

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

Tuesday, December 10, 2019

4:00 p.m.

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Commissioners Present: David Cooke, Brooke Michl-Smith, Shannon Fergus, Todd Boyer, Ben Goodman.

Commissioners Absent: Lauren McNair, Jason Sudy

Staff Present:

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:04 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, January 7, 2020 – 111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor, Room 313.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – Tuesday, January 14, 2020 at 4pm. 111 N Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Monday, November 18, 2019.
MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (4-0-1) [Fergus] APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. **IV-19-12-006**
91 E. Fifth Ave.
DiCarlo's Pizza (Applicant)/ BFWB Partners LLC (Owner)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
2. **IV-19-12-007**
851 N Fourth St.
Woodhouse Vegan LLC (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)
Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-12-007 was divided into Items 'a', 'b', and 'c' for clarity of action.

IV-19-12-007a
Continue application #IV-19-12-007a, 851 N Fourth St., to allow the applicant time to revise the application and submit additional materials.
 - Place vinyl application with a vintage ghost sign appearance on the north brick, per submitted documentation.MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

IV-19-12-007b
Approve application #IV-19-12-007b, 851 N Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:
 - Vinyl application with a vintage ghost sign appearance on the southern elevation exterior, per submitted documentation.MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

IV-19-12-007c

Approve application #IV-19-12-007c, 851 N Fourth St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install three neon signs in the interior transom windows, neon signs will be dim-able in a soft white color, per submitted documentation.
- Front door to have a vinyl Woodhouse Vegan logo, “W,” per submitted drawing.
- Remove the vinyl café/bar at the bottom of the window.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (4-1-0) [Goodman] APPROVED.

3. IV-19-12-008

994 N Sixth St/ SE corner of N Sixth & E Third (Formerly reviewed as 998-990 N Sixth St)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Recommend approval of application #IV-19-12-008, 994 N Sixth St/ SE corner of N Sixth & E Third (Formerly reviewed as 998-990 N Sixth St), as submitted:

Proposed Variances:

- 3332.29 Height District. Whereas a maximum height of 35’ is required and 37’-8” is proposed.
- 3332.039 R-4 District To allow for 2- two family dwellings on a single parcel.
- 3332.15 R-4 area district requirements: A two family dwelling shall be situated on a lot of no less than 6000 square feet in area for two-story, two family dwelling, whereas the applicant proposes 2- 2 unit dwellings on a lot of 8996 square feet.
- 3332.21(D)(C)2 Building Lines Whereas a building line of 25’ is required on East Third Avenue and 3’-1” is proposed and 25’ is required on North Sixth Street and 15’-7” is proposed.
- 3332.25 Maximum side yard required. Whereas a maximum side yard of 13.2’ is required for the north and south side yards and 3’-0” is provided.
- 3332.27 - Rear yard: Each dwelling shall be erected so as to provide a rear yard totaling no less than 25 percent of the total lot area; whereas the applicant proposes to have a combined 2263 square feet or 25.4 % of the lot as rear yard for both dwellings.
- 3332.26 Minimum side yard: Whereas a minimum of 6.27’ is required (37.6’/6 and 3’-2” is provided on the south of the north sixth street house and 3’ is provided on the East Third Avenue house.
- 3332.26 (F) Minimum side yard: for the North and South side yards, 5’ is required, whereas 3’ is provided on the south and 3’-2” is provided on the north.
- Combine two lots for a total lot area of 8996 sq ft. Houses/porch footprint 4390.2 sf or 48.8%. Rear yard 2263.3 SF rear yard or 25.38%.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. IV-19-12-009

291 E Greenwood/294 E Fourth Ave

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Approve application #IV-19-12-009, 291 E Greenwood/294 E Fourth Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Build a three car garage at property instead of a previously approved two car garage.
- Overhangs must be revised per for the long ends to have an overhang and the other edges to have more of an expression as well.
- Lights need to be lined up with the window having a relationship with the modern door.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (5-0-0) APPROVED.

