painted to match the home and spaced to match the existing board and batten cladding of the home. Pergola would include a retractable awning system and vertical adjustable shades for the sides of the structure. Proposed structure would rest on parapet walls.
- Planters installed on the second story rooftop. Plantings to include 1 Dwarf Sour Cherry tree, 3 urban apple trees, 12 prairie drop seed, 5 Ninebark "Amber Jubilee," and 9 switchgrass "Cheyenne Sky."
- Installation of furniture of roof including picnic table, rain barrel, grill, cabinet, refrigerator, and countertop.
- Lower garden area will have raspberry/blackberry bushes, two compost tumblers, limestone patio, and vegetable planters.

- Downspouts rerouted to drain alongside of house into rain barrel with overflow PVC pipe to garden.

9. IV-20-01-020

109 Warren St.

Christopher Premanandan (Owner)

Conceptual Review:

- Installation of privacy fence along the east side of the property line (approximately 156'). Fence will be composed of cedar cap and trim assembly. The fence will start behind the front elevation at the edge of the powder room window.
- Removal of retaining wall on north side of property. Current wall is missing portions of its concrete façade exposing underlying concrete block. Wall is leaning towards sidewalk.
- Replace existing retaining wall with new retaining wall which would extend the length of yard along Warren St. New retaining wall would be composed of cut drywall stone and constructed with a gravel base. Top of wall would be approximately 24-28".
- Front of the yard would include plantings.
- Backyard will be have pavers to the sides of the house and a 30x24' area in the backyard. Cambridge Ledgestone 3-piece will be the primary material.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

• **IV-20-01-001**

919 N Fourth St.

Urban Order (Applicant)/ Laura Dunbar & Eric Hostnik (Owner)

Approve application #IV-20-01-001, 919 N Fourth St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace existing double hung window on elevation of garage with a new casement window, noted on submitted drawing.
- Casement window will mimic the look of a 1-over-1 double hung window with a thickened horizontal division.
- Semco window to be used to match existing windows on the garage, per submitted cut sheet (future window replacements will need to be chosen from the Approved Windows List).

Replace Window

- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

• **IV-20-01-002**

738 Kerr St.

Pro Exterior by APCO –Dan Gesler (Applicant)/ Dana Williams (Owner)

Approve application #IV-20-01-002, 738 Kerr St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace existing windows on all elevations with Marvin Ultimate Next Generation Clad windows.
- Note: Per previous COA#IV-19-12-012, frame expanders are not approved.

Replace Non-Original Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the house with new, Marvin Ultimate Next Generation Clad (1-OVER-1), wood windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

• **IV-20-01-003**

1102-1104 Mt Pleasant Ave.

Whitestone Ent LLC –Mike Couri (Owner)

Approve application #IV-20-01-003, 1102-1104 Mt Pleasant Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Replace the damaged retaining wall and sidewalk with same materials as existing per submitted photographs.
- Paint trim around windows to match the existing color.
- *Note:* Approval does not include repair/replacement of front porches.

Repair Masonry Retaining Wall

- Remove any/all damaged concrete block wall faced with stone and replace with concrete block and stone that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings” supplied by staff.)
- The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs

Exterior Wood Trim Painting

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. All replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Owner has the option of selecting one (1) of the following appropriate painting methods: a) paint all wood trim, windows, doors, etc. the exact same color as currently exists on the wood trim or, b) submit a new paint schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **IV-20-01-004**

838 Hamlet St.

Brian and Sarah Phillips (Owners)

Approve application #IV-20-01-004, 838 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing shingles and replace with Owens Corning (standard 3-tab) in Estate Grey.
- Use cobra ridge vent along with edge vents around perimeter.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **IV-20-01-005**

1100 N. High St.

John Ingwersen (Applicant)

Recommend approval of application #IV-20-01-005, 1100 N. High St., for renewal of expired COA #16-12-21b (Expired: February 21, 2018), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Approve application #16-12-21b, 1100 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- *Addition of two toilet rooms at east end of covered patio.*
- *Enclosure of covered patio by addition of operable glazed overhead doors.*
- *The standing seam metal between the posts is to be changed to at least 12gauge sheet metal.*
- *Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.*

• **IV-20-01-006**

Multiple High Street Locations

Short North Alliance (Applicant)/ City of Columbus (Owner)

Approve Application #IV-20-01-006, Multiple North High Street locations, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install banners on the seventeen (17) Short North Arches within the Italian Village Historic District and the Victorian Village Historic District. Four (4) will be installed on each arch, two (2) on each side of the street (68 total banners.)

- Each double-faced, vinyl banner to measure 54” H x 18” W, and to be hung on custom aluminum poles, painted black, and screwed into existing holes on each arch. Poles to be removed when not in use.
- Bottom of banners to be secured by a fiberglass, mast arm brackets and stainless steel bands, per the submitted drawing.