5. IV-19-12-010

**289 E Greenwood/288 E Fourth Ave
Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

Approve application #IV-19-12-010, 289 E Greenwood/288 E Fourth Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Build a three car garage at property instead of a previously approved two car garage.
- Overhangs must be revised per for the long ends to have an overhang and the other edges to have more of an expression as well.
- Lights need to be lined up with the window having a relationship with the modern door.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

6. IV-19-12-011

**1046 N Sixth St. (Formerly reviewed as 1042 N Sixth St.)
Juliet Bullocks (Applicant)**

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-12-011 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action.

IV-19-12-011a

Recommend approval of application #IV-19-12-011a, 1046 N Sixth St. (Formerly reviewed as 1042 N Sixth St.), as submitted:

Variances:

- 3332.09 R-4: To allow for two single family residences on a single lot in a r-4 district
- 3332.05 (4) Area district lot width requirements: to allow for a 36.14' wide lot in lieu of the required 50'.
- 3332.19 Fronting: To allow new single family to not front a public street and to front alley.
- 3333.24 Rear yard to allow a rear yard of 0 sf lieu of the required 25% for the alley home.

MOTION: Cooke/Fergus (5-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

IV-19-12-011b

Conceptual Review:

- Conceptual design for a single family house with carriage house in the rear (east) of the lot with alley access.

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commissioners noted that there are changes to be made to the overall design.
- The porch needs resolution, potentially playing around with the roof may help.
- West and south elevations have too many expressions. They should be as simple as possible.
- There was also discussion of including a terrace as part of the overall design.

NEW APPLICATIONS

7. IV-19-12-012

738 Kerr St.

Pro Exterior by APCO –Dan Gesler (Applicant)/ Dana Williams (Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

8. IV-19-12-013

**Vacant Lot West of 94 E. Third Ave./010-295537 (92 E Third)
Urban Restorations, LLC/Julio Valenzuela (Applicant/Owner)**

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

9. IV-19-12-014

1112 N. High Street

John Ingwersen (Applicant)

Approve application #IV-19-12-014, 1112 N. High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install three (3) radiant heaters under the previously approved canopy.
- Install strip LED down lighting behind the front channel canopy frame.
- Install two (2) speaker bars behind the support channels at the north and south ends of the canopy.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (0-5-0) DENIED.

Reasons for Denial:

- All three items need to be eliminated as this was the result of a Code Violation. A new application for modified lighting and heating for review.
- Speakers are not in guidelines and have been installed up and down High Street which are receiving code violations on both sides of the street. All establishments that have illegal speakers in the right-of-way are being required to remove them.
- Per Short North Design Guidelines the LED strip lights and canopy are not appropriate. Don't allow those under any other canopies. Additional lighting under the canopy on the façade could be explored.
- Proposed heaters is not appropriate or needed.
- City Code 3116.11 -Standards for Alteration (3) Each property shall be recognized as a product of its own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.

10. IV-19-12-015

36 E. Lincoln Street

Zach Kendall/Schooley Caldwell (Applicant)

Approve application #IV-19-12-015, 36 E. Lincoln Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Eliminate the large ground floor window types that were designed and approve for the restaurant but cannot be fabricated as originally intended.
- Install a folding window panel system (4'-0" sections) below a set of transom windows.
- Apartment windows on second and third floors to match the new first floor window design.
- The windows on the south elevation on Lincoln not be movable, they would be fixed. And Pearl Alley can remain operable with the thicker mullion to match upper mullions.
- If the applicant finds an operable transom solutions, then the applicant may work with HPO staff for a potential staff approval.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.

MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (4-0-1) [Michl-Smith]

11. IV-19-12-016

1002 North Fourth Street

Lisa Suarez (Applicant)/ Lykens Companies (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-11-013a was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action.

IV-19-12-016a

Approve application #IV-19-12-016, 1002 North Fourth Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Keep vinyl decals as already installed with salon's name on both windows.
- Paint exterior store front window trim matte black.
- Place two planters outside of front door, one on each side of steps. Planters could also be on second step.
- Fringe to be temporarily removed until resolved with the Italian Village Commission under #IV-19-12-016b.

MOTION: COOKE/GOODMAN (5-0-0) APPROVED.

IV-19-12-016b

Continue application #IV-19-12-016b, 1002 North Fourth St., to allow the applicant time to revise the application and submit additional materials.

- Install exterior art piece consisting of orange and pink flagging tape, with ties, doing no damage to the exterior façade.

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUE.

Commissioner Comments:

- The hanging of the fringe needs to not damage the building.
- It was suggested that the fringe could be adapted to the entrance alone.
- The artwork needs to respect the building that it's on.
- One of the Commissioners commented that the repetitiveness has taken away from the canopy art and made it more of a brand.
- The exploration of a different exterior piece was also suggested.

12. IV-19-12-017

1124 N High St.

Rohme Ruanphae & Brian Swanson (Applicants)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #IV-19-12-007 was divided into Items 'a', 'b', and 'c' for clarity of action.

IV-19-12-017a

Approve application #IV-19-12-017a, 1124 N High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Keep existing 4 skylights on south side of roof, as shown in photographs. They are low profile and barely viewable from street.
- Gutters and rain carrier system to be kept as previously installed.
- Under special circumstances, due to large amounts of rain, keep existing transparent second floor roof cover.
- Keep existing non-permanent satellite dish on the roof, moving it 5' east from where it currently is placed.
- Paint exterior front doors and window frames black, paint chip to be submitted the HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.
- Paint first floor exterior stucco tan, paint chip to be submitted the HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.
- Graphics on west side of 1st floor retail windows can be kept.
- Blade sign graphic was changed on the existing sign.

MOTION: Fergus/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

IV-19-12-017b

Approve application #IV-19-12-017b, 1124 N High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install speakers on front of building.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (0-5-0) DENIED.

Reasons for Denial:

- City Code 3116.11 -Standards for Alteration (3) Each property shall be recognized as a product of its own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.
- Speakers are not in guidelines and have been installed up and down High Street which are receiving code violations on both sides of the street. All establishments that have illegal speakers in the right-of-way are being required to remove them.
- Speakers are not being approved while further study along the corridor is occurring.

IV-19-12-017c

Continue application #IV-19-12-017a, 1124 N High St., to allow the applicant time to revise the application and submit additional materials:

- Install security cameras, per submitted photos.
- Keep existing ice storage bin and cooking oil container on alley side of building, per submitted photos.
- Gas-fired smoker and required smoker exhaust has been installed on rear of building. Would like survey of right-of-way from applicant with next application and for staff to include discussion on protrusion in alleyways on the next business meeting that the application appears at.
- Remove and not replace second story rear canopy which was worn, damaged, and fell off the building a few years ago.
- Work with Pella to price out and provide samples for new wood replacement windows.

MOTION: Fergus/Cooke (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

13. IV-19-12-018

295 E Fifth Ave.

Jeanne Cabral -Architect (Applicant)/ Michelle Cordle (Owner)

Conceptual Review:

- Conceptual design of exterior remodel including shingles and paint.
- Rear two story addition to the house.
- New three-car garaged proposed at rear of the lot after re-combining separated lot.

Commissioner Comments:

- The dormer on the east/west elevation appears awkward and needs to be resolved.
- Consider a hipped roof as it may be more appropriate.
- Wood railings are needed on the porches.

14. ~~IV-19-12-019~~

~~**59-65 East Russell**~~

~~**Blackfriars Development LLC (Owner)**~~

~~Conceptual Review:~~

- ~~• Develop less than 2000 sq ft of grass surface into 8 asphalt parking spaces.~~
- ~~• Install 270 sq yds (2430 sq ft) of asphalt, strip, and place 8-7' parking blocks with rebar anchors.~~
- ~~• Install approximately 645 sq ft concrete apron.~~
- ~~• Install 34" high by 24" long bike rack along parking spaces on Kerr Street.~~

APPLICANT WAS NOT IN ATTENDANCE.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

- **IV-19-12-001**

1122-1124 North High Street

Ace Roofing (Applicant)/1122-1124 N High St LLC (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-12-001, 1122-1124 North High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Power wash green paint off brick on the east facing wall.
- Tuck point east facing wall.
- Paint wood trim and concrete block window infill SW 6258 Tricorn Black.

Power Wash Spec

- Clean all unpainted masonry in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes. Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and utilizing a broad fan tip. Should chemical cleaning be proposed by the owner or contractor or be determined to be necessary by Historic Preservation Office staff for paint removal of Previously Painted Masonry: the following procedure is required: Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x2') section in the least visible location possible. Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations. If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings").