- **IV-20-01-007**

**67-71 E. Fifth Avenue & 1181 Say Avenue
5th & Say Condos, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #IV-20-01-007, 67-71 E. Fifth Avenue & 1181 Say Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Stucco Repair

- Prepare the damaged surface to accept the repair by removing any loose pieces of stucco in the cracks/holes and enough of the undamaged stucco around the hole to insure application of the repair to a solid wall. Remove any residual dust.
- Replace the underlying wire mesh or tar paper, as needed.
- Apply patch in layers, per industry standards.
- Finish by applying and texturing the final coat to match the existing texture. Paint color to match existing.

Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood soffits and fascia on all elevations, as necessary, with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Porch Roof Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood fascia on all porches, as needed, with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.
- Remove any deteriorated roofing materials and install new EPDM roofing or asphalt shingles from the Approved Roofing Shingles List. Manufacturer/Style/Color of shingles to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to installation.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry is to remain unpainted.**

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the buildings, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.

Install Handrail

- Install a new hand railing at the basement stairway. Cut sheet for hand rail to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Repair/replace existing metal porch railings on all porches. Cut sheet for any new porch railings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

- **IV-20-01-008**

849 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

Approve Application #IV-20-01-008, 849 Summit Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Replace Existing Windows:

- Per field visit with HPO staff, two windows on south façade and one window on east façade are to be replaced with the correct measurements to fit the existing window sizes.

- Window at stair was increased slightly, per submitted drawing and field visit.
- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the house as determined per City Staff site visit determination.
- Install new, Marvin Integrity 1-OVER-1, to match existing double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings, unless mentioned above. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

Siding:

- Infill area where air conditioner was to match existing siding.
- Siding to be 5 ½” HardiPlank, per previous COA#19-5-7.
- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Landscaping:

- Grade adjusted, drawings were revised to reflect existing grade.

Porch Modification:

- Porch column was added on east elevation to match existing condition per field visit. Prior to the installation of the new column, examine the existing front porch service steps and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation for the existing steps with appropriate slope for water drainage.
- Stairs were eliminated at the secondary east entrance, per field visit and revised drawings.

Note: COA#IV-20-01-008 modifies COA#19-5-7 per HPO site visit and consultation.

• **IV-20-01-009**

845 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

Approve Application #IV-20-01-009, 845 Summit Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install Porch Handrail:

- Added railings to the west (rear) porch and modified rear steps.
- Prior to the installation of the new handrail, examine the existing front porch service steps and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation for the existing steps with appropriate slope for water drainage.

Landscaping:

- Grade at rear elevation revised to show existing grade, per submitted drawing and HPO site visit.

Windows:

- Per discussion with HPO during the site visit, there will be no transom over the west (rear) doors.

Note: COA#IV-20-01-009 modifies COA#19-5-6 per HPO site visit and consultation.

• **IV-20-01-010**

272 Cornelius Street

Thomas B and Ann E Poole (Applicant)

Approve Application #IV-20-01-010, 272 Cornelius Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install Awning

- Install new canvas awning on third floor terrace per Jeffrey Park Townhome Roof Awning “A/A1” drawings (COA # 19-5-27 and COA#IV-19-08-018) and submitted materials.

- Install awning within the parapet wall, per submitted documentation. Awning size will not to exceed the size of the parapet wall.
- Awning to be installed with fabric in solid black (silica charcoal or charcoal tweed) color.
- Frame to be installed will be black to match the black railings.
- All connections are to be into mortar joints and not into the face of the brick.

- **IV-20-01-011**

289 E Greenwood Avenue (previously reviewed as 288 E Fourth Rear)

Juliet Bullock, Architect (Applicant)

Approve Application #IV-20-01-011, 289 E Greenwood Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Siding

- Use Allura Siding in lieu of Hardi siding.
- Allura Siding will need to have a smooth finish.
- Siding must match exposure of previously approved Hardi siding of 7 ¼”.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.
- Paint siding and window trim SW 6258 Tricorn Black, per submitted paint chip.
- Paint doors SW 6636 Husky Orange, per submitted paint chip.

- **IV-20-01-012**

291 E Greenwood Avenue (previously reviewed as 294 E Fourth Rear)

Juliet Bullock, Architect (Applicant)

Approve Application #IV-20-01-012, 291 E Greenwood Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Siding

- Use Allura Siding in lieu of Hardi siding.
- Allura Siding will need to have a smooth finish.
- Siding must match exposure of previously approved Hardi siding of 7 ¼”

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.
- Paint siding Artic White.
- Paint window trim SW 6258 Tricorn Black, per submitted paint chip.
- Paint doors SW 6222 Riverway, per submitted paint chip.

X. OLD BUSINESS

- A. Update regarding the drainpipe at 1124 N High Street.

XI. NEW BUSINESS

- A. The Short North Foundation has requested that an IVC representative join them for their regular meetings on the 1st Tuesday of the month.

XII. ADJOURNMENT