Solid Tuck Point Alley Wall

- Check all mortar joints for soundness on east elevation.
- Use hand tools to remove all mortar to a depth of 3/4".
Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings" available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

Exterior Wood Trim Painting

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. All replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Owner has the option of selecting one (1) of the following appropriate painting methods: a) paint all wood trim, windows, doors, etc. the exact same color as currently exists on the wood trim or, b) submit a new paint schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Exterior Painting of Previously Painted Concrete Block

- Paint concrete block SW 6258 Tricorn Black.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing trim elements, as necessary; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare any/all exterior previously painted masonry surfaces for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **IV-19-12-002**

940-942 Hamlet Street

Michael Blue (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-12-002, 940-942 Hamlet Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove trim along fascia.
- Install new Ogee 5” suspended gutters and downspouts, leaving existing jumped box gutters in place.
- Downspouts will be installed on the four corners of the house and one on the west elevation the center front.
- Paint the gutters all the same color as fascia (SW 2822 Downing Sand).

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary.
- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new 5” ogee gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color to be SW 2822 Downing Sand.
- Install new, 5", half-round ogee gutters and new round, metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **IV-19-12-003**

227 E Fifth Ave.

Lykens Companies (Applicant)/ Absolute Properties 227 LLC (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-12-003, 227 E Fifth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint south elevation to match existing white.
- Rear door to be painted Tri-Corn Black.
- Tuck point north elevation.
- North elevation to be painted Tri-Corn Black, only painting masonry that was previously painted.

Exterior Painting

- Paint south elevation to match existing color scheme and paint north elevation Tri-Corn Black. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Spot Tuck Point--(complete)

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Replace any/all missing damaged material and replace with new or used block of the exact same shape, dimension, and color; like-for-like.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.
- New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland

cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings”, available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

• **IV-19-12-004**

834 Hamlet St. (836 Hamlet)

Klaus Gauer (Applicant)/ Kristina Beggs & Adam Ward (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-12-004, 836 Hamlet St, for renewal of expired COA #18-4-9a (Expired April 17, 2019), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Approve Application 18-4-9a, 834 Hamlet St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

New Construction

- *Demolish existing concrete block single-car garage.*
- *Construct new 2-car carriage house with second floor living unit.*

• **IV-19-12-005**

1100 N High Street

John Ingwersen (Applicant)

Approve application #IV-19-12-005, 1100 N High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Erect fence and gate along west elevation, per submitted drawings, to be 6’ tall.
- Install 6’ dumper surround.
- Both fence and dumpster surround will be constructed of vertical cedar fencing.

Install New Privacy Fence and Dumpster Surround

- Install new 6’ wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

15. IV-19-12-006

91 E. Fifth Ave.

DiCarlo’s Pizza (Applicant)/ BFWB Partners LLC (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-12-006, 91 E. Fifth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new 12 sq ft aluminum sign with double-sided applied skeletal neon, featuring colors and fonts to replicate the original 1940s sign, per submitted design.
- Put vinyl decal on door, per submitted drawings.

1. IV-19-12-012

738 Kerr St.

Pro Exterior by APCO –Dan Gesler (Applicant)/ Dana Williams (Owner)

Approve application #IV-19-12-012, 738 Kerr St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove and replace second floor rear patio doors with Marvin Ultimate Inswing Clad French doors in Pebble Grey to fit existing opening.
- A Fortin iron railing will be installed per submitted documentation across the French doors since they open to nowhere.
- Note: Application was approved without Marvin Frame Expander to existing brick openings.

Install New Door(s)

- Remove existing deteriorated/non-original exterior door(s). Second story French doors on rear of house.
- Install new, solid core door in existing door jamb.
- Set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides.
- Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

- **IV-19-12-013**
Vacant Lot West of 94 E. Third Ave./010-295537
Urban Restorations, LLC/Julio Valenzuela (Applicant/Owner)
Approve application #IV-19-12-013, Vacant Lot West of 94 E. Third Ave./010-295537, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Grade, seed, and straw the area where the retaining wall collapsed.

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT MOTION: Goodman/Fergus (5-0-0) ADJOURNED. 7:17PM